The Academic Senate

CITY COLLEGE OF SAN FRANCISCO

50 Frida Kahlo Way, Box E-202, San Francisco, CA 94112 (415) 239-3611 Fax (415) 452-5115
www.ccsf.edu.edu/academic-senate email: asenate@ccsf.edu

Curriculum• Degree Requirements• Grading Policies• Program Development• Student Prep & Success• Governance
Accreditation• Professional Development• Program Review• Planning & Budgeting Process• Others as agreed

CCSF Academic Senate Executive Council Final Minutes
Wednesday, 2020 March 18, 2:30-5:00pm
Zoom meeting

Council Members Present: Susan Berston, Steven Brown, Malcolm Cecil, Nixora Ferman, Ben Finateri, Ekaterina Fuchs, Simon Hanson, Thomas Kennedy, Fanny Law, Alexis Litzky, Marie Osborne, Douglas Owyang, Pablo Rodriguez, Mitra Sapienza, Kevin Sherman, Michele Sieglitz, Michelle Simotas, Chad Stephenson, Fred Teti, Marie Varelas, Rosario Villasana, Katryn Wiese

Council Members Absent: Jacob Adams, Octavio Alvarez, Monica Bosson, Dina Wilson, Christina Yanuaria

Other Senate Members Present: Romana Coates, Debbie, Karl, Kathyrn Frei, Eric Greenfrost, Dayna Holz, Jennifer Kienzle, Brendan O'Leary, Joe Reyes, Harry Bernstein, Coni Staff, Winnie Yiu

Guests: Martha Rendon

I. **Call to Order 2:35**

II. **Orientation to Zoom meetings and conducting business**
President Litzky gave an orientation to the functions of Zoom and roll call voting.

III. **Adoption of Agenda**
The Orientation to Zoom meetings and conducting business will precede the Adoption of agenda.

Revised agenda adopted.

IV. **Public Comment**
- A Senate member expressed concern about the transparency of the emergency Board of Trustees meeting and the rescheduled Spring Break.

- A Senate member shared resources about our current situations affecting our college operation and vulnerable students. The links of the resources can be found in the chat script, the appendix of the minutes.
- A Senate member expressed concerns that there had been no guidance for noncredit and CTE programs.
- A Senate member expressed that many courses in the CTE programs, including the practicum, cannot be taught online.

V. Officer reports

President Litzky briefly reported that:

- It's been incredibly challenging to be a representative leader during this crisis.
- The Board of Governors recently granted State Chancellor Oakley the extraordinary emergency power to manage the crisis for 180 days. Although he claimed that he would continue to consult with the BOG, it's not clear the extent of his granted power.
- It is up to faculty to take charge of modified instruction and instructional continuity, and our Distance Education Coordinator, Jennifer Kienzle, will give us an update and answer questions later in the meeting.
- Many events have been canceled, including Frisco Day, graduation which might turn to a virtual commencement, faculty travel, and the ASCCC Spring Plenary. However, professional development through online education is still supported. More details will be released soon about reimbursements for virtual professional development.
- District business such as the hiring of administrative positions in the bond-related facility management is moving forward. Members' perspectives are welcome regarding this during the current crisis.
- The consent agenda includes a resolution to extend the Academic Senate election nomination period and to waive the requirement to get a signature. If you would like to discuss this item more please pull it from the consent agenda.

Vice First President Hanson briefly reported that:

- There has been some concern about students' tuition refunds and the consequences of class withdrawal.
- Because of the fast-paced dissemination of information among groups of constituents, communication regardless of the content information, tools used, or the target audience has reflected to be a major challenge.
- While some students have shown engagement in the modified instruction format, there is an obvious concern about those students who have not engaged.
- The PGC Budget Committee would like to adopt a realistic budget with the aspirational goals instead of the budget assumptions in the previous years. The budget development should take precautions with how emergency management funding, which comes later, will be used to balance the budget.

- It's prudent for faculty who primarily deliver instruction to our students to get involved in decision making and the participatory process.
- There are concerns about the inevitable decline of enrollment when we reopen, especially with noncredit students and those credit students who don't adapt well to the modified online instruction.
- It's clear that the administration has only focused on credit instruction and had not thought through the transitional plan and impact on the noncredit programs. It's up to the faculty to organize a plan and push it up to the chain of command.

Vice Second President Teti briefly reported that:

Some updates from the Education Policy Committee include:

- The major residency requirement has been brought to the Department chairs and DCC.
- The articulation officer Rachel Cohen reported that there would be guidance from the state soon about students' credit for prior learning.
- The Committee is working on the best version of the model syllabus to bring forth to the Council for recommendation before sending it to HR.

Secretary Law briefly reported that:

- Faculty voice constitutes an essential part of the college decision-making process, reflected from attending the Fan5 meeting.
- The collegiality among the faculty representatives without the recusal policy in the AEP allocation has been an inspiring lesson that shows faculty voice and inter-departmental collaboration are valued.

VI. Consent Agenda

A. Approval of Minutes from 2020, March 4

Resolution 2020.03.18.01A Approval of Minutes: March 4, 2020

Resolved, that the Executive Council approved the minutes for March 4, 2020.

Adopted by consent

B. Academic Senate elections+

Resolution 2020.03.18.01B Academic Senate Executive Council elections resolution

Whereas, the COVID-19 districtwide state of emergency has disrupted the previously recommended election calendar and there is concern about participation in the election,

The CCSF Academic Senate recommends that the nomination period be extended to April 3, 2020; and further

The Academic Senate recommends suspending the requirement to have a signature from a Senator to complete the application.

Adopted by consent

VII. Discussions

A. Communication, pedagogy, and instructional continuity around COVID-19

1. Pedagogy and instructional continuity

Distance Education coordinator Jennifer Kienzle provided an update about the support from Distance Education for faculty transitioning to the modified instruction using Canvas, including live training, archive training, and personalized templates of Canvas shells. There will be upcoming support resources such as webinars about ways to engage students' learning, new apps or LTI like Pronto. Faculty were encouraged to enroll in the instructional continuity course in which we get training, coaching, and announcements.

The Council members shared the following concerns and questions:

- A Senate member asked what recommended information from the college could be given to students about internet access and connectivity in their shelters. The concern about the digital divide and internet access had been raised, and the state and local leaders were aware of the equity gap.
- A Senate member asked about the features of Canvas on their phone app. There was a Canvas app for students and another app for teachers. The features were configured and compatible with the phone screens. An additional communication tool Pronto would be launched soon.
- A Senate member asked about materials and content sharing among faculty in online instruction. Faculty were encouraged to share their materials in their shell, but there had been issues around intellectual property ownership per AFT contract and AS policy. DLAC might help to figure out some parameters for intellectual property, content ownership, and pedagogy.

- A Senate member shared that the instructional continuity course was a great resource to get one on one assistance.
- A clarification was made that the modified instruction in response to the current crisis was not the same as online teaching or online education.
- In light of intellectual property rights over sharing course materials, labor was another issue that needed to be tended to.
- A Senate member asked about the implication when certain courses, such as PE and Dance, showed up as "not available" on Canvas. The response was that every class had a Canvas shell, and some courses had a template built in that says remote teaching is not available, but a form could be filled out to reverse it.
- A Senate member expressed the concern that many noncredit students didn't have a RAM ID, adequate computer skills, or Internet access to receive the modified instruction. The expected decline of enrollment would negatively impact noncredit programs. A response was made regarding some initial discussion of advocating for an alternative way of calculating positive attendance, similar to the average of positive attendance which was calculated at the time of the school closure during the wildfire last year. ESL Department Chair, Greg Keech, was working on a long-term recovery plan to support and rebuild enrollment when school was to open again.
- A Senate member asked about the funding distribution for developing an online course over the initial semesters.
- A Senate member pointed out that the adoption of Canvas is not only to address accreditation and compliance issues but also it's a best practice to adopt a singular learning management system as a communication tool and medium to deliver online instruction.

2. Ongoing questions from faculty

- This document contains ongoing updates of a variety of subjects surrounding the current pedagogical and course concerns.

3. Authorization resolution+

President Litzky explained the reasons behind this resolution:

- Senates in other districts are adopting something like this resolution in response to the current crisis where quorum cannot be met to conduct business.
- While there are advantages and disadvantages to embolden one person with this authorization, it would provide a codified place in public where the Chancellor and the Office of Instruction are required to consult with if the Senate cannot conduct regular business.

Senate members have the following responses:

- First Vice President Hanson expressed that since the current school closure was likely to be extended over the summer months, this resolution took into account for this situation and until the end of the state emergency which could transcend to the next AS President.
- Second Vice President Teti acknowledged the awkwardness that President Litzky had to be the one to present this resolution, but it's a best practice and a reasonable resolution.
- A Senate member asked for clarification about the formality of the authorized President's response in the distinction between a personal opinion or a represented response on behalf of the Senate. President Litzky responded that she's mindful of the distinction.
- First Vice President Hanson pointed out that President Litzky has been highly effective with establishing communication patterns and long term relationships in the college community. The resolution will empower the President to say yes or no based on knowledge of the Senate standpoint.
- A Senate member expressed that this role was essential during this trying time and the upcoming summer.

Resolution 2020.03.18.02 Authorization resolution

The CCSF Academic Senate recommends that during the districtwide state of emergency due to the COVID-19 pandemic, the Academic Senate President is authorized to make recommendations to the district on behalf of the Senate, in consultation with the Academic Senate Officers.

Moved: Rosario Villasana**; Seconded:** Steven Brown
Motion Carries, Abstentions: None
Not present: Jacob Adams, Octavio Alvarez, Monica Bosson, Malcolm Cecil, Chad Stephenson, Dina Wilson, Christina Yanuaria

B. BP/AP 2.23 Communicable Disease*

President Litzky gave some background about this policy in response to the communicable disease that will be discussed at the next PGC meeting.

- A Senate member commented that language about "students who originate from all parts of the world" was not necessary and the long list of communicable diseases should be removed.
- A Senate member expressed concerns about the cost incurred to students who might have to get the diagnostic tests and forced vaccinations.

- A Senate member questioned the purpose of this policy other than being reactionary.
- A Senate member asked how HIPAA law applied here and questioned that the reporting system to CDC might be a tracking system of students who might be undocumented.
- A Senate member commented that the current individual response to this communicable disease superseded the liability aspect of the policy.

VIII. Adjournment, 4:48pm

Appendix A - Academic Senate Zoom Meeting chat script
Wednesday, March 18, 2020, 2:30-5pm

14:19:42 From Fred : In fact, of the MUB, our usual meeting building!
14:19:56 From Alexis Litzky : I KNOW! She's so smart. I don't believe it was just her kids
14:21:31 From Fred : Me either. To Simon: yum! My understanding is that the delivery gig folks are overwhelmed.
14:21:59 From Fred : I have one student that I know of who lost a job…probably many others I don't.
14:22:15 From Alexis Litzky : Oh yeah. Also lots of hotel workers.
14:22:41 From Fred : Ha ha!
14:23:59 From Fred : Is is impolite to ask who is at telephone number ?
14:24:26 From Fred : Hi, Susan!
14:25:23 From Fred : Can you rename me Darth Vader? (j/k)
14:26:02 From Fred : All your houses are so neat and clean. Intimidates me.
14:26:24 From Fred : Oh, right. ::D'oh!::
14:26:57 From Fred : Susan has appeared on video!
14:33:38 From Chad Stephenson : Here in chat!
14:35:23 From Marie : Hello everyone!
14:35:35 From Mitra Sapienza : Hi Marie and all!
14:35:45 From Fred : Alas, no quorum prize today. :-(
14:35:57 From Jennifer Kienzle, DE Coordinator : The strangest meeting and its my first academic senate meeting :)
14:36:14 From Fred : Welcome, Jen!
14:42:58 From Fred : Guilty as charged.
14:43:12 From Rosario Villasana : honesty is the best!
14:44:40 From Ramona Coates, Ph.D. : Is there a way to not have students' phone number pop up when I am recording my office hour Q&A with students?
14:45:38 From Rosario Villasana : is Ramona part of this meeting? question doesn't seem relevant to meeting?
14:46:58 From Ramona Coates, Ph.D. : Oops! Sorry! I just Joined! Though it was a general tutorial!
14:48:20 From Susan Berston : Thx , Simon
14:48:46 From Ramona Coates, Ph.D. : Thanks Simon!!
14:49:05 From Mitra Sapienza : Great to have you here, Ramona!
14:49:26 From Rosario Villasana : How can I see the documents on the screen while the video is up?
14:49:45 From Ramona Coates, Ph.D. : Hi Mirta & All!!
14:50:07 From Katryn Wiese : You can always see the video TOO
14:50:20 From Katryn Wiese : Just click on participants and a separate window will come up, you can move to the side
14:50:54 From Katryn Wiese : Ditto with CHAT. So you can have a chat window, a video window, and the main Zooms screen up at the same time.
14:53:03 From nferman : I can see the zoom feed again
14:56:52 From Fred : Malcolm vote in the participants with a check.
14:57:03 From Malcolm Cecil : Thx fred

14:57:58 From Mitra Sapienza : I'm a yes! Not sure what's up with my mic
14:58:02 From Mitra Sapienza : will work on it
15:00:50 From Rosario Villasana : I can't see the hand icon anymore, I did see it before
15:02:56 From Katryn Wiese : Sounds like his microphone doesn't work
15:04:46 From Edward Simon Hanson : Alexis in case we are not able to get into the meeting Madeline and I wanted to be sure these links are shared with the senate today by way of public comment. Thanks for all you are doing.

https://edsource.org/2020/give-us-a-tuition-break-say-california-students-forced-into-onlineuniversity-classes/626022

https://laist.com/latest/post/20200316/california-community-colleges-chancellor-emergencyauthority-coronavirus

https://www.edsurge.com/news/2020-03-12-the-case-for-shutting-colleges-down-instead-ofmoving-classes-online

15:04:48 From Benjamin Finateri : I second Rosario's comment
15:06:29 From Katryn Wiese : Can Pablo use the chat?
15:11:28 From Jennifer Kienzle, DE Coordinator : Hi!
15:11:36 From Rosario Villasana : there is also the question of intellectual property and copy right materials or infringement
15:22:26 From Alexis Litzky : Agreed, Rosario. That's something I'm working on right now. I've been told that we own the material (according to our AFT contract and an AS policy) but enforcement is the problem.
15:27:05 From conistaff : Right on, Simon. The State Chancellor has his own agenda - now he has extraordinary powers as well. Faculty needs to be able to voice opinions and those opinions be heard and respected at the State Chancellor's Office - our opinions about important actions and direction for CA Community Colleges now, both during these hard times and after.
15:32:48 From Alexis Litzky : Feel free to raise your hand at any time to get on the speakers list!
15:38:57 From nferman : Dean Tessa Henderson Brown said that xfinity comcast is offering two free months of internet use.
15:39:26 From Erik Greenfrost : Yes, but it's very basic Internet. There are concerns that it won't be robust enough to cover things like Zoom meetings
15:39:32 From Chad Stephenson : We have heard commercial services but are not sure of any official recommendations which we can share with students per CCSF endorsement
15:39:46 From Chad Stephenson : We are resistant to recommend private services per our public mandate

15:39:50 From Jennifer Kienzle, DE Coordinator : Erik, we are not recommending Zoom to be used on a large scale. I can talk more about this if needed.
15:40:04 From Erik Greenfrost : Of course, just using that as a sample of "data intense" usage
15:40:07 From Marie : I participate on a few librarian listervs, many schools are facing this challenge and a few internet providers are stepping up to provide free internet access as well as hotspots!

15:41:39 From Mitra Sapienza : This is not specific to technology needs, but should be shared:
15:41:45 From Mitra Sapienza : Maica Porcadas has created a comprehensive list of remote resources for student and employees alike. Check it out and share it out! And let me know if you know of resources that we may have missed.

https://sites.google.com/mail.ccsf.edu/ccsfremoteresources/home

15:42:23 From Alexis Litzky : You can find the link for the instructional continuity class on this page: https://online.ccsf.edu/for-teachers/

15:47:36 From Katryn Wiese : In addition, the Distance Ed folks have to approve all online teachers to ensure they're trained.
15:47:41 From Jennifer Kienzle, DE Coordinator : Thank you for linking Alexis!
16:01:29 From Jennifer Kienzle, DE Coordinator : https://forms.office.com/Pages/ResponsePage.aspx?id=1iIPXhaKfkG_OtCByYs42M1iZ9EPFNBoZlMh0kiBu1UNU1WVFZGMlFKVVo5U0c1SlRSVENKODMzOCQlQCN0PWcu
16:01:33 From Alexis Litzky : THANK YOU
16:07:35 From Michelle Simotas : The sharing issue has been an issue. I did not get paid to develop my first online course for this reason.
16:07:44 From Rosario Villasana : In the case of bumping taking over an online course will be a bigger issue
16:07:55 From Alexis Litzky : I think they’re both labor issues, too
16:10:43 From Erik Greenfrost : One of the recommendations that has come out of the work or RiSE echoes what Katryn said - students have been asking us all to pick a single course delivery method for online + tech-enhanced and to encourage all Faculty to use it
16:17:42 From Fred : Careful…we can’t speak for our against the motion until it’s been moved. Just informational stuff right now.
16:19:46 From michele sieglitz : Can we elect a virtual president after Alexis leaves us? Like “Her” only Alexis’ voice instead of Scarlett Johansen?? :)
16:20:36 From Fred : I should know that reference but I don’t. What is it?
16:21:22 From Jennifer Kienzle, DE Coordinator : Her is a movie with Joaquin Phoenix - he falls in love with an operating system that is voiced by Scarlett Johansen
16:21:41 From michele sieglitz : It’s a fabulous film about the future… Joaquin Phoenix is the lead and ScarJo is is his virtual love interest. It’s extraordinary!!!
16:21:59 From Jennifer Kienzle, DE Coordinator : Thank you for letting me speak at the meeting - I also need to take care of some children. Take care everyone :)
16:23:29 From Alexis Litzky : Thanks for coming. Good luck!
16:23:52 From michele sieglitz : Hand clap
16:26:30 From Fred : Careful…I think Connie is speaking favor of the resolution.
16:26:40 From Alexis Litzky : OMG I love “Her”! Such a good film
16:26:43 From Fred : Indeed she is.
16:26:51 From Alexis Litzky : Yeah I see that

16:30:42 From Rosario Villasana : Ican you just ask if there are no's or abstentions?
16:34:49 From Edward Simon Hanson : Hi Rosario, I think the tedious nature of asking for each individual yes votes is due to the electronic issues with the brown act and recording the vote for the record.
16:47:10 From michele sieglitz : Great idea, Simon.
16:48:41 From Katryn Wiese : Thank you SO much Alexis for leading us so well today!
16:48:54 From nferman : Great job everyone!
16:49:04 From michele sieglitz : I thought this was a lot of fun and shows how Flexible we can all be when we are called to do so...
16:49:13 From Rosario Villasana : Ditto Katryn! great job Alexis...you rock!
16:49:20 From Mitra Sapienza : here here!
16:49:23 From Erik Greenfrost : 👋👋👋
16:49:28 From Fred : I think it went fantastically well. Virtual hats off to Alexis!!
16:50:15 From Tom Kennedy : Thank you Alexis! I thought it went well. And thanks to all officers!
16:50:49 From Steven's iPad : thanks everyone
16:51:05 From Marie : thanks everyone for the zoom meeting, it was great!
16:53:09 From Rosario Villasana : Do we have access to these notes and links afterward?
16:53:33 From Alexis Litzky : I think so. I know I can review the chat history and will try to share it out!
16:56:05 From Fred : I should start working on other things. Ciao, tutti!
16:56:18 From Alexis Litzky : Toodles
16:56:19 From Alexis Litzky : !