



The Academic Senate

CITY COLLEGE OF SAN FRANCISCO

50 Frida Kahlo Way, Box E-202, San Francisco, CA 94112 (415) 239-3611 Fax (415) 452-5115
www.ccsf.edu/academic-senate email: asenate@ccsf.edu

Curriculum • Degree Requirements • Grading Policies • Program Development • Student Prep & Success • Governance
Accreditation • Professional Development • Program Review • Planning & Budgeting Process • Others as agreed

Note: Copies of the Final Agenda, Resolutions and Materials for the Oct 27, 2021 meeting can be found in the [Materials folder for that meeting](#).

CCSF Academic Senate Executive Council

Minutes and [Sound Recording](#)

Wednesday, 2021 Oct 27, 2:30-5:00pm

Location: Zoom meeting <https://ccsf-edu.zoom.us/j/98353441191>

Phone info: +1 669 900 6833 or +1 253 215 8782 * Meeting ID: 983 5344 1191

Council Members Present: Monica Bosson, Abigail Bornstein, Steven Brown, Erik Christianson, Amy Díaz-Infante, Ekaterina (Katia) Fuchs, Kimberly Keenan, Jennifer Kienzle, Jesse Kolber, Nicole Oest Krup, Simon Hanson, Dana Jae Labrecque, Fanny Law, Stephanie MacAller, Jeanette Male, Michele McKenzie, Carole Meagher, Sheri Miraglia, Madeline Mueller, Joe Reyes, Lisa Romano, Mitra Sapienza, Lou Schubert, Michele Sieglitz, Chad Stephenson, Frederick Teti, Katryn Wiese

Council Members Absent: Lenny Carlson, Wynd Kaufmyn

Other Senate Members Present: J Dawgert Carlin, Lancelot Kao, Malaika Finkelstein, OL Karl Westerberg, Olga Shvarts, Kyle Hill, Rosario Villasana, Tina Wong, Shella Cervantes, Jessica Buchsbaum, Harry Bernstein, Carol Amen, Terence Chuck, Maggie Harrison, Muriel Paranteau

Guests: Mandy Liang, Rachel Cohen, Siwei Tang, Rosie Zepeda

I. Call to Order, 2:36 p.m.

- A. "We acknowledge that we are on the unceded ancestral homeland of the Ramaytush Ohlone who are the original inhabitants of the San Francisco Peninsula. As the indigenous stewards of this land and in accordance with their traditions, the Ramaytush Ohlone have never ceded, lost nor forgotten their responsibilities as the caretakers of this place, as well as for all peoples who reside in their traditional territory. As guests, we recognize that we benefit from living and working on their traditional homeland. We wish to pay our respects by acknowledging the ancestors,

elders and relatives of the Ramaytush Community and by affirming their sovereign rights as First Peoples.”

II. Adoption of Agenda

III. Public Comment

- J Dawgert Carlin - In June 2020, The State Chancellor Office made a "call to action' directing community college leaders to make measurable and sincere actions to address systemic racism in all areas of our operations. The call directly mentioned overview of campus policing and first responder training and curriculum, campus leaders hosting open dialogues and address campus climate, Campuses must audit classroom climate and create an action plan to create inclusive classrooms and anti-racism curriculum, District Boards review and update Equity plans "with urgency" as well as other items.

The Behavioral Sciences Department started to create a video library of anti-racism and equity educational components. After completing the first collection of videos, the chair began seeking a place to house them and make them available to any who may find them useful. The vision is for them to be used as anyone chooses--personal viewing, professional development, class modules, as discussion prompts in department meetings, or as a templates for faculty to create their own related material. We consider them to be form of "open source".

We have found places to share this free library of resources through a collaboration with the Office of Equity and OLEC. The videos are being placed in a canvas module.

This module will be placed on the Faculty Resource Center, the Office of Equity Home Page, and released when the new Canvas course shells for Spring come out to all faculty in December. These are **optional** resources for people to use and reference. The current collection in the first release will include:

Using "Science to Deny Humanity:The Troubling History of Race Science and Its Legacies Today-Sarah Ives; White Racial Identity Development-Lisa Harrison; Philippine Identity and Experience in the Bay-Lily An Villaraza; Racism in Child Welfare System and how that Impacts Community College Students- Lark Baum; Reasons for Land Acknowledgment and Indigenous Experiences in the Bay Area- Barbara Lass; Disproportionate Impacts of Policing- Blayke Barker; Mental Health Impacts of Microaggressions- Jen Managdo; Trans 101- Ardel Thomas For Spring (so far): Queering the Classroom-What Queer Students want their instructor to know- Mark Shrayber; An Introduction to Ethnic Studies-Vika

Palaita; The Myth of the Meritocracy-Don't Lie to Students About What will Make them Successful in Class-Carlin

Thank you for getting the word out about this project. If you have contributions to the library, please email jcarlin@ccsf.edu. This is a free and open space."

- Nicole Oest - Register for the Artist Talk with Emory Douglas in Zoom: Thurs., Oct. 28, 6 PM:
https://sfmoma-org.zoom.us/webinar/register/WN_10TlAcOyR2Witiz3UfQUYg. Thank you to librarians Michele McKenzie and Dayna Holz for putting together the Emory Douglas and Black Panther Research Guide:
<https://library.ccsf.edu/emorydouglas>
- Abigail Bornstein - Resignations in Payroll is a huge concern. In referring to the budget, the BOT is confusing the 50% rule and faculty obligation number (FON) along with this massive turnover. This has a big impact for faculty.
- Dana Jae Labrecque - Chairs were previously able to view the schedule for the following semester in "galley" mode. This year it is a downloadable spreadsheet in CourseLeaf that is difficult to use. This makes it hard to correct things. It is also very difficult for chairs to continue to work as building monitors; this takes up a lot of time.
- Steven Brown - CourseLeaf software is more work to use. Administration is threatening to lay off a large chunk of classified staff, which would have a huge impact on our college and creates a hostile environment to work in. Encourage faculty to speak up about this at the BOT meeting.
- Rosario Villasana - CourseLeaf takes twice as much work to get done, and when we go back in-person and need to schedule room usage, this will be an even heavier load. We may need a taskforce to look at this.
- Harry Bernstein - According to the attached Notice of Intent to adopt a mitigated negative declaration (MND) for the Evans Center renovation and the relocation of the AMT program to the Evans Center, "the proposed final MND, including responses to any public comments received, shall be made available to the public by November 29, 2021 on CCSF's Office of Facilities and Capital Planning website." [I could see the long web address in the attachment, but could not copy it or access the site therefrom.] If this matter is on the Board of Trustees agenda by December 3, the Board "may consider adoption of the MND and approval of the Project at such time." That is, over the serious objections of many in the Bayview/Hunters Point community, after the District refutes, downplays or dismisses community concerns (by Nov. 29), they want the Board to go ahead and approve this Initial Study, skip a full environmental study, i.e., the CEQA process (which

the Office of Facilities asserts is unnecessary due to the negligible need of mitigation) and proceed to implement the changes discussed in the Initial Study. Two main points. The attached notice is about the extension of time to submit public comment on the Office of Facilities' Initial Study--until November 18. An earlier request in September to extend the comment period for 30 days was rejected; no reason whatever was given for this unexpected 30-day extension. The second point, and it may be the essential one, is that Dr. David Martin will be arriving soon. He would have to sign off on this plan in order for it to go ahead. He may be able to understand this project with fresh ears and try to find out why the District has given up on the logical alternative--returning the Aircraft Maintenance Technology program to SFO--that's a location that it was designed for. This may be a political issue as much as it is an educational one--that includes the many remaining students who were unable to finish the program and for whom the help in completing the program that was offered by the District has been withdrawn. Those students are on their own now. (That's what I last heard.)

IV. Reports

- Officer reports
 - President Hanson
 - Encourage members to reach out outside of meetings via email and Friday morning office hours.
 - There is overlap across different groups - for example, labor issues which are under the union purview and academic issues which are under the ASEC purview. An example of this is the DCC resolution in this meeting's materials folder/consent agenda.
 - Area B Meeting - meeting of the local academic senates in preparation for the state plenary session next week (ASEC officers, Fred Teti, and Katia Fuchs will be attending plenary). Resolutions packet for plenary where reviewed and are in our materials folder from the last ASEC meeting; notes from Area B meeting are in this week's materials folder. This reflects what is happening at the state level (two legislations were passed last year that were opposed by the ASCCC). There are many colleges understaffed and looking for

administrators right now.

- BOT Meeting tomorrow - ASEC President has been asked to provide a written report in advance of the meeting. This is in our materials folder and an oral update will also be given tomorrow. This report includes resolution on following the Brown Act, which has administrative support as well though acknowledging concerns around timeline, particularly given lower staff levels.
 - PGC Budget Report from AVC Tom Boegel - the spreadsheet is included in the materials folder. This is a planning document, intended to stimulate discussion, make us aware and afraid of the fiscal cliff, the budget complexity; but there is also criticism of this document and it does not align with our actual numbers.
 - TLTR Committee Rubric - this committee is working on a rubric for adopting new technology. This is going to the Tech Committee this week and will come to the ASEC on a future agenda.
- 1st Vice President Sapienza
 - Co-Chairs of Program Review Committee - Andrew King and Dora Dye will serve as co-chairs.
 - Associated Students - working on Parent Pathway and Academic Integrity issues.
 - Love Poem to Current ASEC - [Please Join Awards & Recognition Workgroup](#)
 - Love Poem to Faculty (not on ASEC) - Please sign up to become an Election Commissioner
 - 2nd Vice President Stephenson
 - In-Person Registration at Centers - city beginning to return to normal life.
 - Faculty Survey Results - appreciation for all of the respondents to the survey. Consider various locations and if they are being represented at meetings, and please encourage them to join. ASEC Officers are looking at how we can stay connected as we open back

up.

- Secretary Diaz-Infante
 - Emory Douglas workshop with CCSF students at SFMOMA taking place on Friday. Students were also engaged in graphic design for publicity (Emerge Studio); and in documentation (student photographer engaged).

- AFT2121 check in report
 - Building Monitors - Constituents have come to an agreement that starting on Nov 8, there will be assigned and paid monitors (faculty and classified staff). Faculty will no longer need to monitor the door while they teach their class. This is starting Nov 8 but will likely take time to get up to full speed. Those who have worked previously as monitors will not be retro-actively compensated.
 - Bargaining Meeting - Administration did not show up to the meeting (internet connection and scheduling issues) while faculty waited one hour. Encourage more faculty to attend; every Monday at 1PM. Link to the open bargaining session is at AFT2121 website.

- Associated Students report
 - [Written Report submitted by ASC Student Chancellor Siwei Tang.](#)

- Committee on Committees report
 - See Below, nominations to multiple committees and Online Training workgroup.

- Office of Student Equity Professional Development Report
 - Professional Development Offerings - new offerings from the Office of Student Equity; and please reach out to Kyle Hill for feedback or requests for different options.
 - Other activities include creating a Community of Practice, a

Film Festival to spark dialogues, and a Listen & Learn Series to learn about student support services.

- Equity Times Newsletter - check it out to see what we have planned this semester.

- Constitution Workgroup report
 - Workgroup has met twice now.
 - [Presentation](#) to review the context of where we left off last semester and next steps. Updates to the Constitution and updates to Bylaws have different thresholds for changing.
 - Election Timeline - We can change the timeline, only needs to be *at least* four weeks prior to election.
 - Listening Sessions - this is key to include in the timeline to make sure everyone understands what they are voting on.
 - Representation - need more representation from non credit, part-time, and BIPOC faculty.
 - Resolution - draft presented to update department list; will come back at next meeting to vote on.

- EFF Workgroup report
 - Survey created for faculty input, will share out results once they are compiled.

- Ed. Policies update
 - Catalog Rights - update to allow students impacted by the pandemic to use catalog rights of previous years to receive graduation credit, by being granted excused academic absence due to COVID. (Believe ADTs may be approved, but students missing Area F would need to complete that after transfer).
 - Students who petitioned for graduation in Fall 2020 and also working on ADT putting off for one more semester. This was prior to Area F implementation, and trying to go back and use Fall 2020 again as they did not know implications of Area F implementation prior. - This situation does not relate to students being granted an excused academic leave.
 - This is only a CSU situation, but IGETC is in process of being

revised for adding a new Ethnic Studies area. Should be passed in December.

- According to CSU definition of catalog rights, does conferral of a degree bring a block of catalog rights to an end, as it does at CCSF? - This question has been posed and a final confirmation has not been received, but generally they are more stringent and confer just one degree, not multiple.

V. Consent Agenda

A. Approval of Minutes from [Oct. 13, 2021](#)

Resolution 2021.10.27.5A**Approval of Minutes: Oct 13, 2021**

Resolved, that the Executive Council approved the minutes for [Oct 13, 2021](#).

Adopted by consent.

B. Approval of Committee Appointments

■ Distance Education Training Workgroup

Resolution 2021.10.27.5B
Forces, Work Groups**Appointments to Committees, Task****Nominations to Committees with Unlimited membership****Noncredit Adult Education committee**

-- Beck, Sarah Liv - DSPS (mission) - noncredit - re-appointment

Nominations to Committees with Limited membership**Faculty Professional Development committee**

-- Shvarts, Olga - DSPS (Ocean) - both credit and noncredit - new appointment

International Education Advisory committee

-- Motamedi, Isabel - World Languages and Cultures (Ocean) - credit - new appointment

Pathways committee

-- Lansang, Jean - LVN (JAD) - credit - new appointment

-- Wong, James - New Student Counseling (JAD) - both credit and noncredit - new appointment

**Nominations to AS Workgroups / Task Forces
District-Level Committees and Task Forces / Workgroup
Online Training Workgroup**

- Christina Yanuaria, ESL
- Fred Teti, Math (OLET)
- Mitra Sapienza, English (OSE)
- Sheri Miraglia, Biology
- Jen Kienzle, Comm Studies (OLET)
- Katryn Wiese, Earth Sciences (DLAC)
- Megan Sweeny, Poli Sci (CC)
- Wanda Ziemba, Health Care Technology, JAD (CC)
- Denah Johnston, Cinema (DCC)
- Jessica Buchsbaum, ESL (DCC)
- Michelle Simotas, English (DCC)
- Olga Galvez, DSPS (DCC)
- Jonathan Potter, Computer Science (DCC)
- Darlene Alioto, History (DCC)
- Kevin Sherman, Cinema
- Amy Lawlor, English
- Claudia Ferreira Da Silva, CNIT
- Susan Schall, ESL
- Lijia Lumsden, IDST
- Jen Giang-Icasiano, Asian American Studies

Adopted by consent.

C. [Teaching and Learning Roundtable committee description](#)

**Resolution 2021.10.27.5C
Committee Description**

Approval of Teaching and Learning

Resolved, that the Executive Council approves the Teaching and Learning Roundtable Committee Description.

Adopted by consent.

- D. Adoption of Resolution: [Modifying the CCSF catalog rights policy to accommodate students affected by the pandemic and by the new CSU G.E. Area F requirement](#)

Resolution 2021.10.27.5D **Modifying the CCSF catalog rights policy to accommodate students affected by the pandemic and by the new CSU G.E. Area F requirement**

Whereas, CCSF Students petitioning for an ADT this academic year using the CSU G.E. pattern must satisfy the new Area F (Ethnic Studies) requirement. However, CCSF has no courses currently certified for Area F; and

Whereas, Most such students may use earlier academic years' Catalog rights and thus avoid the new Area F requirement. However, many other such students lost their earlier Catalog rights because of a pandemic-related enrollment interruption; and

Whereas, It is Title 5-compliant (and precedented) for CCSF to modify its Catalog rights policy to allow certain students to retain Catalog rights they might otherwise not have had; therefore be it

Resolved, that the CCSF Academic Senate recommend to the College that the Catalog Rights Policy be modified as follows:

Students who (1) petition for an ADT this academic year (2021–2022), (2) were enrolled at CCSF in either semester of academic year 2019–2020, and (3) had an enrollment interruption after 2019 may exercise Catalog rights as if there had been no such interruption *and that these students have had an approved educational leave, in the sense of [Title 5 §40401](#).*

A&R will compose a special graduation-petition addendum for counselors to complete and attach to their students' ADT graduation petitions.

All counselors whose usual load includes evaluating students for graduation will receive training to evaluate these students' Catalog rights and their eligibility to graduate.

Some students might have Catalog rights in an academic year during which the ADT they seek was not available. These students may “split” their Catalog rights, satisfying one catalog’s G.E. requirements and another catalog’s major requirements.

These students will be advised of all possible ways to meet graduation requirements, including the modified Catalog rights described above, using the IGETC pattern, and passing a CVC-OEI Area-F-certified course. (The College should provide students choosing the CVC option with information about how to defray the CVC fees.)

Resolution is [as proposed by the Education Policies Committee]

Adopted by consent.

E. Endorsement of [DCC Administrator Evaluation Resolution](#)

Resolution 2021.10.27.5E

DCC Resolution on Administrator Evaluation

WHEREAS, City College of San Francisco had for over 20 years, an inclusive administration evaluation process where:

a) All employees supervised by a specific administrator were allowed to evaluate that administrator (e.g., all department chairs had an opportunity to evaluate their school Dean; all employees in an office had an opportunity to evaluate their supervisor;)

b) All employees who had frequent contact with an administrator (although not under direct supervision) had the opportunity to evaluate that administrator (e.g., all chairs had an opportunity to evaluate their Vice Chancellor; all chairs and faculty at a Campus had the opportunity to evaluate the Campus Dean/administrator, i.e., faculty and Chairs at the Downtown Campus could evaluate the Downtown Campus Dean/administrator, etc.)

c) A shorter, scantron questionnaire was made available through the Academic Senate for faculty who wished to have input into any administrative evaluation; and

WHEREAS, past administrative evaluations were vehicles to both validate the strengths of an administrator as well as tools for noting possible paths for improvement; and

WHEREAS, CCSF has for the last several years, eliminated any opportunity for the

above which puts us, as an institution, at greater risk for the accreditation process; and

WHEREAS, all administrators/directors should be regularly evaluated and held accountable in an inclusive and authentic evaluation process; therefore

BE IT RESOLVED, that the Department Chairperson Council (DCC) requests that the Chancellor immediately reinstate the previous administrator evaluation process or work with the College constituency groups to create a similar inclusive and authentic evaluation process; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, that the DCC ask the Academic Senate and all constituent groups to join in this request.

Adopted by consent.

VI. Old Business

A. Program Review Committee Update - (2 min) Updates to the ongoing program review process will be provided as well as recommendations from the Program Review Committee

- Resolution on Program Review recommendations was passed at last meeting and is moving forward.
- DCC has been contacted to request greater DCC representation on Program Review Committee to align planning with budget processes.
- Need to continue conversations and include recommendations for where to have these conversations, and recommendations on processes. We should understand what prompts and data should be communicated to departments in order to write program review.
- This will be an on-going item to make space for recommendations to come forward as we plan.
- Encourage more faculty to join the Program Review committee. We want to see this become a more dominant issue at the college writ large.
- This was presented at consultation and to the BOT. Will continue to bring forward to overlay programming with the budget planning.

- B. AS Executive Council input on current and future plans, initiatives and ideas for the incoming Chancellor. (10 min) [CCSF Faculty New Chancellor Survey Results](#)
- Results show 16% of faculty responding and report includes ranking of faculty concerns (Registration Enrollment and Growth were top results) and all faculty comments.
 - This survey has been shared in the BOT report and will be shared with the new Chancellor.
 - Includes demographic breakdown of respondents.

VII. New Business 4:07

- A. Exemplary Program Award (13 min) a discussion and determination of program nomination for this year's award submission.
- Nominations - three have submitted; for CEI, ESL, and Women's Resource Center
 - ESL - department has stayed connected to ESL community despite remote instruction format and have recovered $\frac{3}{4}$ of enrollment. Social Justice has been incorporated in the curriculum. New pedagogical and student support resources have been created during pandemic as a result of the great efforts of the program.
 - Women's Resource Center - a student-run program and advised by faculty. Programming, grounded in feminist theory, provides services that respond to inequity and in community healing events. [Sign up for the WRC email list here.](#)
 - CEI - Center for Entrepreneurship and Innovation; harnesses innovational spirit of various departments. This provides students with CEI partners and coaches, and skills that apply to a changing workforce. This program has received national recognition.
 - Nominee selected by Council: Women's Resource Center

**Resolution 2021.10.27.7A
for the Exemplary Program Award**

Nomination of the Women's Resource Center

Resolved, that the CCSF Academic Senate endorses the Women's Resource Center

application for submission to this year's Exemplary Program Award.

Motion to Adopt by Acclamation

Moved: Monica Bosson; **Seconded:** Mitra Sapienza

Not present: Abigail Bornstein, Lenny Carlson, Wynd Kaufmyn,

Adopted by acclamation.

B. Marketing Report 4:20 (15 min) As requested the council will hear a report on the college's current marketing efforts.

- Spring Marketing Plan - \$400K budget; In-Person Non Credit Registration at Centers, Alumni Campaign , Rebranding Messages, Student and Alumni Videos, Pictoral Storytelling, Services (summarizing for students what we offer).
- Local Radio Promotion in various languages, Buses, Shopping Carts, and Digital Campaigns; Career Showcase on Nov 17; Prepared Email Campaigns; Analytics
- Update branding images (photographs by students)
- Printed Schedule - would take up full budget (about \$500K), but welcome feedback. Will look into a short-run.
- Meeting with CBOs and realizing that many thought we were closed and also asked about printed materials
- Notecard - plan to do this again with QR code
- Testimonials - can send to Rosie (rzepeda@ccsf.edu)
- Talk Shows - way to get free advertising; can highlight students and other CCSF members
- What are target goals for marketing efforts? - We are dead last in enrollment. Other colleges are also experiencing enrollment issues. Biggest goal is to not lose more students (prediction is that there will be further fall-off of student enrollment).
- Inter-generational Images - marketing materials should reflect diversity of student ages, and particularly as population ages in SF. Also consider including groups of students versus individuals. -- Budget will now allow us to

license more images; can also send images to Rosie.

- Where are the funds coming from? - part of state money, SB85 Emergency Money; which went to students but the argument was also made that we need marketing to reach out to students.
- Will these presentation slides be made available?
- Feedback on postcard - should include "Free City"
- Alumni Association - is on LinkedIn but not formal.
- HEERF Money - will these funds available for students be included in advertising? We have not used all of these funds.
- CCSF Programs have a regional draw and offers unique programs; this should be included in promotions. - Will be included in FB and other digital adds that can have a broader reach.

C. DSPTS discussion of online Accommodations 4:35 (15 min)

- DSPTS - Contact at dspsacom@ccsf.edu, (415) 452-5481. Muriel: mparente@ccsf.edu, Carol: camen@ccsf.edu.
- Serves 2K students with disabilities; including testing accommodations and adaptive equipment and software.
- All services are currently remote
- Online Instruction - majority of DSPTS students are struggling in this environment. Students are requesting access to instructional content in advance. This has not been done previously but other institutions implement this. Some students need more time to read the content on Canvas.
- Student Recommendations - Content provided earlier by opening up modules ahead of time, mid-week office hour, or additional time to complete assignments.
- Online vs Remote courses - online learning courses tend to open up materials earlier. When possible, this may be a better option for students.
- Online Training - would be good to include DSPTS in review of this training/workgroup.
- Free Software - is there a list of digital resources to assist students with disabilities?
- Qualifications for DSPTS accommodations - in the past there has been more limited access to appropriate documentation for international students. Now there is more flexibility for

assessment. Students who do not qualify are directed to other services.

- D. Student Conduct Discussion: (5 min) Along with Changes in instructional delivery Last year saw changes in student conduct issues as reported by the office of Student Conduct and Discipline ([2020-21 At a Glance Report Student Conduct](#)).
- Item tabled to next meeting
- VIII. Future Agenda Items- a brief check in with council on timing, goals, and development of future agenda items will be discussed at the end of each meeting (5 min)
- IX. Adjournment (5:10pm)