



# The Academic Senate

CITY COLLEGE OF SAN FRANCISCO

50 Phelan Avenue, Box E-202, San Francisco, CA 94112 • (415) 239-3611 • Fax (415) 452-5115

[www.ccsf.edu/academic-senate](http://www.ccsf.edu/academic-senate) • email: [asenate@ccsf.edu](mailto:asenate@ccsf.edu)

Curriculum • Degree Requirements • Grading Policies • Program Development • Student Prep & Success • Governance  
Accreditation • Professional Development • Program Review • Planning & Budgeting Processes • Others as agreed

## CCSF Academic Senate Executive Council Agenda FINAL MINUTES Wednesday, February 14, 2018, 2:30-5:00p.m. Ocean Campus, MUB 140

**2017-18 Council Members Present:** Loren Bell, Monica Bosson, Neela Chatterjee, Kimiyoshi Inomata, Thomas Kennedy, Mandy Liang, Alexis Litzky, Danyelle Marshall, Antonio Martinez, Shiela McFarland, Carole Meagher, Madeline Mueller, Marie Osborne, Joseph Reyes, Marc Santamaria, Louis Schubert, Mike Solow, Coni Staff, Fred Teti, Rosario Villasana

**2017-18 Council Members Absent:** Jacques Arceneaux, Verónica Feliu, Pablo Rodriguez

**Other Senate Members Present:** Alicia Fausto, Kim Ginther-Webster, Kathleen Marquez, Lisa Romano

**Guests:** Cynthia Dewar, Monique Pasquale, Theresa Rowland, Lucy Runkel

### **I. Call to Order, 2:32**

### **II. Adoption of Agenda**

One item was removed from the Consent Agenda: Item D, Appointment of Student Services SLO Coordinators.

The revised agenda was adopted.

### **III. Officers' Reports**

#### **President Liang briefly reported that:**

- There are a lot of updates in the recent Senate newsletter for review.
- If you are a chair of a committee you should have received an email from AVC Kristin Charles and President Liang about Accreditation and reviewing the RRP Handbook.
- There is a budget analysis handout from the Legislative Analyst Office to review. There is some discussion at the state level for the proposed consolidation of student services programs. There will be a SWOT analysis about the consolidation soon.
- There is a planning group working to celebrate the Chinese Lunar New Year and Festival at the Chinatown Center. The Chancellor and Trustees will hold a reception at the Chinatown Center. Anyone is welcome to join and attend this event.

#### **First Vice-President Teti provided a written report (Appendix A) and briefly reported that:**

- There have been concerns about the Plus-1's, which VP Teti has communicated to Chief of Staff Cynthia Dewar.

**Second Vice-President Staff reported that:**

- She has appreciation for the people and unpaid labor happening on the Guided Pathways Task Force for their work on the Plan we will discuss later in the meeting.

**Secretary Litzky reported that:**

- No report at this time.

**IV. Public Comment**

- Lisa Romano, Chair of NSCD, brought to the attention of the Council there are extended hours in Student Services. She also invited the Council to the Asian Coalition Scholarship dinner.
- A comment was made about the ongoing issue with the housing development in the Balboa Reservoir.
- A Council member noted that there are a number of ICE raids happening in the Bay Area. There was a recent raid at 7-11 stores looking for undocumented workers and at an immigration office where someone was arrested. We and our students have rights, and there is more information from community organizations that can help.
- An announcement was made about a new lecture series in the Astronomy department.
- The Faculty Association and Friends are in the process of planning some kind of happy hour get-together at Ocean Ale House. Details to come soon.
- There was a call for more information and how to analyze different departments for growth potential and planning in the context of the Enrollment Management Committee. Interested programs should contact Carole Meagher.
- There was a comment that there has been a large body of water behind MUB for about 2 months.

**V. Consent Agenda**

**Resolution 2018.02.14.01A Approval of Minutes: January 31, 2018**

Resolved, that the Executive Council approve the minutes for January 21, 2018.

**Adopted by consent**

**Resolution 2018.02.14.01B Suspend the Foreign Languages Programs in Jeopardy Workgroup**

Whereas, the Foreign Languages Department forwarded a resolution to the Academic Senate requesting it demand the formation of Program Revitalization, Suspension, and Discontinuance (PRSD) committee(s) in Fall, 2016, during a period of steep decline in enrollments in several language programs; and

Whereas the Academic Senate worked with the Chancellor to form a Foreign Languages Programs in Jeopardy Workgroup to further discuss issues related to the programs revitalization and enrollment; and

Whereas, improvements in enrollment are already evident across the department after the reaffirmation of CCSF's accreditation and the implementation of Free City College; and

Whereas, the Path to 32,000 FTES announced by the chancellor is creating the opportunity for individual languages across the department to propose adding courses to solidify programs; and

Whereas, the department members and their chair discussed the desirability of continuing the group's work at its November, 2017 meeting and expressed a unanimous consensus among those present that it would be advisable to suspend the group unless the enrollment situation worsened; be it therefore;

Resolved, that the Academic Senate recommend that the Foreign Languages Programs in Jeopardy Workgroup be suspended, unless the Department of World Languages and Cultures request its reconstitution at a future date.

**Adopted by consent**

**Resolution 2018.02.14.01C Adopting Academic Senate Executive Council Internal and External Evaluation Survey**

Resolved, that the Academic Senate Executive Council Internal and External Evaluation Surveys as assessment tools for the Academic Senate Program Review be adopted.

**Adopted by consent**

**VI. Appointments**

**Resolution 2018.02.14.02 Appointments to Committees and Task Forces**

**Scholarship Committee**

Sonya Worthy, ESL (new appointment)  
Jonathan Siekmann, Biology (new appointment)

**SLO Committee**

Peter Stoffers, NSCD (new appointment)

**Planning Committee**

Simon Hanson, Biology (reappointment)

**College Commencement Ceremony Committee**

Diane Garcia, Radiological Sciences (new appointment)  
Nathan Feingersh-Steele, Communication Studies (new appointment)  
Patrick Toebe, Theatre Arts (new appointment)

**Moved: Carole Meagher; Seconded: Tom Kennedy**  
**MCU, Abstentions: None.**

**Not present: Jacques Arceneaux, Loren Bell, Verónica Feliu, Pablo Rodriguez, Louis Schubert**

## **VII. Reports**

### **A. Academic Senate for California Community Colleges Events Update**

President Liang briefly oriented the Executive Council to some of the upcoming events being held by the Academic Senate for California Community Colleges. She specifically highlighted the value of attending the State Senate Plenary in April, held this year at the San Mateo Marriott.

Council members suggested attending the Area B meeting in March as an alternative or as a supplement to the Plenary as a good opportunity to learn and hear more about upcoming resolutions and policies. Registration is free.

### **B. Career and Transfer Pathways Committee Report**

Interim Co-Chair Alexis Litzky, and Associate Vice Chancellor Theresa Rowland provided a brief update about the Committee's ongoing work in support of Career and Transfer Pathways. In particular they updated the Council on some incoming Haas, Jr. Foundation money that will be used to fund student feedback and participation in naming activities for the Cluster Wheel and some of the future Pathways work.

## **VIII. Unfinished Business**

None at this time.

## **IX. New Business**

### **A. Review of Roles, Responsibilities, and Processes (RRP) Handbook**

President Liang oriented the council to the update currently happening across the College on the RRP Handbook. The President and Associate Vice Chancellor Kristin Charles sent out emails last fall to get input from each of the Academic Senate Committees about what should or needs to be updated in the handbook. Soon there will be an opportunity for individuals to participate. The purpose of the RRP Handbook is to codify our processes in writing, in addition to meeting some of the Accreditation standards required during our last Accreditation process.

We are entering a comprehensive Program Review process. The Chair of Program Review, Loren Bell, spoke to some of the process being used in Program review. For example, they are developing a glossary of costs to help chairs develop a reasonable and accurate cost for various items. There has been a lot of opacity around what is happening at the top levels of administration, and it used to be easier to know what would be possible but right now it feels like making requests into a black hole. The allocations also continue to not be timely, which affects programs and students. Bell said that the process has been redesigned twice since 2007, and now the subcommittee is finally on some better footing because 100% of programs are

completing their Program Review. What we are missing are some of the reflections about our students, which would include our student successes. Program Review is a legal document, and it's important for us to mark certain elements of our work there, and to note what has and has not been responded to. Bell suggested that the Academic Senate keep a record of what has been applied for, and to have some kind of electronic documentation of requests.

There were a number of comments and questions from the Council:

- A comment was made that the Enrollment Management Plan might be a place to create some standardized ways for analyzing data and requests around enrollment and growth. If we start to create standardized templates and ways of asking for information and metrics on how you might measure the success of the program or request, then we can create a screen that shows what resources would be beneficial.
- The resistance to developing an initiative like the RRP handbook can be traced back to Chancellor Griffin, who said, "Oh no, we don't want people actually knowing how we make decisions here." We should give Karen Saginor some credit for at least trying to complete this in the past.
- Will the Academic Senate also be turning in a form? President Liang said that we can provide one form, but since many of the Senate members are on Senate Committees we don't need to complete another one for the Senate. The Executive Council will review the Master Document.
- A comment was made about the relationship between the RRP and existing Board policies. There was a request that committees should make a comment or a request that if any BP or AP that is not consistent with the RRP, that the RRP should overrule the BP or AP.
- A comment was made that the Committee Chairs should get some help focusing on the specific parts of the RRP that the committee uses.

## **B. Guided Pathways Plan - 1st read**

Alexis Litzky, Guided Pathways Liaison and Guided Pathways Taskforce Member, provided a brief overview of the Plan produced by the Task Force and requested any feedback or questions to facilitate a vote in 2 weeks at the next Senate meeting.

The Council had a number of comments and questions:

- A Council member asked about the payment for faculty labor. There is money included for faculty coordinators and liaisons, in addition to non-instructional pay to support mapping workshops. The retreat will probably occur over a Flex Day to coincide with regular workdays for everyone on campus.
- A Council member warned against the use of the word "silo" as a historically pejorative word.
- A Council member asked if this project is related to the recent Career Ladders Project (CLP) update that was given about the mapping of some CTE programs. AVC Rowland responded by saying that this was not explicitly related to the GP Workplan, but that it is in the same vein of work. Litzky also said that CLP are an external organization that has helped with the implementation and design of pathways at other colleges.

The PGC will review this Plan for the first time at the February 15, 2018 meeting, and the Board of Trustees will also receive a first-read at the next BOT meeting on February 22, 2018.

**C. Discontinuation of the Academic Senate Commencement Committee**

President Liang oriented the Council to recent discussions about this Senate Committee. The Chancellor told the officers in Collegial Consultation in January that he is creating an All-College Committee on Commencement. This prompted a decision about what should be done with our own Commencement Committee. Our Senate Commencement Committee met with the Chancellor and in light of the new All-College Committee, they decided we do not need our own AS Committee. VCSD Trudy Walton will be the Chair of the new Committee, with representation from all constituencies. The resolution presented today is to dissolve the Committee.

A friendly amendment was offered to strike the first Whereas, and add the language, "...that has been in existence since 1976." The friendly amendment was accepted.

**Resolution 2018.02.14.03 Discontinuation of the Academic Senate Commencement Committee**

Whereas, it would benefit the College and students in particular to have the current Commencement Ceremony Committee members transfer their historical knowledge and provide guidance as voting members to the new all-College committee; therefore, be it

Resolved, that the CCSF Academic Senate would agree to dissolve its Commencement Ceremony Committee that has been in existence since 1976, as long as the all-College committee be composed of three members from each constituent group Students, Faculty, Classified, and Administration (total of 12 members) appointed by all appropriate appointing agencies, and follow the tri-chair model for optimal transparency and representation, as has been proposed by the CCSF Academic Senate Commencement Ceremony Committee.

**Moved: Louis Schubert; Seconded: Marie Osborne**

**MCU, Abstentions: None.**

**Not present: Jacques Arceneaux, Verónica Feliu, Danyelle Marshall, Pablo Rodriguez, Marc Santamaria**

**D. Recommendation to change the label "Advisory" to "Recommended Preparation"**

Curriculum Committee chair Kim Ginther-Webster oriented the Council to the resolution, and how it aligns us with other schools' catalogue language.

**Resolution 2018.02.14.04 Replace the term Advisory with the term Recommended Preparation**

Whereas, reports from faculty indicate that the term advisory is not clear to many students, some of whom believe advisories are required preparation, needing proof of completion of the advisory course, and

Whereas, some other California Community Colleges use "recommended preparation" in place of "advisory" to describe this form of requisite,

Be it resolved that the Academic Senate recommend changing the label "Advisory" to "Recommended Preparation" in Course Outlines of Record, the College Catalog, the Course Schedule, and other CCSF materials as needed, effective beginning the 2018-19 academic year.

**Moved: Monica Bosson; Seconded: Fred Teti**

**MCU, Abstentions: None.**

**Not present: Jacques Arceneaux, Verónica Feliu, Danyelle Marshall, Pablo Rodriguez, Marc Santamaria**

#### **E. Summer Bridge Program Update**

No update was provided.

#### **F. Update on Minimum Qualification for Apprenticeship Instructors**

AVC Theresa Rowland updated the Council about the State changes in Minimum Qualifications for Apprenticeship Instructors. The Statewide Academic Senate Executive Committee met on February 2, 2018, but no minutes have been produced publically to see what their official position is on this issue. Essentially what is being proposed is a shift for what kinds of Apprenticeship Instructors can be hired. At CCSF we look at experienced Journey People and hire them as Adjunct faculty. We are having a hard time finding instructors for these kinds of positions, and this would give us a bigger net to bring in professionals in the discipline and help them complete their degrees if they don't have them.

There are 2 proposals that would allow faculty to meet MQ:

1. Holding an Associate Degree, and 4 years of working experience.
2. 6 years of working experience, and a Journey level certification.
  - a. They are suggesting someone could do this by also completing 12 units of course level experience in the first 2 years of working.
  - b. This incentivizes college-level learning if they have not done it before.
  - c. This is analogous to emergency certification for teachers in K-12.

Monique Pasquale, Director of Apprenticeship and Instructional Service Agreements, provided an update on the ongoing and developing Apprenticeship programs at CCSF. She highlighted a few examples, such as re-starting the Police Academy, as successful development projects.

The Council had a number of questions and comments:

- There is a copy of what will be the new proposal, but what is the existing policy? AVC Rowland directed the Council to the ASCCC.org website and highlighted again some of the changes that are proposed.
- A council member noted that there used to be a Department Chair for Apprenticeship in the Labor Studies program. When this changed it also removed the position from the DCC. This changed when Apprenticeship became non-credit, but if it is returning to Credit courses then perhaps it should come back to the DCC purview or at least some thinking about how it might return.

- Who issues Journeyman certificates? Do they have to be Union members to get this certification? The Trade Union issues these, and it requires usually 4 years in the Construction trades and then you are recognized as certified. It does mean that the person has to be a member of that union.

## **X. Administration Report**

AVC Theresa Rowland provided a brief report on behalf of Academic Affairs and the new organization charts available on the AA website. These charts will reflect each of the BOT approved changes every month, but she also spoke to some of the upcoming changes. Some of those include:

- Lillian Marrujo-Duck will soon become the Dean of Instruction reporting to the Associate Vice Chancellor of Enrollment Management and Instructional Support.
  - Kristina Whalen will now oversee Foreign Languages.
  - Jill Yee will now oversee the English Department.
- When Ray Gamba left, it was viewed as a huge position with a lot of responsibilities. In light of that:
  - Edie Kaeuper has stepped in to manage the School of Health & Social Services.
  - Robert Frost manages PE & Dance, and Older Adult studies.
- There is a general movement to make most interim positions permanent because we are only allowed to keep administrators in interim positions for a maximum of 2 years per position.

Comments from the Council:

- There was a question about the way this may affect the evaluation process, and AVC Rowland said that the Deans will still be evaluated but are also anxious to know how this will affect their evaluations.
- There was a comment that we should clarify which administrators are Classified and also identify who the Classified managers are.
- There was a comment about historical publications that use to disseminate this information on campus. It would be nice to have a more regular communication strategy where faculty heard about these changes on a regular basis.
- There was a question about whether or not the movement of English, Foreign Languages, and PE & Dance will stay with these Deans. AVC Rowland indicated that there is not a desire to leave these programs there permanently.
- A Council member asked if there will there be new positions. AVC Rowland answered that yes, there will be new positions such as a Dean of High School Programs.

## **XI. Adjournment, 4:50pm.**



What Is Love?

**Past Meetings/Events** include

- 2018.02.01: Officers meeting
- 2018.02.02: Faculty P.D. Activities Committee
- 2018.02.07: Faculty Association luncheon
- 2018.02.07: Collegial Consultation
- 2018.02.08: Officers meeting
- 2018.02.08: F.A. meeting with the Chancellor to discuss retiree reception
- 2018.02.12: Education Policies Committee

**Upcoming Meetings/Events** include

- 2018.02.15: Officers meeting
- 2018.02.20: Agenda Review
- 2018.02.21: Collegial Consultation
- 2018.02.08: Officers meeting

**More notes from the Alternate Universe...er...Collegial Consultation, etc.**

- At one point last meeting, the Chancellor remarked that we (the faculty) like to base decisions on anecdotes but he always works from data. Yet, at his meeting with the Faculty Association leadership, he proceeded to defend his behavior based on all sorts of anecdotes he has heard around the College without a shred of hard evidence.
- After some months of no movement on the Plus 1s, we (well, Mandy) pushed hard for the Chancellor to take our resolutions seriously. I had a lengthy, robust conversation with Chief of Staff Dewar about our position. I think she heard me. Some good might come of this. I reminded her that we are keeping the Trustees apprised of the situation and, if we do not get satisfaction with the Chancellor, we will approach the Trustees directly.

**FA&F Retiree Reception**

The Faculty Association & Friends, despite being “divisive” and “inherently political”, secured some funding from the Chancellor so that we may throw our annual Retiree Reception, planned for Thursday, May 3<sup>rd</sup>. (The Chancellor blamed us both (1) for the faculty at other campuses feeling isolated and (2) for the Classified feeling maltreated.)

**Faculty Travel Update**

Remember, everyone: Always get your supervisor's signatures before sending me the forms (e.g., dept chairs must get deans' signatures). Attach an announcement/brochure/program showing the event's dates, location, and reg fees (if you are asking for reg fee reimbursement). Send me the originals with ink signatures. Please do not send me scans or photocopies. Please do not send me *receipts*.

CTE faculty especially should note that they may use the FTF for certification fees if they include with their applications documentation (1) supporting the need and/or benefit to the College and our students for the certification and (2) showing the board/bureau/whatever awarding the certificate and its location. For reimbursement, they must have proof that they were successfully certified. This usually takes the form of...wait for it...a *certificate*.