

The Academic Senate

CITY COLLEGE OF SAN FRANCISCO

50 Frida Kahlo Way, Bungalow 604, San Francisco, CA 94112
www.ccsf.edu/academic-senate

CCSF Academic Senate Executive Council

Final Minutes

Wednesday November 5, 2025, 2:30-5:00 pm
Room 306, John Adams Campus or Via [Zoom](#)
Alternate Meeting Locations:
Chinatown North Beach Campus Room 905
Mission Campus, Bartlett Building, Room 453

Councilmembers present: Jessica Buchsbaum, Katia Fuchs, Mike Greenberg, Carina Lin, Alexis Litzky, Lillian Marrujo-Duck, Jonathan Potter, Robin Pugh, Pablo Rodriguez (remote non-voting), Lou Schubert, Chad Stephenson

Councilmembers absent: Madeline Mueller, Mitra Sapienza, Anjali Sundaram (on leave)

Other Senate members present: Mary Bravewoman, Landi Ehnle

Guests: Glenda Graves, Edie Kaueper, Malinali Villalobos, Cynthia Dewar

1. Call to Order

[CCSF Land Acknowledgement](#)

We acknowledge that we are on the unceded, ancestral homeland of the Ramaytush Ohlone who are the original inhabitants of the San Francisco Peninsula. As the indigenous stewards of this land and in accordance with their traditions, the Ramaytush Ohlone have never ceded, lost nor forgotten their responsibilities as the caretakers of this place, as well as for all peoples who reside in their traditional territory. As guests, we recognize that we benefit from living and working on their traditional homeland. We wish to pay our respects by acknowledging the ancestors, elders, and relatives of the Ramaytush Community and by affirming their sovereign rights as First Peoples.

The meeting began at 2:41pm with 8 members present. The CCSF Land Acknowledgement was read aloud by Lillian Marrujo-Duck. President Fuchs spoke about the history of the John Adams-DeAvila campus.

2. Adoption of Agenda

2025.11.05.02 Adoption of the Agenda

Moved by Lillian Marrujo-Duck, seconded Jonathan Potter.

Agenda was adopted by roll-call vote with 8 councilmembers present.

3. Public Comment

- a. No public comment

4. Reports

- a. Welcome from Dean of John Adams-DeAvila center, Edie Kaeuper
 - i. Dean Kaeuper welcomed the Senate and gave a brief history of the center; it is the oldest building in CCSF's portfolio and became part of CCSF in 1971 as part of the adult school. It now houses the Allied Health Care program. The goal is to bring enrollment at the center to 1000 FTES by moving most of these programs over from Ocean Campus. General Education programs may be part of JAD in the future.
- b. Officers' Reports
 - i. [President's report](#) – President Fuchs is meeting regularly with Associated Student leaders to build bridges. ASEC meetings at Mission and Chinatown continue with “Senate Ambassadors” to host visitors at these locations—contact the President if you are interested. Credit for Prior Learning Coordinator application has been extended. Fall ASCCC Plenary will be held this weekend where statewide resolutions will be debated and voted on (see item 8b below). The first discipline hearing for changes to mathematics, uncrewed aircraft training, mental health counseling, and ASL will take place on Friday November 7 at 8am; it will be open for anyone to join via Zoom. Final CCSF Equity Talks will be happening this month.
 - ii. First Vice-President Lillian Marrujo-Duck – Canvas features will include AI to support grading, as well as plug-and-play courses, beginning in January 2026.
 - iii. Second Vice-President Alexis Litzky – No report.
 - iv. Secretary Chad Stephenson – Improvements in back-office services of the Senate continue. Working with classified staff and ITS to coordinate systems we've incorporated into the Academic Senate over the past five years.
- c. AFT2121 check-in report – Mary Bravewoman, AFT President
 - i. Registration for contract negotiations
 - ii. Approval of a tentative timeline for bargaining team elections is being set. Bargaining begins in Fall 2026. The film *Adjunct* will be shown at Chinatown/North Beach campus in the coming weeks to illustrate the role of part-time educators in higher education. Rapid Response Teams to support undocumented students are being formed across centers and are an opt-in for all faculty members.
 - iii. AFT will move to 600 Bungalows shortly, nearer to the Academic Senate office.
- d. Associated Students Executive Student Leadership report
 - i. No report
- e. Committee on Committees report
 - i. Report with recommendations shared by Lillian Marrujo-Duck.

5. Consent Agenda

- a. [Approval](#) of [Minutes from October 22, 2025](#)
- b. Approval of [Committee Appointments](#)
- c. [Adopting a variable roll-call vote procedure](#) – Pulled for discussion.
 - i. The Senate discussed this issue and options to randomize the voting order
 - ii. The Secretary will return with the Secretary's recommended method.

2025.11.05.05.a. Approval of Minutes from October 22, 2025

Resolved, the Executive Council approves the minutes for October 22, 2025.

Moved by Lou Schubert, seconded by Jonathan Potter

Adopted by consent with 9 in favor.

2025.11.05.05.b. Approval of Committee Appointments

Resolved, the Academic Senate recommends the following committee appointments:

Educational Policies

Amber Strauss, Learning Assistance

Student Grade & File

Ardel Thomas, LGBTQ+ Studies

Student Equity Strategies

Savio Chan (DSPS)

Moved by Lou Schubert, seconded by Jonathan Potter

Adopted by consent with 9 in favor.

6. Old Business

a. Comprehensive Program Review (CPR) - President Katia Fuchs

- i. [Continued discussion slide deck](#) shared by President Fuchs
 1. Previous discussion of CPR included issues of departmental culture and data, ambassadorship and inclusion of non-Ocean based programs, leadership needs, and options instead of single solutions; guidance for writing action plans; “Cheap and Cheerful Strategies for Student Success”
 2. Additional data discussed included program overlap, unique program costs and revenues sources (e.g. non-Student Centered Funding Formula [SCFF] programs), Strategic Enrollment Management Plan data, a lens needed for adjustment in data (“data calculator”), student success data including retention strategies, a budgetary dashboard (e.g. program revenue generation), heat maps including student success and equity outcomes; additional resources required to teach (e.g. support staff) as related to revenue generation; certificates awarded mapped to courses offered; job acquisition upon exit (“completion is also a job”), “SP” (satisfactory progress) progress indicator (used in noncredit) as completion and success data
 3. Look ahead – Publications of action plans with group reading and follow up
- ii. [Draft resolution](#) temporarily suspending Program Review Committee (PRC)

1. Members of PRC have reviewed the resolution; a check-in by ASEC on this change will occur after 2-years

2025.11.05.06.a.ii Resolution temporarily suspending the Program Review Committee and assigning responsibilities to the Executive Council

Whereas CCSF requested guidance through the Institutional Effectiveness Partnership Initiative (IEPI) and the Partnership Resource Team (PRT) issued a strong recommendation to analyze scheduling and programming practices, resulting in the divergence from the regular Comprehensive Program Review (CPR) process and the adoption of the two-year process known as CPR 1 and CPR 2; and

Whereas the Academic Senate Executive Council (ASEC) voted to endorse this two year comprehensive program review process ([2025.05.21.6.a](#)) and

Whereas Faculty maintain purview over the whole body of curriculum and programming as outlined in these parts of the 10+1:

1. (1) Curriculum including establishing prerequisites and placing courses within disciplines
2. (2) Degree and certificate requirements
3. (4) Educational program development
4. (5) Standards or policies regarding student preparation and success
5. (9) Processes for program review

and,

Whereas the Academic Senate is the official elected representative of the whole faculty body and this exceptional two-year CPR process requires the attention and engagement of the whole faculty body, therefore be it

Resolved, that the Academic Senate express gratitude to the Program Review Committee for their outstanding work developing guidance documents, facilitating reading circles, and engaging faculty in the work of the 2018 and 2022 CPR processes, and

Resolved, that the Academic Senate shall temporarily suspend [the Program Review Committee](#) until Fall 2027, with a review by the Executive Council in Fall 2026 and

Resolved, the Academic Senate Executive Council will assume the responsibilities previously assigned to the Program Review Committee, including:

1. Finalizing the [2026 CPR2 program reflection prompts](#) and data support by December 2025
2. Updating the [CPR guide](#) with resources and support for completing CPR2 in Fall 2026
3. Designing and directing the CPR2 review process, culminating in a [final summary report](#)

And finally Resolved, The Academic Senate Executive Council shall review this suspension in Spring 2027 and make a recommendation about whether the Senate should continue the committee suspension or to reconstitute the committee.

Moved by Lillian Marrujo-Duck, seconded by Robin Pugh

Approved with 9 council members in favor.

- iii. [Draft resolution](#) in support of Program Review Coordinator
 - 1. The coordinator appointment will be from CCSF faculty and supervised by the Office of Instruction
 - 2. Those who spoke in favor appreciated the challenge of this role and indicated a need for significant time and compensation and the need for increased leadership;

2025.11.05.06.a.iii Resolution in support of a Program Review Coordinator for 2025-2027

Whereas, the temporary suspension of the Program Review Committee and assumption of duties by the Executive Council from 2025-2027 will require leadership beyond the capacity of the Academic Senate Officers, and

Whereas, the Student Learning Outcomes (SLO) Committee and Curriculum Committee both have faculty coordinator positions that support the development and submission of assessment reports and curriculum updates which are integrated into program review but the Program Review Committee does not have any coordinator support,

Resolved, the Academic Senate recommends the Academic Senate President work with the Vice Chancellor of Academic Affairs and Associate Vice Chancellor of Institutional Effectiveness to develop a Program Review Coordinator job description for circulation in March 2026 and appointment starting in Fall 2026.

Moved by Jessica Buchsbaum, seconded by Lou Schubert
Approved with 9 council members in favor.

b. Noncredit Adult Education Committee (NCAE) Resolution

- i. Draft [NCAE Resolution](#)
- ii. Concerns and questions: involving and collaboration with department chairs is dissimilar from credit; this resolution is to support improved clarity in resource requests

2025.11.05.06.b.i Resolution recommending action based on WestEd needs assessment

Whereas San Francisco Adult Education Consortium produced a new Three-Year Plan¹ for 2025-28, [accepted by the Academic Senate Executive Council](#) (ASEC) on May 21, 2025 and

Whereas the WestEd Adult Education Needs assessment² subsequently included the recommendation to “establish institutional structures and practices that elevate adult education student needs and facilitate effective responses,” and

Whereas together, the WestEd Needs Assessment and the CCSF AEP 2025–2028 Three-Year Plan provide guidance for integrating aligned priorities into noncredit programmatic planning to strengthen coordinated leadership, ensure transparent budget processes, and promote accountability for outcomes within the Academic Senate’s 10 + 1 purview, be it

Resolved, that the Academic Senate Leadership will work with the AEP supervising administrator to finalize the job description³ for a dedicated adult education and noncredit faculty coordinator, and be it further

Resolved, that ASEC calls the Noncredit Adult Education Committee (NCAE) to work in partnership with the supervising administrator to develop a clear and transparent process for budget planning for both annual and carryover AEP funds, with regular updates shared with appropriate governance bodies , and be it further

Resolved, that ASEC encourages the supervising administrator, in partnership and consultation with NCAE, to develop a process for evaluating and reporting on the effectiveness of AEP-funded projects by the end of each academic year.

Moved by Jessica Buchsbaum, seconded by Lou Schubert

Approved with 9 council members in favor.

- iii. Draft [Noncredit Adult Education Coordinator Job Description](#)

- 1. Moved to bring back at a future date by Alexis Litzky

7. Break

- a. The Senate took a five minute break.

8. New Business

a. Burden-Free Instructional Materials Requirement – Cynthia Dewar, Dean of Library, Academic Resources, Educational Technology, & Online Programs

- i. Slide deck shared Title V definition of “burden free” which includes a wide variety of items and “Understanding Instructional Materials Costs” indicating impacts of material costs to students
- ii. Title V requirements – Board of Trustees must adopt policies ensuring students have access to required textbooks and materials on the first day of class, must strengthen

¹ [SFAEC Three Year Plan](#)

² [WestEd needs Assessment](#)

³ Draft [Noncredit Adult Education Program Coordinator Job Description](#)

access to instructional materials, and district policies must preserve instructor academic freedom

- iii. Timeline includes near term (policy adoption and funding), mid-term (2026-28, to scale OER), and long-term (2028-2030)
- iv. Challenges & Questions: included forming policies effective by January 2026 and ensuring access when costs are unknown
 - v. What should not happen: automatic billing, copyright violation, accessibility violations, purchasing with “soft” money, infringement on academic freedom
 - vi. What should happen: institutional OER, building ZTC pathways, creating access beyond textbooks, locally defined instructional materials, maintaining faculty choice, updating local policies and procedures to align with Title V, and continued support and collaboration
- vii. This item will return at a future meeting TBD

b. Statewide Plenary Resolutions

i. [Resolutions Packet](#)

1. Senate members discussed the various resolutions headed for ASCCC during its Fall 2025. Senate members expressed support for noncredit pathway development with support from noncredit counsellors and faculty at all levels of programming; concerns were raised about the use of automation/AI in academic counselling and the role of faculty; concern was expressed over prioritizing academic freedom in burden-free instructional materials, particularly in social sciences and history disciplines; AI literacy resolution will need to include academic librarians as primary information competency and should be called out as specific area experts in this, as it relates to CCSF Library’s ILOs, additionally that critical information literacy integrates other issues surrounding AI use including political and social implications; faculty evaluations and DEI will need follow up after current legal issues settle
2. President Fuchs will vote on ASCCC plenary resolutions on November 8, 2025

c. Exemplary Program Award - Mike Greenberg and Alexis Litzky, Awards and Recognitions Committee

- i. The committee selected “Voices of Resilience” from the Photography Department as its nominee; this program included mentoring as part of its photography program
- ii. ASEC will host a celebration for award nominees and winners during one of its Spring 2026 meetings

2025.11.05.09.c Exemplary Program Award

The Photography Program was nominated for the 2025 Exemplary Program Award

Moved by Jessica Buchsbaum, seconded by Lou Schubert,
Approved by acclamation

9. Adjournment at 5:23pm