



The Academic Senate

CITY COLLEGE OF SAN FRANCISCO

50 Phelan Avenue, Box E-202, San Francisco, CA 94112 (415) 239-3611 Fax (415) 452-5115

HYPERLINK "<http://www.ccsf.edu/academic-senate>" www.ccsf.edu/academic-senate email: HYPERLINK "<mailto:asenate@ccsf.edu>"

Curriculum • Degree Requirements • Grading Policies • Program Development • Student Prep & Success • Governance
Accreditation • Professional Development • Program Review • Planning & Budgeting Processes • Others as agreed

CCSF Academic Senate Executive Council Minutes **FINAL MINUTES**

Wednesday, 2019 October 2, 2:30-5:00 pm

Ocean Avenue Campus, MUB 140

Council Members Present: Jacob Adams, Susan Berston, Monica Bosson, Nixora Ferman, Ben Finateri, Ekaterina Fuchs, Simon Hanson, Thomas Kennedy, Fanny Law, Alexis Litzky, Marie Osborne, Pablo Rodriguez, Mitra Sapienza, Kevin Sherman, Michele Sieglitz, Michelle Simotas, Chad Stephenson, Fred Teti, Marie Varelas, Rosario Villasana, Katryn Wiese, Dina Wilson, Christina Yanuaria.

Council Members Absent: Octavio Alvarez, Malcolm Cecil, Douglas Owyang, Leslye Tinson.

Other Senate Members Present: Madeline Mueller, Coni Staff.

Guests: John Halpin, Kristin Smith.

I. Call to Order, 2:34

II. Adoption of Agenda

Agenda Adopted

III. Consent Agenda

Resolution 2019.10.02.01A Approval of Minutes: September 18, 2019

Resolved, that the Executive Council approved the minutes for September 18, 2019.

Adopted by consent

Changes/adjustments to the minutes:

Budget Committee Recommendation:

Whereas, as its August 22nd meeting (which featured a two-and-a-one-half hour closed session with no reportable actions), the CCSF Board of Trustees adopted the fiscal year 2019-20 final District budget **without** (replaces “with”) a recommendation from the PGC Budget Committee nor any significant public discussions of the contents and values reflected within the adopted budget; and

Feedback for BP/AP updates and proposals:

BP 1.27 is a rewrite to an existing board policy based on **illegal** (*replaces “nefarious”*) activities around the last bond and election donations. Policies have been created to prevent further occurrences of these events.

Moved: Steven Brown; **Seconded:** Simon Hanson

MC, Abstentions: None

Not present: Octavio Alvarez, Malcolm Cecil, Douglas Owyang, Leslye Tinson.

IV. Public Comment

- Despite disappointment that no one from administration was “listening,” one Senate member reflected on how proud she was of the recent peaceful demonstration staged by students at Conlan Hall.
- John Halpin, Dean, Workforce Development, brought forth and discussed the benefits of the new Career Education Program Guides.
- Designed to facilitate a discussion between part-timers, faculty, and the Chancellor, one Senate member reiterated the ongoing weekly meeting on Fridays at the Mission Center.
- One Senate member is disturbed by the “level of rhetoric” being heard. Furthermore, to open up conversation and compromise, this Senate member agrees that the Senate is poised to lead a campaign for professionalism and professional ethics.
- One Senate member reminded us of the importance of the closing of our last meeting in memory of Tannis Reinhertz, Culinary Arts and Hospitality Faculty, and the many ways she touched our lives.

V. Administration Report: Chancellor Mark Rocha

Chancellor Rocha reported that:

- He met with Faculty and the Department Chair Council, along with representatives of AFT, regarding the class schedule, which is currently being developed for the Spring semester. The hope is that there will be additional classes.
- Chairs raised the issue of how the budget for class schedules is developed, and a working group will be formed with Chairs from each of the seven major schools. Currently, there is a communication breakdown as to how the budget is developed, and how it is filtered down to the various 65 departments for a clear and transparent allocation process.
- There is a post-selection committee for Phase 2 of the compensation plan.
- We should be ashamed at how we have conducted ourselves in public over the last several weeks. The tape of the last BOT meeting (with the mention of “lynching”) indicates that we should take responsibility to act with increased respect and civility to eliminate a culture of “Trumpism.”
- Never in his career has he attacked someone personally, and no one in this college deserves to be attacked personally. He traced back the beginning of uncivil ways of expressing ourselves to January of this year -- which began during an attempt to schedule fall classes and balance the budget.
- If the power struggle is over whether you want him to be your Chancellor (our eighth in a decade), come see him, and speak to Alex Randolph, President of the Board of Trustees.

He prefers to stay at City College of San Francisco, and to make peace while trusting the process.

- Despite our public discourse and the behavior modeled to students, there is genuine love here, and those must be the first steps towards peace.
- We need to trust the process, and an apology was made around how the proposal for administrator salary increases was handled.
- If you feel the numbers are not real, and that you cannot trust the administration, we can work that out. If we continue in this way, the question was raised about who would want to come into this type of environment.
- Upon his arrival, there was a “Free City Euphoria,” a “Love-in” and salary increase. Soon, the reality of running out of money became evident. We are still afloat, and our accreditation midterm report is due next fall.
- A 10 percent salary increase for administrators was approved, and the issue is now about getting back on track with process.
- Administered by Garth Kwiecien, Sr. Director of Administrative Services, there will be a Request for Proposal (RFP) #2020-024 Employee Compensation and Validation Study with Related Services, Certified and Classified Administrators that will go out to the public with a target date of November 1, 2019. The protocol for how the firm will be chosen was reviewed.
- The goal is to get the Classified staff a fair contract.
- He will work to grow enrollment in order to get back to the “Path to 32,000.”
- It is time for us to learn how to live with each other, and time to forgive and forget -- while recommitting to peace and process.

Questions and Comments:

- One Senate member agrees with moving forward, and the lack of transparency about the process has been a sticking point.
- One Senate member reiterated the importance of conversations among different constituents, and the desperation felt among its members. A moratorium on cuts must be made, and let us bring the numbers more “evenly” among part time and full time members.
- One Senate member thanked the Chancellor for addressing the rhetoric, and hopes the conversation will continue. The same Senate member, a single mother of two children living in San Francisco, inquired why an audit of this nature is not being conducted for all employees of the college.
- Along the lines of uniformity of communication methods, one Senate member commented that EFF is not subscribed to by all faculty.

VI. Officer reports

President Litzky briefly reported that:

- Her greatest challenge is that of balancing representation of our faculty vs. leadership communicating to faculty, and “managing up.”
- It is disheartening to hear that AFT has the primary voice of the college.
- She had a conversation earlier in the day with Shannel Williams, a BOT member, who expressed gratitude to the Academic Senate.

- Trust comes from experience. President Litzky quoted her mother – “the proof is in the pudding.”

First Vice-President Hanson reported that:

- We have spent lots of time “gently” asking about process, while continuing to state faculty opinion.
- We recognize how the Chancellor feels, and he inquired about our process for governing decisions at the college.

Second Vice-President Teti reported that:

- He agrees with President Litzky’s mother – that “the proof is in the pudding.”

Secretary Berston reported that:

- Forgiveness is key
- Her student, Allan Reyes, also a photographer, is here to take our group photo.

More comments about the Chancellor’s Visit:

- One Senate member inquired about the number of times the Chancellor has addressed this body, the role of the Path to 32,000, and the prioritization of the noncredit college.
- One Senate member reported that the availability of noncredit enrollment data has been in question.
- Another Senate member reported a process used to divide courses by color – red, yellow, and blue.
- One Senate member mentioned the Chancellor’s ability to use words during difficult times and the importance to hold accountable the actions taken that communicate what the actual thoughts are – or the best we can determine what the thoughts are. She further reiterated the importance of holding the Chancellor accountable, and asking direct and difficult questions to do so.
- One Senate member questioned the number of resolutions that must be written.
- One Senate member reiterated the mention of forgiveness, accountability for all, and remember who you are, and what you represent. We are intelligent people, and we can tell the difference between factual information and derailment. Let’s hold the Chancellor accountable for the process and not get “sucked in” to the rhetoric.
- One Senate member expressed how uncomfortable she felt about the way we were spoken to by the Chancellor. It didn’t feel respectful.
- One Senate member expressed how painful it has been to be at a meeting to watch the Chancellor apologize. The same Senate member thinks that we were shamed (as a constituency) by the Chancellor – having little to do with the attack on his wife during the recent Board of Trustees meeting. Additionally, a full audit of faculty salaries should also be conducted.

VII. Appointments: Committee, Task Force, Work Group Appointments

First Vice-President Hanson has been directed by the Committee on Committee to broadcast the opportunity to serve on a new, revitalized, FreeCity Oversight Committee. President

Litzky can share the MOU and further details of the membership, if needed.
First Vice President Hanson discussed committee appointments, as follows:

Resolution 2019.10.02.02 Appointments to Committees and Task Forces

- **Non Credit Adult Ed.**
 - Maria Rosales-Uribe, TRST (new appointment)
- **Scholarship**
 - Jade Tumazi, Communication Studies (new appointment)
 - Erica Tom, New Student Counseling Department (new appointment)
- **Curriculum Committee - DEA workgroup**
 - Andrea Niosi, Library & Learning Resources (new appointment)
- **Distance Learning Advisory Committee**
 - Michelle Simotas, English (appt. as alternate)

Moved: Rosario Villasana; **Seconded:** Steven Brown

MC, Abstentions: None

Not present: Octavio Alvarez, Malcolm Cecil, Douglas Owyang, Leslye Tinson.

VIII. Special order of business: Group Photo

IX. Reports, Updates, and Discussion items

A. RiSE report

Michelle Simotas asked that all ideas for CCSF All-Stars (videos) be sent to her. She is trying to broaden career clusters, largely CTE-focused when developed. Additionally, there's an afternoon workshop on 10/15 at Flex Day to discuss the naming of the clusters.

X. Unfinished Business

A. Discussion about CityOnline Goals*

1. [Draft feedback*](#)
2. [AS committees and CityOnline*](#)

President Litzky (page 15 of packet) was able to separate the values from the “asks,” and where the items that the Chancellor has asked us to work on should go. President Litzky asked for feedback from Kristin Smith, a new member of the Distance Learning Advisory Committee (DLAC), who reiterated that the document is a work-in-process, and by no means, complete.

Kristin Smith reiterated that the main focus of DLAC is to evaluate courses and instructors tied to the course – and approving courses that can be online courses. The process and steps for teaching a course online were outlined – and funding, of course, is a factor. Ms. Smith reiterated that she took the position to enhance the quality (rather than quantity) of online courses.

- One Senate member asked about funding of online courses. Historically, every online course was approved, and to date, the committee has become more discerning regarding approval.
- One Senate member asked about course development, and each course must be developed individually by the instructor teaching the course.
- One Senate member mentioned that within a department, any course developed online can be taught by different instructors. However, there is still a course outline of record – and each instructor has their own curriculum.
- One Senate member wanted to clear up an item on the Curriculum Committee side – stating that every course has a course outline, and with a fully online course, there is a Distance Education agenda (which sits on top of the course outline – and must meet the same requirements as a face-to-face class). The same Senate member remains concerned that growth is occurring in an area that may not potentially be meeting the needs of the community.
- One Senate member asked about the number of hours spent to lead an online class as compared to a face-to-face class. The topic of faculty and “Canvas-readiness” arose.
- One Senate member asked how noncredit fits into Canvas projects.
- One Senate member feels that a classified person developing curriculum is illegal and against Title 5 Law and the Ed code.
- One Senate member expressed how the quality of online courses is being managed, policy around the multiplier, and ADA compliance.

XI. New Business

A. Board Sub-Committee recommendations

The BOT has created three new sub committees to help increase transparency and inclusion – and pre-processing prior to items arriving at the BOT meetings.

- One Senate member asked how this is different from PGC.
- One Senate member mentioned the way information flows from a subcommittee (using the administrator raises as an example).
- One Senate member thinks we should ask the Board of Trustees how they want input from constituent groups. How will this committee solve the communication that needs to happen between Board Members and solving the conversations we are having in our committee meetings.
- President Litzky has requested that we continue discussing what kind of conversation we wish to have regarding this.

B. School naming process*

Tabled to next meeting

Moved: Monica Bosson; **Seconded:** Simon Hanson

MC, Abstentions: None

Not present: Octavio Alvarez, Malcolm Cecil, Douglas Owyang, Leslye Tinson

XXII. Adjournment 5:02