



# The Academic Senate

## CITY COLLEGE OF SAN FRANCISCO

50 Frida Kahlo Way, Box E-202, San Francisco, CA 94112 (415) 239-3611 Fax (415) 452-5115  
[www.ccsf.edu/academic-senate](http://www.ccsf.edu/academic-senate) email: [msapienz@ccsf.edu](mailto:msapienz@ccsf.edu)

Curriculum • Degree Requirements • Grading Policies • Program Development • Student Prep & Success • Governance  
Accreditation • Professional Development • Program Review • Planning & Budgeting Process • Others as agreed

Copies of the Final Agenda, Resolutions and Materials for the April 26, 2023 meeting can be found in the [April 26 Meeting Materials](#) folder.

The Academic Senate Executive Council is committed to providing access and accommodation to Executive Council meetings. To make a request connected to a disability or health condition contact the Academic Senate President 48 hours in advance of any Executive Council meeting.

### CCSF Academic Senate Executive Council Minutes & [Sound Recording](#)

Wednesday, May 10, 2023, 2:30-5:00pm  
MUB 380 or Via Zoom

<https://ccsf-edu.zoom.us/j/98935746783>

**Council Members Present:** Monica Bosson, Adam d'Aquisto, Malcolm Hillan, Wynd Kaufmyn, Kimberly Keenan, Tom Kennedy, Jesse Kolber, Sheri Miraglia, Madeline Mueller, Ronald Page II, Mitra Sapienza, Lou Schubert, Nuala Sheetz, Michele Sieglitz, Chad Stephenson, Frederick Teti, Katryn Wiese, Jib Wongprassert.

**Council Members Absent:** Matt Duckworth, Kate Frei (leave of absence), Caroline Priestley (leave of absence)

**Other Senate Members Present:** Dayamudra Dennehy, Landi Ehnli, Simon Hanson, Jennifer Kienzle, Alex Leyton, Anna Lisa-Helmy, Ying Liu, Melissa McPeters, Craig Persiko, Joe Reyes, Elizabeth Smith, Nathan Steele, Eliza Woo

**Guests:** Cynthia Dewar, Jen Kienzle, Chancellor David Martin, Cherisa Yarkin

#### I. Call to Order 2:35 (3min)

We acknowledge that we are on the unceded, ancestral homeland of the Ramaytush Ohlone who are the original inhabitants of the San Francisco Peninsula. As the indigenous stewards of this land and in accordance with their traditions, the Ramaytush Ohlone have never ceded, lost nor forgotten their responsibilities as the caretakers of this place, as well as for all peoples who reside in their traditional territory. As guests, we recognize that we benefit from living and working on their traditional homeland. We wish to pay our respects

by acknowledging the ancestors, elders and relatives of the Ramaytush Community and by affirming their sovereign rights as First Peoples.

- Recognize your own indigenous land settlement at <https://native-land.ca>
- <https://www.ramaytush.org/donate.html>
- <https://sogoreate-landtrust.org/donate/>

II. Adoption of Agenda 2:38 (2min)

III. Public Comment 2:40 (10 min)

- Katryn Wiese: Atet of the Facilities- while there has been some improvement, it is hard to see these improvements in the Science Building. Re: Emergency Exit Issue, there was a lot of back and forth with HR, Facilities, etc. we have finally gotten it to a point where the door can be opened in an emergency but only on one side. It would be great to have signage to let students know what is working/not that won't get torn down.
- Wynd Kaufmyn: Thank you Katryn for your work on that door. It's ridiculous. Keith Mueller, Department Chair of Engineering & Technology, led the Engineering Club for the 5th Year in a row for the victory (garbled) and came home with tons of prizes.
- Madeline Mueller: This Thursday there is a choir program. 5:30-6:30 on the 2nd Floor of the Library. 4:30 Happy Hour and Guitar students on the other side of campus.

IV. Reports 2:50

- Chancellor's Report (10 min)
  - Updates to the College
  - Hiring right now: PIO Position is closed and the Committee is starting to screen for that position as well as AVC of Finance and Facilities.
  - Student Registration System. We are going to recommend going through a new process and open it up to more than the 2 bidders who made it through the first time and hope to have a bigger pool of options to pick from.
  - Facilities: SFPL- one of the facilities at our Chinatown Campus may be something they are interested in during their renovations.
  - Mission Campus and SF Unified: looking for 2nd-4th Floors at Bartlett Center. We're going to get more feedback from PGC Facilities Committee.
  - Heating Projects: we are still waiting for the supplies to arrive

- so vendors can start the boiler projects during the Summer.
- Update on Science door that Katryn brought up: we now have Union Doors under contract and we want to schedule to have them come out to do the work.
  - More info on the Diego Rivera mural: the walkthrough decided the old theater will be a viable place to house the mural. We now have to work with SFMOMA to make sure we get this transported over safely in rolling crates.
  - Statewide level. May revision from the Governor re: Public Education. January proposal is an estimate and we should have a revise on Friday.
  - Rising Scholar and Higher Up Grant Opportunities: Approximately \$1.5 million in stipends for students who were formerly incarcerated. Shout out to Amber Strauss who has been instrumental in getting applications out, Student President Brandt and Maureen Harrington for getting students involved.
  - Thanks to all the faculty at CCSF during Teacher Appreciation Week, Your work is appreciated and recognized.
  - Tom Kennedy: The 2nd-4th Floors of Bartlett building are currently all being used and we would have to move all of our classes to accommodate Horace Mann.
  - Chancellor Martin: we are not sure if it is feasible and it is a very big ask by SF Unified but in the spirit of good partnership we are entertaining the idea with SF Unified.
  - Lou Schubert: When the library is going to join us in Chinatown, will they be paying rent or will we be “scratching one another’s backs in the future”?
  - Chancellor Martin: at this point it is preliminary and we will keep the college up to speed as we know more.
  - Lou Schubert: Regarding the mural, how long will that be in storage?
  - Chancellor Martin: potentially we would have it installed in the Fall of 2026 at the end of the timeline if everything goes to plan with the construction and contractors.
  - Lou suggested maybe the mural could go on tour.
  - Chancellor Martin: not many facilities are prepared to show it for a short time because of the size.
  - Madeline Mueller: the safety of the mural is of paramount importance.

- Chancellor Martin: this Friday at 11am.
- Sheri Miraglia: are we still on track with the Science Building?
- Chancellor Martin: we are looking to have it open by Fall 2024.
  
- Officers Reports (15 min)
  - [President's report](#)
  - ASEC Office location
  - Last meeting will be May 24th MUB 140 + Zoom
  - ASEC Officer Position Descriptions: [ASEC Officer Duties](#)
  - President Duties: Chairing the ASEC Meeting, Collegial Consultation, DCC, FPAC, Secondary FSA Committee, Committee on Committees
  
- Sheri Miraglia, 1st VP
  - Main duties are reporting on Committees
  - Keep track of documents related to committees
  - One of the big tasks is keeping track of the master committee file
  - Look at how our committees are functioning and possibly combining committees to reflect the current size of the college.
  - Update Committee Membership up to date on our website.
  - Lots of Meetings: Collegial Consultation, etc.
  
- Lou Schubert, 2nd VP
  - Planning for FLEX meeting in August
  - I put in most of my hours before the semester
  - Committee on Committees
  - Preparing for Officer Meetings: Communicating with faculty
  
- Michele Sieglitz, Secretary
  - Secretarial duties include a lot of typing and splitting one's brain between being present and taking copious notes during ASEC meetings.
  - Some website updates upon request in addition to posting ASEC meetings and new Council + Officers.
  - Weekly Officer and Collegial Consultation meetings in addition to ASEC Meetings and writing up all of the minutes for each meeting.
  - Mitra Sapienza mentioned that reassign time for next year's team is still being negotiated.
  - Sneak Peak of ASEC Schedule next year:

☰ 2023-2024 Academic Senate Meeting Calendar

- Simon Hanson: for the 12 of you who are continuing on next year, even if you don't take one of these executive positions, your job is to support the Officer team.
- AFT2121 check in report (5 min)
  - From the Chat: Negotiations were canceled at the last minute by the district without justification. We are resuming negotiations tomorrow in MUB 261 starting at 2 pm. Please join us. Also please join our Delegate Assembly meeting. Tuesday, May 16th 3-5 pm on zoom. All AFT 2121 members are welcome and encouraged to attend.
- [Distance Education Coordinators' Report](#) (10mins) – Ying Liu and Dayamudra Dennehy
- Ying Liu: Summer 2022 IOTL (25)/ AOTL (19) Training
- Fall 2022 Cohort IOTL (30)/ AOTL (8)
- Huge diversity of instructors and courses. Very different online classes presented.
- Thank yous to all the IOTL trainers
- Huge shout out to Lindsey Webb for web support
- 150 DEAs approved in Fall 2022
- 194 DEAs approved in Spring 2023
- Thanks to Craig Kleinman, Fred Teti, Megan (?), Andrea Fong
- Daya Dennehy: Hy-Flex review in The Guardsman this week.
- Videos on co-working sessions and practices for online teaching.
- Have been compiling resources for Online teaching on blog, Chat GPT and AI Platforms, creating policy and looking at course design.
- Committee on Committees report (5 min)

V. Consent Agenda 3:45 (5 min)

A. Approval of Minutes from [April 26, 2023](#)

**Resolution 2023.05.10.5A**

**Approval of Minutes: April 26, 2023**

Resolved, that the Academic Senate approves the Minutes for [April 26, 2023](#).

Adopted by CONSENSUS.

- B. Appoint Distance and Learning Teaching Specialists: Megan Sweeney, Political Science & Kate Gougoutas, Transitional Studies
- C. Appoint OER coordinator: Ying Liu, Biology and Amy McLanahan, Math
- D. Appoint Equity coordinator: Mitra Sapienza, English
- E. Appoint Equity PD coordinator: Kimberly Keenan, Social Sciences
- F. Approval of Committee Appointments

Resolution 2023.05.10.5F

**Appointments to Committees, Task Forces, Work Groups**

**Nominations to Committees with Unlimited Membership**

**Scholarship**

George Lin (Engineering and Architecture) - new appointment

**Nominations to Committees with Limited Membership**

**Program Review**

Megan Kinney (Library) - reappointment

**Nominations to AS Workgroups / Task Forces District-Level Committees and Task Forces/Workgroup**

**FPAC**

Mitra Sapienza (English) - reappointment

Adopted by CONSENSUS.


VI. Old Business 3:50

A. Simple Syllabus (5mins) – Process, 10+1 and Faculty Support, informational, Jen Kienzle and Mitra Sapienza

- We wanted to see what happened regarding the process of choosing Simple Syllabus. It has been a year and half in the making. The recommendation should have gone to ASEC after TLTR in order to fit the process we are striving for. We are taking the steps of process seriously in order to fit into 10+1. We can discuss this further on May 24th agenda.
- Jen Kienzle: anyone can contact me regarding Simple Syllabus as the lead on this plan to implement SS into our process. We want to be very clear and communicate with faculty every stage of this process. It should not be a lot of extra labor and we plan to have lots of support throughout the Fall semester.

- Katryn Wiese: If I build out my syllabus in the beginning of the summer, will Simple Syllabus override my old syllabus.
- Jen Kienzle said it would not but would just move the old syllabus away and into the background.
- Tom Kennedy went to the Sandbox Session last week and was somewhat comforted that it could be tailored to meet department needs.
- Jen Kienzle concurred and said it was a great opportunity to “norm our syllabi”.

B. [Math Requirement GELO Report Acceptance and Use Resolution](#) (10mins) – Janey Skinner, second read, discussion, vote

- [ASECMath Requirement ASEC presentation 4/12/23](#) 
- Math Requirement report:
  - [2023GELOMathGraduationRequirementAssessment.docx](#)
  - We’re seeking approval from ASEC today for Math Graduation Requirement Assessment.
  - There are serious opportunity gaps among young people in equity populations. 12 and 8% gap for younger students (18-24). As an instructor, I ask myself, how can I modify my teaching to reach this group?
  - Katryn Wiese: there has to be consideration on use of Math in Sciences. How effective are we being with SLOs when Math is applied?
  - Michele Sieglitz: has there been a correlated study with math instruction at High School level which may explain why our younger students are not doing as well?
  - Janey Skinner: I don’t know. I do know that we have changed our own Math Assessment.
  - Mitra Sapienza mentioned that there is a “Math Revolution” happening in K-12 in San Francisco.
  - Lou Schubert moved the Resolution, Tom Kennedy seconded.
  - Passed by CONSENSUS.

**Resolution 2023.05.10.6B****Math Requirement GELO Report Acceptance and Use**

Whereas this assessment of the GE Math Requirement for an Associates degree has been endorsed by the SLO Committee of the Academic Senate and discussed with faculty teaching courses that meet the math requirement;

Whereas, learning outcome assessment reports are essential to thinking critically about and improving teaching and learning, including improving student equity, at the College;

Whereas, this General Education Learning Outcome (GELO) Assessment Report of the Math Requirement is a result of the learning outcomes assessment process and a fundamental component of program planning and improvement;

Therefore be it Resolved, the CCSF Academic Senate accepts the GELO Math Requirement Assessment Report as presented to the Academic Senate Executive Council on May 10, 2023 and;

Be it further Resolved, the CCSF Academic Senate recommends that this report be used, when relevant, during planning and improvement processes.

Approved by CONSENSUS.

**C. [Board Policies and Administrative Procedure on Instructional Materials Fees:](#)**

Deletion of BP 6.13 and replacing it with an addition to AP 5.27 (10mins) – Fred Teti and Eliza Woo, second read, discussion, vote

- We found that there was redundancy in the BP 6.13 and the Student Fees handbook. A lot of other colleges are creating and addendum which we thought was a good idea for CCSF as well. We worked with Bursar Chavez who agreed with this addendum as well.
- a) [BP 6.13](#), Instructional Materials Fees (We propose that the Board delete this as duplicative with BP/AP 5.27.)
- b) [AP 5.27](#) Student Fees proposed new [AP 5.27G](#), to be added to AP 5.27

**Resolution 2023.05.10.6C****Board Policies and Administrative Procedure on Instructional Materials Fees****Board Policies and Administrative Procedure on**

Whereas, the Education Policies Committee is recommending an addition (section G) to AP



5.27 (Student Fees) which will obviate the need for BP 6.13 (Instructional Materials Fees); and

Whereas, CCSF Bursar Chavez has approved the proposed wording of the new AP 5.27G and the deletion of BP 6.13; therefore be it

Resolved, that the CCSF Academic Senate recommend that the Board add proposed new section G to its Administrative procedure 5.27 (Student Fees), as presented to the Senate on May 10, 2023; and be it further

Resolved, that the CCSF Academic Senate recommend that the Board include in AP 5.27 a live hyperlink to the State Chancellor's Office Student Fees Handbook; and be it finally

Resolved, that the CCSF Academic Senate recommends that the Board delete its Policy 6.13 (Instructional Materials Fees).

Approved by CONSENSUS.

VII. New Business 4:20

A. [Resolution: One College Two Books \(2023-2024\)](#) (10mins) – Nathan Steele, discussion, vote

- Two books are being proposed: “Everything for Everyone: History of the NY Commune” (Adelle ??) “The Costs of Completion: Student Success in Community Colleges”. (Simon Hanson)
- Reading the book will be the first step; the next step would be to come together, eat food and discuss.
- Fred Teti: we think the books are somewhat complementary. The second book is more cerebral but will engage people’s passions about the topic.
- Motion to endorse by Malcolm Hillan, Seconded by Fred Teti.
- Motion to pass by Acclimation by Lou Schubert
- Passed by ACCLAMATION

B. Hyflex Pilot (10mins) – Dayamudra Dennehy, Cynthia Dewar, informational, discussion

- Hyflex: coined by Brian Beatty, a professor at SF State.
- Students can choose to do either online or in-person within the same class.
- It’s an equivalent learning model to all our other deliveries.
- RR: San Diego Community College. They met with Cultural and Equity team and had some challenges with Video and Audio while designing the curriculum. Consistent waivers are necessary for being recorded or being on camera.

- Owl camera or Neat Board allows students to be either in the classroom or at home
- Cañada College had a less successful roll out. Importance of preparation and communication across the college. Workforce Issues need to be addressed.
- We need to think about technology, how to create quality experience for the students and workload issues.
- Tom Kennedy: I think this sounds interesting. I've been fearful of having to address two audiences at the same time. It may lend itself more easily to meetings than in a classroom setting.
- Daya: different classes use it in different ways. Smaller departments have seen a boost in enrollment.
- Tom Kennedy: as a participant in meetings delivered through Hyflex, the Owl video doesn't show you a lot of detail. But I was able to go to a conference they wouldn't otherwise.
- Craig Persiko: this is my first meeting with an Owl. The types of classes I am teaching are all synchronous. I kept all the videos I used during the pandemic.
- Daya Dennehy: one of the reasons we want to do this is because everyone is sort of doing their own thing. As a college, I think it will be useful to have consistency.
- Adam d'Aquisto: is this a way for the college to increase enrollment and numbers of students in our classes and not offer as many sections? My other concern would be with whether our school can accommodate the technology we need when we have so many other facility problems, like having heat, etc.
- Cynthia Dewar mentioned that the AFT contract restricts online classes to be the same size as in-person.
- Daya: the slow rollout is very important and we can't just impose this on everyone.
- Madeline Mueller: can we get a list from the three schools who have Hyflex in place to see what departments were involved?
- Daya: I can give you the contacts of the people I spoke to.
- Katryn Wiese: I've worked with the NEAT screens at Cañada College, and they are MUCH better than OWL, because you can see the ZOOM video squares and LOOK at those as you talk. It's really fun to use them. :) They are on wheels, so you can move them into any room you want. AND you can move them around the room. I think you can do the same with an OWL, but you have to also have a projector and separate screen showing the online audience (not just a laptop).

- Michele Sieglitz asked a question about how this might impact Community and Culture if students opt not to come to class.
- Daya responded by suggesting changing the lens to see who we could include rather than exclude.
- Landi Ehnli: I hear a lot of options for the students but what about the faculty?
- Daya: That's interesting. In San Diego the teacher had some flexibility for asynchronous instruction but part of the instruction would be on campus.
- Elizabeth Smith: Some elite institutions have explicitly rejected Hyflex (and online in general) for undergraduates because of exactly what was described -- students stopped coming to class and suffered more loneliness and lack of community. I understand about inclusion but when we include it in this way it is not always people who have specific barriers who use this tech. Not saying it is bad -- just drawing attention to unintended consequences. Also, I would strongly object to this modality for English composition classes specifically as it would make meaningful instruction very difficult. I am hoping no top-down non-discipline-specific decisions on this would be made.
- The request is to create a Workgroup to discuss Hyflex.

C. [Resolution Celebrating the work of the Program Review and the Student Equity Strategies Committees in support of the 2023 Program Review Supplemental Fund Allocation Process](#) (10mins) – Mitra Sapienza, first read, discussion, vote

- Program Review request was very quick and the timeline was less than desirable. Final results are to thank Program Review and Student Equity and Strategies. The Chancellor was also a huge support and helped construct parts of the resolution.
- Sheri Miraglia motioned to approve, seconded by Fred Teti
- Motion to approve by Acclamation
- Approved by ACCLAMATION

**Resolution 2023.05.10.7C                      Celebrating the Work of the Program Review and the Student Equity Strategies Committees in Support of the 2023 Program Review Supplemental Fund Allocation Process**

Resolution Celebrating the work of the Program Review and the Student Equity Strategies Committees in support of the 2023 Program Review Supplemental Fund Allocation Process

Whereas the Program Review Committee (PRC) designed and helped implement the 2022 Comprehensive Program Review Guide that further institutionalizes and promotes diversity, equity, inclusion and anti-racism at City College of San Francisco; and

Whereas, with full support from the Office of Research and Planning, the Office of Academic & Institutional Affairs, and the Senate's Executive Council, the Program Review Committee co-chairs supported and helped design the Program Review Supplemental Fund Allocation Process in Fall 2022 and Spring 2023; and

Whereas, with established equity parameters set by the Executive Council leadership in partnership with college administration through collegial consultation, the Student Equity Strategies Committee (SESC) implemented the Supplemental Allocation Process by designing a Program Review Supplemental Allocation Rubric, scheduling extra meetings, doing extra committee work and successfully completing the final ranking of 26 eligible resource requests in February 2023; and

Whereas the Office of Research and Planning was essential in supporting both the PRC and SESC in completing the Supplemental Resource Allocation Process; therefore be it

Resolved, that the Academic Senate celebrates and thanks the Program Review and Student Equity Strategies Committees, and the Office of Research and Planning for coming together in successful collaboration; and

Resolved that the Academic Senate supports future improvements in this process that empower both committees, department chairs and those requesting supplemental fund allocations in the future.

Approved by ACCLAMATION.

- D. [Honors Coordinator job description](#) (5mins) – first read, discussion, vote
  - Monica Bosson motioned to move this proposal, seconded by Lou Schubert.
  - Next step will be an all-faculty announcement about this position.
  
- E. [Fan5 report of Fall 2022 Program Review resource requests prioritized for funding](#) (10mins) – Cherisa Yarkin, informational
  - Adult Education Program
  - Student Equity & Achievement Program
  - Strong Workforce Program

- Plug for Fan5 Professional Development: Consider applying to be part of one of those teams.  
P Fan5 Presentation - Academic Senate May 10, 2023.pptx
- We are sharing what was prioritized before following up with what is funded.
- Fan 5 Collaboration around Professional Development ‘Strengthening Student Success’ Conference
- Nuala Sheetz: As a member of the Non-Credit Adult Ed community, I am curious what “new prioritized projects” are.
- Cherisa Yarkin: the two tables show the new resource requests and the ones that are applicable to AB7105 plan were brought to SMEE Committee to prioritize.

VIII. Adjournment (5:00pm)