The Academic Senate

CITY COLLEGE OF SAN FRANCISCO

50 Frida Kahlo Way, Box E-202, San Francisco, CA 94112 (415) 239-3611 Fax (415) 452-5115
www.ccsf.edu.edu/academic-senate email: asenate@ccsf.edu

Curriculum• Degree Requirements• Grading Policies• Program Development• Student Prep & Success• Governance
Accreditation• Professional Development• Program Review• Planning & Budgeting Process• Others as agreed

CCSF Academic Senate Executive Council
Minutes and Sound Recording
Wednesday, October 19, 2022, 2:30-5:00pm
Via Zoom
https://ccsf-edu.zoom.us/j/98935746783

Council Members Present: Monica Bosson, Erik Christianson, Matthew Duckworth, Lawrence Edwardson, Kathryn Frei, Malcolm Hillan, Wynd Kaufmyn, Jesse Kolber, Dana Jae Labrecque, Sheri Miraglia, Madeline Mueller, Ronald Page II, Caroline Priestley, Lisa Romano, Mitra Sapienza, Michele Sieglitz, Chad Stephenson, Frederick Teti, Katryn Wiese, Tanichya Wongprasert

Council Members Absent: Wynd Kaufmyn, Kimberly Keenan (Sabbatical), Thomas Kennedy (on leave from ASEC)

Other Senate Members Present: Harry Bernstein, Abigail Bornstein, Rachel Cohen, Jen Kienzle, Tehmina Khan, Andrew King, Alexis Litzky, Patricia Miller, Leslie Pahl, Kevin Sherman, Christina Yanuaria

Guests: Heather Brandt, Tessa Brown, Kristin Charles, Herlim Li, Ying Liu, Mandy Liang, Chancellor David Martin, Wendy Brill-Wynkoop

I. Call to Order 2:30 (1min)
   A. We acknowledge that we are on the unceded, ancestral homeland of the Ramaytush Ohlone who are the original inhabitants of the San Francisco Peninsula. As the indigenous stewards of this land and in accordance with their traditions, the Ramaytush Ohlone have never ceded, lost nor forgotten their responsibilities as the caretakers of this place, as well as for all peoples who reside in their traditional territory. As guests, we recognize that we benefit from living and working on their traditional homeland. We wish to pay our respects by acknowledging the ancestors, elders and relatives of the Ramaytush Community and by affirming their sovereign rights as First Peoples.
II. Adoption of Agenda 2:31 (4min)

III. Public Comment 2:35 (10 min)

- **Matt Duckworth**: No Heating in Batmale Hall. Loss of power and delay in restoration that occurs when people use space heaters. When will Batmale Hall be functional as an educational workplace for faculty, staff and students?
- **Fred Teti:** The Education Policies Committee met on Monday. We received a presentation and made comments on a proposed new process for counselors to waive the unit cap. We also approved two new draft BP/APs, one on Articulation and the other on a Degree and G.E. in Philosophy. These will come to the Council at future meetings.
- **Madeline Mueller**: dittoed what Matt Duckworth said only for Creative Arts Bldg. Read Prop O situation. Trying to get facts right on how many chancellors we have had and accreditation history.
- **Dana Jae:** stepping off ASEC. Trying to stay sane by focusing on BEMA, teaching classes and being a chair. Hard to be in meetings with administrators who are mostly incompetent. I've been contemplating an early retirement based on all the things happening at the college. Thanks for all you are doing to hold things up.
- **Andy Saunders**: Motorcycle Maintenance classes have run at City College since the start of the century. I have instructed these classes, as a part-timer, since 2007. In 2022, I taught two classes in Spring. Moto was one of the first departments to go back to in-person teaching in Summer 2021, and reaching full enrollment for in-person classes was more difficult than fully remote classes. I was ready to teach two classes in Fall of 22. One of the classes, Moto Intro, was fully enrolled. The other had low numbers, but was growing. Both classes were canceled by Dean David Yee at the start of the semester, because there was no staff (ie full time staff) to teach the classes. But I have been teaching these classes for 15 years! Next semester, there are NO Moto classes scheduled. Can we please get the program running again?
- **Harry Bernstein**: Andy was dismissed without acknowledgement of his efforts. Nick Rothman acknowledged that "we no longer have a motorcycle program." Even David Martin mentioned that there was a flaw in not following CA law with the way the classes were canceled but they did not offer them as late-start classes. Please take this seriously.
- **Lou Schubert**: funding available for "temporary, one-time" classes. It is against the law to use public facilities, email, department names, etc. to promote a political cause, proposition, measure, etc. We need to avoid using public resources for electioneering.
- **Hugo Eccles**, Founder, Untitled Motorcycles: Please reinstate the Motorcycle Maintenance classes at CCSF. The classes fulfill an important and irreplaceable service that trains and provides Technicians and Motorcycle Industry professionals that are vital for the future of our industry both locally and worldwide.

- **Sean Narcisse-Spence**: I'm a former CCSF Moto Student. I'm deeply saddened to hear about the loss of the Moto program. I truly can't express what kind of impact that program had on my and my career trajectory. The program empowered me to work with my hands, to build, fix, and create things that have been a core element of my professional strengths to this day. Taking this opportunity away from the community hurts those future motorcycle techs, and hurts the mechanic and creator community. I truly hope we find a way to keep Moto alive. I am a better person, citizen, and San Franciscan because of it.
- **Bret Winters**, Motorcycle Certificate of Achievement earned 2022.: City College's Motorcycle program served the greater Bay Area community of aspiring technicians with an affordable introduction to the Motorcycle industry. Continuing education adults, veterans, retired law enforcement officers and city workers are just a few of the categories of individuals encountered in my years in the program. As we see a rise in the demand for more affordable transportation in the City proper, we see a need for more technicians to serve the motorcycle, scooter and even e-scooter share industries. Please strongly consider re-instating the motorcycle program, to help ensure access and opportunity for individuals in the future. Thank you for your time and consideration.
- **Andy Saunders**: 25% of the participants in the Motorcycle program have been women,

- Reports 2:45

    - Chancellor's Report: Dr. David Martin w/ AVC Vasquez (10 min)
      Report link
        - Alberto Vasquez, Co-presenter
        - Conlan Hall is going to move Chancellor's office down the hall next to Payroll
        - HR, Admin Services, ASEC & Classified Senates and Facilities will move to 700 Bungalows
        - Student Success Building awaiting construction approval
        - Final approval for STEAM project should begin mid-December
        - Diego Rivera Theater project-waiting for cost estimates for schematic design
        - Science Hall: Heating update on boilers; trying to fill some Stationary Engineer positions
        - Mold update: have started and are continuing to clean out the rooms that need cleaning. Rms; 43-45 are scheduled for deep-mold cleaning
        - Replace sliding Doors in Science Hall-getting bids now.

- Cloud & Arts Building are not receiving heat due to leak. Hoping to have it fixed in the coming weeks.
- MUB- heating system is now running. But the heat is turning on and off at random times. Going to get them repaired.
- Problem with North Elevator- will be fixed as soon as parts come in.
- Library- will be repairing the exhaust fans and the roof. Heating system is being evaluated for possible replacement.
- Restrooms in library are all renovated.
- Batmale Hall- all restrooms are renovated.
- Creative Arts- renovations of first floor restrooms are now open; currently working on the 3rd floor, followed by 2nd.
- Northern elevator in CA is still down- waiting on part
- Katryn Wiese: it makes a big difference to hear from the Chancellor and know the status of what is happening on campus- thanks for sharing the developments. What is happening with the damaged door in the Science building?
- Alberto Vasquez: evaluating cost of replace vs. repair from vendor.
- Matt Duckworth: stated his alarm that the HVAC system in Batmale Hall is not on the Facilities list. What is the plan and timeline?
- Alberto Vasquez: stated that he is aware of the problem, will have to look into it and that hopefully a follow up will be given at a future meeting.
- DM: will plan to come back in 2 week to discuss Batmale specifically.
- Harry Bernstein: What is happening with the Motorcycle Maintenance program? What about the one-time funding from Program Review for continuance of MM program?
- David Martin: we need to look at the Local Minimum Qualifications to the different disciplines in departments through FSA requirements and different disciplines..
- Malcolm Hillan: it seems like a disproportionate number of issues are with boilers and heating. Sometimes the issues point back to failed maintenance. Can we get some reassurance that this will be dealt with effectively moving forward?
- David Martin: Funding available through Prop A and State local matches. As we install new boilers, we need to identify ongoing funding for future maintenance.

- Officers Reports (15 min)
    - **VP Mitra Sapienza**
    - President's report
    - ASCCC Area B Resolutions (more to come Oct 20th)
    - DEI Resolution still needs votes from Plenary in November.
    - Statewide resolution to endorse.
    - Delegates will convene and vote on November 5th.. Mitra will cast vote based on feedback from any faculty who have an interest in voting in a particular way. An email will be sent out to faculty and on November 2nd the Council will discuss Statewide Resolutions.
    - Met with Office on Online Learning
    - OER/ZTC Committee of ASEC Proposal on agenda today.
    - In conversation with the Chancellor about the Working Adult Learning program
    - Ongoing conversations about Program Review

      VP Sheri Miraglia
    - Kristin Charles will be coming today to talk about ISER for second read today
    - Re: committees: we have a far smaller faculty base to help support the college to work in a collegial manner. One are that I am concerned about is Participatory Governance.
    - Technology and Health & Safety Committee have openings

      2nd VP Lou Schubert
    - Due to less than surgical precision of lay-offs, there are people who have dibs on rehire who aren't in that specialty. Collegial Consultation with DM: can we use PR money to hire back someone?
    - We asked the Chancellor if money be used to hire back someone for Program Review?

      Secretary Michele Sieglitz
    - Send off to Dana Jae who is stepping down from ASEC

    - Mitra Sapienza: Poll on hybrid/in-person meeting this Fall and beyond

- AFT2121 check in report (5 min) NO SHOW

- Associated Students report (10 min)

  Student Chancellor Heather Brandt

  - Students are confused with registration process and Add Codes
  - Participatory Governance structure: there is some discomfort and lack of support about students being in admin spaces
  - Trying to inform students of their 9+1 Rights
  - Heather has been at Open Educational Virtual Conference: Rise to Action this week, specifically about OER and ZTC
  - This week the Associated Student Council will not be meeting due to the students attending the CCC Student Leadership Conference in San Diego.

  - Program Review Committee report (10 min)
    - Program Review committee report
    - Still soliciting feedback.
    - 750K for Institutionalized Equity
    - Money is supposed to be spent by end of June 2023
    - Committee Membership has been updated to include students, classified staff and administrators but have weighted the committee to be mostly faculty.
    - How many student seats will the committee have? A: 3

- Committee on Committees report (5 min)

IV. Consent Agenda 3:30 (5 min)

A. Approval of Minutes from October 5, 2022

Resolution 2022.10.19.4A	**Approval of Minutes: October 5, 2022**
Resolved, that the Executive Council approved the Minutes for October 5, 2022. Adopted by consent.	

B. 2022-2025 Student Equity Plan

Madeline Mueller asked for clarification on the Student Equity Plan and data/metrics.

Resolution 2022.10.19.4B	**2022-2025 Student Equity Plan**

Resolved that the CCSF Academic Senate Executive Council endorses the 2022-2025 Student Equity Plan.

Adopted by consent.

C. DRAFT Resolution on the creation of an Academic Senate OER/ZTC committee

D. Approval of Committee Appointments

Resolution 2022.10.19.4D **Appointments to Committees, Task Forces, Work Groups**

Nominations to Committees with Unlimited Membership
Works of Art
Stephanie Robison - Art (new appointment)
Eileen Adamian - ESL (new appointment)
SLO Committee
Sheri Miraglia - Biology (reappointment)
CTE Steering Committee
Steven Brady - Automotive (reappointment)

Nominations to Committees with Limited Membership
Student Equity Strategies
Marie Kay Valle - Vocational Nursing (new appointment)
Registration and Enrollment
Marie Kay Valle - Vocational Nursing (new appointment)

Nominations to AS Workgroups / Task Forces District-Level Committees and Task Forces/Workgroup
PGC Facilities
Madeline Mueller - Music (re-appointment)

Adopted by consent.

V. Old Business (3:35)

A. Resolution on Recognition of External IOTL Training (10mins) – Katryn Wiese re-presents this resolution on behalf of the Distance Learning Advisory Committee (DLAC) (see resolution text below)
   - Recognition of of External IOTL Training
   - Increase access to teach online and get credit for trainings.
   - Passed by CONSENT

Resolution 2022.10.19.5A	**Recognition of External IOTL Training**

Resolved, that faculty who completed the equivalent of IOTL training at another qualified institution are not required to complete IOTL at CCSF. Once training is verified, they are qualified to develop and teach online courses within their Faculty Service Area, and with their Department Chair's approval.

Be it further resolved, we request that OLET be the responsible party to maintain a list of all trained (certified) faculty.

Be it finally resolved, that a process and standards for reviewing courses or faculty trained outside of CCSF be created.

Adopted by consent.

B. 2023 Institutional Self Evaluation Report (ISER) (10mins) – AVC Kristin Charles, Second Read and potential vote for recommendation (see resolution text below) www.ccsf.edu/accreditation

   - Madeline Mueller and Steven Brown are the only two to give feedback so
   - far so Kristin suggested a meeting with the two to discuss. Making concrete steps to improve.
   - Madeline asked whether or not there was room to be flexible and alter the document before 12/15.
   - Can respond to comments from Commission or proactively make changes before outside comments are made.
   - Site visit in October 2023
   - Sheri Moved the Resolution and Loren Seconded.
   - Friendly amendment to add 12/9/22 and Passed by CONSENT.

Resolution 2022.10.19.5B	**Approval of 2023 Institutional Self Evaluation Report**

(ISER)

Resolved that the CCSF Academic Senate Executive Council recommends the 2023 Institutional Self Evaluation Report (ISER) as an accurate reflection of the nature and substance of this institution that has been completed through effective participation by the campus community.

Adopted by consent.

C. Resolution on the review and audit of all California Community College Online Faculty Training materials (5mins) – Statewide resolution, Second Read, discussion and potential endorsement
   - Madeline asked a question about who was funding all of the DEI stuff. Center for Urban Development.
   - Fred asked for clarification re: blonde emojis. It is not factual that this is the "only" choice.
   - Sheri Motioned and Kate Seconded to Endorse.
   - Madeline suggested that this is the First reading and should come back for a Second reading.
   - Mitra stated that it's better to take time to refine the document.
   - Heather Brandt: Did the motion die?
   - Madeline: Motion to table. Second from Loren.
   - Tabled until next meeting.

VII. New Business (4:00)

A. Open Education Resources & Zero Cost Textbooks (10mins)-- Ying Liu, OER Liaison[1]

CCSF OER & ZTC 10-19-22

- Grant funded program ($115 million) to keep costs low for students
- Students can choose to enroll in sections that don't have textbook costs or institution can absorb costs.
- Collecting data on textbook costs now.
- Courses need to be FREE by Fall 2024 in order to submit proposal.
- Katryn Wiese: we are not allowed to enforce a single textbook for all faculty, by contract. It's a huge amount of work to create supplementary materials in addition to not having a textbook. I'd love to see CCSF cover the costs of the textbooks.

[1] ASCCC Resolutions – OER, ZTC, and Course Materials More Generally, April 20, 2022
ASCCC Zero Textbook Cost (ZTC) Program Overview, September 26, 2022
California Education Code 78052: Zero Cost Degree Grant Program, effective July 27, 2021

- Ying Liu: yes, every faculty member has academic freedom to choose which book they want. There are some projects being implemented to develop auxiliary products. Eventually they will be equal to what the publisher produces.
- Michele Sieglitz: Can we expand the conversation to learning tools beyond "textbook", i.e. digital/interactive interfaces like Linked-In Learning, since many students don't seem to read textbooks anymore. Link to getting free access with SF Library card: https://www.linkedin.com/learning-login/go/sfpl
- Heather Brandt: asked if Ying had attended the OER/ZTC Conference re: CCC's gap in costs.
- Ying responded by saying that CCSF was hoping to join the second stage of this study re: Bay Area colleges.

B. Faculty Association for California Community Colleges (FACCC) Legislative Update (20mins) – FACCC President, Wendy Brill-Wynkoop will provide a brief recap of recently passed state legislation and how it will affect community colleges.
   - 22 FACCC Leg Update to Senates
   - president@faccc.org
   - We have to change our own local degree patterns or we will see a legislative request
   - AB1111 signed into law in October 2021 and workgroup funded to address course numbering. All of our campuses should have the same numbering.
   - 2022 Legislative Wrap-Up (see presentation link for details)
   - Might want to look into open-meeting requirements coming up with Senate. In-person meetings will resume in February 2023.
   - Intend to pass a bill on Academic Freedom next year.
   - AB2315 Chosen Name Bill was passed and originated by faculty at CCSF.
   - AB1856 PT Faculty to teach up to 85% FT load was VETOED.
   - AB1705 Transfer Level Math & English Bill (see presentation link for details). Watch out for the money that is coming to campus re: 1705.
   - Contact new legislators after they have been seated and let them know you are faculty to begin the relationship.
   - Call for FACCC Membership & perks
   - Monica Bosson: gave a shout out about the value of joining FACCC and the incredible support that FACCC gave to CCSF during accreditation. Mentioned writing off dues on taxes.

C. AB928 report/update (10mins) – Rachel Cohen & Craig Kleinman Moved to next meeting 11/2

VI. Adjournment (5:00pm) in honor of Caroline Blair, retired professor of Directing and Filmmaking at CCSF

- Patricia Miller: Is teaching at CCSF now because of Caroline. Tremendous support and influence in her life.
- Michele Sieglitz: Caroline was a legend and a very special, talented person who touched a lot of lives in her teaching. In the past 10 years, about 1/2 dozen people have lost their lives to cancer in Cinema. Do we need to do an audit of Cloud Hall to see if there are environmental contaminants?
- Tehmina Khan: knew Caroline as a neighbor and remembers her walking her dog, advocating on her partner's health and what a special and thoughtful person she was.