



# The Academic Senate

CITY COLLEGE OF SAN FRANCISCO  
50 Phelan Avenue, Box E-202, San Francisco, CA 94112 • (415) 239-3611 • Fax (415) 452-5115  
[www.ccsf.edu/academic-senate](http://www.ccsf.edu/academic-senate) • email: [asenate@ccsf.edu](mailto:asenate@ccsf.edu)

Curriculum•Degree Requirements•Grading Policies•Program Development•Student Prep & Success•Governance Accreditation•Professional Development•Program Review Planning & Budgeting Processes• Others as agreed

## CCSF Academic Senate Executive Council Official Minutes

Thursday, 2014 January 09, 8:00-9:00 am  
Ocean Avenue Campus, Wellness Center Rm. 103

**Senate Members Present:** Over 100 faculty attended the plenary session.

I. Call to Order (8:08)

II. Adoption of Agenda

III. Executive Council Roll Call

- Members of the Executive Council were introduced.

IV. Officers' Reports

President Fred Teti reported:

- Thank-you cards are available for those who wish to send a personal thank you to Dennis Herrera or Sara Eisenberg.
- There will be a special Executive Council meeting Wed. January 15th at 2:30 on Enrollment Management.
- Thank you to everyone who has helped drum up enrollment.
- Last semester the Academic Senate recommended that our residence requirement for Associate Degrees be a minimum of 12 units. This recommendation will go to the Bipartite committee.
- On the horizon: some students statewide are expressing a desire to reduce the general education requirements for a college degree. Please help spread the word that general education is a good thing.

First Vice President Karen Saginor reported:

- In addition to opportunities listed on the Standing Committee Vacancy List, we are seeking volunteers to work on the Education Master Plan.
- Do not forget to turn in your flex forms.

Second Vice President Villasana reported:

- Pay attention to the details about the Education Master Plan. There are several other plans also under discussion that might be creating some confusion. Pay attention, respond to surveys, we need to be fully participating. There will be a flex day workshop on this.

Secretary Marrujo-Duck reported:

- Draft notes from the December 6th event have been posted online.

V. SLO Update

Kristina Whalen:

- CCSF has been very engaged in assessment activities and reporting. We now have a good catalog of all the improvements everyone is making in their programs. Check out the summary reports; they are inspiring.

- We received direct feedback from the ACCJC on our SLO assessment work through March 2013. They did determine that we were proficient. We were scored in the middle of the pack, slightly above average of all the colleges in CA. We scored low (a 1 of 5) on our larger college-wide discussions about student learning trends. However, this area has already improved since the ACCJC assessed our progress: last year we did create institutional learning outcomes and began assessment on them.
- The SLO committee of the Academic Senate will be compiling the results of the critical thinking ILO. These reports are important because they support our improvement in college-wide discussions.
- The final report for the Natural Sciences GE assessment is available. The next phase is to get feedback from others at the college.
- Area A and Area E are going to be assessed this semester. If one of your courses maps to this area, assess it this semester and report the results by the deadline.

## VI. Accreditation News

Karen Saginor and Donna Hayes (see Appendix A for full report):

- The Accreditation Committee is meeting every two weeks. We are working on the Substantive Change report in order to prompt a new visit by the ACCJC. There are three areas the college has made substantive changes in: 1. control 2. mode of delivery 3. location. The report will be due February 6th to the ACCJC. To prepare for a next ACCJC visit ALO Momjian is developing a mock visit. Volunteers are needed to serve on the various groups and on the mock visiting team.
  - At the National Advisory Committee on Institutional Quality and Integrity (NACIQI) Hearing the Department of Education (DOE) heard oral comment, including commentary from CCSF students and faculty, and voted to extend ACCJC recognition for only one year. In that time the ACCJC must demonstrate it meets DOE requirements, including demonstrating that its standards, decisions, and policies are accepted by educators.
- On January 2nd Judge Karnow ordered an preventing the from revoking our accreditation until the court determines that the process was fair and lawful.
- Nancy Pelosi visited the Chinatown/North Beach Campus on January 6, in support of CCSF. She pledged that both the ACCJC decision and the inability of the Department of Education to do more will be subjected to harsh scrutiny.
- On January 24th FACC is presenting a policy forum on Accreditation.
- Do not be surprised if we receive March 15th letters this year.
- Results of the audit of ACCJC activity and its costs for California community colleges are expected this Spring.

## VII. AFT 2121 Report

Alisa Messer

- There will be a case conference later this month at which the trial start date will be determined.
- AFT2121 has done some outreach to other colleges and has 4 different visits scheduled around the state.
- Three things you can do to help. 1. Join our Speakers Bureau Training 2. Join our members organizing committee. 3. Please talk to us about our Committee on Political Education (COPE) campaign which now also focuses on organizing, not just campaign contributions.
- The Union finances are strained, we are dipping into the reserves.
- Our January checks will show a restoration of a small part of the pay that we lost. We had a record turnout for the last vote. We have a contract. Negotiations begin again a year from now. Join our members organizing committee. Next year we get a restoration of an additional 0.5% that will show up in April.

- Yesterday the governor issued a new budget with additional monies for higher education. This proposed budget takes much of the Prop 30 money to pay back debt. The cost of living adjustment that he proposes is less than 1% instead of 10%.

#### VIII. Adjournment

- The Senate adjourned at 8:58a.m. Members were encouraged to turn in their Flex reports.

## Appendix A:

### **Accreditation News**

*as reported by Donna Hayes and Karen Saginor to the Academic Senate on January 2014 Flex Day (with links and some bits of additional information added after the January 9 meeting)*

### **NACIQI hearing, December 12-13**

Similarly to accreditation for colleges, the ACCJC must periodically seek recognition from the Department of Education, showing that it follows department regulation and meets requirements. Last December 12-13 in Washington DC, personnel from the Department of Education, along with the National Advisory Committee on Institutional Quality and Integrity (NACIQI), reviewed a preliminary report, heard from ACCJC and the agency and heard [oral commentary](#) from others, including seven students and six faculty from City College. The NACIQI committee voted to extend ACCJC's recognition for only one year, at which point it must come back and show that it has corrected a number of deficiencies. For one of these areas, ACCJC needs to provide convincing evidence that its standards, procedures, and decisions are accepted by educators and educational institutions – ACCJ must improve this during coming year. If you are wondering why the Department of Education did not give ACCJC specific instructions about City College -- under federal law, the DOE is not authorized to get involved in specific cases. NACIQI will post full transcripts of their meeting soon, (not up yet).

### **The Injunction**

On January 2, Judge Karnow of the Superior Court of California ordered an [injunction](#). ACCJC cannot take away our accreditation until the court has determined whether their decision to withdraw accreditation was fair and lawful. The injunction doesn't stop our process with ACCJC, but it means that loss of accreditation cannot happen until ACCJC's treatment of City College is scrutinized in court. When will the court case take place? At the end of January Judge Karnow will meet with the attorneys from both sides to schedule dates for the case to begin. It is expected to continue into the summer or even the early Fall. This injunction blocking the withdrawal of our accreditation until the case finishes is an important protection. If you'd like to send a thank you note or letter to Dennis Herrera and Deputy City Attorney Sara Eisenberg, who argued the case very effectively --

City Attorney Dennis Herrera  
City Hall Room 234  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place  
San Francisco, CA 94102

Deputy City Attorney Sara Eisenberg  
City Hall Room 234  
1 Dr. Carlton B. Goodlett Place  
San Francisco, CA 94102

Many of us went to the hearings on [December 26th](#) and [December 30th](#), and some of us took notes. This injunction was one of six motions decided by Judge Karnow on January 2nd. The City Attorney's Office had also requested that ACCJC be prevented from taking adverse actions against other educational institutions statewide until its evaluation policies comply with federal regulations. Judge Karnow did NOT issue a preliminary injunction about that, but that can be part of the case when the trial starts. Judge Karnow denied AFT2121's request for a preliminary injunction, but, again, only the request for injunction, a full hearing for AFT2121's case is still headed for trial. Then there were three motions brought by ACCJC. One was an anti-SLAPP motion, saying that the AFT suit attacked ACCJC's right to free speech, one was a request that the judge abstain on the grounds that the plaintiffs didn't have a case in state court, and the third was a motion for a stay, or delay in hearing the case. Judge Karnow denied all three of the ACCJC motions. The ACCJC motions are over, they cannot be made again later in this court, although ACCJC could file a request for the First District Court of Appeals to review the judgment "for prejudicial errors of law."

**Nancy Pelosi**

On Monday, January 6, [Nancy Pelosi](#) came out to support City College. She talked about the educational value of City College to students of every age and the whole community. She said, "I sing the praises of Dennis Herrera for succeeding with the case," and she pledged that the accreditors will be "subjected to really harsh scrutiny in terms of how they do what they do, and why is it that the Dept. of Education cannot do more."

### **ACCJC meeting and new standards**

The ACCJC had its January meeting last week, January 8-10th in Sacramento. It is understood that the result of the review requested by City College will NOT overturn the June termination decision, but public announcements of business conducted during the closed sessions will not be released until early February. The "public" portion of the ACCJC on Friday afternoon was comprised of reports, policy changes and a first "reading" of greatly revised standards. Most significant of the policy changes were a removal of the requirement that changes to ACCJC Bylaws be considered in public session and extensive changes to the [Policy on Complaints Against the ACCJC](#) narrowing the scope of complaints to which ACCJC must respond, requiring more information and substantial evidence from the complainant; specifying the form that the complaint must take (including an original signature) and disallowing the right to appeal the disposition of a complaint. For the revised standards, it is unclear how this meeting counts as a public presentation of them as a first reading, since these standards were not provided to members of the public who attended the meeting, nor were they read out loud. There was some discussion of sections of it by members of the commission but no changes were made before it was unanimously approved. Vice President Krista Johns estimated that the text may be provided to college CEOs and ALOs by the end of January.

### **Accreditation work at City College**

In addition to continuing work on the Roadmap, ALO Gohar Momjian is working on a substantive change report, to be filed with the ACCJC on February 6. This report will cover three areas:

- Change in mode of delivery -- the creation of online versions of courses have made it possible for the more than 50% of the coursework for several additional majors to be completed online
- Change in location -- several programs will be temporarily moved from the Southeast campus to Evans while major renovation work takes place at Southeast.
- Change in the control of the institution -- we now have a permanent chancellor.

A benefit to submitting this substantive change report is that one or more of these changes may trigger the scheduling of a new evaluation team visit to City College, during which all of our progress in meeting standards may be assessed anew.

### **Self-Evaluation Report and Mock Visit**

To help the college prepare for a future team visit and to provide training to City College, the Accreditation Committee is [preparing an initial self-evaluation report for the four standards, and will organize a mock accreditation team visit](#). The CCSF volunteers who will serve as the members of the mock visiting team will receive the same training that is given by ACCJC to the members of real visiting teams. The mock visit is planned for March 18-19. Want to help? Write to Fred Teti ([fteti@ccsf.edu](mailto:fteti@ccsf.edu)) by Thursday, January 23rd.

### **Upcoming FREE Policy Forum on Accreditation in California**

["The Escalating Fight Over Accreditation: Lawsuits, Legislation, Audits, and More"](#) sponsored by FACC, the Faculty Association of the California Community Colleges

**January 24th, Friday, 10:30 – 1:00**, including free lunch at DeAnza College.

Speakers include Deputy City Attorney Sara Eisenberg and our own Alisa Messer.

Register by going to FACC.org.

### **March 15th letters?**

All faculty may be given March 15 letters, saying that we have no assurance of employment beyond June 30th. You may be full time and tenured, but it will be just like the part-timers are told every year – no promises for Fall. We do not know for sure whether these letters will be issued, but please do not be surprised if they are. The issuance of March 15 letters is specified in the closure report, but thanks to the injunction, even if the college gives us these

letters, ACCJC cannot take away our accreditation unless the court has finished its work AND decided that the process was fair.

### **State audit of ACCJC**

This spring, the State of California will receive results from the audit of ACCJC activity and its costs for California community colleges that was ordered last August. You may remember that meeting of the Joint Legislative Audit Committee (JLAC) as the occasion on which State Senator Jim Nielson called Dr Barbara Beno “arrogant, condescending and dismissive.” ([2.5 hours into the meeting](#)) Results from that audit will become available this spring.

### **Continuing to meet standards and to move forward**

The faculty of City College has done amazing work already both in meeting the standards and in seeking fair assessment for our college. Please celebrate our progress. We need to continue making progress in all areas, including the meeting of ACCJC standards. All faculty need to continue to assess Student Learning Outcomes, to make sure all course outlines are brought up to date, and to do everything else needed to ensure we meet and maintain all accreditation standards. The injunction has NOT changed the need for our work. The difference it makes is that we now have some real assurance that ACCJC cannot cut off our accreditation without good cause, and the next time it assesses our college, we will get a fair assessment. Judge Karnow and his court, the Department of Education, Nancy Pelosi, Jackie Spier, Anna Eshoo and others have their critical eyes on ACCJC and their dealings with us. There are still many unknowns and a lot of work, but we can have confidence that we will get there.

### **Links**

(in case those embedded in the text above don't work)

NACIQI oral commentary [http://www.ccsf.edu/Organizations/Academic\\_Senate/NACIQI-OralComments.pdf](http://www.ccsf.edu/Organizations/Academic_Senate/NACIQI-OralComments.pdf)

NACIQI website where official report of the meeting and transcripts will be posted:

<http://www2.ed.gov/about/bdscomm/list/naciqi.html#meetings>

Injunction ordered by Judge Karnow: <http://sfcityattorney.org/Modules>ShowDocument.aspx?documentID=1592>

Notes on Court hearings, December 26:

[http://www.ccsf.edu/Organizations/Academic\\_Senate/December26CourtInformalNotes.pdf](http://www.ccsf.edu/Organizations/Academic_Senate/December26CourtInformalNotes.pdf)

and December 30: [http://www.ccsf.edu/Organizations/Academic\\_Senate/December30CourtInformalNotes.pdf](http://www.ccsf.edu/Organizations/Academic_Senate/December30CourtInformalNotes.pdf)

Nancy Pelosi video: [https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=lex\\_di3j0oo](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=lex_di3j0oo)

Policy on Complaints Against the ACCJC:

[http://www.ccsf.edu/Organizations/Academic\\_Senate/ACCJCComplaintPolicy.pdf](http://www.ccsf.edu/Organizations/Academic_Senate/ACCJCComplaintPolicy.pdf)

Accreditation Steering Committee 2014 Self Evaluation report and mock visit:

<http://www.ccsf.edu/PGC/2014/January/Accreditation%20Steering%20Committee%20Self%20Evaluation%20and%20Timeline.pdf>

Free FACC Forum: “The Escalating Fight Over Accreditation: Lawsuits, Legislation, Audits, and More”:

[http://facc.org/Policy\\_Forum\\_2014.html](http://facc.org/Policy_Forum_2014.html)

Joint Legislative Audit Committee (JLAC) August 21, 2013 – 2.5 hours into the meeting:

[http://calchannel.granicus.com/MediaPlayer.php?view\\_id=7&clip\\_id=1577](http://calchannel.granicus.com/MediaPlayer.php?view_id=7&clip_id=1577)