The Academic Senate

CITY COLLEGE OF SAN FRANCISCO

50 Frida Kahlo Way, Box E-202, San Francisco, CA 94112 (415) 239-3611 Fax (415) 452-5115
www.ccsf.edu.edu/academic-senate email: asenate@ccsf.edu

Curriculum• Degree Requirements• Grading Policies• Program Development• Student Prep & Success• Governance
Accreditation• Professional Development• Program Review• Planning & Budgeting Process• Others as agreed

CCSF Academic Senate Executive Council
Minutes and Sound Recording
Wednesday, 2020 December 2, 2:30-5:00pm
Location: Zoom meeting https://cccconfer.zoom.us/j/96406746184
Phone info: +1 669 900 6833 or +1 253 215 8782 * Meeting ID: 964 0674 6184

Council Members Present: Abigail Bornstein, Steven Brown, Amy Diaz-Infante, Nixora Ferman, Ben Finateri, Katia Fuchs, Simon Hanson, Gregory Keech, Nicole Oest, Fanny Law, Stephanie Macaller, Jeanette Male, Michele McKenzie, Sheri Miraglia, Madeline Mueller, Douglas Owyang, Joe Reyes, Mitra Sapienza, Lou Schubert, Kevin Sherman, Michele Sieglitz, Michelle Simotas, Chad Stephenson, Marie Varelas, Katryn Wiese, Christina Yanuaria

Council Members Absent: Octavio Alvarez, Pablo Rodriguez, Coni Staff

Other Senate Members Present: Frederick Teti, Malaika Finkelstein, Jennifer Kienzle, Erin Denney, Karl Westerberg, Jesse Kolber, Monica Bosson, Darlene Alioto, Pau Crego, Harry Bernstein, Leslie Simon, Helen Pinto, Levalasi Loi-On

Guests: Kristin Charles

I. Call to Order 2:40
Agenda adopted.

II. Public Comment
- Interesting intersection in these two articles to keep in mind as we function through the pandemic and take care of ourselves: Racism Fuels Poor Mental Health Outcomes for Black Students: https://www.insidehighered.com/news/2020/10/23/racism-fuels-poor-mental-health-outcomes-black-students and Pandemic-Proof Your Routines https://www.nytimes.com/2020/11/28/sunday-review/pandemic-habits-routine-brain.html?fbclid=IwAR1a81Dg85FqDIVB8PG99bc7O270Ox74AT3-JA8-lz_x5pb0APBa9m0_ytE

III. Reports
Executive Council Process report & feedback
- Officers have been discussing ways to consider improving meeting processes, parliamentary procedure, community standards, opening the

floor to everyone, stepping in and stepping back for those who are more vocal, all the while being mindful of time and covering all items on the agenda. The officers are committed to making this process accessible to all.

- The Council members can question the chair at any point if the Council disagrees with the chair. The chair can also not accept a motion if the chair feels the discussion is still robust. Please put in the chat or unmute and mention that you have a parliamentary question at any point in the meeting.
- Discussions are the meat of what we do to give everyone an opportunity to share their thoughts which at times can be stymied by early motions for actions. The chair also has the ability to reject a motion for action if the chair feels the discussion is still robust.
- We all have a voice that represents the areas we are apart of and the students we work with and the goal is to create a brave space within the ASEC meetings so that we can all feel empowered to share. The floor is open to everyone.
- The officers are available to all Council members for consultation at any time.
- The officers are always monitoring chat and they can be used to directly ask process questions, publicly or privately.
    - Clarifying procedures are important; and clarifying our values of community communication standards. Scheduling items on the agenda and respecting those who make the time to attend for those items is understandable. Those who make or oppose motions for action can also respect the process by staying in attendance for the duration of the process.
    - Some feedback was provided about processes that were problematic from past meetings with encouragement that we establish and follow the processes collectively that apply to everyone.

Officer reports

- President Hanson
    - One more Executive Council meeting on December 16th, with a visit from Chancellor Vurdien.
    - ACCJC is meeting January 13-15th which is when we will hear about their review of our Multi-Year Budget and Enrollment plan.
    - Combined Enrollment and Budget meeting scheduled for Dec. 8th.
    - Schedule development will move forward which needs to be in place by the end of January to give department chairs enough time to schedule.
    - Our ASEC work is stimulating discussion from both other

CCSF constituencies as well as state wide. Our resolution on technology use in public meetings is moving through PGC, and our work on establishing distance learning guidelines is being noticed by other colleges who are asking for us to share our work with them.

- First Vice President Law
    - We are developing many plans: Multi-Year Enrollment and Budget plan, Facilities plans, Student Services plans (for both credit and noncredit). It is very encouraging to see the high level of faculty involvement despite the lack of incorporation of our feedback in some areas. Positive things are happening, even though it is a slow process. Let's not lose hope; faculty influence is essential to these processes.

- Second Vice President Wiese
    - Members who are present today, please let Katryn know--via chat or after the meeting via email-- any ways that she can advocate for your perspectives about work being done on the Web Advisory and the Distance Learning Advisory Committees.
        - Web Advisory is working on the storing of internal documents and migrating items into Sharepoint for employees to get access to employee-related forms.
        - DLAC is working on potentially expanding its membership, and working on the rubric and a process of how courses are approved for going fully online.
            - What's going on with the archive website as it seems all new pages on the new site, relocate to archive pages? This archive will soon become uneditable. In three weeks we lose access to making changes or updates to the archives pages, so anyone who is still working on an archive page, should migrate those immediately to the new website.
            - When searching on the new website an error message often shows up for the page. If anyone ever encounters this, please document the link and submit that to the Help Desk which helps them identify these broken links.

- Secretary Sapienza

- Attended the *Chancellor's Office System Webinar:* "Diversity, Equity, Inclusion Integration Plan Update," which highlighted a move away from compliance-based decision making to a more humane, student-centered decision making approach. More schools are creating rubrics to help them make budgeting and programmatic decisions, but none are complete for us to review which raises, again, the question of whether we should create our own rubric to help make these decisions.
- Another group at the CCCO is looking at college mission statements and one suggestion from their DEI taskforce is that schools review their mission statements every 5 years and that they consider including a stand-alone Diversity, Equity and Inclusion statement to be included alongside the missions statements.
  https://www.cccco.edu/About-Us/Vision-for-Success/diversity-equity-inclusion
- Equity resolution passed last week and there is development of an action plan associated with the resolves in the resolution.
- English faculty Ben BacSierra will read from his book *Pura Neta* this evening from 6-7pm as part of the Forum Magazine event series; go to Forumccsf.org for more information.
- The collaboration between LGBT Studies chair, Ardel Thomas and ADMJ faculty Greg Miraglia with support from ADMJ chair Jim Connors, has led to the creation and course approvals for the Public Safety, LGBTQ+ Awareness Certificate of Achievement which is ready for a Fall 2021 roll out. This certificate is the first of its kind nationally and will soon be ready to be part of CityOnline as the team finalizes all the certificate courses to be offered online--only two more courses need approval! Very proud of the collaboration between these two departments and hope it's inspirational to other departments that could innovate and collaborate together. Amidst national, state and college-wide struggle, it's refreshing to celebrate and be reminded of the phenomenal work happening at the college.

Awards & Recognition Hayward Award Nomination

- This award is sponsored annually by the foundation for California Community Colleges and it honors Community College full-time and part-time faculty who demonstrate the highest level of commitment to their students, college and profession.
- This year's CCSF nominees are Professor Jesse Kolber, sociology faculty; Dr. Jennifer Kienzle, Communication Studies and Distance

Education faculty; Professor Alexis Litzky, Communication Studies faculty; and Professor Kathleen White, Child Development and Family Studies faculty.

- The Executive Council voted on their top three choices via google form.
- Congratulations to Professor Kathleen White will be the official CCSF nominee for this year's award. Confirmation of this decision was moved to the consent agenda.

Committee on Committees report

- Overwhelming response to faculty participation on committees over the past few weeks.
- Education Policies is currently full and therefore membership appointment will be effective Spring 2021 semester.
- A few committees have had tabled membership interest as we organize and as more seats become available.

IV. Consent Agenda

A. Approval of Minutes from 2020, Nov 18

Resolution 2020.12.02.5A	**Approval of Minutes: November 18, 2020**
Resolved, that the Executive Council approved the minutes for November 18, 2020 Adopted by consent.	

B. Committee appointments

Resolution 2020.12.02.5B	**Appointments to Committees, Task Forces, Work Groups**
CTE --Andrea Medina, Broadcasting Noncredit Adult Education --Holly Stevens, ESL --Dora Rodriguez, DSPS Scholarship --Elizabeth Smith, English --Kristin Williams, PE/Dance	

SLO
--Sheri Miraglia, Biology
--Natalie Smith, Fashion
--Craig Kleinman, English

Teaching & Learning with Technology Roundtable
--Kevin Sherman, Cinema
--Jennifer Kienzle, Communication Studies

Works of Art
--Alexander Kinneret, IDST

Distance Learning Advisory
--Michelle Simotas, English, as member (effective Spring 2021)

SMEE
--Caroline Priestley, ESL, as member

Education Policies
--Elena Alvarado-Strasser, Sociology, as member (effective Spring 2021)

Faculty Professional Development Activities
--Christina Yanuaria, ESL, as member

International Education Advisory Committee
--Dennis Mullen, Business, as member

Student Grade and File Review
--David Palaita, IDST, as member
--Steven Brown, EH/F, as resource member
--Wynd Kaufmyn, Engineering and Technology, as member

Pathways
--Anna Geyer, Cinema, as member
--Carol Amen, DSPS, as member

Diego Rivera Theater Steering Committee
--Rebeca Mauleon-Santana, Music, as member
--Lenny Carlson, Music, as alternate
--Ben Lim, Music, as alternate

PGC Accreditation Steering Committee
--Sheri Miraglia, Biology, as member

PGC Health and Safety Committee
--Adele Failes-Carpenter, WGST, IDST, Project SURVIVE, as member
--Beth Freedman, Health Education, as member
--Jane Ernstthal, Student Health Services, as member

Adopted by consent.

C. Hayward Award Nomination

Resolution 2020.12.02.5C **Hayward Award Nomination**

Resolved, that the Executive Council endorses the submission of Kathleen White for this year's Hayward Award.

Adopted by consent.

V. Old Business ~

A. Free Speech resolution
   1. Introduction FreeSpeechResolution_Sieglitz.pdf; this resolution is a response to what is happening to the culture at large and around the world where people are being harmed as a result. There are many damaging assumptions being made about groups in order to perpetuate divisiveness. We may not always agree with the beliefs of others, but we should not shut down freedom of speech. We all have a responsibility to foster students' intellectual curiosity and effective debate skills that requires listening to opposing views.
      a) CCSF All-Star video highlighting former student and student trustee, Bryan Daley: https://youtu.be/SOLXe7IwVuA
   2. Concerns, Free Speech Resolution: A Closer Look
      A request to reframe the issue from Freedom of Speech to Speech Equity as the current resolution seems unnecessary and repeats documentation the college already has in place, is a problematic source, uses misleading language, lacks institutional and societal context and therefore, requires equity reframing. The resolution does not address hate speech. Speech Equity includes awareness of power dynamics, responsibility to student safety and institutional responsibilities to dismantle inequity and build equitable systems.

3. Open Discussion
    - The analysis of FIRE seems to suggest that conservative views should not exist which is a dangerous assumption.
    - Conservative thinking should not be abolished; we just need to acknowledge that we don't all have access to these freedoms and protections.
    - Faculty opinion, when it's not relevant to the content, should not be shared and when it is relevant, all sides should have space in the dialogue.
    - How is this issue relevant to courses that don't address these issues in their content? The topic is relevant in not only content but also methodologically and the kind of environments we build for students.
    - Power dynamics in the classroom are important to address and we need to question why students of color are not as comfortable speaking up in class.
    - The false dichotomy perpetuates this idea that we are not open to alternative ideas; the focus is more on equity and how we can promote freedoms within a system that does not apply freedom equitably. There is a way to be equitable and not lose free speech.
    - Our Black students and colleagues are always engaging in risk analysis.
    - We should establish this type of resolution for CCSF, but one that captures the intricacies of San Francisco communities.
    - It's important for everyone to draw their own conclusions about the University of Chicago statement and read more about the background of the resolution to determine if this is a statement we want to endorse.
4. Call for Workgroup participation--Michele Sieglitz, Lou Schubert, Madeline Mueller, Steven Brown.

VI. New Business

A. Resolution from Accreditation Steering committee
Presentation
    - The last visiting team meeting resulted in an inquiry about how we were gathering syllabi to ensure that we met the ACCJC standard that we list our SLOs on syllabi. Many of the syllabi collected did not include the necessary information. As a result we want a better system to collect syllabi to ensure that the most up-to-date SLOs are listed.
    - The current system requires department chairs to collect syllabi for every single course section from faculty, which then gets forwarded

to the school dean. We also need a place to keep the syllabi on hand for future ACCJC site visits.
    - The problem with this current process is that it is a burden on department chairs and is likely being done inconsistently across departments. We want to create a more streamlined process.
- New solution is to use Canvas as the syllabi collection site. For those who already use Canvas, it's built in and easy to review. For those who don't use Canvas, they would be asked to simply upload the syllabus that they are already using to Canvas. Distance Education and the DCC leadership have been consulted on all of this as well.

Debate & possible action or next steps

- This is an elegant solution that avoids making syllabi public but also takes some pressure off of department chairs to collect and store syllabi.
- For visiting team access, and to have a central repository, all faculty would upload, create it directly in Canvas, or link to another site, their syllabus within a Canvas shell for their course.
- All faculty should be trained on Canvas to be able to comply with this requirement, but also to provide even more access for students.
- This is a first read and we will see this resolution return at a future meeting.
- For anyone with further questions, please feel free to reach out to Sheri Miraglia or Katryn Wiese.

B. Land Acknowledgement resolution revised
    - Presentation by Leslie Simon, Levalasi Loi-On, Helen Pinto, Mary Bravewoman
    - Associate Student Council, AFT 2121 have both passed the resolution. The resolution will be presented to Classified Senate, SEIU, PGC, DCC, with the ultimate goal being Board of Trustees approval.
    - The new CSU Ethnic Studies requirement includes Native American Studies and the hope is that many CCSF students headed to CSU will take their requirement at CCSF. American Indian Studies department at SFSU is currently in the process of creating a similar land acknowledgment policy there.
    - The taskforce would work to find outside funding to support added courses; scheduling would be done in collaboration with department chairs, of the potential scheduling of courses related to the resolution.
    - There is strong student support for this.

- Debate & action
    - There are other departments and courses about indigenous peoples and nations that could be integrated into the resolution.
    - There is currently no set statement to be read at meetings and events; the construction of a land acknowledgement statement would be a collective CCSF effort and a next step.
    - This is a unique resolution because we have been consulting Ramaytush and Ohlone representatives so significant changes or additions would require more consultation and the request from the presenters is that this resolution be passed today.
    - In response to a question about how this requirement compares to not being allowed to say the Pledge of Allegiance: it will not and should not feel like a requirement to give a land acknowledgement, but a humane gesture of appreciation. This is the tiniest gesture that we can offer to those whose land we sit on and would go a long way toward healing.

Motion for further discussion at next meeting: Abigail Bornstein; **Seconded**: Katryn Wiese
Aye: Abigail Bornstein, Steven Brown, Amy Diaz-Infante, Nixora Ferman, Ben Finateri, Katia Fuchs, Gregory Keech, Nicole Oest, Fanny Law, Sheri Miraglia, Madeline Mueller, Joe Reyes, Mitra Sapienza, Kevin Sherman, Michele Sieglitz, Michelle Simotas, Marie Varelas, Katryn Wiese
Nay: Stephanie Macaller, Michele McKenzie, Chad Stephenson, Marie Varelas, Christina Yanuaria
Absent: Octavio Alvarez, Douglas Owyang, Jeanette Male, Lou Schubert, Michelle Simotas, Coni Staff

VII. Adjournment, 5:22.