# The Academic Senate

## CITY COLLEGE OF SAN FRANCISCO

**50 Frida Kahlo Way, Box E-202, San Francisco, CA 94112 (415) 239-3611 Fax (415) 452-5115**
**www.ccsf.edu.edu/academic-senate email: asenate@ccsf.edu**

Curriculum• Degree Requirements• Grading Policies• Program Development• Student Prep & Success• Governance
Accreditation• Professional Development• Program Review• Planning & Budgeting Process• Others as agreed

**CCSF Academic Senate Executive Council**
**Agenda & Sound Recording**
Wednesday, November 16, 2022, 2:30-5:00pm
Via Zoom
https://ccsf-edu.zoom.us/j/98935746783

**Council Members Present:** Monica Bosson, Adam d'Aquisto, Matthew Duckworth, Lawrence Edwardson, Kate Frei, Wynd Kaufmyn, Sheri Miraglia, Madeline Mueller, Ronald Page II, Caroline Priestley, Lisa Romano, Mitra Sapienza, Michele Sieglitz, Chad Stephenson, Frederick Teti, Katryn Wiese, Tanichya Wongprasert

**Council Members Absent:** Erik Christianson, Kimberly Keenan (Sabbatical), Thomas Kennedy (on leave from ASEC), Nuala Sheetz (on-leave from ASEC)

**Other Senate Members Present:** Harry Bernstein, Abigail Bornstein, Mary Bravewoman, Alan D'Souza, Simon Hanson, Andrew King, Fanny Law, Alex Leyton, Ying Liu, Katie Marquez, Elizabeth Smith, Christina Yanuaria.

**Guests:** Heather Brandt, Chancellor David Martin, Andrea Niosi, Janey Skinner, Cherisa Yarkin

I. Call to Order 2:30 (3min)
   A. We acknowledge that we are on the unceded, ancestral homeland of the Ramaytush Ohlone who are the original inhabitants of the San Francisco Peninsula. As the indigenous stewards of this land and in accordance with their traditions, the Ramaytush Ohlone have never ceded, lost nor forgotten their responsibilities as the caretakers of this place, as well as for all peoples who reside in their traditional territory. As guests, we recognize that we benefit from living and working on their traditional homeland. We wish to pay our respects by acknowledging the ancestors, elders and relatives of the Ramaytush Community and by affirming their sovereign rights as First Peoples.
      - Recognize your own indigenous land settlement at https://native-land.ca
      - https://www.ramaytush.org/donate.html

- https://sogoreate-landtrust.org/donate/

II. Adoption of Agenda 2:31 (2min)

III. Public Comment 2:35 (10 min)

- **Madeline Mueller:** Scott Joplin's Birthday Celebration: Tuesday 12pm, 11/22. Live Ragtime Music in Person!! Creative Arts Bldg, Rm. 133 (yellow doors)
- **Matt Duckworth**: Still below 60 degrees in Batmale Hall. It's a systemic problem. The ceramic heaters are not enough to heat the buildings. It's a solution that doesn't work. Failure of critical thinking.
- **Katryn Wiese**: Radiator was working in my office this morning. There is hope! Mold issue is still not resolved. It's a stressful thing. State of Emergency with Facilities.
- **Elizabeth Smith**: Batmale is in the 50s when I come to work. Classrooms are never warm enough to remove jackets. Student illnesses are partly related to these conditions. Students often leave early because it's too cold to stay in class. The administration failed in their duty to prepare for the new semester and any discussion of equity on this campus is a moot point when students are too cold to learn. Just this morning, Rutgers University canceled classes when they lost heat. It was 2-degrees warmer than our temp at CCSF.
- **Fred Teti**: The Education Policies Committee met on Monday. We continue to review the Chapter 6 Board policies and administrative procedures but we took no actions. We endorsed a recent Curriculum Committee resolution proposing a change in the Area B General Education Catalog language. We also received a report from A&R about Title 5 changes affecting the Pass/No-Pass deadline and College requirements when issuing the EW symbol. Anyone with questions, contact Fred.
- **Mitra Sapienza:** Please consider joining more than 10 Nobel laureates, and hundreds of National Academy members and university executives by signing the following open letter (by academicians) to President Biden urging him to take action to support university students and faculty in Iran who are under brutal suppression these days. As I am sure you believe, an attack on the freedom of one university community is an attack on the freedom of all. https://www.ipetitions.com/petition/letter-to-president-biden-urging-support-for This letter with more than 2000 signatures was submitted on November 1st. However, we are striving for even a stronger voice from academia. If you decide to sign, please also consider sharing with other academic colleagues.

IV. Reports 2:45

- Chancellor's Report: Dr. David Martin (10 min)
    - Diego Rivera Theatre: in process of finalizing cost estimate for PEAC.
    - City partnerships: Free City Oversight Committee met and approved reserve funds for clearing outstanding student debt. Next step is to take it to mayor's office for authorization and approval.
    - Outreach efforts to CCSF: City and County officials and organizations have been reaching out to discuss Mission campus to potentially house some unified school district middle school classes during renovations and facility repairs for a short time. Complicated when talking about shared spaces for K-12 and college/open-access spaces.
    - Public Defender's Office: starting a program for individuals who are being detained for misdemeanor offenses. Length of time is typically 24-48 hours. How can we potentially get CCSF information in front of these individuals while they are going through processing?
    - 750 Eddy St. (Civic Center) location. SF City is exploring spaces for supervised drug use. Very complicated discussion when considering this as a space to offer classes as well.
    - Chad Stephenson: asked about status update of Civic Center location. That facility did have a bond measure attached to it for rebuild.
    - Chancellor: we do have funding available and have full intent to renovate and use it in the future. When and if we get to construction next semester will be our next decision point. By no means are we diverting from the plan of a full renovation and full operation of this center in the future.
    - Simon Hanson: What are the higher order principles that are guiding these partnerships with the city? Who do we think we are as CCSF to determine if these partnerships are aligned with our Mission Statement.
    - Chancellor: Once we know more about the vision from the city, we will have more details needed to have that discussion. They might lead to connection with existing city services to our educational and certificate programs. We want to define how our mission is being enhanced will be

considered.
    - Katryn Wiese: thanked the Chancellor for email about state of facilities. There are still heat issues in Batmale Hall. Are there resources, given that this seems like an emergency situation.
    - Chancellor: Declaration of Emergency allows college to bypass public bidding process, contact 1-2 vendors, get a formal quote and start construction in the next week or so. Anything in excess of 200K, we usually have to go through a formal, lengthy application process. In emergency we can bypass this process. That is what we're working on right now. Funding from ongoing allocation for repairs available.
    - Fanny Law: who will be making the decision for how the Eddy Street building will be used for drug use? Will constituency groups have an opportunity to provide feedback.
    - Chancellor: It's a very complicated discussion that will impact many stakeholders and we will have broad campus input. We are at the point of just scheduling a meeting to see what the city has in mind.

- Officers Reports (15 min)
    - President's report
    - Review of Plenary Resolutions that were passed or failed. 38 adopted; 3 referred back to state; 1 withdrawn; 2 failed.
    - CCSF DEI Resolution was passed by Acclimation after amendment.
    - Several Coordinator positions were also discussed at Plenary: Equitable Placement & Student Success, OER Faculty Coordinator, IDEAA Liaison
    - Exemplary Award Nomination
    - Hayward Award: submit your nominations
    - Motorcycle Maintenance has 2 classes on schedule for Spring
    - Credit for Prior Learning Task Force has met twice. Megan Corry will have a temp assign position to coordinate CPL.
    - Facilities is an ongoing discussion that is not going as quickly as we like but we are continuing to discuss in Collegial Consultation.
    - 64% in person/28% online/8% remote Spring 2023 Schedule
    - **1st VP, Sheri Miraglia**
    - I continue to support all of our committees and look for chairs for committees that don't have them.

    - ISER is in very good shape and plan to send to ACCJC on December 15th.
    - **2nd VP, Lou Schubert:** ABSENT
    - **Secretary, Michele Sieglitz:** Please update me with absences and tardiness in advance of meeting if possible.

- AFT2121 check in report (5 min)
    - DA Meeting next Tuesday 11/22 at noon.
    - Now that election has come to a close, we are now into bargaining. Please participate in bargaining survey. PT Healthcare, new policy signed by Governor. Potentially a win-win for all. We could get reimbursed 100% for Healthcare costs for PT'ers.
    - Holding listening sessions and looking for input moving forward.
    - Thank you for everyone who participated in the elections.
    - Had over 500 students who came out to participate in the BOT elections. Rejection of the incumbents on our board influenced rejection of Prop 0 so we didn't get the revenue we were hoping for to experience some growth.
    - Hoping that with incoming, student-centered leadership change that this will be positive moving forward.

- Associated Students report (10 min) NO SHOW
- Committee on Committees report (5 min)
- EFF workgroup report (10 min)
    - We spent a year trying to figure out how to reformat EFF, Moderation, who the list is serving, different platforms, etc. We have decided to keep with EFF due to no activity with the new prototype we created on Canvas. No one participated. Also, OLET expressed concern about use of Canvas for this purpose. We have spent a lot of time on this and it doesn't seem like anyone felt it was important enough to change EFF.

V. Consent Agenda 3:40 (5 min)

A. Approval of Minutes from November 2, 2022

| **Resolution 2022.11.16.5A** **Approval of Minutes: November 2, 2022** |
|---|
| Resolved, that the Executive Council approved the Minutes for November 2, 2022. |
| Adopted by consent. |

B. Institutional Planning, Administrative Procedure (AP) 2.18 for endorsement – Board Policy BP 2.18 for reference

**Resolution 2022.11.16.5B** **Endorsement of the Institutional Planning, Administrative Procedure (AP) 2.18**

Resolved that the Academic Senate Executive Council endorses the Institutional Planning, Administrative Procedure (AP) 2.18

Adopted by Consent

C. Approval of Committee Appointments

**Resolution 2022.11.16.5C** **Appointments to Committees, Task Forces, Work Groups**

**Nominations to Committees with Unlimited Membership**

**CTE Steering Committee**
Carin Zimmerman (Engineering and Technology) - reappointment
**SLO Committee**
Ethan Valle (LVN) - new appointment
**TLTR (Teaching and Learning with Technology Roundtable)**
Dayamudra Dennehy (ESL & OLET) - reappointment
**Scholarship Committee**
Jose Del Toro Vasquez (World Languages) - reappointment
Bruce Leung (Business) - reappointment
**Works of Art Committee**
Tulin Good (ESL) - reappointment
Stephanie Levin (ESL) - reappointment
**Sustainability**
Hitesh Soneji (Engineering and Technology) - reappointment

**Nominations to Committees with Limited Membership**

**International Advisory Committee**
Anna-Lisa Helmy (ESL) - new appointment

**Nominations to AS Workgroups / Task Forces District-Level Committees and Task Forces/Workgroup**

**PGC Enrollment Management**
Mitra Sapienza (English, Equity Coordinator, AS President) - new appointment.

Adopted by consent.

VI. Old Business – no items

VII. New Business (3:50)

A. ASEC to sponsor Trans Week of Resilience & Action (5mins) – Ardel Thomas presents; zoom poll vote

- It is not a done deal on the flyer unless it passes.
- November 20th is Transgender Day of Remembrance.
- Murder rates, specifically for black women are very high.
- Tue 11/29 6-8pm, MUB 140
- Mitra Sapienza: What does it mean to sponsor the event?
- Michele Sieglitz: asked for clarification if the sponsorship is for a singular event. Ardel answered affirmatively.
- 14 to 2 In Favor to approve the Resolution.

| **Resolution 2022.11.16.7A** **ASEC to Sponsor Trans Week of Resilience & Action** |
|---|
| Resolved that the CCSF Academic Senate Council agrees to Sponsor Trans Week of Resilience & Action<br><br>12 Ayes<br>2 Nays |

B. Resolution on the Endorsement of the Draft Board Policy and Administrative Procedure entitled "Philosophy and Criteria for Degrees and General Education" (10mins) – Fred Teti, Ed Policies committee chair presents first read

- ACCJC Recommends that the district reviews board policies since it hasn't been updated since the 90s.
- Education Policies have been designated to look at Chapter 6, regarding Academic Instruction.
- The league representing administrators and trustees say we have to have a policy on General Education.
- If the Curriculum Committee creates this then any revisions are in the hands of the faculty.
- Approved unanimously a couple of weeks ago at Education Policies.
- Katryn Wiese: has this been passed by the Curriculum Committee. I want to make sure that this is consistent with the accreditation steering committee. My suggestion is to get the eyes of Sheri and Kristin on the Resolution before passing it. Has the accreditation committee seen the resolution?
- Fred Teti: Craig was one of the first people to read it. Not sure if there is official approval from CC.

- Sheri Miraglia: I didn't see anything looking through it that would preclude it from accreditation.
- Fred suggested that we could approve it and then have it come back to ASEC if we need any changes after PGC looks at it.
- Katryn moved to vote on the Resolution so long as Kristin Charles looks it over before it goes to PGC.
- Loren Edwardson seconded the motion.
- Chad Stephenson wanted to make sure that Office of Articulation was involved and then Fred said Rachel Cohen had been consulted.
- PASSED BY CONSENT

**Resolution 2022.11.16.7B Endorsement of the Draft Board Policy and Administrative Procedure entitled "Philosophy and Criteria for Degrees and General Education"**

Resolved that the Academic Senate Executive Council endorses the Draft Board Policy and Administrative Procedure entitled "Philosophy and Criteria for Degrees and General Education"

Adopted by Consent

C. Resolution on Allowing Certain Courses to be Scheduled as Hybrid (10mins)– Fred Teti, Education Policies committee chair presents first read
   - Has been endorsed by Curriculum Committee
   - Some chairs when transitioning back to campus would like to schedule hybrid sections.
   - Proposal that course has to have fully online DEA and partially-online DEA in review..
   - Michele Sieglitz: Does Admin have to be consulted in order to make such a decision since they just came up with percentage of how classes are going to be offered?
   - Fred Teti:
   - Katryn Wiese: would allow more in person courses. If offerings are over 50% online then a specific process has to happen. Check recording. I fully support it.
   - Ying Liu: Is there a away to make sure DEA is implemented by Department Chairs before the class is offered as hybrid?
   - Alex Leyton: There needs to be a clarification of what hybrid means. At SFState, there has to be a very strict percentage of ratio of in-person to online.
   - Fred Teti: It is written in Curriculum Committee somewhere.

- Jib Wongprasert: currently teaching Public Speaking online. If we had hybrid, we could offer face-to-face in presentations and online with theory.
- Alex Leyton: strongly advocated for this Reso to meet student needs and schedules.
- Katryn Wiese: Moved. Sheri: Seconded.
- PASSED BY CONSENT

| **Resolution 2022.11.16.7C** | **Allowing Certain Courses to be Scheduled as Hybrid** |
|---|---|
| Resolved, that the CCSF Academic Senate recommend to the College that the Office of Instruction/Scheduling Office allow courses that, at the time of bridging, have active FO DEAs and in-review PO DEAs to be scheduled as hybrid.<br><br>Adopted by Consent | |

D. Academic Senate Executive Council meetings for Spring 2023 and Assembly Bill 2449 (15mins)-- discussion and potential action on DRAFT Resolution on the Modality of CCSF Academic Senate Executive Council Meeting

- New Bill was passed by Gov that means that all meetings under Board Act have to meet in person starting Jan.'23.
- Michele Sieglitz: The bill seems very restrictive re: only 2 absences from in-person, i.e. for persons with disabilities.
- Fred Teti:
- Chad Stephenson: will we be the first group to do this? Is MUB 140 the best room for this?
- Mitra Sapienza: BOT had it's first hybrid meeting last week. Yes, MUB is the designated space.
- Chad: we need to consult with BEMA.
- NEAT BOARD: large tv on wheels with camera. Hosts Zoom interface.
- Katryn Wiese: I already have a schedule built and have a class immediately after ASEC that I won't be able to get to in person.
- Madeline Mueller: the purpose of the Brown Act is to have a group of elected officials that will be coming to our meeting. We need to be more clear on how ASEC is defined by Brown Act.
- Fred Teti: defined the Senate as a whole as not defined by the Brown Act. Share skepticism about the logic behind calling ASEC a Brown Act body.
- Mitra Sapienza: let's continue to discuss and revise. Not regulate for the Spring but give us another semester for the transition.
- Madeline Mueller: did the State Senate have a Resolution about this, discussed at Plenary? Mitra will check.

- Katryn Wiese: having been on ASEC for awhile, it feels like the way we interact on Zoom is much more interactive than in person.
- Mitra Sapienza: Wants to bring it back, December 14th meeting.

E. Discussion of SLO Assessment - current practices and possible changes (15mins) – SLO Coordinators, Janey Skinner and Andrea Niosi presenting for discussion
ASEC Meta Discussion November 16
    - Meta-assessment from last Spring after a dozen or so conversations with different constituent groups.
    - Used 2019 assessment data to begin with; will try to make some changes by next Spring or Fall.
    - Most faculty value dialogue and collaborative assessments.
    - Should we assess ALL SLOs in a year then take time off to develop and implement change?
    - What would happen if we spent more time on our programs directly?
    - Learning Committee? Building in better learning outcomes.
    - Possible group assessment sharing for Flex Day? Learning Community on Equity?
    - Michele Sieglitz: asked what happens to the data re: what technology or other improvements in the classroom could benefit SLOs.
    - Janey Skinner said that this information goes to Chairs and then into a larger database but some of that information may be getting lost.
    - Katryn Wiese followed up by saying that the way it was originally built was that the report was not intended to be a communication with the Chair but that we wanted to document evidence for Program Review.
    - Ying Liu asked about using Canvas' Outcome Tool. Janey responded by saying that Canvas, although good for individual faculty, is not good for assessing SLOs.
    - Janey asked about the idea of doing broader SLO assessments, less frequently.
    - Michele responded by saying that post-Covid, it might be wiser to assess more frequently until things get back to "normal".

F. DRAFT Resolution on Flexibility of Modalities for Full-Time Faculty to Fulfill Their Teaching and Professional Obligations – (10mins) – first read, potential action
    - Mitra suggested we move this to next meeting 11/30 to have more dialogue.

G. Resolution on ESL Course offerings at John Adams Campus for Spring 2023 (10mins) – ESL Faculty and Executive Council member, Kate Frei presents for first read, potential action

- DRAFT Resolution on ESL Course offerings at John Adams Campus …
- How can we use our scarce resources to serve our students best
- Admin made a unilateral change, disregarding faculty and student input
- Concerned that Admin is not following proper procedure.
- Michele Sieglitz: Has AFT gotten involved in this? Have the students been instrumental in speaking out?
- Kate Frei: Yes, the students have met and created a petition. Not sure about AFT.
- Sheri Miraglia: Against this proposal because we need to allow Deans and Chairs to make decisions. Not the Senate's purview to pass this resolution. Because the college has many hurdles going on, we have to prioritize and support the administration.
- Madeline Mueller: Deans don't really make the schedules; its a dance between the Chair and Dean. The timing is what concerns me here. Recalling the Midnight Massacre, we still problems from 3 years ago.
- Loren Edwardson: We've lost Civic Center, Southeast Center, Ft. Mason… our ESL community is losing access to classes. Very difficult for those who need language services to get them at the moment.
- Chad Stephenson: Both Loren and Madeline speak my mind. Having taught at JAD for almost 4 years, we continue to see reductions at the last minute. NC is getting picked on. We need to broaden our borders beyond Ocean Campus.
- Kate Frei: agrees that there are many important thinhs going on at the college that need attention, but we wanted to raise awareness of what is happening in ESL since the administration didn't follow proper protocol.
- Katryn Wiese expressed concern about not having enough time to consider this proposal and would not feel comfortable voting on this.
- Michele Sieglitz asked for clarification on time sensitivity of issue.
- Fanny Law mentioned that the administration did not engage with ESL department before making decision to move classes.
- Mitra Sapienza asked if there was time sensitivity to taking action. Fanny replied "no".
- Chad Stephenson asked about the Motorcycle Maintenance courses and whether or not that issue set a precedent. Mitra said the issue was not synonymous.
- Motion to bring this back to next meeting, November 30th.
- Michele Sieglitz mentioned that when looking at the big picture and what the college administration was planning for our various campuses, that

she would would much rather see our campuses being used to teach classes than be designated for drug use.

- Mitra Sapienza stated that it was important to respect nuance and not see it (the proposal the Chancellor made) as simply "using drugs" and that we would bring this back for discussion after Officer Consultation.

VIII. Adjournment (5:00pm)