



The Academic Senate

CITY COLLEGE OF SAN FRANCISCO

50 Phelan Avenue, Box E-202, San Francisco, CA 94112 • (415) 239-3611 • Fax (415) 452-5115

www.ccsf.edu/academic-senate • email: asenate@ccsf.edu

Curriculum • Degree Requirements • Grading Policies • Program Development • Student Prep & Success • Governance
Accreditation • Professional Development • Program Review • Planning & Budgeting Processes • Others as agreed

CCSF Academic Senate Executive Council Official Minutes Wednesday, December 14, 2016, 2:30–5:00 p.m. Ocean Campus, MUB 140

2016–2017 Council Members Present: Jacques Arceneaux, Loren Bell, Monica Bosson, Steven Brown, Lenny Carlson, Neela Chatterjee, Dayo Diggs, Donna Hayes, Thomas Kennedy, Dana Jae Labrecque, Mandy Liang, Alexis Litzky, Sheila McFarland, Amy McLanahan, Madeline Mueller, Marie Osborne, Denise Selleck, Mike Solow, Coni Staff, Fred Teti, Rosario Villasana

2016–2017 Council Members Absent: Verónica Feliu (on leave)

Other Senate Members Present: Beth Cataldo, Ophelia Clark, E. Simon Hanson, Carole Meagher, Richard Wu

Guests: Theresa Rowland, Cherisa Yarkin

I. Call to Order. 2:36 p.m.

II. Adoption of Agenda.

Agenda adopted.

III. Officers' Reports

President Liang Reported:

- That the Executive Council's hard work on making recommendations with respect to 10+1 is greatly appreciated.
- That the hiring committee for the permanent chancellor would consist of 4 faculty members, 3 classified staff, 2 students, 2 Board members, and 3 community members. Faculty members will be Mandy Liang, Alan D'Souza, Rosario Villasana, and Ken Lee.

First Vice-President Teti Reported:

- See written report (Appendix A).

Second Vice-President Staff Reported:

- That the issues highlighted in the state audit of labs happened during a period in which CCSF was under chancellors appointed by the state, and that there appears to have been a lapse in leadership on these compliance issues.
- That President Liang was to be commended on not only her work as president this semester, but also on keeping the Senate office running without staff support.

Secretary Arceneaux Reported:

- That he wished everyone an enjoyable and restful holiday season after a semester of hard work.

IV. Public Comment

- Chancellor hiring committee members were urged to revive the past practice of having finalists sit for questions and open comment, perhaps in Diego Rivera Theatre.
- Members expressed the need for a timely message to the college community regarding the state audit, and for a better handling of media issues. Dissatisfaction was expressed at the media knowing of this situation before the college community.

V. Consent Agenda

None at this time.

VI. Appointments

<p>Resolution 2016.12.14.01 Appointments to Committees and Task Forces</p> <p>Equivalency Committee Lancelot Kao --- Astronomy (reappointment)</p> <p>Legislative Liaison to State Academic Senate Mandy Liang --- New Student Counseling and Senate President</p> <p>Moved: Steven Brown; Seconded: Dana Jae Labrecque; MC Abstention: Mandy Liang Not present: Verónica Feliu (on leave)</p>

VII. Unfinished Business

A. English Sequence Redesign – Erin Denney

Erin Denney provided an update on the English sequence redesign. She reported that she is working with the Curriculum Committee on a streamlined process for amending course outlines to reflect the new numbering system. She furthermore reported that the English Department has begun a large information push to students to explain the path forward to students. Council members commended both her and her department for a model approach to a major redesign.

VIII. New Business/Reports

A. Honors Issues Committee Report – Elizabeth Smith

Elizabeth Smith reported on the work of the Honors Issues Committee. At present, the committee comprises 5 faculty members, a resource member, 2 classified staff members, a representative of EOPS, and 1 student. An email will be sent to students in early January

about honors programs, and the committee has approached the CCSF Foundation for funds to endow an honors-specific scholarship.

B. SLO FLEX Day (April 20, 2017) Update – Sheri Miraglia & Craig Kleinman

Sheri Miraglia and Craig Kleinman gave an overview of the spring SLO FLEX Day. The morning will consist of college-wide activities, and the afternoon will be reserved for internal work in departments. This FLEX Day will focus on holistic aggregate assessment. It is hoped that around half the work will be completed that day. Although not required, using ARGOS could be very helpful.

C. Area F GELO Assessment Report – Sheri Miraglia & Craig Kleinman

Resolution 2016.12.14.02 Academic Senate Accepts the Area F GELO Assessment Report

Whereas, this Area F GELO Assessment report is an effect of the general education learning outcomes assessment process, an accreditation requirement designed to promote analysis, discussion, reflection, and improvement; and

Whereas, serious time and analysis went into this report with the hope of improving student and program success; and

Whereas, learning outcomes assessment reports need to be used to think critically about and improve the College; be it therefore,

Resolved, that the Academic Senate accept the Area F GELO Assessment Report, and

Resolved, that the Academic Senate recommend this report be used, when relevant, during planning and improvement processes.

Moved: Dana Jae Labrecque; Seconded: Donna Hayes; MC

Abstention: Marie Osborne

Not present: Verónica Feliu (on leave)

D. SLO Committee Report – Sheri Miraglia & Craig Kleinman

Sheri Miraglia and Craig Kleinman gave an overview of the current activities of the SLO Committee. They overviewed amendments to ILOs, and indicated that students would soon be surveyed on ILOs. In addition, reporting of SLOs for summer courses will begin next summer. One outstanding issue for the committee is a need for more representation from different areas, especially non-credit business CTE.

E. Explore the issues about establishing CCSF as Sanctuary College to protect undocumented students, staff, and faculty from deportation

Resolution 2016.12.14.03 Explore the issues about establishing CCSF as Sanctuary College to Protect Undocumented Students, Staff, and Faculty from Deportation

Whereas, data extrapolated from Migration Policy Institute (MPI) and cross-referenced with data from U. S. Census, Pew Research, and Public Policy Institute of California, a projection of some 300-750 DACA eligible students are at CCSF as well as staff and faculty at City College; and

Whereas, an overwhelming support from the CCSF Academic Senate Student Equity Strategies Committee comprised of faculty, counseling, students, classified staff, and administrators voted for exploring and establishing a policy to protect the rights and safety of undocumented students, staff, and faculty to be part of the CCSF community and continue their education with allocation of CCSF resources; and

Whereas, on November 29, 2016, San Francisco Unified Public Schools (SFUSD) sent a letter to SFUSD families and community “ensuring that a child’s race, religion and immigration status do not create any barriers to their education” and many of SFUSD families and community are students at CCSF and maybe DACA and undocumented students and CCSF has multiple dual enrollment high school programs with SFUSD students who also maybe DACA and undocumented students; and

Whereas, on November 29, 2016, the University of California, California State University, and the California Community College systems sent a joint letter to President-Elect Trump to continue the federal DACA program and support DACA students in “their dream of higher education in the United States;” and

Whereas, on November 29, 2016, the Dean of Social and Behavioral Sciences and the Diversity Collaborative organized a post-election event with a panel of CCSF Student Health Services, and community legal services from Asian Pacific Islander Legal Outreach (APILO) and Catholic Charities to provide some 70+ students who attended the event immigration legal resources on DACA to vulnerable students fearing for their personal safety and maintaining their current rights under the Obama administration DACA program to continue and finish their education with continued resources; and

Whereas on December 7, 2016, the Department Chairperson Council (DCC) voted to support the resolution from the Student Equity Strategies Committee to support DACA students and do everything possible for CCSF to become a sanctuary college; and

Whereas, on December 9, 2016, more than 500 college and university presidents signed a statement organized by Pomona College President, David Oxtoby, in support of DACA and undocumented students, stating that DACA students are “exemplary students scholars and student leaders;” and

Whereas, a resolution will be presented to the Board of Trustees: “DREAM City: Resolution Requesting the Chancellor Develop a Contingency Plan to Address Equal

Vocational Learning Opportunities for Undocumented DACA Students and to Mitigate Harm To Employees Upon Any Revocation of the Deferred Action for Childhood Arrivals (DACA) Policy,” and expand this resolution to protect all DACA and undocumented students and employee; be it therefore

Resolved that the Academic Senate recommend the Chancellor and the Board of Trustees to explore the following two issues regarding DACA:

a. Policies that would define information access level to the maximum extent that the law allows to safeguard undocumented students and employees and keep CCSF’s commitment as stated in its mission to serve the community and provide access, affordable and high quality education to all its students.

b. Adopt a neutral status and abstain from voluntarily assisting with resources to federal officials engaged in immigration law enforcement of locating and identifying DACA individuals in the deportation of undocumented students and employees and keep CCSF’s commitment as stated in its mission to serve the community and provide access, affordable and high quality education to all its students.

Resolved, that the Academic Senate urge the Chancellor and Board of Trustees to research the impact and feasibility of the two policies of safeguarding data sharing of DACA students; abstain resources to help locate and identify DACA individuals, and present the information at a board meeting in Spring 2017.

**Moved: Dana Jay Labrecque; Seconded: Monica Bosson
Approved by acclamation.**

F. Impact of Changes to Course Repeatability

Resolution 2016.12.14.04

Reviewing and Changing the Limiting Nature to Student Success and Access of the California Community College Repeatability Regulations

Whereas, California community colleges have built extensive depth and breadth of educational programs for over 50 years, developing programs that contribute to a skilled, progressive workforce; fostering a creative, innovative citizenry, capable of critical thought; promoting community vision, health, and lifelong learning; nourishing a diverse, multi-generational context in which all Californians can learn and grow; and in these ways providing an essential component in the social fabric of our state; and

Whereas, in the summer of 2012, when California community colleges were turning away hundreds of thousands of students due to budget shortfalls, the Board of Governors of the California Community Colleges, in the context of rationing education, passed regulations to limit the repeatability of coursework particularly in disciplines such as foreign

languages, the Arts, and physical education in order to focus on basic skills and a narrowed range of certificate and degree programs; and

Whereas, as industries change and modernize, these new repeatability limitations affect the ability of many community college students, particularly those enrolled in career and technical education programs, to return to take a more current version of a course they have already completed in order to transfer, update skills, or maintain professional competence; and

Whereas, lack of repeatability in performance and skill-building courses severely limits the ability of students in the Arts (including dance, music, theatre, and the visual arts) and physical education to transfer as majors or major candidates into programs which select students based on demonstrated performance skills, excellent portfolios, and strong resumes; and to be appropriately trained and qualified for employment in the Arts and Entertainment Industry which is one of California's largest and most important industries; and

Whereas, most of the disciplines targeted by the repeatability regulations require quality practice and repetition and can cite numerous studies describing the importance of a spiral or repetitive approach to learning those disciplines, particularly when learning physical skills and strategic decision-making capabilities, and that learning is not principally "linear" in those disciplines, nor is "linear" the most successful mode of learning for a percentage of our students in general; and

Whereas, the pedagogical principles for the arts, foreign languages, technical skill building, and physical education differ from a linear "take-it-once-and-you-are-done" approach to learning there is a necessity to base our curriculum and enrollment regulations on the foundation of providing sound, quality public higher education and not upon how much a student "costs", particularly since many of our California Community College students are already paying taxes to support the education they hope to obtain; and

Whereas, the Arts as represented by music, visual arts, dance, theater, and physical education teaching and assisting students with fitness, stress reduction, and healthy well-being are necessary components in the educational curriculum of California Community Colleges to produce a well-rounded, informed, healthy citizenry, especially in this era of epidemic obesity and lifestyle-related illnesses; and

Whereas, repeatability regulations now governing classes in disciplines such as physical education and the Arts require colleges to place active participatory classes into "families" of courses that are related in content and that students are then prohibited from taking more than four courses from any given "family" during their college career, with withdrawals and substandard grades counting toward the enrollment limit; and that some degrees within the affected disciplines require four semesters of coursework within a content group, and students who withdraw from such classes face significant obstacles to degree completion, the concept of "families" within the repeatability regulations represents both a barrier to student success and inequitable treatment of students; and

Whereas, the perception of “public taxpayer abuse” involving students being able to repeat Community College courses even when educational research indicates such practice is pedagogically sound for the targeted disciplines is fundamentally incorrect given that the public pays the taxes that fund Community College courses and has every right under the California Master Plan to repeat courses for which they have paid; and

Whereas, in November 2012 voters passed Proposition 30, and in November 2016 voters passed Propositions 51 and 55 signifying state-wide taxpayer support for maintaining access to high-quality public educational programs for which most community colleges now have space available due to current economic factors;

Therefore, be it resolved, that the City College San Francisco Academic Senate Executive Council support unfettered access to quality public community college education for all Californians; and

Be it further resolved, that the Academic Senate Executive Council request the City College of San Francisco Board of Trustees and Chancellor to work with the Consultation Council, the Board of Governors, and the State Chancellor to increase repeatability options needed for student success and access across disciplines; and

Be it further resolved, that the CCSF Academic Senate Executive Committee draft a resolution to be presented at the Academic Senate of California Community College (ASCCC) Spring 2017 Plenary that that organization charge the local senates to gather specific information at their college about the impact at the program level of the 2012 changes to the repeatability regulations from Spring 2017 through Spring 2018, and that the ASCCC comprehensively compile that information and present an impact report to the Fall 2018 ASCCC Plenary along with communicating such findings to the Board of Governors and the State Chancellor; and

Be it finally resolved, that if necessary, the Academic Senate Executive Council request the City College of San Francisco Board of Trustees and Chancellor work towards legislative solutions for revising repeatability options in order to provide equal access to a balanced, comprehensive, and high-quality education as ordained in the California Master Plan for Education.

Moved: Jacques Arceneaux; Seconded: Mike Solow
Approved by acclamation.

G. Report from October 18 Program Review FLEX Day – Simon Hanson & Loren Bell

Simon Hanson and Loren Bell reported that the Program Review Committee had completed its summary report of the October 18, 2016 FLEX Day centered on program review. The report is itself a summary of the summaries of individual program reviews provided by the break-out groups that day. The committee distilled what was reported online by each group, without expressing the views of its members.

H. Strong Workforce Program (SWP) Strategic Plan 2017–2020: Beth Cataldo & Theresa Rowland

Resolution 2016.12.14.05 Recommend the Strong Workforce Program (SWP) Strategic Plan 2017–2020

Resolved, that the Academic Senate recommend the Strong Workforce Program (SWP) Strategic Plan 2017–2020.

Moved: Monica Bosson; Seconded: Donna Hayes; MCU

Not present: Verónica Feliu (on leave)

I. Student Development Division Update – Samuel Santos

Samuel Santos gave an update on the Student Development Division. With respect to EASE, he reported that site visits at all centers had just been completed and that the two to three recommendations per center will be compiled and forwarded. He also reported that, for the first time in a year and a half, the division is fully staffed in administrative positions. Last, he indicated that counseling hours will be expanded into evening at the Evans Center, and that hiring a bilingual counselor for Chinatown/North Beach Center is the number one priority in FPAC.

J. Academic Affairs Division Update – Anna Davies

Anna Davies gave an update on the compressed calendar and on schedule development recommendations for Fall, 2017. With respect to the compressed calendar, she indicated that the discussion will continue into spring, and then be forwarded to the Senate and AFT 2121. Council members expressed a need to see what exactly the format options for a compressed calendar could be. With respect to developing the fall semester schedule, she provided an overview of the process and directed faculty to the Office of Instruction Web site for detailed information. She indicated that some higher-enrolled classes had been removed from the schedule to prevent the closure of programs, which must follow processes not decided by her office.

IX. Reports

Career and Technical Education (CTE) Steering Committee Report – Richard Wu

Richard Wu reported that the Strong Workforce Program (SWFP) and Theresa Rowland were collaborating with the committee on funding. SWFP and Perkins will be integrated into one application. The committee is creating a subcommittee on job placement.

X. Adjournment: 5:00 p.m.

APPENDIX A 12.14.2016 First Vice President Teti's Report

Past Meetings/Events include

- 2016.12.08: DCC (wearing my Senate hat)
- 2016.12.08: College holiday party (in my official capacity, of course)
- 2016.12.09: thru 2016.12.11: CMC3 conference
- 2016.12.13: Collegial Consultation

Upcoming Meetings/Events include

- 2016.12.15: Officers meeting
- 2016.12.16: Compressed calendar
- 2016.12.16: AFT holiday party (as above)
- 2016.12.20: Collegial Consultation (tentative)
- 2017.01.12: Officers meeting
- 2017.01.13: Academic Senate plenary session

Committee Update

Producing an exact percentage of faculty participation on committees (i.e., the ratio of the number of appointees to “seats”) is difficult because both numbers are semi-mobile targets. However, I believe that we have a participation rate of well over 90%, which I think is great. My next task is to try to make accurate the Senate’s records of committee appointments from the *other* constituencies. This is difficult because, well, I have no power over the other appointing agents and cannot force them to share this information with me even though it is crucial to ensure accountability of committee actions. Welcome to my world.

Online Apportionment Crisis

Well, the time that I had scheduled for myself to produce a thoughtful, reflective end-of-semester report was hijacked by the online apportionment crisis. I do not at this time have any of the information that faculty want from me. The period examined by the audit, 2011–2014, precedes my leadership position in Ed Tech. Neither the Distance Ed Coordinator nor I knew the audit was happening. It seems that the administration (namely, Susan Lamb while she was VCAA) self-reported the lack of enrollment evidence and invited the audit. Ed Tech currently requires online faculty to record with us their mechanisms for ensuring what the State calls “regular and effective contact” with students. Presumably this practice is sufficient to avoid another unsuccessful audit finding. I hope to have fresher information to report in person at Council.