



# The Academic Senate

CITY COLLEGE OF SAN FRANCISCO

50 Frida Kahlo Way, Box E-202, San Francisco, CA 94112 (415) 239-3611 Fax (415) 452-5115  
[www.ccsf.edu/academic-senate](http://www.ccsf.edu/academic-senate) email: [asenate@ccsf.edu](mailto:asenate@ccsf.edu)

Curriculum • Degree Requirements • Grading Policies • Program Development • Student Prep & Success • Governance  
Accreditation • Professional Development • Program Review • Planning & Budgeting Process • Others as agreed

Note: Copies of the Final Agenda, Resolutions and Materials for the Sept 15, 2021 meeting can be found in the [Materials folder for that meeting](#).

## CCSF Academic Senate Executive Council

### Minutes and [Sound Recording](#)

Wednesday, 2021 Sept 15, 2:30-5:00pm

Location: Zoom meeting <https://ccsf-edu.zoom.us/j/98353441191>

Phone info: +1 669 900 6833 or +1 253 215 8782 \* Meeting ID: 983 5344 1191

**Council Members Present:** Abigail Bornstein, Monica Bosson, Steven Brown, Lenny Carlson, Erik Christianson, Amy Díaz-Infante, Ekaterina (Katia) Fuchs, Wynd Kaufmyn, Kimberly Keenan, Jennifer Kienzle, Jesse Kolber, Nicole Oest Krup, Simon Hanson, Dana Jae Labrecque, Fanny Law, Stephanie MacAller, Jeanette Male, Michele McKenzie, Carole Meagher, Sheri Miraglia, Madeline Mueller, Joe Reyes, Lisa Romano, Mitra Sapienza, Lou Schubert, Michele Sieglitz, Chad Stephenson, Frederick Teti, Katryn Wiese

### **Council Members Absent:**

**Other Senate Members Present:** OL Karl Westerberg, Harry Bernstein, Patty Chong-Delon, Dr. Patricia Nunley, Craig Kleinman, Malaika Finkelstein, Christina Yanuaria, Dr. Ramona Coates

**Guests:** Cherisa Yarkin, Holly Stevens, Nicholas Wang, Cynthia Dewar, Michele Alaniz, Pam Mery

### I. Call to Order 2:36 (1min)

- A. "We acknowledge that we are on the unceded ancestral homeland of the Ramaytush Ohlone who are the original inhabitants of the San Francisco Peninsula. As the indigenous stewards of this land and in accordance with their traditions, the Ramaytush Ohlone have never ceded, lost nor forgotten their responsibilities as the caretakers of this place, as well as for all peoples who reside in their traditional territory. As guests, we recognize that we benefit from living and working on their traditional homeland. We wish to pay our respects by acknowledging the ancestors,

elders and relatives of the Ramaytush Community and by affirming their sovereign rights as First Peoples.”

II. Adoption of Agenda 2:3 (4min)

III. Public Comment 2:35 (10 min)

- Sent in by Katia Fuchs, Math 108, A course in Foundations of Data Science, launched by Sean Wiggins received articulation with Data 8 at UC Berkeley. A story about this was published on UC Berkeley website and a link was provided in the chat.
- Fred Teti - Education Policies Committee: received an update from Dean Adrew Yang on the Certificate Auto Petition process, which has yielded thousands of new certificates awarded. Vice Chancellor Boegel requested support from this committee in updating Chpt 6 of the Board Policies Manual. This discussion will continue in the upcoming October meeting.
- Fred Teti - Dean Cynthia Dewar is now overseeing Library and Library Learning Resources in addition to Online Programs and Educational Technology. Plan to return to the AS to suggest a more concise title for this position.
- Madeline Mueller - AB928 legislation, opposed by FACCC and UC Berkeley, has the possibility to greatly and negatively impact our students.
- Harry Bernstein - Emergency statewide rally on Monday, Sept 20 at Board of Governors, calling for statewide policies for all community colleges including vaccine requirements for campuses, providing of N95 masks, and provisions for proper ventilation.
- Harry Bernstein - 1400 Evans retrofitting and study states that few changes would need to be made to fit the Aircraft Maintenance program in the space. The study can be found on the Evans Center community forum page. An environmental impact report was also released. Deadline for public comment is Wednesday, Sept 22.

IV. Reports 2:45

Officer Reports

- President Hanson
  - Student Success & Policy Committee made a presentation to the BOT outlining the protocols for communication between the AS and BOT, and the purview of the AS on 10+1 matters, upon whose recommendations the Board should rely on.

Slides which outline BOT and AS respective responsibilities and 10+1 items are shared in the materials folder. Support provided by AVC Charles and conversation was productive and receptive.

- New Chancellor - was not named at the last board meeting, likely in the next week.
  - Accreditation Writing Team - need for faculty, who are not currently adequately represented, to participate. Contact Simon Hanson, or accreditation co-chairs AVC Kristin Charles or Sheri Miraglia, with any questions.
  - ASCCC Area B Fall Meeting - Friday Oct 15, 10AM-3PM via Zoom.
  - ASCCC Fall Plenary - Nov 4-6, conducted in hybrid format. Please notify ASEC Officers if you would like to attend.
  - Academic Senate Budget - funded out of General Fund and goes primarily to faculty re-assign time. It's difficult to assess the exact amount as this is connected to each faculty member's pay rate. Portion of budget also goes to Classified Support and Supplies and Services (this latter category includes ASCCC dues and Faculty Professional Dev Travel Funds). We would like to get a clearer picture of our budget to provide context on our spending. Our ASEC officers were allocated 2.67FTE in 2018/19, after advocating it was approved at 1.9 and noted for 2.0FTE.
  - Faculty Professional Dev Travel Funds - there was a significant reduction in the amount expended last year as we awaited revised travel parameters due to COVID. Working to get a clear picture on these parameters this year and advocating for more timely information to get funds out to faculty more efficiently.
- First Vice President Sapienza
    - Planning at the college - recognizing the intersection of efforts from Dean Mery and colleagues such as Wynd Kaufman on Enrollment Management Committee to align calendars and working to be more efficient and focused in planning efforts.
    - Program Review Committee - in need of members. This review should fully inform institutional policies and budget allocation. On consent agenda is the adoption of the 2018

Comprehensive Program Review Summary report.

- Election Commissioner - need another commissioner to join Sami Kudsi to complete the team.
- Student Access to Resources - students often connect with programs or resources through casual word of mouth. Office of Student Equity is organizing Listen & Learn Sessions on Tuesdays, 1-2PM are being offered to students and employees to find out about more resources. Details were provided in chat.
- Second Vice President Chad
  - Continuing Mini-Orientations for new ASEC members - These 15 minutes sessions are open to all council members. Today's session was a presentation on parliamentary procedures from Fred Teti.
  - Centers were used to allow people to drop off their ballots; more services are planned to be provided on-site in coming weeks.
- Secretary Díaz-Infante
  - Recognition of Latinx Heritage Month, Sept 15-Oct 15. Of particular significance as CCSF is a Hispanic Serving Institution.
- AFT2121 check in report (5 min)
  - No report at this time
- Associated Students report (5 min)
  - No report at this time
- Committee on Committees report (5 min)
  - Report on appointments approved by committee, list included in the Consent Agenda.
  - Curriculum Committee has been piloting expanding membership. Seeking clarification for the category under which Dr. David Palaita would fall.
  - EFF and ASEC Constitution workgroups have unlimited membership if others would like to join.
- Curriculum Committee Update on Ethinc Studies requirement changes.

- (15 min) -Reference Document: [Area F what Happened](#)
- OEWD Grand Jury Report - calls out Curriculum Committee in item #2 of report. City looking for better coordination between CCSF and OEWD. Committee is seeking 3 additional resource members (in Consent Agenda) to give more support and bring in non-credit representation
  - CSU Area F Ethnic Studies Requirements - Curriculum Committee has been discussing the potential impacts over the past year. 21 courses were submitted in collaboration with ethnic studies faculty to meet CSU core competencies. All 21 courses were rejected and this is prevalent across the state. Disconnect in language used in outlines and core competencies lead to rejections.
  - Resubmission - Courses resubmitted in June (half following one suggested format and half another). Courses are reviewed by CSU ethnic studies faculty; and all resubmissions were also rejected.
  - Resubmission, part 2 - There is a new strategy to resubmit the 21 courses plus two potential cross-listed courses. However, ES outlines will now follow slightly different guidelines than others. Will include new prefix code (IDST not accepted, but ETHN is).
  - CSU Area F required currently and in Fall 2022 CCC will require it as well. This requirement impacts CCSF Area H (which includes Women & Gender and LGBTQ Studies, which could be displaced).
  - Is there a mechanism for relaying these obstacles to the State? Has been voiced at gatherings with statewide representatives and with Curriculum Institute last summer but no substantive response has been made.
  - Resources provided for CSU to meet Ethnic Studies modifications, but not to community colleges.
- Discussing cultural norms on using titles, a Report and discussion about what happened last meeting. (20 min)
    - Review of topic brought forth in previous meeting on how titles can be used to imply or exercise authority over others, and the complexity of the various contexts for this - for example amongst faculty peers versus between faculty and administrators. Interest expressed in creating a standard

around not using titles.

- Also noted was how the use of titles ignores comparable achievements and expertise of CTE faculty.
- Discussion on how creating a norm of not using titles can also be ostracizing for individuals and the added element of erasure for faculty of color, and particularly Black faculty members. This touches on a history of institutionalized racism wherein marginalized populations must over-perform and also a history of not being able to name yourself.
- Support voiced for allowing individuals to determine how they would like to be addressed versus creating a policy on this.
- Time was extended for further discussion, while other members voiced opposition to and questioned the appropriateness of discussing this topic within the Academic Senate meeting.

V. Consent Agenda 3:50 (5 min)

A. Approval of Minutes from [May 26, 2021](#)

|                                 |  |
|---------------------------------|--|
| <b>Resolution 2021.09.15.5A</b> | <b>Approval of Minutes: May 26, 2021</b> |
|---------------------------------|--|

Resolved, that the Executive Council approved the minutes for [May 26, 2021](#).

Adopted by consent.

B. Approval of Minutes from [Sept. 1 2021](#)

|                                 |  |
|---------------------------------|--|
| <b>Resolution 2021.09.15.5B</b> | <b>Approval of Minutes: Sept 1, 2021</b> |
|---------------------------------|--|

Resolved, that the Executive Council approved the minutes for [Sept 1, 2021](#).

Adopted by consent.

C. Approval of Committee Appointments

|                                 |   |
|---------------------------------|---|
| <b>Resolution 2021.09.15.5C</b> | <b>Appointments to Committees, Task Forces, Work Groups</b> |
|---------------------------------|---|

**Sustainability**

--Cannon, Joseph - Biology - credit - reappointment

**Faculty Professional Development Advisory**

--Lin, Carina - Counseling - both credit and non-credit - new appointment

**Curriculum Committee**

--Palaita, David - IDST, VASA, Diversity and Social Justice, Critical Pacific Islands & Oceania Studies, Ethnic Studies - credit - new appointment

**Guided Pathways**

--Sieglitz, Michele - BEMA - credit - new appointment

**Faculty Position Allocation Committee (FPAC)**

--Avrus, Elaine - Learning Assistance Department - credit and noncredit - new appointment

--Kaufmyn, Wynd - Engineering - credit - new appointment

**Enrollment Management**

--Torres, Edgar - Latin American & Latino/a Studies - credit - move from alternate to voting member

**ASEC EFF Workgroup (unlimited)**

--Christianson, Erik

--Kienzle, Jen

--Miraglia, Sheri

--Schubert, Lou

--Sieglitz, Michele

--Stephenson, Chad

--Wiese, Katryn

**ASEC Constitution Review Workgroup (unlimited)**

--Bosson, Monica

--Brown, Steven

--Fuchs, Katia

--MacAller, Stephanie

--Mueller, Madeline

--Sapienza, Mitra

--Schubert, Lou  
--Sieglitz, Michele  
--Teti, Fred

Adopted by consent.

- D. Approval of request to add resource members to Curriculum Committee

**Resolution 2021.09.15.5D** **Approval of Request to Add Resource Members to Curriculum Committee**

Resolved, that the Executive Council approves the addition of resource members to the Curriculum Committee to include the following workforce-related positions: Associate Dean of Workforce Development, Associate Dean of Adult Education, and Pathways Committee chair.

Adopted by consent.

- E. Adoption of [2018 Comprehensive Program Review Summary report](#)

**Resolution 2021.09.15.5E** **Approval of 2018 Comprehensive Program Review Summary Report**

Resolved, that the Executive Council adopts the 2018 Comprehensive Program Review Summary report.

Adopted by consent.

- F. [SMEE Committee Update](#)

**Resolution 2021.09.15.5F** **Approval of SMEE Committee Description Update**

Resolved, that the Executive Council approves the updated SMEE Committee Description.

Adopted by consent.



G. [SLO Committee Update](#)

|  |                                  |
|--|----------------------------------|
| <b>Resolution 2021.09.15.5G</b>  | <b>Approval of SLO Committee</b> |
| <b>Description Update</b>  |                                  |
| Resolved, that the Executive Council approves the updated SLO Committee Description. |                                  |
| Adopted by consent.  |                                  |

VI. Old Business

- A. **Budget Discussion** - 3:55 (20 min) An ongoing discussion of current status of the [FY 2021-22 Final Adopted Budget](#) and process that went into developing it, including current status of past Budget related resolutions passed by the ASEC ([Resolution 2019.12.11.06 Budget process and shared governance](#) & [Resolution 2021.05.19.4.A Lack of Confidence and Request for Action](#) ) Discussion will include additional [Draft Resolutions](#) that have been proposed for discussion with the council.
- BOT passed a tentative budget but with not as much input as faculty and participatory governance have asked for, as evidenced in several previous resolutions.
  - Internal Auditor - was recommended in Resolution 2019.12.11.06. Auditor was hired and produced reports but recently resigned.
  - Marketing Budget - was recommended in Resolution 2021.5.19.4A to allocate funds for marketing. The budget recently passed by BOT includes 75K for this line item.
  - Other ongoing efforts continue that are directly related to recommendations of resolutions.
  - Tentative Budget - ongoing challenges in getting a tentative budget in advance of BOT approval for discussion through participatory governance.
  - Other ongoing challenges include need for clear direction on opening up campus and need for a enrollment growth plan. No movement on adding a steering committee.
  - College Budget is a spreadsheet exercise making numbers add up,

but not tied to enrollment or other goals. Budget numbers were still missed even after pay cuts from last year.

- New Draft Resolution - in review of previous resolutions, there is satisfaction that the concerns presented in the draft resolution have been covered in said resolutions.
  - We are understaffed, particularly in finance, and these budgetary challenges reflect that as well. \$1M of Free City money had to be returned because it was not properly tracked.
  - Nervousness about granted funds not being properly allocated because of structural deficiencies in budget management.
  - PTO also accumulating and not being tracked or reigned in.
- B. Program Review - 4:15 (5 min) The council has received the comprehensive program Review summary report and will discuss and potentially take action on specific recommendations or endorsements for this year's Program Review process.
- We are in a program review year and need help on this committee, including and particularly people not on the EC.
  - Committee has suffered from not seeing recommendations being met with action. What action can we take to get this work linked to budget?
- C. Approval of Coordinators for AY 2021-22 (2 min) Status update on the pending AS Approval of Coordinators for the AY 2021-22.
- Meeting with VC Tom Boegel in the next week, continuing to seek complete information to present to the Council.
- D. Constitution Review Workgroup (2 min) Status Update
- Planning to have their first meeting next Monday, Sept 20, 11AM-12PM.
- E. Electronic Faculty Forum Maintenance/Revision Workgroup (2 min)  
- Status update.
- Working to find a meeting time.
- F. [CCSF-Bayview/Hunters Point Community Education Plan](#). 4:26 (15 min) - Second Read. last meeting the educational plan for the Bayview/Hunters point community was presented for a first read and consideration. The council will have a second read and take

potential action on adopting this plan.

- Credit enrollment and course success - Previous courses were cancelled. Can we allow time and resources to build up enrollment?
- Southeast and Evans are in proximity and sometimes presents competition for courses and struggle with retention. Some programs that were previously at SouthEast, such as Fire, were relocated. Library ceased staffing that location in Dec 2018 since courses were not being offered.
- 1800 Evans and 1550 Evans, three locations are interconnected and there is need for more input/voices, particularly from the Chairs and Deans from these locations.
- Data should be verified.
- Report lacks the voices of the community and their needs, as well as breakdown of potential funding and cost-benefit analysis.
- Plan does not describe how it will be executed - it is a plan to have a plan.

## VII. New Business

- A. Technology Plan Update -4:45 (10 min) Explanation of the updating process. ( References: [Draft Technology Plan Overview \(PPT\)](#), [Draft Technology Plan](#).) Presenters: Tech. Comm. Work Group.
- This is the first of three visits scheduled to present the draft plan. Draft is being presented to various constituent groups for feedback.
  - Technology Committee is a standing committee to PGC.
  - Technology Plan was rooted in college-wide technology goals established through outreach across constituent groups, the Educational Master Plan, and assessment of current technology.
  - VCSA Vice Chancellor for Student Affairs, VC Institutional Affairs
  - Budget - the workgroup is gathering feedback and simultaneously working on budgetary commitment.
  - Priorities, Timelines, and Budgets will be included in the final version of the Technology Plan.
  - What are priorities for council/faculty and do we need more information/context to better assess how to prioritize?

## VIII. Future Agenda Items- a brief check in with council on timing, goals, and development of future agenda Items will be discussed at the end of each meeting (5 min)

- Update on EFF workgroup
- Update on Distance Learning work group
- Update on College plan for outreach

IX. Adjournment, 5:07pm