



# The Academic Senate

## CITY COLLEGE OF SAN FRANCISCO

50 Frida Kahlo Way, Box E-202, San Francisco, CA 94112 (415) 239-3611 Fax (415) 452-5115  
[www.ccsf.edu/academic-senate](http://www.ccsf.edu/academic-senate) email: [asenate@ccsf.edu](mailto:asenate@ccsf.edu)

Curriculum • Degree Requirements • Grading Policies • Program Development • Student Prep & Success • Governance  
Accreditation • Professional Development • Program Review • Planning & Budgeting Process • Others as agreed

### CCSF Academic Senate Executive Council Minutes and [Sound Recording](#)

Wednesday, 2020 November 18, 2:30-5:00pm

Location: Zoom meeting <https://cccconfer.zoom.us/j/96406746184>

Phone info: +1 669 900 6833 or +1 253 215 8782 \* Meeting ID: 964 0674 6184

**Council Members Present:** Octavio Alvarez, Abigail Bornstein, Steven Brown, Amy Diaz-Infante, Nixora Ferman, Ben Finateri, Katia Fuchs, Simon Hanson, Gregory Keech, Nicole Oest, Fanny Law, Stephanie Macaller, Jeanette Male, Michele McKenzie, Sheri Miraglia, Madeline Mueller, Douglas Owyang, Joe Reyes, Mitra Sapienza, Lou Schubert, Kevin Sherman, Michele Sieglitz, Michelle Simotas, Coni Staff, Chad Stephenson, Katryn Wiese, Christina Yanuaria

**Council Members Absent:** Pablo Rodriguez, Marie Varelas

**Other Senate Members Present:** Frederick Teti, Jennifer Kienzle, Karl Westerberg, Kathleen White, Lancelot Kao, Monica Bosson, Kathryn Frei

**Guests:** Mandy Liang, Cherisa Yarkin, John Halpin, Carole Meagher

- I. Call to Order 2:34
- II. Adoption of Agenda
  - Agenda adopted with one revision: spelling of “Noncredit” as one word instead of two.
  - Motion to move Equity resolution to first item of old business.
    - Review of the order is requested because of the interconnectedness between the resolutions on the agenda.
    - Discussion of processes for changing the agenda
    - Agenda is published 72 hours in advance.
    - Items are ordered by time to give everyone designated times to be involved and some folks plan their schedules around the time slots for items.
    - Discussion to make changes comes before adoption of the agenda.
    - Roll call vote is combined with adoption of agenda.
- III. Public Comment

- Career Workforce workshop after the ASEC meeting today.  
<https://drive.google.com/file/d/1DGdDBKkN8nO-U9b8iPlwqHmP17m7naf9/view>
- Board of Trustees are in violation of their own resolutions and their own processes when they have closed meetings in which they make decisions. Multi-year budget is not sufficient as a plan to help the college be successful.
- Last Board of Trustees meeting there was an option for the public to make comments, but there was no way to raise the blue Zoom hand or make comment. The transparency is lacking in these meetings.
- ASCCC Plenary session on enrollment management and budget allocation was inspiring; humanity in FTEF allocation which led to having a meeting with Dr. Isabel Gonzales, VP of Instruction at San Diego Mesa College. They are creating a rubric that inspired the thought of whether CCSF could also create a rubric of our own to make these enrollment and budget decisions.
- Good news! Planning for the new buildings is going forward. Thanks to folks who are involved with the STEAM complex charter to make sure that we are taking care of the programs that are impacted by the plans for the building. We need to stay engaged in this whole process.
- Airforce Maintenance and Technology program to be moved to 1550 Evans site. Chancellor Vurdien suspended the move but it still needs to happen by the end of the year.
- PAC building architects have been fired; everyone is uninformed and in shock. \$30 million has already been spent on this project.

#### IV. Reports

##### Officer reports

- President Hanson
  - CCSF still has a reputation at the state level as not having our budget in order. Looking toward a state January budget revise.
  - 6 spring 2020 hiring committees renounced last week: Dean of Student Success, Assistant Director of Student Activities, Assistant Director of Finance Aid & Special Programs, Dean of Student Engagement & Wellness, Director of Student Health and EOPS/CARE Director.
  - New hires, all beginning in the next few weeks: VC Finance & Administration, Director of Media & Marketing, Internal auditor, VC of Student Affairs and Chief Technology Officer.
  - In further attempts to reduce college expenditures, there will

be an administrative mid-level reorganization which has yet to be fully announced.

- Highlights of the Multi-Year Budget Enrollment Plan are that by 2024 we'll have salary reductions for administrators, classified staff, and faculty along with 600 classes removed from next year's schedule.
- Next steps are looking at the schedule and the implementation of a campus climate survey.
- We need to have a deep programmatic prioritization plan for course reductions.
- Consent agenda overview.
- Remote instruction recommendations are being worked on and need to be shared with all faculty.
- Constitution workgroup is working on multiple structural issues.
- First Vice President Law
  - Multi-Year Budget plan passed at the Board meeting last week. Many ESL and Noncredit faculty publicly commented because the plan is not clear to many. Noncredit are concerned because the plan lacks analysis and inclusion of Noncredit support to build enrollment. Support for Fall semester came too late for Noncredit students and programs.
  - Promotion for participation on the 24 Senate committees.
  - Building user groups are also places for faculty engagement.
- Second Vice President Wiese
  - Review of ASEC Zoom meeting procedures: sound and video muting guidance.
  - Distance Learning Advisory and Web Advisory committees are areas of focus and additional spaces for faculty involvement. Discussion about the incorporation of Admissions and Records processes and procedures to be included in the Faculty Resource Center in Canvas to address changes in myRAM. Working on systematic ways to share information. VP Wiese welcomes anyone interested to connect with her for information or comment regarding these areas.
- Secretary Sapienza
  - Report passed for the sake of time.

#### Committee on Committees report

- See committee appointments below.

## ASCCC Plenary Report

- Those who attended shared their thoughts.
  - Faculty should be proactive to influence legislature on future mandates regarding Ethnic Studies requirements.
  - Some great sessions but seemed the frame of Equity is a bit new to ASCCC.
  - Building equity and humanity into our budget process was a highlight that we could implement at CCSF.
  - Center for Urban Education focus toward diversity in hiring implementation which requires institution support to do things like: changing diversity statements, repository of past interview questions, expanding definitions around previous experience, targeted outreach. If we're not seeing diverse pools it's on us to create those pools. And then retain employees by creating an environment that people want to be in and stay in. Very clear that we are still at the beginning stages of this work.
  - Demoralizing and refreshing--may seem like an oxymoron, but it is demoralizing to see cognitive dissonance regarding Black Lives Matter, but refreshing to see some openness to learning. How can we continue to be reflective and avoid knee-jerk reactions. Take a sacred pause before we respond. People don't care how much you know until they know how much you care.
  - There is a hope that ASCCC would be more courageous with more leadership related to anti-racist practices.

## OER Taskforce Report

- Librarian and OER lead, Maggie Frankle gives an Open Educational Resource (OER) overview. OER is digital resources for students to save textbook costs and have access to free, digital course resources.
- OER is a great Equity tool--helps students maintain their GPAs, students in OER courses have higher retention rates and have improved end-of-course grades.
- SB1359: requires us to demarcate in the course schedule which courses are OER or ZTC (zero-cost textbooks)
- Contact Maggie Frankel, [mfrankel@ccsf.edu](mailto:mfrankel@ccsf.edu), for help getting OER for your course.
  - Some faculty use Lynda.com to keep textbooks free for students. There is a way to mark this through our bookstore

by contacting Rose Twyman.

CTE Report

- Overview of CTE 2016-17 and 2018-19 data, including which departments have CTE programs, and differentiating CTE program and faculty expectations.
- CTE Faculty survey results with details about how moving to remote instruction has impacted students and faculty, with a highlight of concerns for the future.

V. Consent Agenda

- A. Approval of Minutes from 2020, October 28

**Resolution 2020.11.18.5A**

**Approval of Minutes: October 28, 2020**

Resolved, that the Executive Council approved the minutes for October 28, 2020

Adopted by consent.

- B. Committee appointments

**Resolution 2020.11.18.5B Appointments to Committees, Task Forces, Work Groups**

**Career Technical Education Committee**

- Rich Harlan, Apprenticeship Program
- Jim Connors, Adm. of Justice/Fire Science Technology
- Stephen Brady, Automotive

**Noncredit Adult Education Committee**

- Greg Keech, ESL

**Teaching and Learning Technology Roundtable**

- Maura Devlin-Clancy, CNIT

**Sustainability**

- Hitesh Soneji, Engineering & Technology

**Honors Issues**

- Elizabeth Smith, English
- Rebecca Ancheta, Behavioral Sciences

**STEAM Steering Committee**

--Katryn Wiese, Earth Science

Adopted by consent.

C. Approval of Student Health Center & COVID 19 resolution

**Resolution 2020.11.18.5C                      COVID-19 and the Student Health Center**

Whereas, the staff members at The CCSF Student Health Center have been proactive about providing support to CCSF students and employees during the COVID-19 pandemic; and

Whereas, the staff members at The CCSF Student Health Center have been providing free flu shots for our students; and

Whereas, the staff members at The CCSF Student Health Center have gone above and beyond our expectations in caring for our communities; therefore

Be it resolved that The CCSF Academic Senate recognize and applaud the amazing work of the staff members at The CCSF Student Health Center;

And be it finally resolved that the CCSF Academic Senate urge the CCSF Board of Trustees to do likewise.

Adopted by consent.

D. Approval of [SWP Strategic Plan](#)

**Resolution 2020.11.18.5D                      Approval of Strong Workforce Program Strategic Plan**

Resolved, that the Executive Council approved the Strong Workforce Strategic Plan

Adopted by consent.

VI. Old Business

A. [Academic Freedom](#)

- The item is about free speech and free expression, which is what Academic Freedom rests on. This is the foundation and we can build from here.
- This resolution connects with the limitations of those with authority, thwarting participation and free speech, such as the limitations we are seeing at Board meetings and their restrictions on disallowing participation.
- AFT contract, Article eight reflects free speech and censorship.
- The University of Chicago Free Speech statement has been signed on to by over 70 other universities and colleges.
- This is not about anti-equity or anti-diversity; it promotes those.
  - A request is made to table the item to a future date in order to have more time to discuss.
  - Procedural discussion ensues.
  - A link to a documentary film was shared  
<https://www.gofundme.com/f/whenindoubtfilm?fbclid=IwAR0rSYg7P66mt7eT23BftpCPiK32wZ96zC0LNeGwFsD5oVIGUmGf6rEQSC8>
  - The college has many statements on Academic Freedom and this resolution seems redundant.

**Motion to table time uncertain:** Michele McKenzie; **Second** Stephanie Macaller.

**Ayes:** None.

**Nays:** Octavio Alvarez, Abigail Bornstein, Steven Brown, Amy Diaz-Infante, Nixora Ferman, Ben Finateri, Katia Fuchs, Nicole Oest, Gregory Keech, Fanny Law, Stephanie Macaller, Jeanette Male, Madeline Mueller, Douglas Owyang, Joe Reyes, Lou Schubert, Michele Sieglitz, Michelle Simotas, Coni Staff, Chad Stephenson, Katryn Wiese, Christina Yanuaria

**Abstentions:** Michele McKenzie, Sheri Miraglia, Mitra Sapienza, Kevin Sherman

**Motion Fails.**

**Not Present:** Pablo Rodriguez, Marie Varelas

**Motion to table to next meeting:** Katryn Wiese; **Second:** Nixora Ferman

B. [Mission Statement](#)

- A request has been made for the Council to review and reflect on the CCSF mission statement.
- The Board of Trustees has purview over revising the college mission statement; the Senate has purview over making revision recommendations to the Board.

- An inquiry of how the new enrollment management is reflected in the mission statement was made.
- The mission statement review is helpful for this body to have once a year in order to constantly align our goals and values. We need to address that we are the adult education provider in the city of San Francisco. This is not being addressed in the latest course cuts.
- Past mission statements have been stronger than what we have now; our statement from 10 years ago is a good starting point.
- A workgroup could work on revision ideas and bring back to ASEC in order to move forward recommendations to the Board.
- Three examples of changes to the Mission Statement over time at the college was shared in the chat:  
[https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1wsG--rcPzgrry\\_iWW4XCScGwfGjTV2xr?usp=sharing](https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1wsG--rcPzgrry_iWW4XCScGwfGjTV2xr?usp=sharing)
- Workgroup volunteers are Steven Brown, Chad Stephenson, Stephanie Macaller, Lou Schubert, and Michele Sieglitz.

#### C. [Multi Year Budget Enrollment Plan](#) Discussion

- ASEC gave feedback on the plan, discussions were had, there was no vote. Involvement was strictly consultative, not incorporating decision-making by faculty, nor has the faculty feedback been incorporated into the plan that was voted on by the Board last week.
- There are significant reductions to salaries and courses over the course of the next few years.
- This plan is a plan for a drastically different college; this is an exit plan not a proactive plan for growth or success.
- This plan needs to be about students.
- This new Enrollment Plan document reflects very little work.
- Raw data from faculty surveys, as promised to be shared by VC Boegel, has not been at the time of this meeting.
- As we proceed, we should engage in dialogue about how this plan can be modified, per ACCJC standards.
- Council members need more clarity on what we can do moving forward to make an impact and help make better decisions for the college. We need to know what the possibilities are --a list that runs the gamut-- in order to make a decision about how to move forward.
- Writing a resolution is not going to be enough.
- Bringing back a list of different approaches and tenable options moving forward is a good next step.

#### D. [Resolution about Equity Values at CCSF](#)



- Latest resolution reflects three months of dialogue and revisions with various constituency groups. This is the fifth read of the document; this iteration we highlight the latest changes, including a supplemental document about process and those who have contributed to the creation of this final version of the resolution.
- Discussion distinguishing whether this is a first read on the document or not.

**Resolution 2020.11.18.6D**

**Resolution on Diversity, Equity and Inclusion**

Resolved, that the Executive Council approved the Resolution on Diversity, Equity and Inclusion.<sup>1</sup>

Whereas the Academic Senate for California Community Colleges [Diversity, Equity and Inclusion statement](#) promises: *As a collective community of individual colleges, we are invested in cultivating and maintaining a climate where equity and mutual respect are both intrinsic and explicit by valuing individuals and groups from all backgrounds, demographics, and experiences, and,*

Whereas City College of San Francisco is a community of diverse students, staff, faculty, and administrators that work and serve in the context of a society marked by increasingly complex racial, ethnic, cultural, identity and class divisions; and

Whereas as educators we have a responsibility to uphold promote, protect, and ensure human dignity, equitable access, opportunity and resources in City College of San Francisco classrooms and work environments free of hatred, bigotry, and intolerance expressed explicitly and implicitly which requires that all employees acknowledge and regularly reflect on their individual and collective obligations toward these efforts;

Whereas the City College of San Francisco Academic Senate recognizes that despite the efforts made towards implementing equity in programs, curriculum, and professional development, the persistence and continuance of institutionalized racism, interpersonal racially insensitive acts, and opportunity gaps for student success still cause severe harm for communities of color;

Whereas the City College of San Francisco Academic Senate acknowledges that we live in a society built on a culture of white supremacy and institutionalized racism, and that we must actively work to dismantle structures that perpetuate racist attitudes and biases, and more insidiously, processes and procedures of higher education that work

---

<sup>1</sup> [Equity Resolution Process and Contributions](#)

silently to marginalize populations even when the best of intentions are at hand.

Whereas the City College of San Francisco Academic Senate recognizes gender identity and gender expression; and the use of preferred personal pronouns are normalized throughout the college community in all aspects of campus life so that all persons, regardless of gender identity or expression, are fully acknowledged as members of the greater college community and feel that City College of San Francisco is a safe space for them to live their authentic lives.

Whereas the City College of San Francisco community fully supports students and employees who identify as lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender, queer, intersex, asexual or allied (LGBTQIA+) and requires pedagogy, support services, policies and procedures that are designed to create a safe and judgement-free academic environment and acknowledges the intersectionalities between these groups and other minoritized populations.

Therefore, be it resolved, that the Academic Senate affirms its core values to

- advance a comprehensive diversity framework that promotes social justice throughout policies, procedures and practices in the context of all matters academic and professional at the college;
- foster a campus-wide climate of mutual respect between all constituencies, an appreciation for diversity, and anti-racism in every physical and digital corner of the college;
- ground just, inclusive and transparent governance processes based in open and honest communication with a focus on dismantling systems that continue to create barriers for students and employees and to ensure diversity at all levels of the institution: to deepen critical thinking, enhance cultural fluency, strengthen campus community, and increase student success;
- promote student leadership and inclusion in college governance by supporting students of color through political education and leadership development opportunities in order to empower students and the institution that serves them;
- embed racial equity into practices to hire and retain diverse faculty, to increase racial representation and prioritize hiring employees who demonstrate equity-minded competence;
- ensure diversity and equity at all levels of the institution so that City College of San Francisco's mission and strategic priorities will consistently align and be fully implemented in curricular content and pedagogical approaches;
- cultivate a culture of meaningful reflection, and continuous examination of our own institutional systems and processes that inhibit equitable access, growth, and support of our students and employees in the college community;
- join the Academic Senate for California Community Colleges in

--supporting [\*The Anti-Racism Pledge\*](#)

--adopting [\*Anti-Racism Education in California Community Colleges\*](#) paper

Be it resolved that the faculty of City College of San Francisco, in every department and program, commit to being influential and transformative leaders in advancing equity at City College for students, faculty, staff, and administration through ongoing reflection on and dialogue about how faculty bias explicitly and implicitly impacts the classroom climate and as a result, student success.

Be it resolved that the Academic Senate encourages all staff, faculty and administrators, to participate in the CCSF Office of Student Equity [Equity Education Certificate training](#).

Be it resolved, that the Academic Senate will engage in collegial conversations that remind all college constituents of our shared responsibility to eliminate racism and discriminatory language, processes and acts in all physical, remote and digital CCSF spaces;

Be it resolved, that the Academic Senate calls upon the Office of Student Equity, Academic Affairs, Student Affairs, Classified Senate, Union leadership and the CCSF Chancellor's office to lead a coalition of all San Francisco Community College District communities to intensify efforts to combat intolerance, hatred, bigotry, and discrimination through constant and consistent self-reflection and thereby, identification of how eradicating inequity at CCSF is the obligation of everyone;

Be it resolved, that the Academic Senate urges the CCSF Administration, to

- themselves actively participate in ongoing professional development efforts currently offered by the college that focus on anti-racism, social justice, inclusion, cultural fluency, and transformational, equity-focused leadership;
- update the CCSF mission statement to properly reflect our commitment to diversity, equity, inclusion and belonging;
- review the CCSF Student Code of Conduct and pair it with an Employee (faculty, staff, administrator) Code of Conduct to reflect employee obligation to maintain anti-racist, inclusive and culturally-responsive conduct that promote student success;
- commit to recruitment and hiring practices that prioritize attainment of racially diverse employees and employees who demonstrate equity-minded competence;
- mobilize professional development resources in support of the intentional implementation of anti-racist, culturally-responsive curriculum, and pedagogical practice;
- collaborate with all college constituencies, including but not limited to the Academic Senate, Classified Senate, Associated Student Council, District Program Review and

Diversity Committees to create jointly organized college-wide dialogue that codifies action plans to address, dismantle and bring constituencies together to combat institutional and systemic racism at City College of San Francisco.

**Moved:** Coni Staff; **Second** Steven Brown.

**Motion Passes, Abstentions:** Abigail Bornstein, Lou Schubert.

**Not Present:** Pablo Rodriguez, Marie Varelas

VII. New Business

A. [Noncredit resolution](#) discussion.

- This resolution is the acknowledgement of the evaporation of our Noncredit programs and courses through major cuts--90% reduction in Older Adult program with expectations that further cuts will be made across all Noncredit programs.
- Noncredit programs serve many equity populations that are being served in locations that CCSF partners with and there is a continued concern that these services are going to be outsourced. When we cut these programs we are cutting our community access.
- Clarifications were made to some of the items with some minor revisions.

**Resolution 2020.11.18.7A                      Academic Senate Resolution: Multi-Year Budget and Enrollment Plan--Impact on Non Credit**

Whereas, as CCSF is the primary adult education provider in San Francisco, and its Mission Statement promises educational programs and services for the pursuit of degrees, career advancement, and Basic skills, including ESL and Transitional Studies;

Whereas, significant reduction in course schedules have been imposed on noncredit programs (20% was cut from noncredit ESL from Spring 2020 to Fall 2020, 70% cut from Fall 2019 to Fall 2020 in Business, and Older Adults suffered a 90% cut in Fall 2019) – these cuts were disproportionate to any decline in enrollment, resulting in the closure of healthy classes;

Whereas deep and hasty cuts to coordination in all departments in Spring 2019 have created predictable obstacles to the smooth functioning of programs and services to students;

Whereas, in Spring 2020, noncredit programs were not given direction on remote instruction, attendance reporting, or a remote registration process, which resulted in serious damage to Fall 2020 noncredit ESL enrollment;

Whereas, the college's habitual reluctance to acknowledge noncredit in college-wide planning, and most specifically the fiscal benefits of noncredit Career Development and College Preparation (CDCP) certificate-based enhanced funding at \$5622 per FTES, is clearly reflected in the Multi-Year Budget and Enrollment Plan;

Whereas, a reduction in noncredit ESL and Business classes, including Vocational ESL classes and classes that lead to CDCP certificates, will make it more difficult for immigrants to search for jobs or to improve their job prospects by improving their English, especially those who are frontline essential workers during the pandemic;

Whereas, the Multi-Year Budget and Enrollment Plan presents demographic information showing that upwards of 100,000 San Franciscans are potential ESL students, yet does not propose any marketing or outreach to serve these residents;

Whereas, the Multi-Year Budget and Enrollment Plan does not seek to rebuild the college but rather outlines its demise by asserting a disproportionate reduction in faculty which will result in an inability to maintain the 18,600 FTES projected enrollment necessary to survive the end of hold harmless funding in 2024 (the "SCFF cliff"), and a lack of vision in academic and programmatic innovation and growth;

Therefore be it Resolved, The Academic Senate recommend that CCSF invest in robust and creative marketing and outreach to San Francisco residents in learner-friendly English and in multiple languages to ensure the equity that our Mission Statement promises to our most vulnerable populations - including people of color, immigrants, low-income residents, the underhoused, the disabled, and the technologically disadvantaged;

Resolved, That CCSF restore adequate coordination and non-instructional time (such as for faculty advisors) to enable the college to respond in a timely and effective manner to essential marketing and outreach;

Resolved, That CCSF support a student-centered, accessible, navigable registration system for both credit and noncredit with substantial multi-lingual wrap-around support;

Resolved, That CCSF value and support the diverse academic goals of our students including but not limited to degree-seeking, employment advancement, and Basic skills,

including ESL and Transitional Studies;

Resolved, That CCSF rely on shared governance and collegial consultation with Department Chairpersons and other stakeholders through transparent communication in developing and implementing the Multi-year Budget and Enrollment Plan.

**Moved:** Coni Staff; **Second** Fanny Law.

Adopted by acclamation.

VIII. Adjournment, 5:28pm.