



The Academic Senate

CITY COLLEGE OF SAN FRANCISCO

50 Frida Kahlo Way, Box E-202, San Francisco, CA 94112 (415) 239-3611 Fax (415) 452-5115
www.ccsf.edu/academic-senate email: asenat@ccsf.edu

Curriculum • Degree Requirements • Grading Policies • Program Development • Student Prep & Success • Governance
Accreditation • Professional Development • Program Review • Planning & Budgeting Process • Others as agreed

Note: Copies of the Final Agenda, Resolutions and Materials for the November 16, 2022 meeting can be found in the [November 16 Materials folder](#).

CCSF Academic Senate Executive Council Minutes & [Sound Recording](#)

Wednesday, November 30, 2022, 2:30-5:00pm
Via Zoom

<https://ccsf-edu.zoom.us/j/98935746783>

Council Members Present: Monica Bosson, Adam d'Aquisto, Erik Christianson, Kate Frei, Wynd Kaufmyn, Sheri Miraglia, Madeline Mueller, Ronald Page II, Lisa Romano, Mitra Sapienza, Michele Sieglitz, Chad Stephenson, Frederick Teti, Katryn Wiese,

Council Members Absent: Matthew Duckworth, Lawrence Edwardson, Kimberly Keenan (Sabbatical), Thomas Kennedy (on leave from ASEC), Caroline Priestley, Nuala Sheetz (on-leave from ASEC), Tanichya Wongprasert

Other Senate Members Present: Eileen Adamian, Abigail Bornstein, Rachel Cohen, Alan D'Souza, Katia Fuchs, Simon Hanson, Barbara Lass, Alexis Litzky, Ying Liu, Katie Marquez, Leslie Simon, Elizabeth Smith.

Guests: Heather Brandt, Chancellor David Martin, Maria Salazar-Colon

I. Call to Order 2:30 (3min)

A. We acknowledge that we are on the unceded, ancestral homeland of the Ramaytush Ohlone who are the original inhabitants of the San Francisco Peninsula. As the indigenous stewards of this land and in accordance with their traditions, the Ramaytush Ohlone have never ceded, lost nor forgo Smithtten their responsibilities as the caretakers of this place, as well as for all peoples who reside in their traditional territory. As guests, we recognize that we benefit from living and working on their traditional homeland. We wish to pay our respects by acknowledging the ancestors, elders and relatives of the Ramaytush Community and by affirming their sovereign rights as First Peoples.

- Recognize your own indigenous land settlement at <https://native-land.ca>
- <https://www.ramaytush.org/donate.html>

- <https://sogoreate-landtrust.org/donate/>

II. Adoption of Agenda 2:33 (2min)

III. Public Comment 2:35 (10 min)

- **Elizabeth Smith:** heat has been restored in Batmale Hall. Did not take much time or money. It took endless and loud complaining. Disabled bathroom is still having access issues. Faculty need to advocate for their own facilities.
- **Lou Schubert:** FIRE recently had a legal victory in FL to shutdown the Stop Woke Act. This is the organization that visited us. We got an mail regarding a training for "California Preventing Workplace Harassment for Employees" due 12/30. The timing is not acceptable and I'm hoping the council can discuss this.
- **Madeline Mueller:** Yes, Elizabeth is correct- we need to complain. Concert coming up at the Library (our only performance space) at 5:30pm on Thursday 12/8. Lecture series will called "Mother Music: Tracing African Roots"
- **Kate Frei:** At the beginning of the semester we had multiple classes in ESL that reached 200 cap and no additional sections have been opened. 100s of students have been locked out. The lowest tech-savvy, highest-need students have been locked out.

IV. Reports 2:45

- Chancellor's Report: Dr. David Martin (10 min)
 - Treasure Island Museum wants to house the Diego Rivera Mural to temporarily house it there in January 2024.
 - PAEC Update: We have been spending the Fall semester getting updates for a smaller facility than what was originally planned. Almost ready for approval. Last component is funding. Costs have risen 35%. \$180 million project/\$80 million delta. We might be able to take money from other bond projects to fund this building.
 - We got notified from ACCJC that we would get placed on Enhanced Monitoring for 2021 for 3rd year in a row as an "at risk institution". Most likely there will be a hearing in January as a result. I believe our report will be very strong re: being able to maintain a viable and sustainable future.
 - Hoping to have an Interim Dean of Business & Downtown Campus, Permanent Dean of Student Engagement and Wellness, Permanent Dean of Mission Campus and Permanent Dean of English & Communication.

- VC Ly's position will also be filled on an interim basis while he serves as Interim Vice Chancellor.
 - Permanent Dean of Student Engagement & Wellness has been vacant since the previous Dean submitted their resignation.
 - We will have a CCSF Construction Management update on our website so people can see the progress of various projects around the college.
 - We did hear back from the DSA that our Student Success Center has been approved for construction of building.
 - Chad Stephenson: when will the current information re: Covid guidelines be available.
 - David Martin: Friday Forum will be the first time we will talk about this. Friday 12/3. It will be recorded and posted for people to see it. The Health & Safety Committee has been having preliminary conversations about masking requirements.
 - Abigail Bornstein: will the January meeting with ACCJC be open to the public?
 - David Martin: It will be up to the committee to decide whether or not it will be open to the public.
 - Simon Hansen: I have a public request. I hope you will take into consideration that any presentation in front of the ACCJC should have the Chancellor and the President of the Academic Senate be present. This was very compelling the last time we met with ACCJC because it showed a unified presence.
- Officers Reports (15 min)
 - [President's report](#)
 - HR has asked us to send two faculty volunteers to Sr. Dir. of Budget and Accounting and Sr. Dir. of Admin Services hiring committees.
 - Hayward Award and Stanback Stroud awards are open!
 - Faculty Hiring Document is being revised.
 - Faculty Training expectation is untenable to be completed by 12/30 so we are discussing this now.
 - Collegial Consultation: Cantonese Certificate concerns.
 - Batmale Hall is now warm. We had this on our CC meeting agenda 8X this semester. Things are happening behind the scenes even though it doesn't always appear this way.
 - Program Review update. SESC to rank requests.

- Six (6) Faculty Coordinator positions will be open for Spring 2023.

Vice-President Sheri Miraglia

- Attended Webinar on Teleconferencing and Brown Act. Update on the different acts we are currently operating under. Governor has indicated that the State of Emergency will be lifted in February 2023.
 - Teleconferencing is possible with new Brown Act
 - Public Accessibility-ADA Compliance is necessary
 - New Rules apply starting in January 2023 after Governor gets rid of State of Emergency
 - Details broken down below:
 - **Teleconferencing and the Brown Act presentatio...**
 - Michele Sieglitz asked for clarification re: how many meetings could be missed for "Just Cause". Sheri responded that it would be 20% of the meetings not more than or 3 months.
- ~~AFT2121 check in report (5 min)~~
 - Associated Students report (10 min) – Student Chancellor Heather Brandt
 - Apologized for missing last ASEC meeting because of serving on a hiring committee for Dean of Student Engagement & Wellness.
 - Student Parents United and Family Resource Center are going to have a Holiday Gathering, 'Hope for the Holidays'. Will send on information to Mitra.
 - Recently served on Panel with students hosted by CA Student Aid Commission. Food, Housing, Transportation. Student Council is currently working on a Resolution on Transit as well as a Resolution on John Adams class cancellations.
 - Committee on Committees report (5 min) – Sheri Miraglia
 - Legislative Liaison Report (10mins) – Alexis Litzky & Katia Fuchs
 - **CCSF ASEC Leg & Advocacy liaison updates - AY 2022-23**
 - Review of State Academic Senate relationship to local CCSF Academic Senate

- Katia and Alexis are Legislative Co-Liaisons with ASCCC and can help figure out advocacy and funding for things that are on the horizon and facilitate between local and state senate.
- Lots of new legislation at the State level will be rolled out soon which we will continue to monitor.
- Link to future Plenary Breakout sessions for those interested: <https://www.asccc.org/directory/legislative-and-advocacy-committee>
- Madeline talked about how important this Legislative Liaison role is because increasingly the state is controlling all community colleges.
- Mitra Sapienza stated that ASEC can specifically task the Co-Liaisons to address things at the state level.

V. Consent Agenda 3:35 (5 min)

A. Approval of Minutes from [November 16, 2022](#)

Resolution 2022.11.30.5A **Approval of Minutes: November 16, 2022**

Resolved, that the Executive Council approved the Minutes for [November 16, 2022](#).

Adopted by consent.

B. [Program Review Committee description](#) / [Tracked changes](#)

C. Approval of Committee Appointments

Resolution 2022.11.30.5C **Appointments to Committees, Task Forces, Work Groups**

Nominations to Committees with Unlimited Membership

TLTR (Teaching and Learning with Technology Roundtable)

Alexandria Leyton (English) - reappointment

Nominations to Committees with Limited Membership

DEA Subcommittee

Andrea Niosi (Library) - reappointment

Matriculation Advisory Committee

Katie Marquez (EOPS Counseling) - reappointment

Student Equity Strategies

Lily-Ann Villaraza (Philippine Studies, Social Science, IDST Studies) - reappointment

Curriculum Committee

Lily-Ann Villaraza (Philippine Studies, Social Science, IDST Studies) - reappointment

Nominations to AS Workgroups / Task Forces District-Level Committees and Task Forces/Workgroup

PGC Technology Committee

Sean Kim (English) - new appointment

Adopted by consent.

VI. Old Business 3:40

A. [DRAFT Resolution on Flexibility of Modalities for Full-Time Faculty to Fulfill Their Teaching and Professional Obligations](#) – (10mins) – second read

- Chad Stephenson: mentioned the need to acknowledge his roles as both ASEC council member and Department Chair. Library Faculty as unique and will abstain from voting.. Librarians serve in multiple modalities. I want to make sure we are all speaking the same language. “Autonomy” is not quite the same as for instructional faculty.
- Alan d’Souza: Classroom faculty have designated time to teach classes and the autonomy to do preparation and grading wherever. Library faculty don’t have the autonomy or liberty of where we do our work that is non-teaching.
- Lisa Romano: mentioned she appreciated Chad’s point of view. Has concerns about the resolution. Will abstain because of the current grievance in her department about scheduling.
- Chad Stephenson: how does this fit into 10+1? Essentially, I’m in two roles in ASEC--as a member, and as a dept chair--and the resolution touches on both groups.
- Jesse Kolber: asked for clarification about what the resolution is proposing regarding percentage of in-person vs. not in-person. What are the power dynamics of faculty being scheduled by their Chairs and Deans?
- Mitra Sapienza gave some backstory about the 2018 Resolution, pre-covid. Is this draft worthy of continuous revision. Put link to old resolution in chat.
- Madeline Mueller: there is a situation about a grievance that is related to these issues. Would like to revisit the Resolution when we have more facts about the grievance.
- Sheri Miraglia: Chad hit the nail on the head. There is too much in the resolution that is out of 10+1. These are more DCC and potentially Union issues.
- Mitra Sapienza: one of the concerns was that there were some administrators that were quoting the original ASEC Reso as a guide. The

spirit of the resolution was to offer support for each of the groups that were impacted.

- Lou Schubert: there is insufficient data to support a resolution at this point. We need to have a better idea what is needed based on student demand.
- Alan d'Souza: recommended we file a motion to table to time certain.
- Jesse Kolber: wants to affirm our contract and faculty rights that are already in place with whatever decision is made about the Resolution..
- Chad Stephenson: talked about the learning moment. We are hearing from faculty who either not on the senate or on a committee and they need help articulating the language to help those people.
- Michele Sieglitz asked if we can conceivably determine if we can schedule a new read when a current grievance is up in the air.
- Mitra, Lisa, Madeline, Fred all said let's schedule to February "if possible."
- Motion to table to February 8, 2023.

B. [Resolution on ESL Course offerings at John Adams Campus for Spring 2023](#)
(10mins) – second read

- Kate Frei: there was no real dialogue about the decision to move classes from JAD to Mission and that's what the real point of the frustration is about.
- Sheri Miraglia: clarified why she is opposed to this item because it is a right of the Deans not the ASEC. Not a 10+1 issue. We need to support the efforts of the Admin in trying to grow the college. Deans have right of assignment.
- Chad Stephenson: doesn't share the same opinion as Sheri. Students, Faculty and the Department Chair do not agree with the decision that was made. It's an area of concern that ASEC provides a check. What data was used to make the decision that was made? I think there was a foul here. Without consultation, we don't have all the answers.
- Madeline Mueller: this has to do with Student Success. No, the deans do not schedule. We are unique at CCSF at having a DCC Council. The chairs make the decision but it is done through consultation. The administration has the ability to make arbitrary decisions. We need to remind the administration that they do not have absolute authority.
- Abigail Bornstein: confused about the actual goals of the resolution. They seem very broad. Do we need to broaden the Whereas? I don't understand the last Whereas... most of our programs are on one campus not in specific neighborhoods?
- Kate Frei: in responding to Abigail's question, we wanted to point out a very specific issue and create a resolution that is more broad for faculty

moving forward. There was no consultation. There was no data whatsoever provided by the Dean for the rationale.

- Chad Stephenson: is this time sensitive, i.e. are we voting on this to create an impact on Spring schedule?
- Kate Frei answered that this was the original intent.
- Lou Schubert: now is the time. I'd like to offer a friendly amendment to change the resolves to something more specific saying that ASEC would like the administration to keep ESL courses at JAD.
- Abigail Bornstein: where, by stating that, that we just got additional FTEF. Schedule is already out and students are already enrolling. Are we going to pull those classes from Mission? I think we're getting to something on the scheduling side that I don't think ASEC should be making these decisions.
- Chad Stephenson: you hit it on the head, Abigail. People made decisions without asking and that's why we're asking to address this from the Senate.
- Lou Schubert: Is there an equity problem if we don't offer these classes at other campuses?
- Monica Bosson seconded the Motion added by Lou.
- Fred Teti: we need a vote on the amendment and then go back to the main motion.
- Roll call vote on Amendments: 12 Nays; 4 Abstains
- Motion Passes with 8 Ayes; 3 Abstain; 5 Nays
- Mitra said that because the motion passes, due to Title 5 it will require that the Administration respond in writing.

Resolution 2022.11.30.6B
Spring 2023

ESL Course offerings at John Adams Campus for

Resolved, that the Executive Council approved the [Resolution on ESL Course offerings at John Adams Campus for Spring 2023](#)

AYES (8): Kate Frei, Wynd Kaufmyn, Jesse Kolber, Madeline Mueller, Lou Schubert, Michele Sieglitz, Chad Stephenson, Fred Teti

NAYS (5): Adam d'Aquisto, Erik Christianson, Malcolm Hillan, Sheri Miraglia, Lisa Romano

ABSTAIN (3): Monica Bosson, Ronald Page, Katryn Wiese

VII. New Business (4:00)

A. Distance Learning Advisory Committee update (15mins) – Katryn Wiese

1. Resolution: DLAC Recommendation of all Spring 2023 online training applications

2. Resolution: Inventory of Online-Trained Faculty
 3. Resolution: Summer and Fall 2023 Rubric for IOTL and AOTL Online Training Applications.
 4. Scoring Rubric for Applications for Summer and Fall 2023 Trainings
 - a) [Link to DLAC resolutions in full](#)
- Lou Schubert asked to Move Resolutions.
 - Katryn clarified that they have already passed- no need to pass Resos.
 - The document needs to be revised for next meeting because one is missing.
 - Clarification that Resolution passed.

B. Student Conduct (15 mins) – Maria Salazar Colon

- <https://prezi.com/p/xrzwi6jww1bb/ccsf-student-conduct-discipline-due-process/>
- We do not have a Dean of Students. It is now Office of Student Conduct & Discipline.
- We are working on electronic-only versions of student conduct violations.
- We have over 32 Student Codes of Conduct: Distressing, Disruptive, Dangerous
- There was a recent incident where a student put the entire college in danger. What is the best way to get the information out without violating that student's rights?
- Michele Sieglitz: asked if there has been a concerted effort on the part of administration to deal with student conduct in a more holistic manner, specifically addressing mental health concerns which have often been addressed by penalizing students rather than addressing much deeper mental health challenges. Put out an appeal to deal with student holistically.
- Maria Salazar-Colon said that this was a goal when Dean Lystrup was here. It barely got off the ground and that she will start that conversation with the new Dean of Student Wellness and Engagement by showing cases that really need that kind of help..
- Adam d'Aquisto asked for clarification about allowing a student back into class after two class periods.
- MSC answered by saying that if you have to remove a student because of a code violation then you can remove them for up to two classes and then immediately file a Maxiam report. They may be suspended or removed from a program.
- Heather Brandt: I was wondering if a training opportunity would also extend to elected student leaders.

- MSC asked for clarification on what and explained that the training would be for instructors; for specific employees.
- Heather Brandt asked for where to find process information and MSC said it was on the website. She also asked if the information was in other languages besides English?
- MSC answered that interpreters are available for a hearing and explained that students can also bring an advocate (not a lawyer) to a hearing. Everything is done virtually.
- Mitra Sapienza mentioned that Non-violent Communication documents were created by some faculty in Behavioral Sciences which may also be helpful.
- MSC mentioned that Integrity Workshops were created specifically to deal with students who had plagiarism issues during Covid.

C. Works of Art committee report (10mins) — Barbara Lass, Leslie Simon, and Eileen Adamian

- Barbara Lass: Chair of Works of Art Committee
- Intro of Tour of Art Map on CCSF Website.
<https://www.ccsf.edu/campus-life/tour-art-map>
- Working on Parking Permit with one of our pieces of art on it. Chancellor will decide between 3 selected art pieces.
- Eileen Adamian: just joined the committee. Is an amateur photographer who uses art in her ESL classes. She is going to be photographing all of our works of art and creating a social media page on Instagram.
- Leslie Simon: In speaking about the Diego Rivera Mural, there will be some contention. We should all be part of this dialogue. We look at large and small, global and local. Our committee is a space for peacefulness. Please join us.
- Barbara Lass brought up the whales sculpture which is supposed to be installed in front of the new Student Success Center.
- CCSF is really unique in how many priceless works of art we have on our various campuses.

D. BP and AP on Articulation, [CCSF AP 4050 Draft.docx](#) and [CCSF BP 4050 Draft.docx](#) (10mins) – Rachel Cohen (Tabled to 12/14 meeting)

VIII. Adjournment (5:00pm)