The Academic Senate

CITY COLLEGE OF SAN FRANCISCO

50 Phelan Avenue, Box E-202, San Francisco, CA 94112 (415) 239-3611 Fax (415) 452-5115

HYPERLINK "http://www.ccsf.edu/academic-senate" www.ccsf.edu/academic-senate email: HYPERLINK "mailto:asenate@ccsf.edu"

Curriculum •Degree Requirements •Grading Policies •Program Development •Student Prep & Success •Governance

Accreditation •Professional Development •Program Review •Planning & Budgeting Processes •Others as agreed

CCSF Academic Senate Executive Council Agenda **FINAL MINUTES**
Wednesday, 2019 October 16, 2:30-5:00 pm
Mission Campus, Room 106

Council Members Present: Octavio Alvarez, Susan Berston, Nixora Ferman, Ben Finateri, Simon Hanson, Thomas Kennedy, Alexis Litzky, Marie Osborne, Douglas Owyang, Pablo Rodriguez, Mitra Sapienza, Kevin Sherman, Michele Sieglitz, Michelle Simotas, Chad Stephenson, Fred Teti, Leslye Tinson, Rosario Villasana, Katryn Wiese, Dina Wilson, Christina Yanuaria.

Council Members Absent: Jacob Adams, Monica Bosson, Steven Brown, Malcolm Cecil, Ekaterina Fuchs, Suk Fun Fanny Law, Marie Varelas.

Other Senate Members Present: Madeline Mueller, Irma Romero, Leslie Simon.

Guests: Gregoria Cahill, Adriana Rivera, Victor Purizag

I. Call to Order 2:30

II. Adoption of Agenda

Agenda Adopted

III. Public Comment

- One Senate member mentioned that simply by coming to a different center, it doesn't appear that we have engaged that center – and it's no more or less complicated than going to Ocean Center.
- One Senate member agrees that she appreciates (as a Center person) going to the Centers, and hopefully we can do this again at other centers such as John Adams. It offers a chance for people at other facilities to see beyond – and it creates less of a silo.
- One Senate member suggests that it tells people that CCSF is not just Ocean Avenue – and to start back and forth between Ocean and Mission.
- One Senate member expressed that the original idea was that all Centers would have an opportunity to come to our meetings and that we can see that we are supportive of CCSF, and not just the Ocean Avenue Campus. This was done in an effort to open things up and make things more equitable. Having said that, parking can be at a premium at certain campuses.
- One Senate member expressed that it remains an issue – and that when we have meetings at other campuses, it precludes guests from attending. Additionally, we need to do more promotion at the site where the meeting is being held.

- One Senate member remains conflicted – and attendance from the home campus can be impacted. Is the purpose being met? Could we potentially emphasize a particular campus at each meeting and invite them?
- One Senate member saw a CCSF Officer issuing tickets during Flex Day. Some faculty members do not have permits for Ocean Avenue.
- One Senate member discussed the controversy over the words "Center" vs. "Campus."
- One Senate member stated that legally we are one college and nine "centers."
- One Senate member mentioned a previous meeting held at the Mission Center where we were greeted with a meal and a warm welcome from the Center Dean.
- One visitor drew out attention to a $53 million deficit. She also had a handout of a panel event to be held at the Commonwealth Club of California on November 18, 2019.

IV. Officer reports

President Litzky reported that:

- She will travel to Newport Beach in early November to attend the ASCCC Fall 2019 Plenary Session .
- There will be a voting session (link to Resolutions packet sent in email), and it will be an action item at next meeting. Pre-Session Resolutions Packet and feedback will be asked.
- There will be a "call-in" / "call-out" session, which is part of a communication strategy during difficult times.
- Student center funding formula uniquely impacts colleges like our with a high number of students living under the poverty line in urban areas (such as ours and Los Angeles). A flyer was shown (Chabot/Las Positas).
- This information is being used to lobby at the state level. This data has been presented to oversight meetings in Sacramento. In addition, they're looking to organize with colleges who fit into this category.
- Administration at other campuses feel differently than our Chancellor about the funding formula.

First Vice President Hanson reported that:

- There is a lot of discussion about diversity and diversity efforts – and how to get faculty representing students. The State Academic Senate will be developing tools related to diversity in hiring, and more.
- More items related to term limits are being introduced – think of these in terms of Diversity Initiatives.
- Diversity will be integrated into State Chancellor's vision for success – and money will come along with this.
- The budget committee has met, and Abdul Nasser has been doing a good job of producing financial information that we didn't have last year.
- The Program Review Committee met. long with a focus on the quality of the programs, The program review process that occurs every three years – and a focus on the quality of

our programs during the review process. He reported that there is no longer a chair of the Program Review Committee.

- We have an accreditation requirement to keep track of our programs.
- People are stepping down from committees
- If you know of someone who has written program reviews with a vested interest in the college, and who might be a good advisor or leader in this process we are required to do – evaluating the academic quality of our programs, please send them my way. We continue to need a revitalization in this area.

Second Vice-President Teti reported that:

- It is always interesting to go to these meetings and to realize that we are not alone.
- The Education Policies Committee met on Monday and we continued to discuss semi-awarding certificates to eligible students.
- We were asked to consider a degree residency requirement within the major.

Secretary Berston reported that:

- She wishes to show gratitude and express thanks! Printed group photos were distributed to each of the Senate members.
- She is unable to fulfill her role as Secretary beyond the current semester. If you're interested in running (an election will be held), and assuming the role beginning in the Spring 2020 semester, do consider talking to her or to President Litzky.

V. Consent Agenda

A. Approval of Minutes from 2019, October 2

Resolution 2019.10.16.01A Approval of Minutes: October 2, 2019

Resolved, that the Executive Council approved the minutes for October 2, 2019

Adopted by consent

VI. Appointments: Committee, Task Force, Work Group Appointments

First Vice President Hanson discussed committee appointments, as follows:

Resolution 2019.10.16.02 Appointments: Committee, Task Force, Work Group Appointments

Nominations to Committees with Unlimited membership

- Works of Art
  - Nicole Oest - Art (Ocean) Credit - new appointment
- Scholarship
  - Alexander Lee - New Stud. Counseling (CNB) Both - new appointment

Nominations to Committees with Limited membership

- Basic Skills
  - Carina Lin - New. Stud. Council. (Civic Center) Both - new appointment *council. rep needed!*
  - Marlen Vasquez - English (Ocean) Credit- new appointment
- International Education Advisory
  - Kim Franklin - ESL (Downtown) Non Credit - new appointment

Nominations to AS Workgroups / Task Forces

- ASCCC legislative liaison
  - Hanson, E. Simon - Biology (Ocean) credit

District-Level Committees and Task Forces/Workgroups

- Participatory Governance Committee
  - Coni Staff - PE&D (Ocean) credit - appointment as alternate representing faculty at large
- RFP Selection Committee for Admin. Employee Compensation Study
  - Abigail Bornstein - CNIT (Ocean) credit - representing Faculty at large
  - Ardel Thomas - LGBT Studies (Ocean) credit - representing DCC
  - Steven Brown – Environmental Horticulture (Ocean) credit – alternate representing DCC

Adopted by consent

VII. Reports, Updates, and Discussion items

A. RiSE report

Michelle Simotas wanted to clarify a few things said during Flex Day:

- Give credit and a nod to the counselors, tasked with calling students and facilitating earning certificates, for the uptick in ADTs awarded
- The "old college" legacy college – it's not something RiSE has put forward.
- RiSe is meeting students where they are and helping them do what they wish to do at this college. This was not a vision from the RiSE team.
- Issues around inclusiveness from various parts of the college.
- Flex day workshop was an unveiling of the reorganization.
- There will be additional workshops (see CityNotes), and surveys will be made available to solicit thoughts and feedback.
- Starting to create a vision about mapping noncredit.
- Every center has counselors who guide students in different ways. Looking to document best practices (brain drain).

Questions and Comments:

- One Senate member wished to acknowledge the work RiSe is doing, but to also express concern about finding a medium between how students conceptualize programs and taking the expertise of faculty members who teach in those disciplines.
- Informationally speaking, the noncredit adult committee is looking for people as liasons with RiSe.
- One Senate member expressed that if you want to figure out what people think about their discipline, current and academic programs, look at program reviews.

VIII. Unfinished Business

Discussion about CityOnline Goals*

1. AS committees and CityOnline*

- President Litzky invited Starfish folks to come to next meeting.
- Please provide feedback about location and order of the items AS Committees and CityOnline.

Questions and Comments:

- One Senate member wonders if accreditation committee should be involved – and accreditation about pulling students out of other districts who are coming to SF "virtually." It may also be an enrollment management issue. For example, night enrollments have been impacted if we also have an online course.

- One Senate member discussed the TLTR – and at this point, it is pretty advanced. Some of the courses are fairly advanced.
- One Senate member expressed the need to keep face-to-face open for production side of things.
- One Senate member mentioned recommendations for these committees to make – and to get there, we need to do "XYZ," and to resource in a certain way.
- One Senate member mentioned that recommendation that enrollment management be who we advise – enrollment pattern that sustains what the actual student population is. I think we are asking for enrollment management here.
- One Senate member mentioned perceptions around change in rigor, flexibility, deadlines – and all the myths we try to dispel.
- One Senate member mentioned the topic of part-time pool. In one department, a Senate member discussed various types of pools (each person is ranked, and classes must be offered in that ranking).
- One Senate member commented that even with an influx of courses taught online, the phase out of the face-to-face creates an issue for students who may not have access (internet/online). Not all students can handle a course online. There is a disadvantage to students when face-to-face classes are phased out.
- One Senate member mentioned that while we may not entirely agree with online education, if we don't get courses approved through the CDC as part of the California Virtual Campus, we may lose out.
- One Senate member does not see noncredit in this paradigm.
- One Senate member thinks we are losing the potential to gain new students if we don't do this.
- We should evaluate which students we wish to serve – while evaluating the impact on enrollment.

B. **Board Sub-Committee recommendations**

The Board subcommittee made a recommendation to an external auditor to take a look at our finances.

- One Senate member mentioned concern with the name "Student Success and Policy."
- It has to come through the Senate.
- One Senate member queried about the auditor vs. auditing request – and what was requested by Trustee Lee at the Board Meeting.
- One Senate member mentioned that if a board committee makes its own recommendations, it bypasses participatory governance.
- One Senate member mentioned that it was asked whether a Senate or faculty resource was needed when these board sub committees were formed, and we were told no.
- One Senate member mentioned that a subcommittee come up with recommendations in direct opposition to PGC.

- One Senate member mentioned recommendation that the Board listen to their subcommittees. They have been told that they have the ability to call in resource members to meet with them.
- One Senate member expressed the appearance of collusion with the Board of Trustees. If the Chancellor is going to make the decision about what is "going down," why bother going through the board or through the motions.
- One Senate member believes that process has value – even if it is just a conscience of sorts. Part of the value of process is to allow people to have conversations.
- President Litzky will try to craft something to bring back to respond more completely.
- One Senate member believes that the Board is trying to break this unilateral fold.

IX. New Business

ASCCC Exemplary Award Nomination

Tom Kennedy. Nixora Ferman , and Rosario Villasana on the ASCCC Exemplary Award Awards and Recognition Committee has three programs interested. Which do we wish to advance to the statewide? Descriptions/nominations were read for each:

- Culinary Arts and Hospitality Studies - 2 votes
- Puente Program - 17 votes
- Child Development (Family Resource Center) - 11 votes

Award goes to: Puente Program

A. School naming process*

President Litzky asked for recommendations and feedback

- One Senate member asked whether it could be closer to the deadline for information for the catalog. It would be helpful for a student to know the school in which their department falls.

B. Review of **Resolution 2019.10.16.03 Reinhertz naming resolution**

- There may be some process conversation at the next meeting, but this should not be controversial.

- Our approach to this from a process point of view is that we support this moving forward through the appropriate process.

Resolution 2019.10.16.03 Reinhertz naming resolution

RESOLUTION TO NAME THE LARGER ROOM IN SMITH HALL CAFETERIA
IN MEMORY OF TANNIS REINHERTZ

WHEREAS Tannis Reinhertz, who passed away on September 5, 2019, began her career at City College of San Francisco (CCSF) as a Culinary Arts and Hospitality Studies student after working in Bay Area restaurants, such as Enrico's, Harry Denton's, Oliveto, and Vanessi's;

WHEREAS Tannis Reinhertz joined the faculty at CCSF immediately after graduation and served as a dedicated faculty member for 25 years;

WHEREAS Tannis Reinhertz, also served as a visionary, passionate, and highly successful leader as Department Chair of Culinary Arts and Hospitality Studies for ten years;

WHEREAS, Tannis Reinhertz, a "Grow Your Own Leader," mentored countless students, many of whom were people of color and immigrants, which resulted in their becoming employed in the restaurant and hospitality industry and rising to leadership positions in top restaurants in the San Francisco Bay Area and beyond;

WHEREAS Tannis Reinhertz worked with the San Francisco Office of Workforce Development and Success Center SF to develop a service skills program that teaches marginalized people the skills they need to work in the food service industry;

WHEREAS Tannis Reinhertz helped start an exchange program that allows students to study food culture in Oaxaca, Mexico;

WHEREAS Tannis Reinhertz, served her native San Francisco in a variety of capacities, which included philanthropic work fostering cultural equity that exemplified her belief in the mission of CCSF, which extends beyond the classroom walls and into the very rich and diverse neighborhoods of San Francisco and the greater Bay Area;

WHEREAS Tannis Reinhertz served as the Chair of the Board of Directors of La Cocina, a non-profit that promotes equity in food entrepreneurship for women and people of color;

WHEREAS Tannis Reinhertz wrote and published articles on food;

WHEREAS Tannis Reinhertz combined her passions in life, social justice, hospitality, and the dining experience to become a powerhouse in the Bay Area food scene and an inspiration to all those whose lives she touched;

WHEREAS Tannis Reinhertz throughout her career remained a bright light who wanted everyone to feel welcome, nourished, and loved;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that the larger room of Smith Hall Cafeteria be named the Reinhertz Room and signage be affixed to the wall indicating the new name;

C. **Review of Resolution 2019.10.16.04 Land Acknowledgment Resolution**

Leslie Simon from IDST has written a Land acknowledgement resolution. The resolution supports this process happening. People can decide in different ways (beginning of semester / twice a year). She is open to any and all feedback and changes to the resolution. This is uncharted territory for her.

Resolution 2019.10.16.04 Land Acknowledgment Resolution

RESOLUTION TO COMMIT CITY COLLEGE OF SAN FRANCISCO TO LAND ACKNOWLEDGMENT PRACTICES AT PUBLIC MEETINGS AND GATHERINGS, INCLUDING SPORTS AND CULTURAL EVENTS

Whereas United States history is marred by brutal treatment of Indigenous people, including systematic murder of Native populations, separation of families, and land theft;

Whereas United States educational institutions including schools, colleges, universities, and museums have often presented distorted histories of Native Americans;

Whereas Governor Gavin Newsom has recently made a formal apology for the state's genocidal practices toward California's Native population in an executive order, which also called for a Truth and Healing Council to disseminate knowledge of this history;

Whereas City College of San Francisco is committed to social justice education through its Ethnic Studies and Social Justice Departments and its Social Justice AA-T degrees;

Whereas City College of San Francisco's "Introduction to Museum Studies" class emphasizes the importance of decolonizing and indigenizing museums, thereby participating in the movement among museums throughout the country to repatriate stolen objects, expose the brutal treatment of Native Americans in U.S. history, and include Indigenous perspectives in programs and exhibitions;

Whereas City College of San Francisco recently mounted the "Ohlone Elders and Youth Speaks: Restoring a California Legacy" exhibition in the Rosenberg Library, which honored the cultural traditions of the Indigenous people of the Bay Area;

Whereas Native Americans and other Indigenous people have maintained sacred relationships to ancestral lands and continue to serve as stewards of those lands, including promoting ecological practices that can restore the planet during this time of climate crisis; and

Whereas a resistance and resilience movement led by Native Americans calls for an accounting of brutal U.S. practices toward Native people and, as a first step in healing, for formal acknowledgment that these institutions sit on ancestral lands.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT:

City College of San Francisco acknowledges that it sits on the traditional land of the Ramaytush Ohlone peoples.

Land acknowledgment statements, developed in consultation with the Ramaytush Ohlone peoples, will be offered with respect and purpose at all City College of San Francisco public meetings and gatherings, including sports and cultural events.

City College of San Francisco will continue to offer and promote history and other courses that include Indigenous perspectives.

Moved: Pablo Rodrigues; Seconded: Michele Sieglitz
MC, Abstentions: Rosario Villasana, Fred Teti, Chad Stephenson, Katryn Wiese
Not present: Jacob Adams, Monica Bosson, Steven Brown, Malcolm Cecil, Ekaterina Fuchs, Suk Fun Fanny Law, Marie Varelas.

Questions and Comments:

- It is a fluid document
- Leslie Simon mentioned that Ramaytush Ohlone representative has approved.
- One Senate member expressed the need to include the Senate – and concern of wording "will be offered" and prescriptive nature of the paragraph.
- One Senate member expressed wording – "development and maintenance of"
- One Senate member expressed concern over the mandate wording "at all City College of San Francisco public meetings and gatherings, including sports and cultural events.
- One Senate member expresses concern over "wordsmithing" the document, and playing to "comforts," and sitting from a place of privilege.
- One Senate member expressed the emotion on the table and that this is "too little, too late." But at least, it is something. We cannot even consider a resolution that will bring something to our brothers and sisters who are no longer with us. With regards to the rules, this motion as it is, he would not accept any amendments.
- One Senate member mentioned that there is nothing wrong, in her opinion, with it becoming a pledge of allegiance.
- One Senate member expressed feeling in an awkward position, along with her discomfort about pushing this resolution through -- and she feels supportive in theory.
- One Senate member mentioned being uncomfortable talking about wordsmithing, and that is part of the system of White Supremacy -- and it is hard to step out of that lens and that perspective and engage in these uncomfortable conversations.

X. Adjournment 5:00