



# The Academic Senate

## CITY COLLEGE OF SAN FRANCISCO

50 Frida Kahlo Way, Box E-202, San Francisco, CA 94112 (415) 239-3611 Fax (415) 452-5115  
[www.ccsf.edu/academic-senate](http://www.ccsf.edu/academic-senate) email: [asenate@ccsf.edu](mailto:asenate@ccsf.edu)

Curriculum • Degree Requirements • Grading Policies • Program Development • Student Prep & Success • Governance  
Accreditation • Professional Development • Program Review • Planning & Budgeting Process • Others as agreed

Note: Copies of the Final Agenda, Resolutions and Materials for the November 30, 2022 meeting can be found in the [November 30 Materials folder](#).

### CCSF Academic Senate Executive Council Minutes & [Sound Recording](#)

Wednesday, December 14, 2022, 2:30-5:00pm  
Via Zoom

<https://ccsf-edu.zoom.us/j/98935746783>

**Council Members Present:** Monica Bosson, Kate Frei, Wynd Kaufmyn, Sheri Miraglia, Madeline Mueller, Ronald Page II, Lisa Romano, Mitra Sapienza, Lou Schubert, Michele Sieglitz, Chad Stephenson, Frederick Teti, Katryn Wiese,

**Council Members Absent:** Adam d'Aquisto, Erik Christianson, Karen Cox, Lawrence Edwardson, Kimberly Keenan (Sabbatical), Thomas Kennedy (on leave from ASEC), Caroline Priestley

**Other Senate Members Present:** Harry Bernstein, Abigail Bornstein, Rachel Cohen, Constance Conner, Alan D'Souza, Landi Ehnle, Jennifer Kienzle, Craig Kleinman, Andrew King, Carmen Lamha, Ying Liu, Nuala Sheetz (on-leave from ASEC), Megan Sweeney

**Guests:** Heather Brandt, Dr. Ramona Coates, Chancellor David Martin

#### I. Call to Order 2:30 (3min)

A. We acknowledge that we are on the unceded, ancestral homeland of the Ramaytush Ohlone who are the original inhabitants of the San Francisco Peninsula. As the indigenous stewards of this land and in accordance with their traditions, the Ramaytush Ohlone have never ceded, lost nor forgotten their responsibilities as the caretakers of this place, as well as for all peoples who reside in their traditional territory. As guests, we recognize that we benefit from living and working on their traditional homeland. We wish to pay our respects by acknowledging the ancestors, elders and relatives of the Ramaytush Community and by affirming their sovereign rights as First Peoples.

- Recognize your own indigenous land settlement at <https://native-land.ca>
- <https://www.ramaytush.org/donate.html>

- <https://sogoreate-landtrust.org/donate/>

II. Adoption of Agenda 2:33 (2min)

III. Public Comment 2:35 (10 min)

- **Carmen Lamha:** I recently found out that a period of 39 months will continue to impact impacted departments. What are the criteria for making this decision? Enrollment is high as is FTEF but the restrictions have made it difficult for the department to grow. Where can I find information that shows our department deserves this?
- **Harry Bernstein:** at the AFT Meeting yesterday, there was a long discussion from Higher Ed Action Team centered on 13 points. The union watered down part of it but adopted the 13 points, sent to EFF on Monday. Re" the Resolution on what's happening at John Adams, what are faculty rights when they are infringed upon? Has this ever happened before and has there been a positive outcome?
- **Kate Frei:** two full timers retired so we were taken off the impacted department list. We thought we could bring PT'ers back to restore classes but this has not happened. Our grants pay for 75% of PT salaries yet no FTEF have been added even though we were taken off the impacted department list. Hundreds of students have been locked out. The demand is huge and they are not bringing the PT instructors back.
- **Abigail Bornstein:** At the last ASEC meeting, the ASEC approved a Resolution for ESL Course Offerings at JAD but the title of the resolution and the whereas pertains to ESL and JAD but the resolves were broad and general. When Lou Schubert tried to match the Whereas with the Resolves, the resolution was voted against. When the intention does not pass resolves, there is a problem with the resolution. The Board doesn't have to answer to anything when the Resolution is written this way. I want to remind everyone that classes were moved from JAD to another campus. Talk to CTE faculty about layoffs and classes not offered anywhere.
- **Carmen Lamha:** I'm here because you are a very supportive group. The major consequence for me is that I am the most senior faculty in the department and I have been pressured to retire by many people.
- **Michele Sieglitz:** That's obscene and absurd and the worst form of ageism. I also believe that's an HR issue.

IV. Reports 2:45

- Chancellor's Report: Dr. David Martin (10 min)
  - Breaking event: STEAM Building Groundbreaking event tomorrow at 9:30am. Outdoors by MUB. Please come by.
  - ISIR report update: we have officially submitted the report to ACCJC. Thank you for all the work that went into producing

this report.

- We have heard from ACCJC regarding the third assessment of Enhanced Monitoring. Hearing will be between 1/11-1/13/23. CCSF will be asked to provide a closed session hearing. President Sapianza will be present along with Kristin Charles and the Chancellor. Next steps will be decided after this.
- Admin Procedure on Communicable Diseases. Health & Safety Committee have decided areas where masking will still be required even if lifted across the greater campus: in the future, i.e. Student Health Services.
- Eddy Street Update: SF was informed of college's plans to renovate Eddy Street so they are no longer interested in using the space for supervised drug use.
- Housing Locations for people in transition from housing. CCSF may offer a place for people to park their RVs or vehicles for certain amounts of time. Next step is to get feedback from Facilities Committee. This will impact hundreds of parking spaces.
- Update of Performing Arts & Education Center. Looking at a \$180 million dollar project based on current designs and current cost of construction from Prop A. No date is official at this time. Good chance that a special meeting may be called by BOT on 12/22/22.
- We are waiting for more information from Treasure Island Museum regarding transportation and curation of Diego Rivera mural.
- Want to give Student Chancellor Heather Brandt props for coordinate going to Sacto. with a group of students to advocate for Student Transportation. More info will be coming soon.
- Lou Schubert: I'm glad you brought up parking. Since the reservoir was taken away, what about collaborating with Lick Wilmerding to see if we can share their parking?
- Chancellor Martin: We are going to have to get creative once the reservoir is taken away; I'm always open to new suggestions and ideas.
- Harry Bernstein: Re: the new Trustees-elect who are coming on board on 1/12/23. There is also a Retirement event that day in the morning. Could you use your influence to make sure those events are not at the same time?

- Chancellor Martin: January 10-13th are very busy days. The Board has historically used the second Thursday of January to swear in new Trustees. I will look at the calendar and get that info out to the college community so we can be diligent.
- Abigail Bornstein: Retirement workshops are not open to all faculty. It's only a select group who are welcomed to that. You have to pay for that in order to find out the process for retiring.
- Officers Reports (15 min)
  - [President's report](#)
  - I had the honor to present at a CCC Math Conference.
  - Deadline for Stanback-Stroud Diversity Award is 1/24/23.
  - See report for details on policies being taken up in Sacramento.
  - Updates on Hiring Document with DCC and HR. We will review draft in Spring.
  - Plenary 1/13/23 8-9am
  - Many Coordinator positions will be opening in the Spring, potentially 10 Faculty Leadership positions.
  - There will be an all-Faculty call for appointments and have a formal appointment process.
  - Collegial Consultation: credit for prior learning, hearing issues, response to Resolution on ESL classes at JAD coming soon.
  - Program Review rubric is being finished up SESC soon.

#### **VP Sheri Miraglia**

- We submitted ISIR one day early. Thank you to Kristin Charles and everyone who participated. I'm optimistic that the hearings with ACCJC will be successful based on ISIR.
- We need more people to serve on Committees.

#### **2nd VP Lou Schubert**

- Ned Buskirk will be coming back in March for Flex Day for grief & healing session. We may have a hybrid event but definitely online. Possibly we may do other things for faculty mental health.
- FIRE update: reviewed the Free Speech case on the "Stop Woke Act" that was overturned in Florida because it violates the 1st Amendment.. It set up a situation where professors would have to answer to the government. We need to avoid making regulations that violate 1st Amendment rights. We can save a lot of time by not taking away things like Free

Speech that are going to be overturned legally.

**Secretary Michele Sieglitz**

- I wish everyone a healthy and warm holiday and time for self-care and healing and look forward to seeing people in the Spring..

**AFT2121 check in report (5 min)-- VP, AFT: Alan d'Souza**

- Alan d'Souza: thanked everyone for their efforts
- Talked about an example of student, faculty working together to prevent closure of JAD Campus.
- Loss of Prop O really stinks but there continues to be a surplus in the budget.
- We began to replace Trustees who voted for faculty layoffs. Now we need to hold them accountable while continuing to cultivate a working relationship with the Trustees.
- Fill out the AFT Bargaining Survey to advocate for what you want. It's not enough to say what you want; we have to fight to get what we want.
- Listening sessions in Spring to discuss department priorities.
- We are still working on getting repairs and heating solved across campus.
- Excited about groundbreaking of STEAM building tomorrow at 10:30am. We want to dispel any rumors of AFT crashing with a demonstration.
- Thu January 12th, the retirees are putting together an event for members to plan for your future: [tinyurl.com/fpdreg](https://tinyurl.com/fpdreg)
- End of Semester AFT party at EL Rio next Wednesday 12/21, 6-8pm
- Happy Holidays, have a great break and see you next year.

**Associated Students report (10 min) – Student Chancellor Heather Brandt (no show)**

**Committee on Committees report (5 min) – First Vice President, Sheri Miraglia**

V. Consent Agenda 3:35 (5 min)

A. Approval of Minutes from [November 30, 2022](#)

**Resolution 2022.12.14.5A**

**Approval of Minutes: November 30, 2022**

Resolved, that the Executive Council approved the Minutes for [November 30, 2022](#).

Adopted by consent.

B. Endorsement of [Program Review Supplemental Allocation Rubric Sp' 23](#)  
(approved 12/6 by SESC)

**Resolution 2022.12.14.5B Program Review Supplemental Allocation Rubric Sp' 23**

Resolved that the Academic Senate Executive Council endorses the [Program Review Supplemental Allocation Rubric Sp' 23](#)

Adopted by consent.

C. Approval of Committee Appointments

**Resolution 2022.12.14.5C**

**Appointments to Committees, Task Forces, Work Groups**

**Nominations to Committees with Unlimited Membership**

**SLO Committee**

Nathaniel Lawless Steel (Communication Arts) - new appointment

**CTE Steering Committee**

Sean Rowley (Learning Assistance) - new appointment

**NonCredit Adult Education Committee**

Dora Rodriguez (DSPS) - reappointment

**Nominations to Committees with Limited Membership**

**Program Review**

Alexandria Leyton (English) - new appointment

**Student Grade and File Review**

Sean Rowley (Learning Assistance) - new appointment

**Nominations to AS Workgroups / Task Forces District-Level Committees and Task Forces/Workgroup**

**PGC Facilities**

Jennifer Rudd (Culinary Arts/Hospitality) - new appointment

Adopted by consent.

VI. Old Business 3:40

VII. New Business (3:45)

A. BP and AP on Articulation, [CCSF AP 4050 Draft.docx](#) and [CCSF BP 4050 Draft.docx](#) (10 mins) – Articulation Officer, Rachel Cohen

- BP and AP on Articulation, updated policy below:
- [https://citycollegesf-my.sharepoint.com/:w:/g/personal/rcohen\\_ccsf\\_edu/EU\\_smOpISZIMq6oUD6uEdIsBBNqozjpi53qklzwOYOMFtA?e=uCySpC](https://citycollegesf-my.sharepoint.com/:w:/g/personal/rcohen_ccsf_edu/EU_smOpISZIMq6oUD6uEdIsBBNqozjpi53qklzwOYOMFtA?e=uCySpC)
- [https://citycollegesf-my.sharepoint.com/:w:/g/personal/rcohen\\_ccsf\\_edu/ER\\_gTRO5q\\_9OrlZ8IojpkA0B9IAEj4\\_vbNCxXa56GwqNgg?e=AzMpCP](https://citycollegesf-my.sharepoint.com/:w:/g/personal/rcohen_ccsf_edu/ER_gTRO5q_9OrlZ8IojpkA0B9IAEj4_vbNCxXa56GwqNgg?e=AzMpCP)
- <https://www.ccsf.edu/sites/default/files/2022/document/bp-6-16.pdf>
- Madeline Mueller: Is this a statewide standard or by us? Do we have to match up with other schools?
- All of the groups have consulted the AP/BP with other colleges to see how we'd like to express these ideas for ourselves.
- Lou argued in support of the resolution.
- Passed by CONSENT.

**Resolution 2022.12.14 7A**

**Approval to Endorse the BP and AP on Articulation**

Resolved that the CCSF Academic Senate Executive Council approved the endorsement of [BP on Articulation](#) and [AP on Articulation](#).

Adopted by consent.

B. Peer Online Course Review (10mins) – Associate Dean Jen Kienzle, Ying Liu and Megan Sweeney– information about POCR at CCSF, the [local POCR Review Process](#) and future goals, informational, discussion; [POCR Presentation](#)

- <https://cvc.edu/>
- Online Course Exchange/CA Virtual Campus
- Courses have been quality-reviewed to make sure we have quality online courses.
- Megan Sweeney talked about her use of POCR for all of her classes. Took 8 months to refine all of her classes since she hadn't done IOTL/AOTL for a long time. Lots of effort but then it got easier over time.
- Faculty were very supportive and collegial in giving feedback. Wonderful opportunity to have eyes on your classes. I encourage other faculty to put their courses through POCR.

- We see POCR as not just another training. It's a collaborative experience. i.e. we can align courses as a team in departments.
- Abigail Bornstein: which college gets the credit for completion of classes?
- Jen Kienzle: it depends on the student and their "home college".
- Abigail: do we receive funding for participating in this?
- Jen Kienzle: yes, the state is trying to incentivize this. I think there will be more funding coming.
- Madeline Mueller: is this the famous 160-campus "virtual campus"? CalBright.
- Mitra confirmed it was not. It would be nice to see who is involved. Are we keeping track of the data of student success?
- Jen Kienzle: a lot of colleges who are ahead of us have been producing data that shows greater student success, especially with equity groups.
- Lou Schubert: As this moves beyond our campus, how do we reserve our rights to intellectual property? Is the state offering compensation for offering our course content? We should ask these questions moving forward.
- Jen Kienzle: this review process has been somewhat controversial because of the time it takes. People have been encouraging faculty to share their courses with other faculty. It has to be an opt-in. I can bring forth these concerns to the State.

C. [Resolution to revise option 3 for satisfying CCSF GE Area B](#) (10mins) – English Department Chair, Karen Cox

- 1-2 students per year that needs this.
- Monica Bosson moved the Resolution. Katryn Wiese seconded the motion.
- Passed by CONSENT

**Resolution 2022.12.14.7C Approval to Revise Option 3 for Satisfying CCSF GE Area B**

Resolved that the CCSF Academic Senate Executive Council approved the proposal to [Revise Option 3 for Satisfying CCSF GE Area B](#).

Adopted by consent.

D. College-wide communication (15mins) – Sheri Miraglia

- How are we communicating to our students, especially since Covid?
- There are a ton of messages in all different spaces for students: emails, texts, Canvas for Registration, Events, etc.
- Spends a lot of time reformatting messages and pdfs to make them readable to students.



- Jen Kienzle: we need to have a plan/rubric for what we are messaging and with whom?
- Landi Ehnle: bonus module in Canvas for all the things students need at the beginning of the semester. The updates to CityNotes seem good to keep students informed.
- Katryn Wiese: I'd like to go on the record as also being a "rule follower but I don't see a request to share information as a rule and don't always forward on the information. I like the idea but, like Landi, I provide a lot in Canvas modules. I make a point to not use class time to discuss things outside of class.
- Mitra Sapienza: we will bring this to Collegial Consultation.

E. [Requesting additional Minimum Qualification Discipline](#) and

F. [Resolution on General Education Area Definitions](#) – Curriculum Committee  
Chair, Craig Kleinman (15mins)

- There have been a number of courses lately where departments have wanted to have a different option for Min. Quals. besides what is currently listed by the State Chancellor's Office. The idea is that the local Academic Senate makes recommendations to the State Academic Senate for any changes.
- Craig asked if there is a specific form to fill out. Mitra said that she is awaiting information on that from the State.
- Lou Schubert asked if this is what we add in the pull-down menu when putting in a new course in CurricUNET.
- Fred Teti asked what is Area Studies?
- Craig confirmed it is a study of a region (Geography-related).
- Michele Sieglitz asked for clarification on how Min Quals are related to the decisions the administration made to not recognize different disciplines/fields within impacted departments, citing BEMA and EH as examples of departments that were forced to let go faculty in one field which were unrelated to that of the FT faculty who were let go.
- Craig said he did not know the answer to that question. Didn't follow all the logic of the decisions made by administration.
- Katryn Wiese: the layoffs were made re: FTEF, not necessarily subdivided in departments. One of the workarounds is to create individual programs within departments and have FTEF assigned to "sub-programs". We have to be recognized as having different programs. I believe that this would involve the Office of Instruction having a list of which programs would be supported within a department.
- Mitra asked what it would mean to have different programs recognized within particular departments.

- Katryn mentioned that there was lots of nuance but something ASEC should definitely be involved in.
- Abigail Bornstein: I would like to see the person who was let-go in CNIT brought in. That individual teaches in one area and we can't bring in any part-timers who teach cyber-security as a result. It's a big problem that we've taken out big chunks of the departments.
- Malcolm Hillan: our FT'ers and PT'ers suffered collateral damage with the way the layoffs were made. Same problem in Horticulture as we described.
- Michele Sieglitz asked if this list could be updated to include other programs.
- Malcolm Hillan made a Motion to move this Resolution with a caveat that this may be revised later.
- Craig mentioned that other programs could be added later on after further discussion.
- Mitra Sapienza confirmed that the Minutes of this meeting would contain the information we discussed if revisions needed to be made on the document people voted for.
- Madeline Mueller made a motion to approve the Resolution on General Education. Seconded by Lou Schubert.
- Passed by CONSENT

**Resolution 2022.12.14.7E                      Requesting additional Minimum Qualification Discipline**

Resolved that the Academic Senate Executive Council endorses the [Requesting Additional Minimum Qualification Discipline](#)

Adopted by consent.

**Resolution 2022.12.14.7F                      General Education Area Definitions**

Resolved that the Academic Senate Executive Council approves the Resolution on [General Education Area Definitions](#)

Adopted by consent.

VIII. Adjournment (5:00pm)