

Official Minutes
CCSF ACADEMIC SENATE EXECUTIVE COUNCIL
Wednesday, April 15, 2009
Ocean Campus, Rosenberg R518

Council Members Present: Mary Bravewoman, Steven Brown, Beth Cataldo, Ophelia Clark, Michael Estrada, Nora Goodfriend-Koven, Lynda Hirose, Hal Huntsman, Tore Eldor Langmo, Renato Larin, Suzanne Lo, Madeline Mueller, Elliott Osborne, Marie Osborne, Luz Maria Pena, Francine Podenski, Indiana Quadra, Lisa Romano, Maria Rosales-Uribe, Karen Saginor, Leticia Silva, Jane Sneed, Fred Teti, Edgar Torres, Trinh T. Tran, Ellen Wall, David Yee

Council Members Absent: Denise Quinn

Other Senate Members Present: Monica Bosson, Sue Homer, Susan Lopez, Alisa Messer

Guests: Nicole Ammon, Rick Cantora, Odet Garnica, Gessika Krieger, Chrissy Leuma, Joshua Neilsen, Choco Vilbar

I. Call to Order

The Academic Senate Executive Council came to order at 2:36 pm.

II. Adoption of Agenda

Council adopted the agenda.

III. Approval of Minutes: March 25, 2009

Council approved the Executive Council minutes of March 25.

Council approved the Bipartite minutes of March 25.

IV. Officers' Reports

President Huntsman reported that:

- The Green Industry Advisory Task Force will meet again on Monday, April 27.
- The Chancellor is watching enrollment figures carefully. The numbers may be high enough to use 2008-09 to claim growth money from the State. On Tuesday, April 14, the State Dept of Finance put out a statement on the status of the budget showing that the state has taken in \$737 million less in revenues than projected for this point of the budget year. This makes it likely that the Community Colleges will see an unfavorable May budget revise. It could also create problems for next year's budget.
- The Brown Act specifies that debate on issues by public officials should happen in public. A majority (15) of Executive Council members may not get together to make a decision. Also forbidden are serial meetings: 15 members phoning each other to discuss an issue. During meetings, members should not pass notes or text about how they will vote. Because of the Brown Act, the Council listserv cannot be used to discuss issues, only to arrange meeting times, etc.
- The College Advisory Council approved a change to the membership of the Program Review Committee to add one member from DCC and one Classified member. This change must go back to their parent council, Planning and Budgeting. With this change the composition of the committee will become one DCC representative, four other faculty, three administrators, three classified members, and two students.
- A group appointed by the Chancellor is continuing work towards applying for Federal stimulus dollars. Anyone who has ideas for this should contact her/his department chair to forward ideas to the group.
- Academic Senate Executive Council responses for the Board of Trustees Self Evaluation have been averaged and the comments compiled. These will be forwarded to the Board on Friday, April 17.
- The State Academic Senate Plenary starts tomorrow. Three of the officers will attend. A new discipline in Biotechnology is being proposed by Fabio Saniee. Also on the agenda are issues about prerequisites. City College will argue for local control of prerequisites rather than state control.
- On the issue of the trademarked CCSF logo, V.C. Mark Robinson had stated that College departments could use the logo without charge, but he has not provided anything in writing. This issue will be agendized for our next meeting.

- Vice Chancellor Murillo has raised questions about the coordinators reporting to the Basic Skills Ad Hoc Coordinating Committee. To allow the job announcement to go out right away so the person can be in place for Fall semester, the language in the posting will say “reporting structure to be determined.” This item will be placed on the next agenda.
- Executive Council group photograph has been postponed. When the photographer has been rescheduled, the date will be announced.
- Ballots have gone out for the Executive Council Elections. Departmental affiliations were inadvertently omitted from the candidate statement page. An updated version will be posted to the Senate website very soon.
- Student elections are also being held April 28-29. Encourage your students to vote.

1st Vice President Torres spoke about the importance of hearing students and of working collaboratively

2nd Vice President Yee showed pictures of the March in March. The Information Policies Committee reports that the district has purchased software that enables the restoration of email messages after deletion from the trash bin and software that will archive email for a longer time period. Implementation awaits a legal opinion from District Counsel Ron Lee.

Secretary Saginor reported that she will be making an audio recording of this meeting.

V. Committee Appointments

Resolution 2009.04.15.01 Shared Governance Committee Appointments.

Resolved, that the Academic Senate Executive Council approve the appointments to shared governance committees, as recommended by the Committee on Committees.

Moved: Podenski; seconded: Bravewoman; motion carried unanimously. Appendix A.

VI. Unfinished Business

A. Student Equity Resolution.

Karen Saginor moved to divide the question and consider the Student Equity Resolution in parts. The motion passed and the resolution was divided into five parts. Each part was discussed, amended and approved. [Secretary’s note – for better comprehension, the resolution has been re-assembled for Appendix B.]

Resolution 2009.04.15.02.a Student Equity Resolution, First Part.

Resolved, that the Academic Senate Executive Council approve as amended the part of the Student Equity resolution containing the Whereas and the first Resolved clause.

Moved: Hirose; seconded: Bravewoman; motion carried. Appendix B.

Resolution 2009.04.15.02.b Student Equity Resolution, Second Part.

Resolved, that the Academic Senate Executive Council approve as amended the part of the Student Equity resolution containing the second Resolved clause and Section I. a-c.

Moved: Hirose; seconded: Bravewoman; motion carried. Appendix B.

Resolution 2009.04.15.02.c Student Equity Resolution, Third Part.

Resolved, that the Academic Senate Executive Council approve as amended the part of the Student Equity resolution containing Section II.

Moved: Hirose; seconded: Bravewoman; motion carried. Appendix B.

Resolution 2009.04.15.02.d Student Equity Resolution, Fourth Part.

Resolved, that the Academic Senate Executive Council approve as amended the part of the Student Equity resolution Section III. a-c.

Moved: Hirose; seconded: Bravewoman: motion carried. Appendix B.

Resolution 2009.04.15.02.e Student Equity Resolution, Fifth Part.

Resolved, that the Academic Senate Executive Council approve as amended the part of the Student Equity resolution containing the Purpose and Summary.

Moved: Hirose; seconded: Bravewoman: motion carried. Appendix B.

B. Discussion: Academic Calendar.
This issue was not discussed.

VII. New Business

A. First Reading: Changes to Proposed Naming Policy.
This issue was not discussed.

B. First Reading: Proposed Changes to the Grades and Files Subcommittee.
This issue was not discussed.

C. CTEA Allocations – Fred Teti.
This issue was not discussed.

D. Basic Skills Initiative – Center for Teaching and Learning Coordinator.
This issue was not discussed.

E. Graduation Ceremony – Rod Santos.
This issue was not discussed.

F. Administrative Evaluations – David Yee.
This issue was not discussed.

VIII. Open Forum

There was no open forum.

IX. Adjournment

Council adjourned at 5:40 pm.

Respectfully submitted,
Karen Saginor, Academic Senate Secretary

APPENDIX A
Committee Appointments

**Appointments to Committees for Committee/Subcommittee
Academic Senate Meeting
4/15/09
(Approved by the Executive Council)**

Appointments to Committees with Limited Membership

Parking-Transportation
Janet Zanetto

ESL

Student Equity

Frederick Teti

Mathematics

Appointments to Committees with Unlimited Membership

Scholarship

Carolina Avila

Counseling Services

APPENDIX B

Student Racial and Ethnic Equity Resolution

Purpose and Summary

The purpose of this resolution is to establish policy at the City College of San Francisco (CCSF) to help eliminate racial/ethnic achievement gaps throughout the college through the following means:

- Assessing the existence and extent of achievement gaps; and,
- Directing the Chancellor to create and publish a yearly comprehensive report on student opportunity and success and the college's progress on the issue; and,
- Directing the Chancellor to disaggregate student data so that inequities can be more easily identified; and,
- Directing the Chancellor, in consultation with the College Diversity Committee, the Student Preparation and Success Committee, and Academic Senate to establish concrete and specific goals for eliminating the achievement gap at CCSF; and,
- Directing the Chancellor to work within Shared Governance to propose strategies and plans for reducing all existing inequities; and,
- Directing the Chancellor to propose a comprehensive educational equity training program; and,
- Asking the college to include Shared Governance and other appropriate means to assess all new significant policies for their potential impact on student equity; and,
- Asking the college community, through Shared Governance and other means, to meet publicly to discuss achievement gaps and propose remedies.

Whereas, public education is the foundation for societal participation and personal enrichment and should be a right, not a privilege, and

Whereas, CCSF has significant impact on the education of the San Francisco community and serves 23-30%, a quarter to almost a third, of students graduating from San Francisco high schools (Source: CCSF "High School Report" V – X, Office of Research, Planning and Grants); and

Whereas, we recognize that all students, regardless of race, color, religion, gender, sexual orientation, national origin, language, marital status, age, physical or mental disability, veteran status or socio-economic status deserve to succeed and reach their educational and personal goals and to be supported in that journey; and

Whereas, CCSF has consistently worked to improve the academic success of all students as demonstrated in various plans, programs, grants and policies, including the Master Plan, The Strategic Plan, the Basic Skills Initiative, Title 3, and Early alert and seeks to further improve student equity; and

Whereas, CCSF has many dedicated and talented faculty, along with numerous programs and services—including, but not limited to, the African American Scholastic Program, the Asian Pacific American Student Success Center, Disabled Students Programs and Services, Extended Opportunity Programs and Services, and the Latino Services Network—which serve our students effectively, yet achievement gaps continue across the college based on race, ethnicity, and other demographic categories; and

Whereas, CCSF has a non-discrimination policy which stipulates that we provide educational and employment opportunities to all "regardless of race, color, religion, sex, sexual orientation, national origin, marital status, age, physical or mental disability," yet we may still have a racial/ethnic achievement gap; and

Whereas, this resolution is focused on the success of students of color and it is not meant to exclude or in any way deemphasize the success of students in other demographics; and

Whereas, racial/ethnic achievement gaps are recognized as a problem nationally and have been highlighted at the state level by Jack Scott, State Community College Chancellor and California Education Superintendent Jack O'Connell; and

Whereas, institutional racism and educational inequity may often be replicated unintentionally during planning and developing new policy; and new policy that may appear innocuous may have educational equity implications unless it is being consciously and proactively counteracted; and

Whereas, to the extent allowable by law, racial/ethnic, socioeconomic, language-proficiency and ability justice in education should be measured, not by good intentions, but rather, by equitable opportunities and outcomes; and there exists a lack of information and data collection related to indicators of racial/ethnic, socioeconomic, language-proficiency and ability equity and justice; and

Whereas, most students of color transfer to four-year institutions at lower rates than their white counterparts and than the overall transfer average; and

Whereas, students of color are disproportionately represented among students placing into basic skills courses; and

Whereas, although CCSF collects data on 23 different possible ethnicities (as reported by the student on their application for admission), reports on student success and retention are usually disaggregated only into eight categories: African American/Non-Hispanic, American Indian/Alaskan Native, Asian/Pacific Islander, Filipino, Hispanic/Latino, Other Non-White, White Non-Hispanic, Unknown/No Response; in particular, Pacific Islanders, and Southeast Asians are aggregated with all other Asian groups;

Therefore be it resolved, that the San Francisco Community College Board acknowledges racial/ethnic, socioeconomic, language-proficiency, and ability/disability inequities in our society and that our institution of learning is committed, *to the extent that applicable law allows*, to consciously and actively address racial/ethnic, immigration status, socioeconomic, language-proficiency, and ability inequalities and ensure equal opportunity and equal treatment for all students; and

Be it further resolved, that the San Francisco Community College Board embraces the following activities to advance educational equity within our District.

I. Data Collection, Reporting, and Goal Setting

- a. **Public Disclosure on the Educational Equity Report:** The Chancellor, in collaboration with the Office of Research, Planning and Grants, shall make public, in an ongoing and easily accessible manner, all significant data and information regarding educational equity, and shall annually prepare and publicly release an educational equity report. This report shall detail disaggregated statistics on key academic opportunity and outcome indicators (including those developed in part I-c, below), a report of progress since the previous year to reduce educational inequities, and an analysis of shortcomings. This report shall be published no later than October 15, 2009, and annually thereafter. All reports shall be completed to the extent possible without violating student privacy or other applicable confidentiality laws.
- b. **Disaggregation of Racial, Ethnic, Socioeconomic, Language-Proficiency, and Physical Ability Data:** The Board, Chancellor, other administrators, faculty and classified staff are committed to continuing to collect all significant student and employee data that is disaggregated by race, ethnicity, gender, age, immigrant status, socioeconomic status, language, and ability—data that we currently do collect—in a manner consistent with the District's *Student Equity Plan*. This data is necessary for policymaking, program planning, and evaluation work to eliminate racial/ethnic, immigration status, socioeconomic, language-proficiency, and ability disparities.

To help ensure that Board policymaking, program planning, and evaluation work to eliminate these disparities, the Board requests that the District provide uniform comprehensive reports illustrating the demographics of the academic success of our students (including testing, probation, success and transfer), as well as the demographics of all District employees. In particular, all reports should be disaggregated by at least the following categories: African-American, Asian, Caucasian, Filipino, Latino/a, Native American, Pacific Islander, and Southeast Asian. At least annually, reports should be generated disaggregating the Pacific Islander category into Guamanian, Hawaiian, and Samoan, and the Southeast Asian category into Cambodian, Laotian, and Vietnamese. The Board also requests the District add the categories of Fijian, Tongan, Thai, Malay and Burmese to the CCSF Student Admissions application as options for race and ethnicity.

These categories should be revisited on a regular basis in an attempt to reveal differential impacts for particular populations. The intent of disaggregating the data is to find differential impacts; therefore, other ways of disaggregating the data—such as, by race, ethnicity, religion, sex, sexual orientation, national origin, language, marital status, age, physical or mental disability—may be appropriate as potential differential impacts are identified. All disaggregating shall be done to the extent possible without violating student privacy or other applicable confidentiality laws.

- c. **Accountability Measures and Goals:** The Board directs the Chancellor, in consultation with the College Diversity Committee, the Student Preparation and Success Committee, Academic Senate and the Office of Research, Planning

and Grants, and other appropriate stakeholders, to set concrete, specific, and multiple measurement indicators to assess the success of the policies in this resolution; similarly, the Chancellor, the College Diversity Committee, the Student Preparation and Success Committee and other stakeholders shall establish concrete and specific goals for those indicators, with appropriate timelines for meeting those goals.

II. Institutional Educational Equity Impact Assessment

All new significant policies shall be analyzed to assess educational equity implications and to identify barriers to student success. This analysis should occur within the administration, Shared Governance, schools, departments, programs, and other parts of the college, as appropriate. The analysis shall include a projection and analysis of impacts disaggregated by ethnicity, immigration status, socioeconomic status, language-proficiency, and ability before a policy is enacted and implemented in order to ensure that it advances equity and will not result in any unintended consequences.

III. Remedies and Process

- a. Public Participation and Shared Governance Input:** The Board, Chancellor, and all employees shall, through Shared Governance and other means as necessary, meet regularly with students and other community members, to assess educational inequities, solicit public input, and propose recommended remedies.
- b. Educational Equity Training:** A comprehensive training program promoting educational equity will be developed. Key components will include diversity and social justice, systemic inequities, prejudice reduction, and cultural sensitivity and competence, at a minimum. This resolution directs the Chancellor to provide a proposal(s) for this program(s) by September 2009.
- c. Process for Proposed Remedies:** Proposals for addressing educational inequity can and hopefully will come from every part of the college. In particular, the Board directs the Chancellor, in conjunction with the Diversity Committee, Student Preparation and Success Committee, and Academic Senate to propose strategies and concrete plans for reducing all existing inequalities. As appropriate, such proposals shall be submitted for full Shared Governance review and input prior to implementation.