



# The Academic Senate

## CITY COLLEGE OF SAN FRANCISCO

50 Frida Kahlo Way, Box E-202, San Francisco, CA 94112 (415) 239-3611 Fax (415) 452-5115  
[www.ccsf.edu/academic-senate](http://www.ccsf.edu/academic-senate) email: [asenate@ccsf.edu](mailto:asenate@ccsf.edu)

Curriculum • Degree Requirements • Grading Policies • Program Development • Student Prep & Success • Governance  
Accreditation • Professional Development • Program Review • Planning & Budgeting Process • Others as agreed

### CCSF Academic Senate Executive Council Minutes and [Sound Recording](#)

Wednesday, 2020 October 28, 2:30-5:00pm

Location: Zoom meeting <https://cccconfer.zoom.us/j/96406746184>

Phone info: +1 669 900 6833 or +1 253 215 8782 \* Meeting ID: 964 0674 6184

**Council Members Present:** Octavio Alvarez, Abigail Bornstein, Steven Brown, Amy Diaz-Infante, Nixora Ferman, Ben Finateria, Katia Fuchs, Simon Hanson, Nicole Oest, Gregory Keech, Fanny Law, Stephanie Macaller, Jeanette Male, Michele McKenzie, Sheri Miraglia, Madeline Mueller, Joe Reyes, Douglas Owyang, Mitra Sapienza, Lou Schubert, Kevin Sherman, Michele Sieglitz, Michelle Simotas, Coni Staff, Chad Stephenson, Marie Varelas, Katryn Wiese, Christina Yanuaria

**Council Members Absent:** Pablo Rodriguez

**Other Senate Members Present:** Sheila MacFarland, Frederick Teti, Jennifer Kienzle, Karl Westerberg, Darlene Alioto, Janey Skinner, Kathleen White, Lancelot Kao, Mary Bravewoman, Jack da Silva, Susmita Sengupta, Malaika Finkelstein, Shella Cervantes, Monica Bosson, Deborah Kitchin, Lawrence Damato, Claire Brees, Denah Johnston, Pamela Kamatani, Alexandra Kaplan, Diana Garcia-Denson, Kathryn Frei, Megan Sweeney, Elaine Avrus, Neela Chatterjee, Melinda Weil

**Guests:** Angelica Campos, Mandy Liang, Cynthia Dewar, John Halpin, Dan Jae Labrecque, Cherisa Yarkin, Carol Meagher, Rachel Cohen, Dianna Gonzales, Tom Boegel, Rajen Vurdien

- I. Call to Order 2:30
- II. Adoption of Agenda
  - Agenda adopted with one revision: adjournment honor.
- III. Public Comment
  - Dana's Halloween Night of Mischief & Memories, Saturday, October 31st 10pm, Dana Galloway Memorial Tribute, Halloween Night, 10pm on Zoom. Come in Costume to celebrate Dana.  
<https://cccconfer.zoom.us/j/92347916557?pwd=VUo3UmNrd000bWF0aUVNM1YrV2dVZz09> Password: 114778
  - STEAM building groups have been meeting and discussing the

- construction of the STEAM building complex. While it's going well, we need to ensure that all departments and programs are included in these discussions.
- Student Chancellor Angelica Campos announces the success of a Participatory Governance orientation for student participation a few weeks ago. It is essential to have student voice in PGC and Academic Senate committees.
  - AFT is sponsoring Organizing for Humanity: Celebrating with our Ancestors: Día de los Muertos Retablo/Altar Making:  
<https://www.eventbrite.com/e/celebrating-with-our-ancestors-dia-del-los-muertos-retabloaltar-making-tickets-125371705145?utm-medium=discover&utm-campaign=social&utm-content=attendeeshare&aff=escb&utm-source=cp&utm-term=listing>
  - Chair of Non-Credit Adult Education gives appreciation to Chancellor Vurdien and the student representatives for attending the Non-Credit committee meeting.
  - Appreciation was given to Student Chancellor Campos for being at this meeting.
  - Union President asks that we are mindful of planning for short-term and long-term plans post national election and with ideas on how best for faculty to proceed for the next few weeks: be more flexible, discuss with students if appropriate, avoid stacking exams around this time.

#### IV. Reports

##### Officer reports

- President Hanson
  - Goal is to ensure there is space here at ASEC meetings that capture and recognize all voices on the call.
  - ASCCC Plenary, November 5-7 is coming up with 6 CCSF members attending; please get President Hanson any feedback on the resolutions presented there: he is the CCSF delegate and will vote on Saturday November 7th.
  - Faculty Travel budget and allocation process are still being confirmed;
  - Faculty Evaluations are still being negotiated through AFT;
  - Administrative Hiring has confirmed four positions with the fifth, Internal Auditor, hiring still in progress. All of these positions align with conversations directly with Chancellor Vurdien in collegial consultation related to our entire administrative reorganization; the next step is the mid-level reorganization. Unlike previous leadership who utilized an

expedited hiring process, the current Chancellor has proceeded with a hiring process that includes hiring committee members at every step of the process, creating a decision-making process that is truly collaborative and clear and holds everyone accountable.

- Thanks to Student Chancellor Campos for inviting the Senate to the student orientation.
  - Let's ensure that we are responding to students in a way that is considering the high stress-levels that they are facing; as we are all under pressure, our flexibility with ourselves and our students is essential.
  - We are committed to reviewing and empowering Senate committees to ensure that the work being done in those spaces is up-to-date, productive and empowering for their members. The Academic Senate leadership is here to support all committees in their work.
  - Draft Multi-year budget proposal has been circulated throughout the college to solicit feedback from all constituencies and will be presented today at the end of this meeting; we need clarity on how our feedback will become part of the decision making process.
- First Vice President Law
    - Faculty do more than teach and are doing a lot of work to contribute to the college, both in their areas and college-wide.
    - Non-Credit enrollment has suffered greatly since moving remotely. Taking classes remotely for our students is unknown territory, triggering fear and anxiety related to the technology resulting in students stopping out or not registering to begin with. We need to focus even more on how to best engage and retain students.
    - Thank you everyone for all of your hard work and for being the role models for this hard work.
- Second Vice President Wiese
    - What we're doing we care about doing well and often in conversation about policy or procedure, it gets left out that quality teaching and offering students the best experience that they can have is what we are all striving toward.
- Secretary Sapienza

- A beautiful message from Christina Yanuaria plugging Amy Diaz-Infante's work and Organizing for Humanity: Celebrating with our Ancestors with a reminder from Friedrich Nietzsche, "we have art, lest we perish from the truth," Christina shares, "Art is even more necessary the deeper we go into the rabbit holes of 2020 and issues CCSF is grappling with. Art is restorative and healing, and [Amy Diaz Infante's] workshop is a way to help us reflect & heal, and draw strength from our ancestors."
- Sound recording of meetings will now be linked at the top of all future Minutes.

#### Committee on Committees report

- See committee appointments below.
- There are more and more faculty showing interest in joining committees, such as Student Equity Strategies as well as DLAC. We are in discussion about perhaps expanding committee membership given the latest surge of interest and the timeliness in some of these areas.
  - Is there really any downside to adding more faculty seats for involvement? It's important to maintain balance of perspective on committees, but we should adapt committee structure to the current needs of college constituencies and many more faculty are interested in participating in areas, particularly in areas that are focused on college-wide issues.

#### Award Committee Update

- Marie Varelas presents this year's Exemplary Award nomination: [ASCCC Nomination letter](#) for the Center for Entrepreneurship & Innovation and program faculty lead, Vivian Faustino-Pulliam.

#### [CTE Report](#)

- A survey conducted captured faculty concerns about the overall health and viability of the CTE programs and whether they will be supported to make curricular changes to get students out in the workforce more quickly, such as development of short-term courses and availability of lab access and face-to face instruction. There is a disconnect between community need and the speed at which our students can go through these programs.

#### [SWP 3 year plan](#) update

- Dean of Workforce Development, John Halpin the 2020-2023 three-year Strong Workforce Program Strategic plan that has been worked on by all constituencies: 29 faculty, 10 classified staff and 10 admin, as well as a rep from SFUSD. The group reviewed CTE data, drafted the plan and approved the plan through an online vote of workgroup members. The main focus moving forward is how best to implement short-term training
- Dean Halpin has been collaborating with Office of Instruction, Fan 5, Office of Student Equity, RiSE to identify overlapping efforts and to determine the best next steps.

V. [Consent Agenda](#)

- A. Approval of [Minutes](#) from 2020, October 14

**Resolution 2020.10.28.5A**

**Approval of Minutes: October 14, 2020**

Resolved, that the Executive Council approved the minutes for October 14, 2020

Adopted by consent.

- B. Committee appointments

**Resolution 2020.10.28.5B Appointments to Committees, Task Forces, Work Group Appointments**

**Career Technical Education Committee**

- Golnar Afshar, Engineering & Technology
- Guillermo Luzardo, Architecture

**Teaching and Learning Technology Roundtable**

- Galina Gerasimova, DSPS
- Dayamudra Dennehy, ESL

**Faculty Professional Development**

- Alexandria Leyton, English, new appointment as member

**Student Equity Strategies**

- Dennehy, Dayamudra, ESL, new appointment as member
- Lori Brown, Library & Learning Resources Center, new appointment as resource
- Matthew Schweitzer, Biology, new appointment as resource

**STEAM Steering Committee**

--Dayamudra Dennehy, ESL

--Brian Wong, Chemistry

**Diego Rivera Theater Building User Group**

--Harry Bernstein, Music

--Lenny Carlson, Music

--David Hardiman, Music

--Ben Lim, Music

--Rebeca Maulen-Santana, Music

--Michael Shahani, Music

--Lee Strawn, Music

- C. Endorsement of the Center for Entrepreneurship and Innovation program for the Exemplary Program Award

**Resolution 2020.10.28.5C                      Endorsement of the Center for Entrepreneurship and Innovation program for Exemplary Program Award**

Be it resolved that the CCSF Academic Senate endorse the Center for Entrepreneurship and Innovation program application for submission to this year's Exemplary Program Award.

Adopted by consent.

VI. Old Business

A. [Resolution about Equity Values at CCSF](#)

- Materials folder from September 30th forward has all the differing iterations of the resolution to highlight what changes were made when.
- Student Chancellor Campos shares feedback from Associate Students and Trustee Chung, and that this resolution is in line with a similar resolution Associated Students is also working on.
  - Suggestions for revision from Student Trustee Vick:
    - make the resolution more concrete in what it is asking us to do as faculty and as an institution
    - include more about prioritizing diversity in faculty hiring practices
    - include more about the need to ensure faculty are aware of

their individual obligations to anti-racist and equity-minded practices.

- Timing of feedback from students is essential, but a little off at this time, so one option is to delay vote on this item still.
- There is a commitment to incorporating student feedback, but an eagerness to move the resolution through to make way for next steps, but also a reminder that this resolution is a value statement that can birth more detailed resolutions of action in the future.
- This is an ongoing conversation beyond this resolution and should be on our agenda every time.
- It is essential to put the onus on the administration to prioritize and financially support diverse hiring and to make the resolves and next steps more tangible.
- Do the students have a resolution prepared and if so can we align this resolution with that one to ensure that the two documents are working in tandem with one another?
- We shouldn't spend too much time trying to wordsmith and we should pass what we have with absolute knowledge that this is a living document and ongoing conversation.

**Moved:** Steven Brown; **Seconded:** Joe Reyes

**Ayes:** Steven Brown, Madeline Mueller, Joe Reyes, Lou Schubert, Michele Sieglitz, Coni Staff

**Nays:** Amy Diaz-Infante, Gregory Keech, Stephanie Macaller, Jeanette Male, Michele McKenzie, Mitra Sapienza, Marie Varelas, Christina Yanuaria

**Abstentions:** Octavio Alvarez, Abigail Bornstein, Nixora Ferman, Ben Finateria, Katia Fuchs, Nicole Oest, Fanny Law, Sheri Miraglia, Kevin Sherman, Michelle Simotas, Chad Stephenson, Katryn Wiese

**Motion Fails.**

**Not Present:** Pablo Rodriguez, Douglas Owyang

B. Office of Online Instruction and Ed. Tech [Recommendations for Remote Learning](#)

- Distance Education coordinator, Jen Kienzle, goes over the Recommendations for remote learning document that has changed significantly since last read at the October 14th ASEC meeting, highlighting the main sections.
- President Hanson reviews Resolution on Distance Learning Recommendations.
  - Some confusion on the last recommendation in the

Recommendations document: Recommendation on Remote Instruction; is there something happening with the schedule so that students know upon registering in what modality the class will be?

- There is work being done between Office of Instruction and Office of Online Learning on seeing if there is some standard language we can use to add to the schedule that indicates remote and tells the students what time is required of them.
- A reminder was shared that there are still disparities between what students have access to while we are remote.
- There is a loss of opportunity for students to navigate online learning if the way we present information is not clear and uniform; we need to be more proactive about the terminology that we use and that we ourselves are clear on what modality options there are.
- A motion to table the resolution has been made with discussion about wanting to ensure the ASEC had touch on the information before the schedule is published, which will happen before the next ASEC meeting.
- A suggestion was made that an additional resolve be added to address the communication in the schedule with a response that the Office of Online Learning and Office of Instruction ensure clear communication to students in the schedule.

**Resolution 2020.10.28.6B**

**Resolution on Distance Learning Recommendations**

Resolved, that the CCSF Academic Senate adopt the following recommendations as presented on October 28, 2020, to apply during temporary remote instruction; and be it further

Resolved, that the CCSF Academic Senate acknowledge that changes in State CCCCCO guidelines, Title 5, ACCJC standards, FERPA, and DOE rules may require modifications in these recommendations; and be it finally

Resolved, that the CCSF Academic Senate shall receive from the Office of Online Learning and Educational Technology proposed modifications for adoption as needs arise.

**Moved:** Chad Stephenson; **Seconded:** Abigail Bornstein



**Motion Carries, Abstentions:** Ben Finateri, Stephanie Macaller, Madeline Mueller, Chad Stephenson

**Not Present:** Pablo Rodriguez

- C. [Academic Freedom](#) consideration of adopting an adapted statement from the University of Chicago about Academic Freedom
  - Tabled, no discussion.
- D. Academic Senate [Constitution Review](#)
  - Tabled, no discussion.
- E. [Mission Statement](#)
  - Tabled, no discussion.
- F. Roles and Responsibilities handbook ongoing discussion
  - Tabled, no discussion.

VII. New Business

- A. [Credit For Prior learning Administrative Procedure](#) presented by Articulation Officer, Rachel Cohen and Interim Dean of Student Completion, Mandy Liang.
  - Council will be asked to [endorse and recommend](#) this new administrative procedure.
  - The State has incorporated new procedures for determining Credit for Prior Learning with a new AP and BP in place by December 31, 2020. All constituencies have reviewed or will review this document.
  - Two questions arose around wording of the procedures regarding implementation of AP scores and if students can remove units submitted through this process if they change direction and units impeded different academic goals.
    - students are encouraged to discuss their options with an advisor or counselor.
  - A question arose about how portfolios would be graded and if it would be traditional A-F grading scale.
    - currently CCSF gives a Pass or No Pass grade for portfolios.
  - Inquiry about the section, “Determination for Eligibility for Credit for Prior Learning” part that mentions students’ qualifications needing to have a 2.0 GPA, not be on academic probation and references to holds needing to be cleared prior to petitions. We need to be cognizant about what is happening to students who may find themselves in these situations and how we are for decades upholding policies that proceed to build barriers to particular

students populations and are groups that are disproportionately impacted by these policies. What is the reason why we would continue to use these measures of qualification?

- Let's talk about this more.

**Resolution 2020.10.28.7A**

**Credit For Prior learning Recommendation**

Whereas, recent California legislation requires the California community colleges to adopt Credit for Prior Learning policies and procedures, intended to encompass all ways that students may earn credit without taking classes (e.g., credit by exam, military transcript evaluation) and to allow for more than just elective credit; and

Whereas, the CCSF Articulation Officer and the Dean of Student Completion and Retention Have developed a draft administrative procedure (based on one from Palomar College), in consultation with all College constituencies; and

Whereas the Education Policies Committee reviewed the current draft at its 2020 October 19 meeting and endorsed it for adoption by the college; therefore be it

Resolved, that the Academic Senate endorse and recommend this policy, as presented to the Senate on Oct. 28 2020, for adoption by the college through the PGC and Board new policies approval process as outlined in the Roles and Responsibilities Handbook.

**Moved:** Steven Brown; **Seconded:** Joe Reyes

Adopted by Acclimation.

B. Review of the [multi year Budget/Enrollment plans](#)

- Chancellor Vurdien highlights the importance of the feedback from the ASEC before introducing VC Tom Boegel who then presents the Multi-Year Budget/Enrollment plans: administration is meeting with a variety of PGC groups across the college to review this plan; they are working on meeting Associated Students next. This plan--a framework looking out into multiple years-- is addressing decreasing enrollments over the course of the past few years and reconciling the current college budget situation. VC Boegel briefly reviews the document, highlighting each section.
- Deputy Vice Chancellor Dianna Gonzales adds the need to focus on enrollment as we go through the plan; we want to focus on what the impact of the budget decisions on programs are when the plan is presented to the Board on November 12th.

- This is the second time we've seen this report; has the feedback already provided been incorporated in this document?
  - There is a survey being disseminated out of AVC Charles' office to solicit feedback from all constituency groups on the plan.
  - Will be prepared to address the feedback at the PGC meeting on November 3rd. The intention is to incorporate all the feedback from the survey and various meetings to the Board on Nov. 12th.
- VC Boegel reviews areas that have been revised since the first iteration of the document and suggests looking at the cost of programs and what are the enrollment goals that align with those costs. The link to the feedback form is on the Institutional Advancement and Effectiveness website.
  - The various iterations of the document don't reveal what the edits are and there is no mention of SCFF.
  - Faculty salaries need to maintain competitiveness in order to bolster all employee ranks through hiring. Some faculty have to work multiple jobs to be able to work at CCSF and live in San Francisco. We need to engage with more community partners to recruit and outreach more students. There is also nothing about real estate generating funds in the current plan's iteration as was mentioned at a past Board meeting.
  - We are perfectly poised to attract students interested in transfer from surrounding high schools; our institution is focused on serving students, but we are not focusing on classes for students, we are, rather, focusing on the institution and not on what students demand.
  - From the very first draft to today, there is not much progress that's visible, in terms of planning, which is not reflected in this document. This seems like a framework for a plan, but this is not reading as an in depth plan. We haven't gotten to how decisions are being made or what the priorities are going to be to shape 2024-25.
  - The seemingly most obvious roadblock to gaining enrollment is our registration process that can not be navigated easily. We can't expect to improve enrollment with a registration system that makes our courses nearly inaccessible for the students who need it most.
  - This seems like a missed opportunity to make some significant changes at the college like evaluating the costs of

maintaining all of our centers which seems cost ineffective. So instead we are lowering faculty salaries and making it even more impossible to get qualified applicants.

- If faculty are going to take a cut, we want to be very clear about what percentage cut we're getting in comparison to other employee groups at the school. We need all the groups. Many of us are working double and triple times than normal, so if you are going to continue to ask us to do this with a salary cut that doesn't go across the board, the future is uncertain.
- Students select schools based on the quality and integrity of instruction. If you undercut the faculty, you don't have a school and these cuts read as though faculty are expendable.
- Dr. Vurdien concludes the discussion with assurance that he will be conferring with Deputy VC Gonzales and VC Boegel and take consideration of all of our feedback.

VIII. Adjournment, 5:41 in memory of French professor, Samuel Paty.