



The Academic Senate

CITY COLLEGE OF SAN FRANCISCO

50 Frida Kahlo Way, Box E-202, San Francisco, CA 94112 (415) 239-3611 Fax (415) 452-5115
www.ccsf.edu.edu/academic-senate email: asenate@ccsf.edu

Curriculum • Degree Requirements • Grading Policies • Program Development • Student Prep & Success • Governance
Accreditation • Professional Development • Program Review • Planning & Budgeting Process • Others as agreed

CCSF Academic Senate Executive Council DRAFT Minutes

Wednesday, 2020 September 16, 2:30-5:00pm

Location: Zoom meeting <https://cccconfer.zoom.us/j/96406746184>

Phone info: +1 669 900 6833 or +1 253 215 8782 * Meeting ID: 964 0674 6184

Council Members Present: Octavio Alvarez, Abigail Bornstein, Steven Brown, Amy Diaz-Infante, Nixora Ferman, Ben Finateria, Katia Fuchs, Simon Hanson, Nicole Oest, Gregory Keech, Fanny Law, Stephanie Macaller, Jeanette Male, Michele McKenzie, Sherie Miraglia, Madeline Mueller, Joe Reyes, Mitra Sapienza, Lou Schubert, Kevin Sherman, Michele Sieglitz, Michelle Simotas, Coni Staff, Chad Stephenson, Marie Varelas, Katryn Wiese, Christina Yanuaria

Council Members Absent: Douglas Owyang, Pablo Rodriguez

Other Senate Members Present: Malaika Finkelstein, Harry Bernstein, Alex Mullaney, Frederick Teti, Jennifer Kienzle, Rosario Villasana, Karl Westerberg, Monica Bosson, Mary Bravewoman, Alexis Litzky, Carole Meagher

Guests: Cherisa Yarkin, Mandy Liang, Cynthia Dewar

- I. Call to Order 2:33
- II. Adoption of Agenda
Agenda Adopted.
- III. Public Comment
 - There is no data yet for the current semester in terms of the number of cuts, canceled classes and number of faculty positions lost. We have heard of things like 250 part time instructors eliminated this year, including 16 non credit ESL instructors, 17 part time, etc. Since the Union has unsuccessfully asked for this information, perhaps the Senate can also request this data, along with a summary statement for the last two years.
 - Expenditures for part time faculty have gone from \$26,319,020 in 2018-19 down to \$16,500,000 in the final budget for the current fiscal year. The Union negotiated medical benefits for faculty who have lost assignments this year, and might have otherwise lost their benefits. How can we find the estimated cost the district is paying for these

benefits, where they partly secure it from the hundreds of part-time faculty who lost their positions in the past year.

- There's at least a reasonable chance that additional revenues may come to the district from WERF or Proposition 15, for the budget committee asked that this be incorporated in the five year plan at least after the election if they're positive results.
- Things were dire this semester, things are dire over the summer and things are going to get a lot more dire very, very fast, and this is a moment for every single one of us to step back, get a little bit away from what we personally want and need and listen and work together, and to whatever extent we do that is the extent that our school survives. And it's that serious right now. This is real. And it's terrifying for a lot of us. We're gonna have to do a lot of budget analysis. And it may be that the numbers coming to us from the College aren't 100% accurate or maybe they're a little tweaked or we don't know yet. There's a lot of work to do there. But whatever little tweaks, we can find, we're still in the hole. There is a real budget crisis and our administration has said repeatedly that they are not interested in trying to bring more money into this college, that they don't believe it can be done, and they're just not going to put work into it. Which means we need to push them to do that.
- We need to do some of that work ourselves so we need to do things like look at the state funding formula. Our administration has refused for years to advocate for us at the state level, they are also not doing anything about Prop 15. We need to win prop 15 and every single person in this room can help with that effort right now by signing up for a phone bank. SF rising is putting together phone banks for 15 they're mostly on Thursday nights. But there are other times and dates as well. Please, please, please join this effort. It can make a huge difference. It can save this school. And I don't know what else can at this point.
- If you drill down into the Board's agenda there's a way of seeing how we spend money on Purchase Orders in any given month for the last couple of years, the aggregate figure is \$100 million. No one is really investigating the viability of this hundred million dollar annual outflow, and without anybody asking about it. We just don't seem to get that information. It may be all totally legitimate, but it seems to me to be a huge black hole of budget expenditures without anyone checking it out. No matter what our budget situation is, somebody's got to watch 100 million dollars of outflow annually.
- Celebration and appreciation goes to some really good work supporting the non-credit portion of the college. On behalf of of Non-Credit ESL that there's been a good support for numbers of students enrolling with some really groundwork teamwork from the ESL department who have picked up the pieces for Admissions and Records and enrollment folks. A significant portion of our Non-Credit community members are non-native speakers of English, and what we're struggling with is maintaining those folks as part of the college. Our registration process is struggling heavily to try to keep people who are non native speakers shepherded through the process of enrolling.

- Technology, notwithstanding, and other things that those communities may face this has been a real hit and I want to raise up Greg's work and the department's work there.
- Celebration and appreciation goes to the work that's been done on the website, on behalf of adult education. The website is clearly laid out with an appropriate description of the Non-Credit portion of the College, which is a third of the college. This despite the fact that Non-Credit programs have been hit disproportionately with cuts. Despite the good work that's being done, more continued work is going to be needed to fully support our Non-Credit students as we stay remote for Spring. Non-Credit is open enrollment. So I want to really understand that. As the chair of Non-Credit adult education, I want to encourage people to come help us on our committee to do that work with supporting this large portion of college. Also brings in funding for the college we do get money for students that attend. So to help the college work together as one unit I want to encourage our counterparts in for Credit to consider joining the non credit committee.
- 7800 enrollment in Non-Credit ESL currently; in Spring of 2020 we had 15,000 enrollment.

IV. Reports

A. Officer reports

- President Hanson

- At the state level:

- we adopted a budget with an appropriation process where the state decided not to make significant cuts to the California Community College; instead, they differed about \$1.5 billion. They added \$11 million for undocumented students to offset the federal allocations which are not supporting undocumented students. This deferral of 1.5 billion is predicated on the federal government providing support.
- Hold Harmless has been extended to 2025-26.
- The Calbright online system still exists, but its funding has been reduced by about \$45 million and \$40 million from two different pots.
- Legislation has passed lifting some restrictions off of the use of lottery funds which can now be used for direct student support (i.e. laptops, technology, etc).
- The CSU system passed an ethnic studies requirement. There was a similar bill that went forward for the community college level, which was voted down, not because of the content of the bill, which many support, but because of the process by which the bill is being presented which has been through direct lobby to the legislature, and not through the academic bodies that are in charge of academic and professional matters.
- The Board of Governors is considering changes to Title V regulation in areas of competency-based education programs; protocols for defining

correspondence education, for state standards of evaluation of International Baccalaureate transcripts and for codifying the Chancellor's emergency authority that was given to them at the start of COVID-19 in the Spring.

- The Board of Governors have passed value statements focused on diversity, equity, and inclusion.
- State Academic Senate will hold a virtual plenary session November 5th-7th. Without confirmation of our CCSF travel budget, we can not confirm how many people can attend with reimbursement, but President Hanson will attend and represent CCSF, regardless. There are scholarships available for those interested, but due by October 5th. Email President Hanson for details.
- At the local level
 - State Academic Senate President, Dolores Davidson is prepared to assist us regarding unanswered resolutions by the Board of Trustees
 - November will bring potentially 4 new Board members which will offer a chance to make sure the Academic Senate is included in Board orientations and retreats
 - Narrative at the state level is that CCSF is a bad money manager, over-spending since 2012, but we had high reserves and a six-year plan in 2017.
 - The Board facilities meeting reviewed bond facilities with question of spending for the new facilities.
 - CARES funding
 - Policy on Infectious diseases was brought to Student Success committee bringing into further question of Roles, Responsibilities and Procedures .
 - Draft budget for 2020-21 was presented at PGC and at the last Board meeting with long-range enrollment plans
- First Vice President Law
 - ESL Lab has over 500 students enrolled with 30-50 students attending small group workshops; we are here to provide education and we are engaging our students as best we can.
 - Despite the Non-Credit registration problems, we are building our Non-Credit enrollment.
 - Despite successes, there is still no way to report census for Non-Credit students.
 - Success for Non-Credit students goes well beyond transferring into credit: learning English, gaining Citizenship, job placement, certificate completion.

- The resolution passed last year regarding Non-Credit equalized funding has still not been addressed by the Board of Trustees.
- Budget situation is dire; reductions are on their way.
- Second Vice President Wiese
 - Attending many meetings related to online learning: DLAC, Distance Education department faculty to learn about processes related to resources and technology.
- Secretary Sapienza
 - Request for continued feedback on meeting minutes in order to accurately reflect the meeting dialogue.
 - Equity, Diversity and Inclusion resolution will be reviewed today, not as an action item, but for initial read through and discussion only.
 - Workgroup construction to revise ASEC Constitution is coming forth at our next meeting, September 30th, 2020.

B. Committee on Committees report (see committee appointments below)

C. Distance Education Coordinator Report: Jennifer Kienzle
(jkienzle@ccsf.edu)

- [Jennifer's powerpoint](#)
- Summer 2020 and Beyond Temporary Distance Learning Training (webinars, one-on-one meetings and discussions): 851 instructors trained in basic computer skills, Canvas training, and leveraging Canvas for how to be an effective teacher. This brought many people together to collaborate that would not otherwise be connected.
- Summer was also spent expanding LTIs (app that integrates into Canvas): PlayPosit, Labster, Canvas Studio, CidiLabs Design Tools, Pronto and Pisces.
- Faculty Resource Center: a place to take the pulse and heartbeat of our faculty; one-stop shop for help with anything related to remote teaching--some onlines but mostly faculty who are teaching remotely (TDI). This is also where faculty will see global announcements.
- 20 hours of one-on-one appointments a day, serving approximately 80 faculty per week.
- Introduction and advanced training is currently serving 20 introductory faculty trainees and 33 advanced training participants.
- Student support services through global announcements, virtual counters, passport for Canvas course (self-paced), support pages in multiple languages, welcome to Canvas message.
- Future topics for the Academic Senate: live remote teaching guidance,

academic integrity when proctoring exams while also protecting students, applying to teach online, peer online course review,

V. [Consent Agenda](#)

A. Approval of [Minutes from 2020, Sept. 2](#)

Resolution 2020.09.02.5A Approval of Minutes: September 2, 2020

Resolved, that the Executive Council approved the minutes for September 2, 2020

Adopted by consent.

B. Committee appointments

Resolution 2020.09.02.5B Appointments to Committees, Task Forces, Work Group Appointments

Scholarship
--Kendra Lockman, Mathematics
--Jacob Adams, Social Sciences
--Jose Del Toro Vazquez, World Languages & Cultures
--Steven Brown, Environmental Horticulture & Floristry
--Bruce Leung, Small Business

Teaching and Learning Technology Roundtable
--Kurt Robinson, ESL
--Michael Greenberg, Mathematics

Sustainability
--Michelle Gorthy, Communication Studies

Equivalency
--Mark Piper, Latin American & Latino/a Studies, reappointment as member

Distance Learning Advisory
--Katryn Wiese, Earth Sciences, new appointment as resource member

Matriculation Advisory
--Peter Stoffers, New Student Counseling, new appointment as member

Pathways

--Yi Liang, Library & Learning Resources Center, new appointment as member

Facilities Steering Committee-Diego Rivera Theater

--Anna Asebedo, Art, member

--Nicole Oest, Art, member

Facilities Steering Committee- STEAM

--Robert Del Vecchio, Engineering & Technology, member

Facilities Building User Group for STEAM, Diego Rivera, Student Success Center, and Evans

--Michelle Nermon, Architecture

Diversity

--Mark Piper, Latin American & Latino/a Studies, reappointment as member

PGC Technology

--Michelle Simotas, English, new appointment as member

VI. Old Business

A. Faculty input on COVID transition to remote Instructional Delivery - *with close to 100% of instruction currently being remotely delivered, with possibility of continuing remote instruction in Spring, this portion of the meeting will be to consider communication strategies to ensure current faculty experience is incorporated into future plans for online and remote delivery of instruction.* (ref: [Expenditures for Cares Consideration](#))

- Conversations are happening about the Spring 2021 schedule default being that courses are remote.
- Question to Dean Cynthia Dewar and Jen Kienze about implementation of faculty evaluations online and unrelated, if faculty prefer to remain remote even when we return to face-to-face instruction.
 - Distance Education department is waiting on the outcome of the Union negotiations regarding faculty evaluations.
 - Administration rejected initial AFT request to limit evaluations for this semester, consequently, AFT is working on determining what the criteria are to evaluate and are their ways to tweak the process. The proposal is in progress. Ideally evaluations are about improvement and that is the focus for AFT's proposal.
 - Carol Reitan and Dean Dewar wrote the temporary DEA in order to offer flexibility when modalities need to shift for folks who want or

need to teach online.

- Request for clarification on what City Online is.
 - Dean Dewar responds: City Online has not changed and continues to be degrees and certificates that are attainable online or partially online with no special advertising or special attention paid. It also offers students multiple entry points with late-start course options.
 - The Academic Senate officers and the Office of Online Education is conferring on the evolution of our online structures; conversations ongoing.
- A question was asked about whether there are correlative programs for technicians and folks in student services so that they know what students are experiencing in order to be better equipped to help students.
 - Dean Dewar reports that DLAC will be focusing on student services and invites faculty to invite the Office of Online Learning to give classroom presentations.
- An inquiry was made about how we are onboarding students in order to welcome students to the college remotely
 - The Department of Online Learning is hoping to get messaging to students as part of the registration process.
 - Anyone can go in and look at resources in Canvas, all faculty have been added to the Faculty Resource Center, not just instructional faculty.
 - An amazing student worker is running the virtual Canvas help desk with most visits from Non-Credit students.
- A question about workload in relation to online versus face-to-face teaching. Are getting any data, besides anecdotal on how workload has increased; can we temporarily change our workload?
 - These are issues that overlap with AFT purview, but the Senate can address issues of class size and how we are serving our students in online courses that were never intended to be offered online, which is something that the Senate can discuss.
 - Live Remote Teaching Guidance coming through the DLAC addresses these questions and a webinar is forthcoming on how to best communicate with students online.
- Some faculty are reporting that the students are doing better online and therefore want to do remote teaching beyond Spring 2021 but the.
 - Department of Online Learning suggests applying to teaching online.
 - Senate member acknowledges the lengthy time it takes to be approved to train to teach online.
- There is an inquiry raised about whether student workers can come back in

various capacities (tutors, lab aides) since moving remote.

- Elaine Avrus is leading the online tutoring onboarding program and student workers are being hired; contact her.

B. Faculty input on Enrollment Management & Budget plans - *last meeting council was provided an opportunity to provide input on the framework of Enrollment and budget plans, council will revisit this input in context of current budget information and refinement of long term planning and programmatic goals.*(ref: BP [6.17](#) & AP [6.17](#), [Multi year Budget & Enrollment plan Draft](#), [Sept 10 BOT projections and plan Framework](#), [Draft 2020-21 Budget](#))

- Last week the plan was developed more, while still sparse, but reiterates how dire our budget situation is and will potentially continue to be dire through the next six years.
- The recommendations from the Chancellor are solely focused on salary reductions, considering the centers, and cutting workforce. Deputy Chancellor mentioned program discontinuance which involves the Senate which the Board of Trustees are discussing these issues in closed session.
 - One member posits that program discontinuance is very scary and these actions are completely illegal as this not just a Senate matter, but a matter of Title V. We get permission from many different levels of governance to build our programs and the Board of Trustees are not the only level of approval. We need an attorney and someone at the State level that will fight for us. The Board of Trustees is ill-advised and we must do everything we can to make a program work before the program is discontinued.
 - The Senate purview is our Program Review process which may need to be looked at.
 - Administration purposefully refused to show the Senate the 16-page document and instead we were shown an outline. Deputy Gonzales intentionally wanted to show the Board of Trustees the plan before the Senate review. They are stepping through the minimum process to pass through decisions that have already been made with a severe lack of transparency to the Senate.
 - Other colleges could be experiencing the same things that we are; it may help to reach out to the State Academic Senate to see if there are workgroups or other groups working on how to resolve similar issues related to administration making cuts due to dire budget situations and thereby making decisions about curriculum and program development which should be done in consultation with the Senate. This is an effort that is larger than CCSF and therefore, we should address this on several different levels by contacting State

lawyers. We could lose a lot here in the realm of curriculum.

- There is worry that nuance and student voice will get lost if these conversations are only referring to numbers (i.e. productivity, expenses).
- Perhaps the only thing the Senate can do is to consider a faculty takeover of the Board. We need to be guided by what the community asks for and on students success and demand data, not by narrow political calculations. If our administration vanished tomorrow, we could run this school. Perhaps that is a viable alternative.
- At the State level it is being said that no cuts shall be made during the pandemic; therefore, we should use the FACC, we should lawyer up, and we should go to the State, who has helped us in the past when we have been illegally treated. We are the only district in the state without a CFO. We need to get to Gavin Newsom. The student-centered funding formula is tied to ALEC and Koch and it is not about student success.
- The administrators have historically taken a big splatt of data and then they say CCSF is going to look into this, they look at the Vision Statement and then they end up cutting what is easiest to cut. They need to have analysis that proves the validity of the program cuts; they need to present data that they used to come to that analysis, which therefore means that they will need the tools and criteria used clearly outlined and actually shows how they are making those decisions. The worry is that there is no presentation of the framework for this plan and the hope is that the Chancellor, Board and ACCJC expect more from this institution.
- We could write a Senate resolution to the Board about proper management that includes making plans and processes that are data driven and that we have no confidence in the current plan.
- The 16-page plan should not be approved by the Academic Senate for accreditation.
- This plan needs to come back to the Senate for any final decisions.

C. Roles and Responsibilities handbook ongoing discussion

- Ongoing process, all involved in PGC committee work should be noting the process: how do we bring things forward so they don't go from the Board to administration and back to the Board without including everyone in the conversation.

VII. New Business

A. Resolution about Equity Values

- A draft resolution was presented as an informational item, to get initial feedback before a future vote. The goal of the resolution is to begin a larger, ongoing and constant conversation about more clearly articulating our core values and action items to address equity, diversity and inclusion at our college. This resolution is not a one and done initiative, but a preliminary step to an all-college call to action. This resolution will be shared with Academic Senate committee chairs, Classified Senate, Associated Student Council, Administration, Union leadership.
- General consensus from those who commented was in full support of the resolution with input feedback for improvement.

B. Discussion of Communication tools and issues

- The officers have been discussing communication tools. We have an unmoderated online forum that has been problematic. We are taking suggestions and trying to figure out how we can create better communication tools that are more effective. We are currently examining an all-faculty Canvas shell, but we are working on improving
- A request was made to add a review of our college mission statement on to a future agenda.
- If anyone is using the Faculty Resource Center, and you have feedback on how that format could be replicated for Academic Senate related issues, send it to Katryn Wiese.

VIII. Adjournment, on the nose, 5:00pm