



# The Academic Senate

## CITY COLLEGE OF SAN FRANCISCO

50 Frida Kahlo Way, Box E-202, San Francisco, CA 94112 (415) 239-3611 Fax (415) 452-5115  
[www.ccsf.edu.edu/academic-senate](http://www.ccsf.edu.edu/academic-senate) email: [asenate@ccsf.edu](mailto:asenate@ccsf.edu)

Curriculum • Degree Requirements • Grading Policies • Program Development • Student Prep & Success • Governance  
Accreditation • Professional Development • Program Review • Planning & Budgeting Process • Others as agreed

Note: Copies of the Final Agenda, Resolutions and Materials for the September 7, 2022 meeting can be found in the [October 19 Materials folder](#).

### CCSF Academic Senate Executive Minutes & [Sound Recording](#)

Wednesday, November 2, 2022, 2:30-5:00pm

Via Zoom

<https://ccsf-edu.zoom.us/j/98935746783>

**Council Members Present:** Monica Bosson, Erik Christianson, Matthew Duckworth, Lawrence Edwardson, Wynd Kaufmyn, Sheri Miraglia, Madeline Mueller, Ronald Page II, Caroline Priestley, Lisa Romano, Mitra Sapienza, Lou Schubert, Michele Sieglitz, Chad Stephenson, Frederick Teti, Katryn Wiese, Tanichya Wongprasert

**Council Members Absent:** Adam d'Aquisto, Kate Frei, J. Malcolm Hillan, Jesse Kolber, Kimberly Keenan (Sabbatical), Thomas Kennedy (on leave from ASEC), Nuala Sheetz (on-leave from ASEC)

**Other Senate Members Present:** Harry Bernstein, Abigail Bornstein, Rachel Cohen, Simon Hanson, Andrew King, Craig Kleinman, Ying Liu, Katie Marquez, Elizabeth Smith, Christina Yanuaria, Julie Ososke, Jane Ernstthal

**Guests:** Heather Brandt, Rachel Cohen Geisce Ly, Chancellor David Martin, Pam Mery, Rachel Peralta, Michael Snider

#### I. Call to Order 2:30 (3min)

A. We acknowledge that we are on the unceded, ancestral homeland of the Ramaytush Ohlone who are the original inhabitants of the San Francisco Peninsula. As the indigenous stewards of this land and in accordance with their traditions, the Ramaytush Ohlone have never ceded, lost nor forgotten their responsibilities as the caretakers of this place, as well as for all peoples who reside in their traditional territory. As guests, we recognize that we benefit from living and working on their traditional homeland. We wish to pay our respects by acknowledging the ancestors, elders and relatives of the Ramaytush Community and by affirming their sovereign rights as First Peoples.

- Recognize your own indigenous land settlement at <https://native-land.ca>
- <https://www.ramaytush.org/donate.html>
- <https://sogoreate-landtrust.org/donate/>

II. Adoption of Agenda 2:31 (2min)

III. Public Comment 2:35 (10 min)

- **Madeline Mueller:** has been looking up information about student debt. There is a block on certain states that don't want student loan forgiveness. Send any info to Madeline if you find anything. African-American young women are most apt to go into lifelong debt.
- **Matthew Duckworth:** Re: HVAC in Batmale Hall. There is also a mold problem in Batmale. What might be happening in the air ducts? My message is to Administration: about the oversight, budgeting and tangible progress.
- **Elizabeth Smith:** Batmale Hall was 58 degrees this morning. The boiler for B&G stated that the boiler was not on the priority list because the renovation for Batmale did not go through in June. Nobody thought to put this on the list. Please hold administration accountable for things like heat and buildings.
- **Andy Saunders:** Mitra read an email from Andy Saunders about the state of the Motorcycle Program. "Thank you for keeping Moto program. 5 students have graduated with AS degree in Moto Technology, 37 certificates. Employment after just completing intro courses. Moto 90 Intro class was canceled with a full enrollment in Fall and has prevented students from going through the program."
- **Harry Bernstein:** Andy was hired in 2007. Moto classes were canceled last minute because of "no instructor on record". Now two classes are listed in the schedule. No instructor is mentioned. What is to prevent these classes from being canceled. What is the legitimacy of such instructions to have STAFF listed? ASEC should make sure classes run.

Reports 2:45

- **Chancellor's Report: Dr. David Martin (10 min)**
  - In circling back to Batmale Hall, an update on heating. The boilers are turning on/off properly.
  - Position Control Work will be underway to clean up existing PCW. More info will be delivered to the college community in coming weeks. This will cause updates in budgets. Will not

- change FTEF for Fall but may impact Spring.
  - Early Spring semester, going to do administrative evaluations. Due March 2023.
  - VC HR & Employee Relations. No interviews requested from any of the applicants. Looking into getting a retiree to provide support for 6 months.
  - Lactation areas on campus?? Working on getting the rooms updated.
  - Update on Geothermal Wells under MUB. Some are under ground of Balboa Reservoir, land CCSF no longer owns.
  - Shout out to Pierre Coste students and faculty. Delicious food, great service.
  - Mitra Sapienza: Yesterday was Chancellor Martin's 1 year Anniversary.
  - Wynd Kaufmyn: WWe knew about the wells years ago. I hope the BOT pays close attention. Also, will Moto classes run without an instructor on record?
  - Chancellor Martin: Yes, classes will continue to be lifted as STAFF due to Secondary FSA Committee schedule. Spring schedule will probably still list faculty as STAFF due to FSA Secondary schedule
  - Chad Stephenson: is anyone paying attention to lighting across campuses re: health and safety?
  - David Martin: Good reminder especially with shorter days. I will continue to bring updates and reach out to Facilities to focus on Lighting.
  - Lou Schubert: Re: multi-pronged facilities issues. We may need to get some outside contractors. Could we bring in a local crew to take care some of the Buildings & Grounds list so the staff has support?
  - Chancellor Martin: we need to exhaust all possibilities in getting support, especially during Winter months.
- **Vice Chancellor of Academic and Institutional Affairs, Dr. Gesice Ly (5mins)**
    - Updates: Credit for Prior Learning. Money for CPL Coordinator is available.
    - Upcoming Favorite Lecture Series: Mitra Sapienza, Arcadia Maximo, Darlene Alioto, Olga Galvez
    - Thu May 25th: Corrected Commencement Date
    - Heather Brandt: Does Commencement conflict with Finals?

- Geisce Ly No, it should not conflict
- Spark Point Generosity Project: Backpacks with Goodies for Students to let them know we care.
- Officers Reports (15 min)
  - [President's report](#)
  - Tomorrow is beginning of Fall Plenary. Mitra, Katia Fuchs and Christina Yanuaria are all headed to Sacramento.
  - Comprehensive Program Review guidance was just shared with DCC. \$750K Resource Allocation.
  - Conversations about Facilities is at top of list, ongoing, although slow.
  - There is a list of Admins/Designees for Facilities that shows who is doing what.
  - Google Spaces conversations are happening
  - ISER: lots of conversations are still happening.
  - Tomorrow there is a session on Racelighting. Free Online Web Series.  
<https://www.psychologytoday.com/us/blog/the-psychology-racial-equity/202210/when-they-say-you-re-emotionally-unstable>
  - Follow Up on Zoom Poll
  - Other Officer Reports (review Recording)
  - **Vice-President Miraglia**
  - Continuing to work on supporting faculty who serve on committees.
  - Also spending a lot of time on ISER; busy time to get it finalized. Nov 8th 1st reading with BOT.
  - **2nd Vice-President Schubert**
  - A lot of the discussion over Motorcycle, etc. is about Local Qualifications. We can use our creativity to think our way through some of the issues we keep facing over and over. We need to think outside the box and try to solve problems, suggest them to Admin.
  - **Secretary Sieglitz**
  - We all need to be on the lookout for Mold across campus and not just focus on isolated areas, "Mold Patrol".
  - Katryn Wiese asked to be updated with photos for mold-documentation she has created.
- AFT2121 check in report (5 min) *forthcoming*

- **Associated Students Report (10 min)**
  - Heather Brandt: Lots of conferences in September and October. Student Leadership Conference in San Diego. Important opportunities for student leaders.
  - ESL Classes on John Adams Campus. Chancellor Martin was there and it became a listening session. Lots of concerns about moving from JA to Mission Campus. Seems the move is not in alignment with CCSF's Mission Statement. Is this possibly in violation of Faculty 10+1 and Student 9+1 Rights. Seems like Communities of Color are being pitted against one another.
  - Chad Stephenson wrote in the comments section is that JAD is being turned into an Allied Health center. Heather disagreed.
  - If the intention is to move all Allied Health at JAD then why are things moving to Ocean and Mission? I feel like the college is being downsized.
  
- **Committee on Committees report (5 min)**
  - Only 3 Nominations. All reappointments.

IV. Consent Agenda 3:35 (5 min)

A. Approval of Minutes from [October 19, 2022](#)

**Resolution 2022.11.02.4A**

**Approval of Minutes: October 19, 2022**

Resolved, that the Executive Council approved the Minutes for [October 19, 2022](#).

Adopted by consent.

B. Approval of Committee Appointments

**Resolution 2022.11.02.4B**

**Appointments to Committees, Task Forces, Work Groups**

**Groups**

**Nominations to Committees with Limited Membership**

**Pathways Committee**

Yi Liang - Non-Credit (re-appointment)

**Nominations to AS Workgroups/Task Forces District-Level Committees and Task Forces/Workgroup**

**PGC Enrollment Management**

Steven Brown - EH&F (re-appointment)

**PGC Health and Safety**

Beth Friedman - Health Ed (re-appointment)

Adopted by consent.

- **Madeline Mueller:** Follow up comments from 10/19/22 ASEC Meeting regarding funding on DEI: Lumina Foundation. We have to be so careful. ALEC funds FAC Group, Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation. Funding Math and cutting Reading, Writing and ARTS. There are usually strings attached and we need to be aware that we have those players in the house.
- **Mitra Sapienza:** Submit an agenda request if it's the wish of the council.

V. Old Business (3:40)

A. [DRAFT Resolution on the review and audit of all California Community College Online Faculty Training materials](#) (10mins) – Statewide resolution, third read with revisions, tabled from 10/19, discussion and potential endorsement (first and seconded for approval from 10/19). Mitra will bring it to Plenary in the Spring since it's too late for Fall Plenary.

- Katryn Wiese asked if we could withdraw the Motion so we can discuss the revised version to the Resolution.
- Loren Edwardson
- Ying Liu: what materials will be audited?
- Mitra Sapienza: this is asking us not to audit what faculty create, but the materials used to train faculty to teach online
- Loren Edwardson: asked for clarification if this is for Online-only courses.
- Mitra Sapienza: likely there will be a ripple effect for in-person classes as well.
- Katryn Wiese: The document doesn't clearly state that this is just for Online teaching. Can we put a quick resolution to support the "spirit" of the document but language could change moving forward?
- Katryn Moved, Sheri Seconded.

Resolved that the CCSF Academic Senate Executive Council supports the spirit of [Resolution to Review and Audit of all California Community College Online Faculty Training Materials](#) with the understanding that the language may change as it moves through the Academic Senate for California Community College process.

**AYE:** Wynd Kaufmyn, Sheri Miraglia, Madeline Mueller, Ronald Page, Caroline Priestley, Michele Sieglitz, Chad Stephenson, Fred Teti, Katryn Wiese, Jib Wongprasert


**NAE:** Loren Edwardson

**ABSTAIN:** Monica Bosson, Lisa Romano, Lou Schubert

**ABSENT:** Adam d'Aquisto, Erik Christianson, Matthew Duckworth, Kate Frei, Malcolm Hillan, Jesse Kolber

VII. New Business (3:50)

A. [AB928 report/update](#) (10mins) – Rachel Cohen & Craig Kleinman

- More units for STEM but no special STEM Pathway because law states it has to be a particular pattern.
- GE Program Pattern- important for faculty input. Currently CSU and IGETC. This will combine into one CalGETC pattern. Has not been fully passed yet.
- **Auto Placement- ADT. Students can opt out.**
-  [AB 928 Summary AB 928 Committee.pdf](#)
- Supposed to be student-centered, student-facing, equity-based.
- One of the extreme challenges with removal of Lifelong Learning at CSU is there also talking about making it an **upper-division** graduation requirement.
- Addition of Oral Communication requirement at UC
- Reduction of total units to 34; no more than 6 extra units for STEM. No separate STEM Pathway allowed by law.
- We can move to articulate more of our courses, like LERN50: College Success.
- We have to create our own **mirrored pathway** or it will be legislated for us.
- Concern that American Ideals and Institutions is going away. Doesn't show up on pattern because it's not GE, but it's still there.
- AB928 Committee met for the first time on 10/14 and were upset that Lifelong Learning was going away. Next meeting on 1/26/23.
- A one-size fits-all may be more limiting than freeing.

B. [AP 2.23 Communicable Disease Policy](#) (including vaccine mandate), [powerpoint presentation](#) – (10mins) Health & Safety committee members: Michael Snider, Jane Ernstthal, Julie Ososke – first read, potential action, time sensitive

- Jane Ernstthal: Department Chair, Student Health Services. Julie Ososke: Family Nurse Practitioner. Michael Snider: Medical Assistant. Represent Health & Safety Committee.
- Proposal to remove Vax Mandate because it is outdated. Proposal to remove it and remove weekly testing.
- Student Health is required to verify all vaccine verification weekly tests. 24, 847 records have been verified to date.
- Mandate was originally implemented to encourage vaccination and because it was believed to stop transmission but we now know that is no longer the case.
- We need to align with the CDC and CA DPH Recommendations which changed to eliminate mandatory testing in August. Testing for C19 for students and staff may be considered “high risk activity”.
- CA SMARTER Plan has been implemented by Governor’s office.
- Masking is recommended in schools and health environments.
- Michele Sieglitz: Hallelujah, I am happy to hear that CCSF finally caught up with the data. I was the lone voice on the faculty who voted against a Vax Mandate because of the data we saw coming out of Israel which showed an inverse relationship between most heavily vaccinated populations and rate of C19 infection. We are also starting to see a number of legal cases show up regarding the mandates. What is the plan to recapture students who were turned away for not having the vax requirement?
- Michael Snider: I don’t believe Health & Safety is responsible for student recapture or that we turned away too many students due to vaccination requirements. I believe that students dropped because the process was difficult to submit requirements.
- Monica Bosson: will we still be requiring people to wear masks in the classroom? Move to Endorse Proposal.
- Michael Snider talked to the Chancellor and he doesn’t expect this to change for Spring because he wants to have Town Halls on the issue.
- This proposal does not include Mask Mandates; strong advisory will likely be implemented.
- Chad Stephenson: wants the list of people on Health & Safety Committee to be updated to acknowledge people who came up with the proposal so that I can update this with my constituency group.
- PASSED BY CONSENT



Resolved that the CCSF Academic Senate endorses the updates to [AP 2.23 Communicable Disease Policy](#)

Adopted by Consent

- 2023 Exemplary Program Award nominations (10mins) – Loren Edwardson & Sheri Miraglia, Awards and Recognition workgroup, vote
  - ☰ Exemplary Award Nomination: VĀSĀ (Oceania) Student Success Pr...
  - Lisa Romano mentioned that even though the VĀSĀ Counselor was laid off, she assigned a new one.
  - Loren Moved by Acclimation. Sheri seconded.
  - Madeline Mueller noted that she wants VĀSĀ to perform at new Performing Arts Center.
  - Sheri Miraglia introduced the Hayward Award. Nominations Due on by 12/13.

C. [DRAFT Resolution on ASCCC Fall 2022 Plenary Resolutions](#) (15mins) – [Fall 2022 Plenary Resolution Packet](#), discussion and vote.

- Discussion of various topics to be voted on at Plenary.
- Lou Schubert 09.01 OER: I didn't see anything on Academic Freedom and Instructional choice. Without a statement on Academic Freedom, it's a little problematic. 13.02: Updating Codes of Conduct. How is this different from dealing with classroom disruption. I would recommend not voting for this without more clarity.
- Sheri Miraglia: Reso from Librarian Faculty. They are concerned that the new standards do not call out Library as a separate section. One of the goals is to remove redundancy in Accreditation standards and I would vote no on that. The current standards are very redundant. Simplified standards recognize faculty collectively.
- Caroline Priestley: 07.11.422. Pre-transfer Math & English. Can you explain more about what this is?
- Mitra Sapienza: historically the State Academic Senate has not been in support of AB705. Faculty are still grappling with this at CCSF.
- Chad Stephenson: Library is 3 parts: Instructional, it's a place that people can go to, it includes Facilities. We're a student service but we're also a building and deliver instructional materials. Caution on omitting specific criterion for librarians. It leaves open the possibility it could be that the

libraries could be staffed by classified or faculty who are not trained librarians.

- Madeline Mueller: Good Luck, Mitra. I used to be the voting delegate at these meetings and they are intense. Law is now putting CSU in the catbird seat and we are the experts. Law was not designed academically; it was designed politically. Our role should be front and center.
- Mitra wants to revise the resolution and will follow up with a report after Plenary in the past-tense.
- Fred said, it's not a Resolution if it's from the past- it should be added to a report.

D. Student Conduct (15 mins) – Maria Salazar Colon **NO SHOW**

E. Institutional Planning, Administrative Procedure (AP) 2.18 (10mins)  
(informational, first read)– Dean Pam Mery [revised draft AP 2.18](#); [existing AP 2.18](#) and Board Policy [BP 2.18](#) for reference

- Some of the items are out of date so the item was flagged.
  - Planning Process Flow Chart (came before RRP. Does not reflect the current RRP handbook. It's the proto-RRP.)
  - Want to make the language more plain, clear and direct.
  - Mitra Sapienza: This will come back for a second-read at next meeting.
  - This ultimately goes to PGC, not exclusively 10+1.
  - Kristin Charles brought it to Associated Students in October.
  - Heather Brandt: Do previous AP's get stored so you can see how they are changed over time? That's a question for the Chancellor's office.
- Poll Results

VI. Adjournment (5:00pm)