

Official Minutes
CCSF Academic Senate Executive Council
Wednesday, July 10th, 2013, 2:30 – 5:00 pm
Ocean Avenue Campus, Visual Arts A114

Council Members Present: Anna Asebedo, Monica Bosson, Steven Brown, Venette Cook, Matthew Duckworth, Beth Ericson, Donna Hayes, Vivian Ikeda, Lancelot Kao, Wendy Kaufmyn, Kimberly Keenan, Suzanne Lo, Lillian Marrujo-Duck, Carole Meagher, Kitty Moriwaki, Madeline Mueller, Francine Podenski, Suzanne Pugh, Carol Reitan, Lisa Romano, Karen Saginor, Lou Schubert, Fred Teti, Rosario Villasana, Laura Walsh, Debra Wilensky.

Council Members Absent: Dayo Diggs, Ellen Wall.

Other Senate Members Present: Patricia Arack, Erwin Barron, Loren Bell, Xochi Candelaria, Curtis Chee, Ophelia Clark, Guy De Primo, Cynthia Dewar, Kim Ginther-Webster, Jeff Goldthorpe, Edward S. Hanson, Andrew King, Dana Jae Labrecque, Gary Ling, Caroline Minkowski, Enrique Mireles, James Sauv , Max Sklar, Trinh Tran, Michelle Troen, John Verosky, Laura Walsh, Karl Westerberg, Kristina Whalen

Guests: Nathan Atkinson, Katie Gelardi, Joanne Low, Faye Naples.

I. Call to Order

The Academic Senate Executive Council came to order at 2:39pm.

II. Adoption of Agenda

Council adopted the agenda.

III. Public Comment

- Speakers commended Bill Shields for his Chronicle editorial, alumnus Joe Fitzgerald for his Bay Guardian article “Who Killed City College”, and all CCSF alums who were among the first responders at the Asiana Air crash.
- President Teti responded to a question about enforcement of the Title 5 75% rule.
- The Save CCSF Coalition will hold a community support meeting on 7/18.

IV. Officers’ Reports

President Fred Teti distributed a written report. He highlighted some items.

- The District will conduct abbreviated searches for three interim deans. The Marketing Director position is now open. The Vice Chancellor of Academic Affairs and the Student Health Director are re-opened. Human Resources has called for volunteers for the search committees.
- Teti’s primary goal for this meeting is to receive input on how to represent the faculty at this challenging time.

1st VP Karen Saginor reported that:

- She continues to serve on the Chancellor search committee and will let everyone know about plans for the continuation of this process.
- She attended the Board of Governors July meeting. There were general questions at that meeting about the effectiveness of bringing in a special trustee. State Chancellor Harris pledged support for CCSF.
- State Chancellor Harris will be in daily contact with special trustee and is open to communicating with the senate officers.

- She offered some advice: 1. Continue to meet accreditation standards do not scale back on SLO assessment work. 2. Please continue to look at the motto of our school –seek the truth and the truth shall set you free 3. Please take care of students. 4. Please take care of yourselves.
- Presented a Summary of Findings from ACCJC in July 2013. See Appendix.
- Included is a summary of the 14 recommendations. The summary notes whether we were found to have met them or not. See attached.

2nd VP Rosario Villasana reported that:

- She attended the faculty leadership conference in Sacramento. The conference was very instructive, with workshops on empowering local senates and on the nuts and bolts of constructive meetings. There were reps from everywhere, many expressing support for CCSF.

Secretary Lillian Marrujo-Duck reported that:

- She also attended the faculty leadership conference and heard lots of support for CCSF. The State Senate has a website with white papers on position and guidance on academic issues.

V. **Special Orders of Business:**

A. **Administrator Hiring Update**

1. Teti reviewed which positions were open and re-opened.
2. Vice Chancellors Joanne Low and Fabienne Naples introduced themselves and provided updates on the incoming administrators as well as the continued hiring process. Faculty asked if notices could be made as new hires arrived.
3. Council discussed the content of a memo to the Special Trustee detailing leadership qualities the Senate wishes to see in the next chancellor.

Resolution 2013.07.10.01 Letter to Special Trustee Robert Agrella

Resolved, that the officers send to Special Trustee Robert Agrella a memo concerning desirable qualities for the next chancellor.

Moved: Meagher; Seconded: Steven Brown; MSC
 Laura Walsh and Wendy Kaufmyn abstained.

The memo's content and tone will be informed by the draft reviewed at today's meeting and the ensuing commentary.

B. **Accreditation Update**

- The officers intend to draft a letter to the special trustee and the state chancellor asking for clarity on the steps necessary for CCSF to retain accreditation.
- Some ideas were discussed to help build consensus among faculty on best approaches and also to build communication between faculty and administration. Ideas include: Flex day forums; open forums with administrators, Board of Trustees, and Chancellor; regular communication between administration and the Executive Council officers.
- Counselors expressed concern about how they should address students' long term planning.

Resolution 2013.07.10.03 Explore Request to State Chancellor and Special Trustee

Resolved, that Fred Teti explore asking Brice Harris and Robert Agrella their intent for the mission of CCSF, in particular seeking direct communication from them about the size of the college and which students we will be serving in the future.

Moved Saginor; Seconded Villasano; MSC

Resolution 2013.07.10.04 Extend a Welcome to Robert Agrella

Whereas State Chancellor Brice Harris has appointed Robert Agrella to the position of Special Trustee with extraordinary powers,

Be it resolved that the CCSF Academic Senate, as the voice of the faculty on academic and professional matters, extend a welcome to Trustee Agrella in his new capacity and inform him that we look forward to working with him to ensure the continue accreditation of the college.

Moved Lou Schubert; 2nd Steven Brown; MSC

VI. Open Forum (4:30)

- Resolution writers will mark draft documents as drafts.
- There was a request for a one-page visual that clearly differentiates the role of EC and AFT.
- It was suggested that we find out how other agencies define their appeal process for comparison purposes to the ACCJC.
- Karen Saginor will continue to represent the EC to the press until summer classes end.
- State Academic Senate President Beth Smith will visit the College soon.
- Concern was expressed that data regarding the success rates of our students is being ignored.
- Concern was expressed that the requirement targets for retaining accreditation seem to be internally inconsistent.
- It was suggested that Dr. Robert Agrella's position and power have changed sufficiently to make his actions this year more effective than last year: let's work with him.
- It was suggested that we build on Karen Saginor's chart highlighting the different assessment outcomes in the various reports regarding CCSF performance.
- The faculty thanked Katie Gelardi for representing students.

VII. Adjournment (5:00)

Appendix A: President's Report

Appendix B: First Vice-President's Report

Appendix C: Summary of Findings from ACCJC in July 2013

Appendix A: President's Report

President's Report

2013-07-27

The Theme from "A Summer Place"

1. **Past Meetings/Events** include
 - 2013-05-16: Meeting with the Interim Chancellor about the PRSD policy
 - 2013-05-16: Participatory Governance Council (see notes below)
 - 2013-05-20: Officers Meeting with the Interim Chancellor
 - 2013-05-22: Meeting with Curriculum Chair and Dean of Instruction
 - 2013-05-23: Board meeting
 - 2013-06-07: ACCJC open session in Burlingame
 - 2013-06-27: Board meeting
 - 2013-07-09: Senate Officers Meeting
2. **Upcoming meetings/Events**
 - 2013-08-13: CCSF Senate Plenary + all regular Council meetings
3. **Draft Job Announcements reviewed or Approved** (some with minor changes)¹
 - Director of Communications and Marketing: sent recommendations for changes to HR 5/21 and again on 6/26
4. (5/23 Board meeting) The Board accepted the Senate's Program Revitalization, Suspension, or Discontinuance policy unanimously (but only after Trustee Ngo was assured that the Board was involved in the final decision). They accepted our suggested edits to the EEO Plan with only Trustee Ngo voting no because he harbored suspicion that the new EEO plan might supplant the "Blueprint".
5. (6/27 Board meeting) The draft budget was approved. The special trustee's contract was renewed. The chancellor search is moving forward complete with faculty participation (over Trustee Ngo's objections). Many, but not all, administrator positions were filled. See below for some of the ones that weren't.
6. The District will conduct abbreviated searched for three interim dean positions (in short: Business, ESL, and Counseling). In addition, three positions will be re-opened: Vice Chancellor of Academic Affairs, Student Health Director, and Marketing Director. Meanwhile, Dean Bell still functions as Dean of Mission (as well as his official Dean of Financial Aid role). I think Terry Hall still functions as Dean of John Adams (as well as his official Dean of formerly-Allied Health role).

Participatory Governance Council notes, 2013-05-16

- I brought up the Senate's (initially, Kitty's) recommendation that the District EEO plan consistently reference the 16 locally-protected categories and not just the state-and-federal 3 (gender, ethnicity, disability). I followed up on that with an email to Clara and Lani.
- A PGC workgroup chaired by Kathleen White is still drafting "procedures" for the PGC. I wrote to suggest that we adopt Robert's Rules and be done with it. I mean, I know we City Collegians love re-inventing wheels but *really!*

¹ A = noncredit ("adult") faculty, B = both credit and noncredit faculty, C = credit faculty, D = administrators

Appendix B: Report of First Vice President

Link:

http://www.ccsf.edu/NEW/content/dam/ccsf/images/academic_senate/AS_Docs/ListOfMeetings_2013_14/VP1Attachment.pdf

Appendix C: Summary of Findings from ACCJC in July 2013

Summary of Findings from ACCJC in July, 2013, (with comparison to 2012 Sanctions/Findings)

prepared ksaginor, July 10, 2013

VTR = Visiting Team Report prepared by Sandra Serrano.

Fourteen recommendations were written specifically for City College in 2012. Here's what the VTR and Decision letter say about CCSF's success in addressing them.

1. Mission Statement Partially addressed. VTR anticipates this being fully addressed by end of Summer, 2013
2. Effective Planning Process. Partially addressed.
3. Assessing Institutional Effectiveness. VTR: Addressed. Decision Letter: "addressed and nearly resolved."
4. Student Learning Outcomes (for Instruction). VTR: Addressed. Decision Letter: Not included with addressed recommendations.
5. Student Support Services. Partially addressed.
6. Human Resources Components of Evaluation. VTR: Addressed. Decision Letter: Fully addressed.
7. Human Resources. Partially addressed.
8. Physical Resources. Partially addressed.
9. Technology Resources. VTR: Addressed. Decision Letter: Fully addressed.
10. Financial Planning and Stability. Partially addressed.
11. Financial Integrity and Reporting. Partially addressed.
12. Leadership, Governance and Decision-making. Recommendation is to provide training. Partially addressed.
13. Governance Structures. Partially addressed.
14. Effective Board Organization. Partially addressed.

This information is from pp. 66-77 of the VTR (Visiting Team Report) and from top of p. 3 of Beno's Decision letter for the Commission.

Eligibility Requirements. These are required of every college. In 2012, four of them were not confirmed for CCSF. The same four are not confirmed now.

- ER. 5. Administrative Capacity.
- ER. 17. Financial Resources.
- ER. 18. Financial Accountability.
- ER. 21. Relations with the Accrediting Commission.

This information is from pp. 63-66 of the VTR (Visiting Team Report) and from p. 2 (middle of last paragraph) of Beno's Decision letter for the Commission.

Accreditation Standards. These are required of every college. There are four main standards each with two -- four sections that are then further broken down into many pieces. The 2013 Visiting Team's Report goes through numerous pieces of standards, saying that CCSF meets or does not meet each Standard [piece]. There is more detail given about the Standards this year than was provided in the Visiting Team Report of 2012. Beno's Decision letter for the Commission lists thirty standards [pieces] that CCSF "does not yet meet." The final Visiting Team Report says we meet ten of those thirty. Grey shading marks those ten on the chart on the next page.

This information and the information in the chart is from pp. 9-62 of the VTR (Visiting Team Report) and from p. 2 (bottom of page) of Beno's Decision letter for the Commission.

Sources

Visiting Team Report (VTR) prepared by Sandra Serrano based on findings of the April 2013 team of ACCJC trained volunteers http://www.ccsf.edu/ACC/CCSF%20Show%20Cause%20Visit%20Team%20Report_05_20_2013.pdf

Decision letter written by Barbara Beno for the Commission: http://www.ccsf.edu/ACC/Decision_07_03_2013.pdf

Accreditation Standards. <http://tinyurl.com/pdfAccredStandards>

Eligibility Requirements and Standards. <http://tinyurl.com/ohjuv9e>

2012 Visiting Team Report prepared by Sandra Serrano based on findings of the March 2012 team (not identical membership – this was the team that included Beno's husband)

<http://www.ccsf.edu/ACC/Accreditation%20Evaluation%20Report%202012.pdf>

Standard Section	2012 Report	Visiting Team Report published July '13			Decision 7/3/13
	2012 Sanctions	VTR says MET in 2012	VTR says MET NOW	VTR says NOT MET NOW	Decision Letter says NOT MET NOW
I.A.1		M	M		

I.A.2		M	M		
I.A.3	X		M		X
I.A.4		M	M		
I.B.1	X		M		X
I.B.2	X		M		X
I.B.3		M		X	X
I.B.4	X			X	X
I.B.5		M	M		
I.B.6	X		M		
I.B.7		M	M		
II.A.1	X			X	X
II.A.2	X			X	X
II.A.3	X		M		
II.A.4		M	M		
II.A.5		M	M		
II.A.6	X		M		X
II.A.6.a	X				
II.A.7		M	M		
II.B.1	X			X	X
II.B.2		M	M		
II.B.3	X				X
II.B.3.d				X	
II.B.4	X		M		X
II.C.1	M			X	X
II.C.2	M			X	X
III.A.1		M	M		
III.A.1.c	X		M		
III.A.1.d		M	M		
III.A.2	X			X	X
III.A.3.a		M	M		
III.A.3.b		M	M		
III.A.4		M	M		
III.A.4.c		M	M		
III.A.5		M	M		
III.A.6	X			X	X
III.B.1	X	M	M		X
III.B.2	X			X	X
III.C.1	X		M		X
III.C.2	X		M		X
III.D.1			M		X
III.D.1.a-c	X			X	
III.D.1.d	X		M		
III.D.2	X			X	X
III.D.2.a-c	X			X	
III.D.2.d		M	M		
III.D.3	X			X	X
III.D.3.a,c,f,h				X	
III.D.3.b,d-e,g		M	M		
III.D.4				X	X
IV.A.1	X		M		X
IV.A.2	X			X	X
IV.A.3	X			X	X
IV.A.4				X	X
IV.A.5	X			X	X
IV.B.1	X			X	X
IV.B.2				X	X