The Academic Senate

CITY COLLEGE OF SAN FRANCISCO

50 Frida Kahlo Way, Box E-202, San Francisco, CA 94112 (415) 239-3611 Fax (415) 452-5115
www.ccsf.edu.edu/academic-senate email: asenate@ccsf.edu

Curriculum• Degree Requirements• Grading Policies• Program Development• Student Prep & Success• Governance
Accreditation• Professional Development• Program Review• Planning & Budgeting Process• Others as agreed

Note: Copies of the Final Agenda, Resolutions and Materials for the May 11, 2022 meeting can be found in the Materials folder for that meeting.

CCSF Academic Senate Executive Council
Minutes and Sound Recording
Wednesday, 2022 May 11, 2:30-5:00pm
Location: Zoom meeting https://ccsf-edu.zoom.us/j/98353441191
Phone info: +1 669 900 6833 or +1 253 215 8782 * Meeting ID: 983 5344 1191

Council Members Present: Abigail Bornstein, Monica Bosson, Steven Brown, Erik Christianson, Amy Díaz-Infante, Ekaterina (Katia) Fuchs, Wynd Kaufmyn, Kimberly Keenan, Jesse Kolber, Nicole Oest Krup, Fanny Law, Simon Hanson, Dana Jae Labrecque, Jeanette Male, Michele McKenzie, Sheri Miraglia, Madeline Mueller, Joe Reyes, Lisa Romano, Mitra Sapienza, Lou Schubert, Michele Sieglitz, Chad Stephenson, Frederick Teti, Katryn Wiese

Council Members Absent: Lenny Carlson, Stephanie MacAller

Other Senate Members Present: Jessica Buchsbaum, Malcolm Hillan, Tanichya Wongprasert, Caroline Priestley, OL Kark Westerberg, Dayamudra Dennehy, Matt Duckworth, Dina Wilson, Malaika Finkelstein, Kimberly Keenan, Lisa King, Ying Liu, Leslie Simon, Andrew King, Rosario Villasana, Tom Kennedy, Dr. Ramona Coates, Dr. Nunley, Mary Bravewoman, Susmita Sengupta, Craig Kleinman, Kate Frei, Lori Admokom

Guests: Cherisa Yarkin, Mandy Liang, Jennifer Kienzle, Alexis Litzky, Wendy Miller, Josh Halpin, Chancellor David Martin

I. Call to Order 2:30 (1min)
   A. We acknowledge that we are on the unceded ancestral homeland of the Ramaytush Ohlone who are the original inhabitants of the San Francisco

Peninsula. As the indigenous stewards of this land and in accordance with their traditions, the Ramaytush Ohlone have never ceded, lost nor forgotten their responsibilities as the caretakers of this place, as well as for all peoples who reside in their traditional territory. As guests, we recognize that we benefit from living and working on their traditional homeland. We wish to pay our respects by acknowledging the ancestors, elders and relatives of the Ramaytush Community and by affirming their sovereign rights as First Peoples.

II. Adoption of Agenda 2:31 (4min)

III. Public Comment 2:35 (10 min)

- Fred Teti - The Education Policies Committee met on Monday. We are now considering board polices and administrative procedures about articulation and student/materials fees. We will continue to do so at our September meeting. Interested individuals may write to me for more information. fteti@ccsf.edu
- Harry Bernstein - An emergency meeting by AFT2121, tomorrow, 3:30-5:30 pm, about where we go from here. We have done this before. The Union is proposing a parcel tax, but we have been on this route before where we have brought money in but the same people decide where this money goes.

IV. Reports 2:45

- Chancellor's Report Dr. David Martin (10 min)
  - Gratitude for the allocation of this time on the agenda. Hope to provide updates on where we believe we are going.
  - Want to recognize the gravity of this week, the week prior and weeks to come. We have members of our campus that will no longer be with us when the new academic year comes.
  - We have another tough decision in looking at our administrative structure and hope to implement that on July 1. The new administrative contracts will go to the BOT in June, and there will be fewer contracts. We hope this will be the last of a series of difficult

decisions and hope and expect to move forward with future year's budgets with allocations available for the very important needs that we will have to meet when we return.

- 65% of our classes will be back in person and we need to spend the summer time to really prioritize funding to meet immediate and on-going technology needs.
- Program Review - We have come to a place in recent years where any funding for Program Review has been scraped together. We have to shift the mindset to budget annually for program review needs and to encourage innovation and growth.
- It is not an easy week or easy semester, but do think the tough decisions are behind us and we can start collectively moving forward in a sustainable model and without any outside agencies circling us. This won't make this any easier in the coming weeks, but appreciate your willingness to work together to build the City College we need.
- Appeal Hearings were very limited by FSA and seniority levels. But there was information that assessment of departments (low or high performing, was erroneous), if this information is forthcoming, will some of these decisions be revised? Also, what is our message to the community about certificates that will no longer be available. - It would be disingenuous to go back and revise decisions based on historical data. But as we move forward, if we see demand in certain areas we will work to meet that demand. In terms of the messaging to the community, I recognize that the messaging has not been welcoming but as we move forward, we need to improve campus climate and and when we are able to respond to program review needs that this will be something we can point to to show our community that we are heading down the right path.
- DEAs - you are confirming that they will be restored to the curriculum process. I would like to request if that information can be shared widely with your administration, as there are a number of the DEAs that

have been submitted for this new process, and they are certain currently sitting with deans who are specifically saying they were told not to pass them forward. The curriculum committee is prepared to take them as far as I understand and I've been working with a Curriculum Committee chair, so it would be great if we could get that resolved before the end of the semester, so that we know how we're moving - I did hear about the log jam of approvals yesterday, and that is something that I will communicate and have started communicating. So hopefully we'll see some of those filter through the approval process here in the near future

    - As a Black person, the moving forward is really problematic because there is so much pain in the past. It's like saying, "forget that you were enslaved, everything is fine". In this context, what are we going to do to restore confidence? - Thank you for the opportunity to expand. I did not mean to ignore the heaviness of the past. What I believe is that we have the opportunity in the next year to get through an accreditation year and have funding available for program review. I do believe our campus will see movement in areas to show our community and students that are important to their education. I do believe getting out of the cycle of evaluation from outside agencies is something we can point to to show that we are moving in the right direction.
- Officers Reports (15 min)
    - President Simon Hanson
        - What you just described Chancellor is the "what" - in order to get through our budget problems we have to figure out a way to make certain corrections and we've been very clear on the what we need to do to get rid of salary expenses you've also been very clear on the what we are headed for with equipment and with funds for a program review or for infrastructure. What I would like you to know,

and I would like the entire college here at this point to know is that, from my perspective, I see faculty that are beyond where they can go and they are not looking for a “what”, they are looking for a “why”.

- Our accreditors have have multiple standards that they look at for this college, but those standards serve the mission and purpose of the College. This is something we're going to be taking up at this meeting today to discuss because it has been a long time since we have had conversations about who we serve and why we serve them and instead we have had multiple management come in and tell us they could correct the College, by managing us better and shifting our resources to other places. Shifting of resources may be important if we are on the same page about what we are doing with those resources and why we are doing it.
- At our last meeting of the Academic Senate, we very clearly had students come up and express passionate concerns because they could not receive the classes they needed. Having computers, microscopes, infrastructure is the “what” but that is not the “why”, and we are not hearing that. We hope to change our dialogue here. Even in accreditation a lot of it had to do with standards other than the finances, such as whether we are meeting our mission. There is a huge need for faculty to hear whether they have a place here. We are having a hard time having the work continue. Giving a new microscope but canceling a Microbiology class does not serve my students.

- First Vice President Mitra Sapienza
  - Thank you Chair, and Chancellor for sticking around, I know this is not easy for you either.
  - The new Equity Times has just dropped. Want to share the opening message here: As many of

us reel this year from classified layoffs, to now faculty layoffs, to forthcoming administrative layoffs, ending another year with Covid, enrollment decline and many identified institutional barriers still intact, the Office of Student Equity wants to both acknowledge this time in our college's history as one of struggle and heartbreak, and call on us to come together with a fiercer focus on serving the students of City College of San Francisco.
We must acknowledge the employees and students that are directly impacted by this year's classified staff and faculty layoffs. Hundreds of classified staff, full and part-time faculty have received layoff notices this year, impacting our ability to maintain robust course offerings and support resources to students, depleting our morale along the way. The layoffs have exhausted our community in a myriad of ways, leaving holes where relationships have been built. We implore our institutional leaders: Vice Chancellors, Associate Vice Chancellors, Directors, Deans, Classified Staff, Department chairs, all Faculty, the Chancellor and our Board of Trustees, all of us, to see how broken our community is, to see the aftermath and how all of this has devastated not only how we see each other, but what we have left for the students. Leaders may not agree with one another or with why people are upset or why people are asking for change or why all of this is so important to the survival and success of students and employees, but it is our jobs as leaders to listen. And to include. And to adjust. And to lead with bravery.

- Congrats to Craig Kleinman on being re-elected for another term as the Chair of the Curriculum Committee.
- I want to thank the Technology Teaching and

Learning Roundtable for their panel presentation on Monday. Thanks to Maura Devlin-Clancy, Sheri Miraglia, Michele Sieglitz, and Katryn Wiese for teaching the community about how to develop video tutorials for students.

- I went to the dance performance on Saturday, for the dance department, and it was a balm for my soul, so thank you Jeanette Male for all the work you put in for that.

- Second Vice President, Chad Stephenson
  - Welcome to the incoming reps that are here today. I've experienced a lot of positive things through this year and I know we're reaching our last meeting in the next two two weeks of this group so I just want to appreciate the reps for being here.
  - As 2nd VP I have been in charge of orientations for the incoming reps and I want to encourage folks to be mindful that our officer elections are coming up in 2 weeks. That will give us a chance to reflect on where we've been for the past year and the role that the officers have played.
  - Want to appreciate the Chancellor for being here for this amount of time. You will be the third Chancellor since I have been here. When I first began was when the most drastic cuts occurred to noncredit and when we lost 95% of the older adults program.
  - Later today we will focus on this; that the College is not engaging with the lifelong learners and we will reflect on the importance of including that in the mission of the College. I also want to again reflect on the engagement we've had over the past six months or so since you've been here with the noncredit portion of the College; that has been much appreciated and we look forward to seeing some changes.

        - Program Review - This was deferred earlier this year and we're really going to be putting efforts into this in the coming year. The meaning of Program Review since my time here at the College has been challenged. In terms of acknowledgement and use as a focus of the school; so hoping to marry a program review with the mission of the College to help to guide us forward a bit.
        - With that comes just another acknowledgement that the Vice Chancellor Academic Affairs is still to be hired at this time and that that's a concern that we've shared and the need for focus will rely on that position.
        - Also want to acknowledge to the Chancellor that you are here today and you are the first Chancellor that has returned to this group and acknowledged work with this group despite the challenges that the College faces.
    - Secretary, Amy Díaz-Infante
        - ASEC Officers - I also wanted to mention as elections are coming up, to again offer for anyone who's thinking about stepping up and as an Officer, please feel free to reach out to us. We have the Officer Duties documents available, but if you want to talk to us and get some more nuance around what it's like to be an officer, please feel free to reach out with questions. I'm happy to help in the transition to the next year for the new Secretary.
        - Vision - also really wanted to echo a lot of what my colleagues have mentioned here. Dr. Nunley brought up a really good point about the past is the present we are still living with the past. And for a lot of us, as mentioned, we are wondering where we're going and and for some of us, like myself, we frankly need to know that because we need to know if this is still the right place for us. I started just a few years ago, as a new

faculty and I just received tenure, but I was on the cut-off list last year. I am first in line in my department and am also the only full-time faculty of color in my department; and we know that cuts have disproportionately impacted faculty of color.
        - I appreciate what you are saying about looking at infrastructure because when I started at CCSF I had a faculty office that I couldn't use because of mold. We've all been making it work as best we can, but what I've been looking for is that direction of the college. We've seen the mission statement change in just the few years that I've been here, so I appreciate the Noncredit Committee who is bringing forward a resolution today to look at our mission.
        - I think a lot of us are looking for that vision of where we're going, and who we are serving and who, who are as a community as a college. There are so many of us who are willing to do the work and the extra work, but we need to know where we're heading, so I want to echo that we're really looking for that vision.
- ASEC Election Updates (25 min)
    - 251 votes cast for the (3 negated for double votes); 248 total counted for this ASEC Election.
    - Approximately 80% were full-time faculty and 21% were part-time. The majority identified with working from the Ocean Campus.
    - Welcome all the new Executive Council Members. All of these individuals listed with total vote count. There were 18 seats and 14 candidates on the ballot. All candidates will be seated. (All requirements were met - no department can have more than 3, except ESL which can have 6).
    - In total next year we will have 25, but we have four empty seats as our total allotment is 29.
    - Election Protocol - this will take place on May 25. Immediately after the new council members are

seated, we will start the election of officers.

- There are four spots, President, First Vice President, Second Vice President, and Secretary. Officers shall be elected from the Council immediately after the newly elected Council members are seated. The President must be a tenured faculty at CCSF. The term of the office is for one year.
- The Election Committee will take nominations for the office of President, it must be seconded and the nominees must state if they accept. After all candidates are nominated, each can make a statement and we will have a roll call vote of the newly formed Executive Council will take place for each officer role.
- Want to encourage everyone, even those who are new to the Council to run for an officer position. I ran for an officer position as a new member and it was a great experience for me. It is also a very good time to be an officer because we have collegial consultation and we have not always had a Chancellor who would meet with the Officers. Reassign time - we have 1.9 total reassign time for the officer positions. The President determines how the re-assign time is divided amongst the officers. It is currently 0.8 President, 0.5 VP, 0.2 2nd VP, 0.4 Secretary . Duties can be shifted around based on the team you create.
- Officers can only be selected from the ASEC membership.
- Can you be an officer if you do not have a guaranteed assignment in the coming fall semester? - Our constitution only states that it must be “faculty” but it does not clearly define faculty. In the past some faculty have served when they did not have assignment time.
- Are there any people that we know of on the list of 25 members that will not be here in the fall? - Asking for newly elected members to confirm that they would still like to serve. Do not see that anyone on the ASEC member list is on the layoff list.
- There is nothing in the Constitution as it is written that bars a current faculty member from serving if they lose

their teaching assignment. However, all members must attend and can not miss a certain number of meetings, or they will be removed.
    - The other distinction is for an officer role, if you do not have an assignment then there is nothing that you can be reassigned from.
    - The definition of faculty in the Constitution allows for part-timer participation even if they lose their assignment. Also, part of this definition is under the Union purview. We also have extra seats this year so accepting a seat is not hindering someone else from taking a seat.
    - When officer candidates make their pitches, can others speak on their behalf as well or any other speaking for/oppose as with other items? - No, the process only allows for the officer candidates to make their statements.
    - The document on officer roles is available, but also encourage the council to consider that we are building a team here that will work together and that will help shape the change in culture.
    - Some elected members have asked if we will meet in-person or in Zoom next year - this is something we will need to discuss.
- AFT2121 check in report (5 min)
    - We know that the college does not have a system in place to check for student vaccinations in Noncredit, Library, and Counseling. This is especially important to think about because they're open to the public and there's a push for them to open up over the summer. For credit there is a policy that students must submit their vaccination when they register but as far as we know there is not an actual implementation method for Fall.
    - We don't have information about ventilation in many buildings now faculty have a variety of reactions and opinions about this and i'm not in this room here saying what we should do about it. I am going to tell you what I think we shouldn't do, though, and we

shouldn't pretend this isn't real.
    - Have asked if we are going to be an unvaccinated campus, and we should think about this because it is real. Predict that many classes will pull back to remote if infrastructure is not provided in summer and fall.
    - Layoffs - About half an hour before this meeting started, learned that the Custodial program will be down to one instructor. This is a program that always has full classes and leads to direct job placement.
    - For pink-slipped faculty - if they are assigned in the fall, then they are not laid off. If they are assigned now though, this does not guarantee that they will be still be assigned in the fall. We do not yet have a date for when this will be certain. However, the most important thing for Chairs and Deans is to get these assignments in the schedule.
    - Severance Packages - many faculty are asking about medical benefits. However we need to have nuance with these conversations. We need to save jobs, and a compassionate process for those that will lose their jobs.
    - AFT2121 is having an emergency meeting tomorrow, 3:30-5:30PM.
- Associated Students report (5 min)
    - None at this time.
- EFF Workgroup Updates (5 min)
    - All Academic Senate members have received an invitation to the Canvas shell. You can test drive it and review the collegiality prompts.
    - We will meet next week - asking whether to have faculty self-enroll or auto-enroll. If we enroll everyone, how to we avoid a lot of work for Distance Ed from fielding request to unenroll. However, with auto-enroll there is the potential that someone who is not faculty could enroll and this would require monitoring.
    - Discussion formats - the shell is set up with a new beta discussion format that may work well for our threaded discussions.
    - Please check out the shell and provide any feedback to

the workgroup, which they can discuss at their meeting next week.
    - Right now if we want to communicate with our fellow faculty, we have a limited number of them on EFF. The benefit of being able to give everyone access and the new beta discussion (which puts new discussions at the top) will help us to have a platform where faculty can effectively communicate.
    - Hoping to check out the new Canvas set up in the next week and hope others will play along, even if it's not a deep conversation.
- Degree Works Update (+5 min)
    - Degree Works is an online web-based plan that faculty and students use to monitor progress towards program completion.
    - This provides an accessible way for students to see where they are academically.
    - This is not a substitute to meeting with and staying connected with a counselor.
    - Plan to launch this in the next month. Want to acknowledge those who have worked on this, including the Counseling Center and ITS for working diligently on this the last 7.5 months.
    - Invite you to attend our Degree Works workshops. We will have two more next week.
- Committee on Committees report (5 min)
    - See below.
    - Two Truths & a Lie links for Amy Díaz-Infante & Nicole Oest

V. Consent Agenda 4:00 (5 min)

A. Approval of Minutes from April 27, 2022

Resolution 2022.05.11.5A	**Approval of Minutes: April 27, 2022**
Resolved, that the Executive Council approved the minutes for April 27, 2022.	

Adopted by consent.

B. Approval of Committee Appointments

Resolution 2022.05.11.5B **Appointments to Committees, Task Forces, Work Groups**

Nominations to Committees with Unlimited membership

CTE Steering Committee
- Devlin-Clancy, Maura - CNIT and MAKR - credit - Ocean - re-appointment
- Freedman, Beth - Health Education - credit - Ocean - re-appointment
- Lin, Carina - New Student Counseling - both credit and noncredit - JAD - re-appointment

Noncredit Adult Education Committee
- Law, Fanny - ESL - both credit and noncredit - JAD - re-appointment

Teaching and Learning Technology Roundtable
- Sherman, Kevin - Cinema - credit - Ocean - re-appointment
- Rodriguez, Dora - DSPS - noncredit - Ocean - re-appointment
- Smith, Kristin - English - credit - Ocean - re-appointment
- Nixon, Shannon - Biological Sciences - credit - Ocean - re-appointment

Scholarship
- Chatterjee, Neela - ESL - noncredit - CHNB - re-appointment
- O'Brien, Andrea - Social Sciences - credit - Ocean - re-appointment

Works of Art
- Simon, Leslie - IDST - credit - Ocean - re-appointment
- Lass, Barbara - Behavioral Sciences - credit - Ocean - re-appointment

Nominations to Committees with Limited membership

Honors Issues
- Anchetta, Rebecca - Behavioral Sciences - credit - Ocean - re-appointment
- Reyes, Joe - Biology - credit - Ocean - re-appointment

Pathways
- Sweeney, Megan - Social Science - credit - Ocean - re-appointment

Nominations to AS Workgroups / Task Forces District-Level Committees and Task Forces/Workgroup
Accreditation Steering
- Niosi, Andrea - Library - credit - Ocean - re-appointment

Professional Development
- Simotas, Michelle - English - credit - re-appointment

Adopted by consent.

C. Reaffirmation of Resolution 2021.09.29.5B Continuing Academic Senate Executive Council Authority to Hold Virtual Meetings Pursuant to AB 361
D. Approval of Revised DLAC Committee Description

Resolution 2022.05.11.5D Approval of the Revised DLAC Committee Description

Resolved, that the Executive Council approves the revised DLAC Committee description as presented on May 11, 2022.

Adopted by consent.

E. Appointment of Kimberly Keenan as AS Travel Coordinator for AY 2022-23

Resolution 2022.05.11.5E Appointment of the AS Travel Coordinator for AY 2022-23

Resolved, that the Executive Council appoints Kimberly Keenan as the Academic Senate Travel Coordinator for AY 2022-23.

Adopted by consent.

VI. Old Business (4:05)

A. Education. Policies Committee Recommendations (5 min) Council has directed the following revisions be sent to the accreditation steering committee for input before endorsement. These items will be brought forward for subsequent consideration:

1. Proposed New Board Policy on Nursing Programs
2. Proposed New Administrative Procedure on Nursing Programs
3. Proposed Revision of BP 5.06 Degrees and Certificates
4. Proposed New Administrative Procedure 5.06 Degrees and Certificates

- These were reviewed by the Accreditation Committee and there is no concern about these posing any accreditation issues.
- "Degrees and Awards" was changed to "Degrees and Certificates"
- Minor editorial changes were made from the last review.
- AVC Charles: I am hereby confirming that the [BP/APs align with the Accreditation Standards]. A few notes:
    - BP/AP 5.06 (Degrees and Awards) relates primarily to Standards IIA5, IIA12, and IIA13. AP 5.06 specifically calls out elements in the Standards such as the minimum units for degrees, the number of units required in general education, and the requirements regarding "focused study in at least one area of inquiry" (major).
    - The new BP and AP on Nursing Programs somewhat relate to Standards IIC6 and IIC7; perhaps more importantly, I understand that they are legally required.
- There are no major changes but Ed Policies will be reviewing all of these policies as part of a regular review. This will also be someting that we can include in our accreditation report.

Resolution 2022.05.11.6A Endorsement of the Education Policies Committee Recommendations

Resolved, that the Executive Council endorses the Education Policies Committee recommended revisions to BPCCLC 4106- Nursing Programs, CCLC AP 4106-Nursing Programs, BP 5.06 Degrees and Certificates, and AP 5.06 Degrees and Certificates.

Motion to Adopt
Moved: Monica Bosson; **Seconded:** Mitra Sapienza

Adopted by consensus.

B. Online training workgroup update (5 min) Council will be updated on implementation status of the recommendations made by this group.
    - Last meeting we passed multiple resolutions by the Online Workgroup. The DEA resolution is in process of implementation.
    - The resolution on minimum training requirements went to consultation and expect that the Office of Online Learning will respond to the resolution at the next ASEC meeting.
    - Any further update on the DEA resolution? - Was brought directly to consultation, agreement that it is a 10+1 item, was endorsed by the Chancellor who has asked what Curriculum Committee needs to change to respond to this. The Curriculum Committee may need to update to be explicit about the new process.
    - The DEA work was not originally part of the Curriculum Committee so it shouldn't be a problem to make this change.
    - This illustrates how at every level of this institution that we can't make assumptions. For example, the assumption is made that when a department approves the DEA that they'd had the conversation that that course is acceptable for delivering online. These types of things are not about process but about clarity.
    - This is a wonderful opportunity to look at how DEAs are processed and to make sure it is meeting all of the accreditation requirements.
C. Response to Faculty Layoffs (10min) Council will discuss and take action in response to the recently approved full time faculty layoffs including consideration of resolutions expressing the position of the Academic Senate on these actions (Draft Resolution Acknowledging Faculty in Response to Faculty Layoffs) and (Draft Resolution on Faculty Input in Budgeting and Planning)
    - It was clear that the 38 faculty who have been laid off were laid off by no fault of their own. The first resolution is to acknowledge the faculty and respond to the layoffs.
    - This is a statement of support and acknowledgment of the faculty who continued with their excellent work while being laid off.
    - It is important to list their names and to acknowledge them as people, not just numbers on a list.

- The intent is to call out mismanagement and support our colleagues. However, is this going to be an accreditation issue for the ASEC to put out something in writing that is so damaging to the school? - There are accreditation standards that refer to how the college communicates and talks to each other, and it would be disingenuous for us to pretend that we do. I think our biggest issue for accreditation is the finances and this could be viewed in conjunction with the belt-tightening. We also shouldn't be afraid to be honest.
- There are a great deal of issues about the reality of the budget, as presented by John Al Amin and we may have to bite that bullet in our accreditation report because it's going to come out. Last night SF Unified voted to not move forward with layoffs of 120 employees; they redirected some administration to other positions within the district and have a $5M deficit.
- The word management comes from the French word "manège" - to put a bit in the mouth of a horse to lead it. We are supposed to have administrators, which is to serve the college. We do have to be truthful and we are still writing to the standards.
- This is intended to celebrate those that are losing their jobs and to codify evidence that it was not a result of any of their doing. This was written not for accreditation, but centering faculty who are losing their jobs.

Motion to Extend Time by 2 Minutes
Moved: Mitra Sapienza; Seconded: Katryn Wiese

- I very much want to honor our colleagues who have lost their jobs, I just don't like that paragraph that says this has happened because of other things that that faculty have been involved in and, in particular, the tenure process itself as part of the problem. I don't think it would help if we don't include that and we just say through mismanagement, period.
- Can we just do a friendly amendment to remove that paragraph? - Friendly amendment made.

Motion Extend Time by 3 Minutes:
Moved: Monica Bosson; Seconded: Katryn Wiese

Resolution 2022.05.11.6C **Acknowledging Faculty in Response to Faculty Layoffs**

Whereas the CCSF Board of Trustees took action at a special meeting on May 6, 2022 to effectuate layoffs of 38 full time faculty members, almost all of whom were tenured with 15 of them being awarded Tenure within one month of their termination and,

Whereas over 375 community members attended, and over one-hundred members of the public made comment for over two hours spoke in support of the retention of these 38 full-time faculty members, the hundreds of part-time faculty members who will also be laid off, and the unprecedented breaking of Tenure contracts at the college;

Whereas the rationale provided for these proposed layoffs had nothing to do with job performance, teaching excellence, quality of academic work, or contributions to the college, and was instead predicated by a lack of adequate programmatic planning and fiscal mismanagement at the college which the Academic Senate has previously addressed through multiple resolutions, [1,2,3] and

Therefore be it resolved that the CCSF Academic Senate commend and express its heartfelt appreciation to the following faculty for their excellent service to the college, who have continued to serve students even while going through the process of being laid off.

Tanya E. Lyles	Aircraft Maintenance Technology
Kenyon Verbeckmoes	Aircraft Maintenance Technology
Michelle Nermon	Architecture
Agustus Barone	Automotive
Bo Hong	Automotive
Lisa DiGirolamo	Biological Sciences
George Peterson Jr.	Broadcast Electronic Media Arts
Carole Meagher	Business
Michael Needham	Business
Clayton Viertel	Business
Mia Rusali	Business
Allen Fung	Business
Mai T Hurt	Chemistry
Emily Chu	Chemistry
Tamika Jones	Computer Networking and Information
Kathleen Marquez	Counseling

Adriana Rivera	Counseling
Alexandra Kaplan	Counseling
Michael D'Aloisio	Counseling
Golnar Afshar	Engineering & Technology
Johnna Scheffer	English
Elizabeth Smith	English
Kyle Hill	English
Erik Green	English
Alissa Buckley	English
Christian Olmos	English
Leila Easa	English
Ronald Richardson	English
Jenny Tabarracci	Environmental Horticulture & Floristry
John Salansang	EOPS
Arlene Bugayong	EOPS
Lori Admokom	ESL
Angela Blackwell	ESL
Maggie Frankel	Library & Learning Resources
Katrina Rahn	Library & Learning Resources
Jill Evans (Johnsen)	Physics
Patricia Miller	Theater Arts
Jacques Arceneaux	World Languages & Cultures

Motion to Adopt
Moved: Katryn Wiese; **Seconded:** Mitra Sapienza

Ayes: Abigail Bornstein, Monica Bosson, Steven Brown, Erik Christianson, Amy Diaz-Infante, Katia Fuchs, Wynd Kaufmyn, Jesse Kolber, Nicole Oest, Dana Jae Labrecque, Fanny Law, Jeanette Male, Michele McKenzie, Sheri Miraglia, Madeline Mueller, Joe Reyes, Mitra Sapienza, Michele Sieglitz, Chad Stephenson, Fred Teti, Katryn Wiese

Nays: Lisa Romano

Motion Carries.

Not Present: Lenny Carlson, Kimberly Keenan, Stephanie MacAller, Lou Schubert

VII. New Business (4:25)

A. Student Trustee voting rights (10 min) Council will discuss and take action on a recommendation from the SESC in regard to student trustee voting rights. Student Equity Strategies Committee (SESC) Resolution to Honor Student Voice

- Resolution brought forth by the Student Equity Strategies Committee. We are very frustrated with the state of affairs. This resolution is to have the Student Trustee have more power rather than advisory role. We feel that Student Trustee is a powerful voice, usually a BIPOC voice. This voice is sometimes laughed off when not included. We want this position to be taken more seriously.
- Why is it that the Student Trustee only has an advisory role and not a vote? - There are a few community colleges that have Student Trustees with full voting rights. It has been expressed by our BOT that there are liability issues that the advisory role protects the student from, but we believe there are creative solutions to this.
- Thank you for putting this together and bringing it forward. If we vote for this, what would a hypothetical process look like for this to be put into practice? - This is a well-written resolution because it asks to work together to find solutions. It is not telling the BOT exactly how to do it (for example if something where illegal). If this passed today, it would be brought forward to Collegial Consultation and he would be obliged to bring it to the BOT. There is precedent for this and it would take those implementing it to kind of take ownership of the process and in my mind.
- Is the current Student Trustee involved in the drafting of this? - yes, the Student Trustee has had their eyes on this since it began months ago. They want it to come from the SES so that it is not about individuals but about the position. President Heather Brandt has also been involved.
- This is a first read, is it urgent that it be voted on today? - We would like for it to happen today with everything that has been happening at our college. One of the integral pieces of this is that at every BOT meeting, they forget to ask for the advisory vote. This enforces that this vote is not taken seriously. If we pass it today, it could be begin being considered at the next May 19 Board meeting.
- It is very well-written for investigation and I just want those who are investigating to really know that San Francisco has a unique charter language about how elections of our board works. So in investigating I think that's where we might run up against some legal charter language, for example, we're the only school if we

have a vacancy on our Board of Trustees the Mayor appoints the substitute. Just giving a heads up to those looking into this, but it is absolutely needed at this point.

- Have no issue with this but don't see how this follows under 10+1 - Believe this falls under "student success".
- Student Trustee has been treated horribly, it's so blatant. But also it could lead to having an even number of votes which may pose a logistical issue.
- I watch the board meeting last Friday, and it was extremely painful and I have to commend Malinalli for his persistence and the courage and the bravery, for which he spoke up against layoffs because Davila came out aggressive and angry the minute the Zoom turned on.

Motion to Adopt:
Moved: Steven Brown; Seconded: Monica Bosson
Adopted by Consensus

Resolution 2022.05.11.7A **Resolution to Honor Student Voice**

Whereas, the voice of the Student Trustee is not sufficiently acknowledged, heard, and integrated into policy decisions; and,

Whereas, the Student Trustee's advisory vote gets repeatedly overlooked during Board of Trustees meetings, indicating a lack of attention and prioritization of the advisory vote and the substantive inclusion of the voice of the CCSF Student Trustee;

Whereas, the Student Senate of California Community Colleges (SSCCC) has proposed a Student Trustee Full Rights and Responsibilities Resolution that requests "that the Student Senate for California Community College will advocate for legislation that would require the student trustee position on a district's board of trustees be given full rights, responsibilities and privileges as regular trustee members"; and

Whereas, the CCSF Academic Senate Resolution 2020.11.18.6D Resolution on Diversity, Equity and Inclusion states "that the Academic Senate affirms its core values to promote student leadership and inclusion in college governance by supporting students of color through political education and leadership development opportunities in order to empower students and the institution that serves them.

Therefore, be it resolved that the Academic Senate affirms that voice of the Student Trustee be acknowledged, heard, and integrated into policy decisions and urges the

CCSF Board of Trustees to give the CCSF Student Trustee a formal vote; and,

Be it resolved that the Academic Senate recommend City College of San Francisco Board of Trustees work, in collaboration with student leaders, to find solutions to the reasons that the CCSF Student Trustee does not currently have full rights and responsibilities and not wait for a state mandate that supports these efforts;

Be it further resolved that while the Board works to attain the CCSF Student Trustee full rights and responsibilities, that the Academic Senate urges the Board of Trustees to ensure that the Student Trustee advisory vote is asked for at the start of every vote, and that the Board of Trustees will take time to fully understand the reasoning for and potential policy impact of the Student Trustee's advisory vote.

Motion to Adopt:
Moved: Steven Brown; **Seconded:** Monica Bosson

Adopted by consensus.

- Student Trustee is not included in closed session. But if they have a vote, then they would de-facto be prrt of this. Part of closed session is when they discuss personnel issue that a student isn't privy to

B. Categorical Funding Priorities (10 min) Council will receive a presentation from the FAN 5 group at the college be asked to receive and endorse a report detailing the categorical funding requests for next year (FAN 5 report on summary of priorities for funding year 2022-23)

- Fan 5 is the nickname for the allocation workgroup that helps coordinate categorical funds with College-wide mandates.
- This includes ASEC committees that work with these allocations as well as Online Learning & Education Technology, RISE Guided Pathways, and colleagues from ASEC and Classified Senate.
- Each allocation has a plan that is defined by the State. They have processes for soliciting input, goals, metrics, etc.
- ASEC has involvement on the front end when we are getting ready to approve the plans. The ASEC President is one of the official signers when these plans go to the State.
- ASEC Committees have an important role in reviewing requests and prioritizing them.

- The priorities for Fan5 are being shared, which were developed by the committees. We will come back in September to give you an update on what actually happened with those lists of priorities.
- The purpose of presenting it today is to be able to document that that was presented to the academic Senate, as part of this process that we have read and accepted that list as it's been reported to us. Part of this is also because funding decisions of moving forward on those items are going to be coming back next meeting.
- Shout out to the committees that work on reviewing all of these, and big thank you to Cherisa. Thank you to Mitra and Simon as well for all of the unseen work that you do.
- Even though I have strong feelings about different priorities, see that they went through a thorough review of the committees.
- The cabinet and the Chancellor felt these were very solid.

C. Noncredit Adult Education Committee Academic Senate resolution: (10 min) NCAE committee will give a presentation calling for Reinstating lifelong continuing education in the CCSF mission statement

- Noncredit Committee's purpose is to look at various issues, not just with noncredit, but really also how to serve the community; so we look at access.
- Engaged in reflective process of reviewing past mission statements, starting in 1997. In 1997 it included life-long learning. It also included all action words because it is our responsibilities.
- In 2012 it changed from verbs to nouns, but does include life-long learning.
- In 2014, life-long learning was removed and added language that college provides other programs only when resources allow.
- Our current statement brings back life-long learning but removed "only" when referring to resources.
- We would like to propose new language to include "equitable and accessible access" to life-long learning through credit and noncredit programs.
- Am very much in support of life-long learning; can we not also include "achievement". This is a broad term and can imply different goals.
- This is a bigger issue than the Academic Senate. What we initiate here might also come with a resolution to regularly review our mission. What we need right now is to recommit to our mission and would like to move forward with the idea that we need to have this conversation college-wide. We need more discussion college-wide.

- Friendly amendment to include "promoting student achievement"

Resolution 2022.05.11.7C **Reinstating Lifelong Continuing Education in the CCSF Mission Statement**

Whereas the CCSF mission statement has omitted "lifelong continuing education" since 2012, and

Whereas the CCSF mission statement is obligated to reflect the role of CCSF as the adult education provider of the City and County of San Francisco, including providing lifelong educational opportunities for all adult age groups for personal and professional development and

Whereas student access to CCSF's educational programs and student services requires CCSF to offer classes and student services across the City at a variety of locations and

Whereas the CCSF mission statement is one of the guiding documents for CCSF administrative, instructional, and departmental decision making, therefore

Be it resolved that the current CCSF mission statement:
Consistent with our Vision, City College of San Francisco provides educational programs and services that promote student achievement and life-long learning to meet the needs of our diverse community.

Be replaced with:
Consistent with our Vision, City College of San Francisco is committed to ***promoting student achievement and*** *providing open and equitable access to* ***lifelong continuing education*** *with the highest standards for credit and noncredit instruction to meet the needs of our diverse community.*

Motion to Adopt
Moved: Dana Jae Labrecque; **Seconded:** Abigail Bornstein

Adopted by consensus.

- Encourage further college-wide discussion on this. Encourage others to volunteer on any committee to review the mission.

- The Chancellor is in support of life-long learning and has mentioned that he's looking to link up with other colleges around us that are in support of that also.
- Important that we spread the word about the passing of this resolution, we then gain more support across the college.

VII. Future Agenda Items- a brief check in with council on timing, goals, and development of future agenda items will be discussed at the end of each meeting (5 min)

A. https://jamboard.google.com/d/1RHW4LP8il_UmrxZGtVjebs1Z_aycZdzz9zihOTzpfPo/edit?usp=sharing

- Two Truths & a Lie

VIII. Adjournment (5:00pm)

Resolutions:

Committee Appointments

II. Nominations to Committees with Unlimited membership

- CTE Steering Committee
  - o Devlin-Clancy, Maura - CNIT and MAKR - credit - Ocean - re-appointment
  - o Freedman, Beth - Health Education - credit - Ocean - re-appointment
  - o Lin, Carina - New Student Counseling - both credit and noncredit - JAD - re-appointment
- Noncredit Adult Education Committee
  - o Law, Fanny - ESL - both credit and noncredit - JAD - re-appointment
- Teaching and Learning Technology Roundtable
  - o Sherman, Kevin - Cinema - credit - Ocean - re-appointment
  - o Rodriguez, Dora - DSPS - noncredit - Ocean - re-appointment
  - o Smith, Kristin - English - credit - Ocean - re-appointment
  - o Nixon, Shannon - Biological Sciences - credit - Ocean - re-appointment
- Scholarship
  - o Chatterjee, Neela - ESL - noncredit - CHNB - re-appointment

    - o O'Brien, Andrea - Social Sciences - credit - Ocean - re-appointment
- Works of Art
    - o Simon, Leslie - IDST - credit - Ocean - re-appointment
    - o Lass, Barbara - Behavioral Sciences - credit - Ocean - re-appointment

III. Nominations to Committees with Limited membership

- Honors Issues
    - o Anchetta, Rebecca - Behavioral Sciences - credit - Ocean - re-appointment
    - o Reyes, Joe - Biology - credit - Ocean - re-appointment
- Pathways
    - o Sweeney, Megan - Social Science - credit - Ocean - re-appointment

IV. Nominations to AS Workgroups / Task Forces District-Level Committees and Task Forces/Workgroup

- Accreditation Steering
    - o Niosi, Andrea - Library - credit - Ocean - re-appointment

Upcoming/Returning agenda items

- Endorsement of Technology Adoption Rubric (min) This item was discussed and feedback was provided on 1/23. At our last meeting it was pulled from a consent, and is waiting for further refinement before coming back to the council.
- Committee Description revision: Pathways
- FSA resolution and action revisit- being addressed in FSA workgroup
- CCSF-Bayview/Hunters Point Community Education Plan. - Discussion. Last meeting a request was made to continue the review of the educational plan for the Bayview/Hunters point community. The council will continue this discussion and potentially take action on adopting this plan.
- Draft Resolution in progress recommending naming of Walkway in Honor of Ellen Wall

Academic and Professional Matters over which the Senate Has Purview (10+1)

- Curriculum, including establishing prerequisites.
- Degree and certificate requirements.
- Grading policies.
- Educational program development.
- Standards or policies regarding student preparation and success.
- College governance structures, as related to faculty roles.
- Faculty roles and involvement in accreditation processes.
- Policies for faculty professional development activities.
- Processes for program review.
- Processes for institutional planning and budget development.
- Other academic and professional matters as mutually agreed upon.

Land Acknowledgement

"We acknowledge that we are on the unceded ancestral homeland of the Ramaytush Ohlone who are the original inhabitants of the San Francisco Peninsula. As the indigenous stewards of this land and in accordance with their traditions, the Ramaytush Ohlone have never ceded, lost nor forgotten their responsibilities as the caretakers of this place, as well as for all peoples who reside in their traditional territory. As guests, we recognize that we benefit from living and working on their traditional homeland. We wish to pay our respects by acknowledging the ancestors, elders and relatives of the Ramaytush Community and by affirming their sovereign
rights as First Peoples."

CCSF Guide to Acronyms