



# The Academic Senate

## CITY COLLEGE OF SAN FRANCISCO

50 Frida Kahlo Way, Bungalow 604, San Francisco, CA 94112 (415) 239-3611 Fax (415) 452-5115

[www.ccsf.edu.edu/academic-senate](http://www.ccsf.edu.edu/academic-senate) email: [smiragli@ccsf.edu](mailto:smiragli@ccsf.edu)

### CCSF Academic Senate Executive Council DRAFT MINUTES

Wednesday, November 29, 2023, 2:30-5:00 pm  
MUB 140 or Via Zoom

[November 29, 2023 Meeting Materials](#) | [ASEC Zoom Meeting Pro Tips](#) | [Community Guidelines](#) | [Guide to CCSF Acronyms](#)

**Council members present:** Adam D'Acquisto, Monica Bosson, Jessica Buchsbaum, Matthew Duckworth, Katia Fuchs, Michael Greenberg, J. Malcolm Hillan, Kimberly Kennan, Stephan Johnson, Thomas Kennedy, Fanny Law, Alexis Litzky, Ying Liu, Sheri Miraglia, Madeline Mueller, Ron Page, Craig Persiko, Caroline Priestley, Robin Pugh, Louis Schubert, Nuala Sheetz, Richard Taha, Fred Teti, Tanichya Wongprasert

**Council members absent:** Kate Frei

**Other Senators present:** Abigail Bornstein, Rachel Cohen, Karen Cox, Mary Bravewoman, Megan Corry, Landi Elne, Lisa King, Craig Kleinman, Lilian Marrujo-Duck, Mitra Sapienza, Elizabeth Smith

**Guests:** Jennifer Kienzle, Malinalli Villalobos, Cherisa Yarkin

#### 1. Call to Order at 2:32

President Miraglia read the land acknowledgement:

*We acknowledge that we are on the unceded, ancestral homeland of the Ramaytush Ohlone who are the original inhabitants of the San Francisco Peninsula. As the indigenous stewards of this land and in accordance with their traditions, the Ramaytush Ohlone have never ceded, lost nor forgotten their responsibilities as the caretakers of this place, as well as for all peoples who reside in their traditional territory. As guests, we recognize that we benefit from living and working on their traditional homeland. We wish to pay our respects by acknowledging the ancestors, elders, and relatives of the Ramaytush Community and by affirming their sovereign rights as First Peoples.*

Recognize your own indigenous land settlement at

- <https://native-land.ca>
- <https://www.ramaytush.org/donate.html>
- <https://sogoreate-landtrust.org/donate/>

2. The updated agenda was adopted unanimously via roll-call vote.

3. Public Comment

- a. Madeline Mueller: Please help promote upcoming music events in the library on December 7 at 5:30pm, and the Jazz band will be in the MUB on Tuesday at 7pm. At the last PGC Facilities meeting the committee rejected the proposal to rename the MUB in honor of Harry Britt.
- b. Lou Schubert: Comment asking for better coordination of the Thanksgiving calendar with SFUSD.
- c. Ying Liu: Provided an update from the OER committee about the new book adoption form in progress for Spring 2024.
- d. Craig Persiko: Shared an email announcement about a proposal for a new faculty union at CCSF.

4. Reports

a. Chancellor's Report

The Chancellor shared a video report with the Council. The report touched upon naming a room rather than the entire MUB building after Harry Britt, the upcoming annual review process and allocations, the upcoming Open House for the Frida Kahlo Quick-Build, and some facilities concerns about the smell of gas around Cloud Hall.

b. Officers Reports

President Miraglia provided a report. See Appendix A for the full report.

c. AFT2121 check-in report

AFT President Mary Bravewoman provided a brief mediation and bargaining update with the district. The next Delegate Assembly meeting is this coming Tuesday.

d. Student Chancellor report

Student Chancellor Malinalli Villalobos provided an update on behalf of the students. The last meeting of the semester for the students on Friday, December 8 at 1pm.

e. Committee on Committees report

1st Vice President Fanny Law reviewed the current slate of faculty appointments for committees on the consent agenda.

5. Consent Agenda

a. Approval of Minutes from November 15, 2023

**Resolution 2023.11.29.5A** Approval of Minutes: Minutes from November 15, 2023

Resolved, the Executive Council approved the minutes for November 15, 2023.

Adopted by consent.

b. Approval of Committee Appointments

**Resolution 2023.11.29.5B** Approval of Committee Appointments

Resolved, that the Executive Council approved the following appointments:

**CTE**

Constance Conner (Computer Science), member, re-appointment

**NCAE**

Maria Rosales-Urbe (Transitional Studies), member, re-appointment

Jessica Buchsbaum (ESL), member, re-appointment

Liv Beck (DSPS), member, re-appointment

**Scholarship**

Gaby Alvarenga (Counseling), member, re-appointment

Timothy Harrington (Visual Media Design), member, re-appointment

**SLOC**

David Stevenson (Visual Media Design), member, re-appointment

Janet Carpenter (Art), member, re-appointment

Janey Skinner (Health Education), member, re-appointment

**Student Equity Strategies**

Lizzie Brock (English), member, re-appointment

**Program Review**

Katia Fuchs (Math), member, re-appointment

**Student Grade and File Review**

Chante McCormick (English), member, re-appointment

**PGC Accreditation**

Sheri Miraglia (Biology), member, re-appointment

**PGC Budget**

Katia Fuchs (Math), member, reappointment

**PGC Diversity**

Gayle Tang (Health Education), member, re-appointment

**PGC Planning**

Craig Kleinman (English), member, reappointment

Adopted by consent.

6. Unfinished Business

7. New Business

a. [Nominations for the Hayward Award](#)

Fanny Law and Ron Page from the Awards & Nominations committee introduced 4 candidates under consideration and the Council chose to nominate 2 candidates.

**Resolution 2023.11.29.7A** Nominations for the ASCCC Hayward Award

The Academic Senate Executive Council nominates Kevin Sherman, a full-time faculty member and Lark Baum, a part-time faculty member for the 2023 ASCCC Hayward Award, and we encourage Rick Kappra and Dominic Yin to submit a nomination again in the future.

Adopted by consensus.

b. Discussion - [Credit for Prior Learning Update](#)

Megan Corry, CPL Coordinator, provided an update about the implementation of Credit for Prior Learning at CCSF.

c. [Endorsement of the GE Area C GELO report](#)

Janey Skinner, SLO Coordinator, presented the GE Area C GELO report and asked for endorsement.

**Resolution 2023.11.29.7C** Endorsement of the GE Area C GELO report

Whereas this assessment of GE Area C has been endorsed by the SLO Committee of the Academic Senate and discussed with chairs and faculty of Area C departments;

Whereas, learning outcome assessment reports are essential to thinking critically about and improving teaching and learning, including improving student equity, at the College;

Whereas, this General Education Learning Outcome (GELO) Area C Assessment Report is a result of the learning outcomes assessment process and a fundamental component of program planning and improvement;

Therefore be it Resolved, the CCSF Academic Senate accepts the GELO Area C Assessment Report as presented to the Academic Senate Executive Council on [Month, day] 2023 and;

Be it further Resolved, the CCSF Academic Senate recommends that this report be used, when relevant, during planning and improvement processes.

Adopted by consensus.

- d. The Council took a 5-minute break.
- e. Decriminalizing Academic Probation Language and Task Force Launch  
Mitra Sapienza, Equity Coordinator and English faculty, introduced a resolution supporting a Task Force and developing alternative language for academic probation.

**Resolution 2023.11.29.7E Decriminalizing Academic Probation Language and Task Force Launch**

Whereas California Code of Regulations Title 5 §55031 Standards for Probation<sup>1</sup> requires colleges to place students on academic or progress probation if they fall below grade point average or successful course completion standards;

Whereas, the Academic Senate for California Community Colleges (ASCCC) passed a resolution in Spring 2023 recommending Title 5 changes in academic probation language and encouraging local academic senates' to review "local policies and practices with an aim of mitigating local processes that may negatively impact students who are on academic or progress probation while Title 5 changes are in progress."<sup>2</sup>

Whereas, the ASCCC guidance is predicated on the fact that "the term 'probation' is a deficit-minded principle that is associated with criminal activity, and this term and current practices are perpetuating trauma for

<sup>1</sup> California Code of Regulations, title 5 §55031 Standards for Probation:

<https://casetext.com/regulation/california-code-of-regulations/title-5-education/division-6-california-community-colleges/chapter-6-curriculum-and-instruction/subchapter-1-programs-courses-and-classes/article-3-probation-and-dismissal/section-55031-standards-for-probation#:~:text=A%20student%20who%20has%20attempted,system%20described%20in%20section%2055023.>

<sup>2</sup> Destigmatize Academic Probation language,

<https://www.asccc.org/resolutions/destigmatize-academic-probation-language-and-processes>

students who identify as Black, Indigenous, or People of Color as well as justice-impacted students” with data that shows the negative impact on students’ educational success and mental health;<sup>3</sup>

Whereas changes to academic probation language leads to a reimagining of academic probation and how it can serve as a more affirming tool to support student progress; therefore, be it

Resolved that the CCSF Academic Senate convene a taskforce to implement language changes to the Academic Policies and Procedures section of the 2023-24 CCSF Catalog (28 references); the AP 5.16 Student Code of Conduct (“Sanctions” pg 6), the AP 5.17 Student Discipline (5 references), and wherever the term is used in any other CCSF policies, procedures, communications and webpages review and revise all communication sent to students regarding their academic progress

Recommend any further changes to be made in language or process regarding academic progress

Resolved that the Academic Senate Executive Council convene a cross-constituency taskforce that includes Counseling faculty, students, members from the Student Equity Strategies committee, Office of Research and Planning, Admissions & Records, financial aid, and other appropriate Student Affairs and Academic Affairs areas.

Adopted by consensus.

f. Title V/Local GE Area Changes

Rachel Cohen, Articulation Officer, and Craig Kleinman, Curriculum Committee chair, introduced a resolution from the Curriculum Committee about updating our local GE areas based on Title V changes to Associated Degree requirements.

**Resolution 2023.11.29.7F Title V/Local GE Area Changes**

Whereas, the California Community Colleges Board of Governors approved regulatory action entitled “Associate Degree Requirements,” (Title 5, Section 55060 and 55061), which was filed with the Office of Administrative Law and the California Secretary of State on October 17, 2023 and becomes effective 30 days from the 10-17-2023 filing date or November 16, 2023; and pursuant to California Code of Regulations, section 52010, college districts have one

---

<sup>3</sup> “The African American Tipping Point: Identifying the Factors that Impact Transfer Among African American/Black Community College Students.” Brief 1 of 3. (October 2022).

hundred and eighty (180) days to conform their policies and procedures to the regulatory requirements;

Whereas, Title 5, Section 55061 regulates that each California Community College maintain a General Education (GE) pattern that aligns with Cal-GETC; that increases the minimum number of General Education units from 18 to 21; and regulates a General Education (GE) pattern that consists of the following areas:

Area 1 English Communication

1A: English Composition (3 semester units)

1B: Communication and Critical Thinking (3 semester units)

Area 2: Mathematical Concepts and Quantitative Reasoning (3 semester units)

Area 3: Arts and Humanities (3 semester units)

Area 4: Social and Behavioral Sciences (3 semester units)

Area 5: Natural Sciences (3 semester units)

Area 6: Ethnic Studies (3 semester units);

Whereas, the Curriculum Committee and stakeholders have discussed the statewide changes to the General Education pattern and how these changes might best be realized at City College of San Francisco and meet a combined 60-unit maximum for major, general education, and electives;

Whereas, the new Title 5 Sections 55060 and 55061 involve the work of the whole college, touching the following areas: District Policy; Philosophy and Criteria for Associate Degree and General Education; Types of Courses Appropriate to the Associate Degree; Minimum Requirements for the Associate Degree; and Acceptance of Noncredit Courses, the CCSF Curriculum Committee understands that its responsibility is for compliance with only the GE section of Title 5 Section 55061.

Resolved, that the City College of San Francisco Curriculum Committee will make changes to the local GE pattern to ensure that the college is in compliance with Title 5 55061 GE regulations for Fall 2024 semester in the following ways:

- moving from a letter naming GE system to a number naming GE system in order to align with the Cal-GETC transfer GE pattern and adopt a less confusing and more student-facing GE pattern;
- forming a GE and Grad Requirement Subcommittee to facilitate the implementation of the new local GE pattern by 1) making recommendations, as guidance from the State Chancellor's Office becomes available, to the full Curriculum Committee to determine suitable processes determining suitable courses for new and adjusted GE areas; and 2) collaborating with the SLO team and SLO Committee

to make necessary additions and adjustments to GE definitions, mapping, and GELOs;

- migrating, in the spirit of the college's desire to contribute to the overall well-being of students, the current Area F, U.S. History and Government, as a three (3)-unit graduation requirement;
- migrating, in the spirit of the college's desire to contribute to the overall well-being of students, the current Area G, Health Knowledge and Physical Skills, to a single one-to-three (1-3) unit graduation requirement;

Resolved, that the two graduation requirements will be waived for degree-seeking students in high-unit majors; with military experience; following the transfer GE pattern; or in possession of a baccalaureate degree from an institutionally-accredited institution;

Resolved, that over a two-year period the Curriculum Committee will continue to engage in discussions with stakeholders and collect relevant data to determine the appropriateness of these graduation requirements to the local degree and whether to continue additional graduation requirements.

Moved: Tom Kennedy; Seconded: Ying Liu

**Motion adopted.**

Abstentions: Kimberly Keenan, Richard Taha, Tanichya Wongprasert

Not present for vote: Adam D'Aquisto, Stephan Johnson, Lou Schubert

g. EFF Purpose and Guidelines

This item was tabled until the next meeting.

8. Adjournment at 5:05pm



## APPENDIX A



## 2023 Fall Plenary Session Resolutions

Final results of voting on resolutions are recorded using the following, based on the [Resolutions Handbook](#) (page 12):

- MSC: Moved, Seconded, Carried
- MSF: Moved, Seconded, Failed
- MSR: Moved, Seconded Referred
- MSU: Moved, Seconded, Unanimous (including consent calendar & unanimous consent)
- Acclamation: Moved, Seconded, Acclamation

<b>Resolution Number</b>	<b>Resolution Title</b>	<b>Disposition</b>
01.01	Honoring Wheeler North with Senator Emeritus Status	Acclamation
03.01	Academic Senate Support for Increasing Faculty Diversity and Advancing Diversity, Equity, Inclusion, and Accessibility in Evaluation and Tenure Review Processes	MSC
04.01	Communicate Requirements of Articulation of High School Courses	MSU
06.01	Recommendations for the Implementation of AB 607 (Kalra, 2023) Amendments to California Education Code §66406.9	MSC
06.02	Support Vision 2030 Goals and Strategic Directions	MSC
07.01	Address CCCApply Impact on Current Incarcerated Individuals and Justice-Involved Students (Rising Scholars)	Acclamation
07.02	Clarification of Licensing Requirement and Inclusion of CC BY-NC License in Procedures and Standards of the Board of Governors	Acclamation
07.03	Clarify Student Placement into Math Pathways for the Business Administration 2.0 Associate Degree for Transfer	MSU
07.04	AB 1705 Meaningful Metrics for Equitable Outcomes	MSC
07.05	Update CCCApply to Address the Needs of Lifelong Learners	Acclamation
07.06	Support Waiver of Transcript Fees for Current and Formerly Incarcerated Rising Scholars	Acclamation
08.01	Noncredit Counseling Professional Learning and Support for Students	MSC

09.01	Support Revisions to Title 5 to Include DEIA in the Course Outline of Record	MSC
09.02	Support of an Equitable Course Prefix in Lieu of ESL	MSC
13.01	Prioritizing the Prevention of Sexual Harassment and Discrimination at California Community College Campuses	Acclamation
13.02	Revival of the California Virtual Campus-Online Education Initiative (CVC-OEI) Proctoring Network for Online Classes	MSC
15.01	Support the AB 928 Associate Degree for Transfer Intersegmental Implementation Committee Recommendations as of October 2023	MSC
15.02	Support the AB 1111: Common Course Numbering Task Force Recommended Implementation Plan as of October 2, 2023	MSC
15.03	Requiring C grades for Cal-GETC	MSU
15.04	Allowing the Use of Credit for Prior Learning on Cal-GETC	MSU
17.01	Sustainability and Institutionalization of Zero-Textbook-Cost Pathway Efforts	Acclamation
17.02	Part-time Faculty Inclusion in OER and ZTC Pathways	MSU
17.03	Supporting Equal Rights for Part-time Faculty	MSU
17.04	Addressing the Health and Well-being Crisis Among California's Community College Students	MSC
20.01	Equitable Treatment of Part-time Students for Student Tutor Positions	MSU
20.02	Provide Student Access to Free Open Educational Course Resources	MSU
09.02.01	Amend Resolution 09.02	MSF
09.03	Proposed Revision to Title 5 related to the Associate Degree and American Institutions and Ideals	MSF
14.01	Attendance and Grading	MSF