



The Academic Senate

CITY COLLEGE OF SAN FRANCISCO

50 Frida Kahlo Way, Box E-202, San Francisco, CA 94112 (415) 239-3611 Fax (415) 452-5115
www.ccsf.edu/academic-senate email: msapienz@ccsf.edu

Curriculum • Degree Requirements • Grading Policies • Program Development • Student Prep & Success • Governance
Accreditation • Professional Development • Program Review • Planning & Budgeting Process • Others as agreed

Note: Copies of the Final Agenda, Resolutions and Materials for the December 14, 2022 meeting can be found in the [January 25 Materials folder](#).

CCSF Academic Senate Executive Council

Agenda & [Sound Recording](#)

Wednesday, February 8, 2023, 2:30-5:00pm

Via Zoom

<https://ccsf-edu.zoom.us/j/98935746783>

Council Members Present: Adam d'Aquisto, Monica Bosson, Matt Duckworth, Wynd Kaufmyn, Kimberly Keenan, Tom Kennedy, Sheri Miraglia, Madeline Mueller, Ronald Page II, Lisa Romano, Mitra Sapienza, Lou Schubert, Nuala Sheetz, Michele Sieglitz, Chad Stephenson, Frederick Teti, Katryn Wiese, Jib Wongprassert.

Council Members Absent: Kate Frei (leave of absence), Caroline Priestley (leave of absence)

Other Senate Members Present: Gaby Alvarenga, Landi Ehnli, Simon Hanson, Jennifer Kienzle, Alexis Litzky, Ying Liu, Elizabeth Smith

Guests: Heather Brandt, Dr. Tessa Brown, Dr. Ramona Coates, Megan Corry, Edie Kaeuper, Mandy Liang, Chancellor David Martin, Pam Mery, Malinalli Villalobos

I. Call to Order 2:35 (3min)

A. We acknowledge that we are on the unceded, ancestral homeland of the Ramaytush Ohlone who are the original inhabitants of the San Francisco Peninsula. As the indigenous stewards of this land and in accordance with their traditions, the Ramaytush Ohlone have never ceded, lost nor forgotten their responsibilities as the caretakers of this place, as well as for all peoples who reside in their traditional territory. As guests, we recognize that we benefit from living and working on their traditional homeland. We wish to pay our respects by acknowledging the ancestors, elders and relatives of the Ramaytush Community and by affirming their sovereign rights as First Peoples.

- Recognize your own indigenous land settlement at <https://native-land.ca>
- <https://www.ramaytush.org/donate.html>
- <https://sogoreate-landtrust.org/donate/>

II. Adoption of Agenda 2:38 (2min)


III. Public Comment 2:40 (10 min)

- **Fred Teti:** Education Policies Committee will meet Monday 2/13 at 1pm to meet on Board Policies on Materials Fees, Academic Freedom & Athletics
- **Ron Page:** Announced a Women in Engineering Conference @ San Jose State on March 18th. 25 spots held for CCSF students. Email Ron: rpage@ccsf.edu. <https://2023.siliconvalleywie.org/>
- **Tamika Jones:** I'm a returning instructor in CNIT (PT) from most recent layoff. Delay in rehiring caused low enrollment in classes. Can you spread the word about my classes? *Intro to Computers, Intro to Computers Using PCs, Computer Hardware* class.
- **Wynd Kaufmyn:** Filed Retirement paperwork. Will have a retirement celebration on March 24th at Ocean Ale House. 2-5pm. Will buy the first 20 people drinks.

IV. Reports 2:50

- Chancellor's Report (10 min)
 - Student Registration (RFP). Bid deadlines has closed. We had two separate vendors submit bids and we're currently going through those to see if they meet all legal requirements that are mandated through public contract code. Hopefully we'll have a decision by end of Spring semester.
 - Science Hall: heat stopped working late last week. Boilers were fixed but then started leaking. We are going to replace all the pipes. We'll need to get quotes and get outside help with which the Facilities Department is in the process of doing.
 - Temporary options: space heating. More space heaters are coming next week. Please work through **School Dude** from Building Lead or Monitor to request heaters.
 - Mask mandate shifted to masks "strongly recommended". Aaron Chase is the point person regarding accommodation re: lifting of mask mandates.
 - Admin Evaluation will begin this Spring. First we want to make sure our management team is up to speed and how this will feed into upcoming contractual decisions.
 - Census enrollment: should have data in the coming weeks. I'm pleased to see we're seeing enrollment stabilizations. Head counts are higher than Fall 2022. Average unit load/student is lower than last Spring. We hope to see the

- number continue to move upward with late-start classes.
 - On verge of new Brown Act requirements. New requirements will be implemented in March after State of Emergency for Covid is withdrawn by Governor and we have more guidance.
- Vice Chancellor of Academic and Institutional Affairs, Geisce Ly (5 min)
 - Summer Schedule development process is underway. March 27th Schedule goes LIVE. We have augmented classes for Summer.
 - Fall Schedule next. Have met with 35 Chairs so far. We have a “measured growth” approach to schedule and enrollment.
 - April 17th is when schedule goes LIVE.
 - March 16th: 2-4pm Hybrid Culturally Responsive Enrollment Management Meeting with expert in the field.
 - Mitra Sapienza will be co-chair of Enrollment Management Committee.
 - Chad Stephenson: will building hours be posted soon?
 - Geisce Ly: Yes, we will have summer hours posted soon. No evening classes except for Mission.
- **Officers Reports (15 min)**
- [President’s report](#)
 - Elections are coming up.
 - Still looking for 2 faculty members each for: Associate Dean of Student Completion & Interim Associate Director of Student Activities
 - We submitted the Stanbeck Stroud aware for LilyAnn Villaraza on Sunday
 - FPAC has been meeting and discussing faculty positions moving forward to fulfill accreditation requirements.
 - Facilities: updates from AFT and Chancellor
 - Mask mandate did not happen suddenly. There were months of consultation and lots of opportunities for shared governance since Fall 2022.
 - ACCJC is deferring action on 8 At-Risk areas.
 - Student Equity Strategies just reviewed their rankings for Program Review.
 - Will announce funding as soon as possible.

- Grief & Healing Workshop will be shared between ASEC and College, thanks to the Chancellor.
 - First VP, Sheri Miraglia
 - Most of the standards in the letter from the ACCJC are from Finance. We discussed this in the Accreditation Steering Committee meeting.
 - We have to maintain fiscal control that has been recently implemented. If we're able to meet our standards, we will mostly likely be reaffirmed for 18 months.
 - Be on the lookout for follow up meetings in March re: ACCJC.
 - Secretary, Michele Sieglitz
 - We will be organizing an event in May after hybrid Senate meeting for people who may be interested in becoming an Officer of ASEC. More to follow.
 - Mitra Sapienza reminded the council that we are migrating to Hyflex Meetings and more information will be forthcoming.
- AFT2121 check in report, Mary Bravewoman (5 min)
 - Hyflex: Sunshine Document for Bargaining. Please attend meeting on Friday via Zoom. All members are welcome to attend and precinct reps will be voting.
 - If endorsed, we will be taking the Sunshine Document at the BOT meeting on 2/16/23.
 -  2023.02.10 DA Agenda - Special Meeting
- Committee on Committees report (5 min)

V. Consent Agenda 3:40 (5 min)

A. Approval of Minutes from [January 25, 2023](#)

Resolution 2023.01.25.5A **Approval of Minutes: January 25, 2023**

Resolved, that the Executive Council approved the Minutes for [January 25, 2023](#).

Adopted by CONSENT

B. Approval of Committee Appointments

Resolution 2023.02.08.5B **Appointments to Committees, Task Forces, Work Groups**

Nominations to Committees with Unlimited membership

TLTR

Michelle Gorthy (Comm Studies) - reappointment

Ingrid Shultz (Cinema) - reappointment

Marie Varelas-Bojnowski (Library) - reappointment
Scholarship

Dory Rincon (HCT) - reappointment

Nixora Ferman (New Student Counseling) - reappointment

CTE Steering Committee

Gina Hector (Business) - reappointment

SLO Committee

Dorian Brown (African American Studies) - reappointment

Works of Art

Madeline Mueller (Music) - new appointment

Nominations to Committees with Limited membership**Faculty Professional Development Committee**

Alex Leyton (English) - reappointment

DLAC

Lark Baum (Soc and Psych) - new appointment

Gina Hector (Business) - new appointment

Natalie Cox (Behavioral Sciences, Anthropology) - new appointment pending confirmation of space

Nominations to AS Workgroups / Task Forces District-Level Committees and Task Forces/Workgroup**College Professional Development Committee**

Nathaniel Lawless Steele (Communication Studies) - reappointment

Adopted by CONSENT

VI. Old Business

A. [Transfer Center BP/AP 5.13](#) (10mins) – Gabriela Alvarenga second read, discussion, vote

- Dean Mandy Liang is also here to answer questions.
- [Transfer Center Plan](#) (2018)
- AP5.13. We believe this should be collaborative and not just be from one department.
- Lou Schubert: how are we specifically working with UC Berkeley transfers?

- Gabby Alvarenga: we have a representative from UC Berkeley who comes to CCSF and we're also looking at a fieldtrip in addition to posting events. We may be able to communicate through EFF.
- Mandy Liang: also suggested going to Transfer website to get on top of current events.
- Madeline Mueller: have you been in touch with American Cultures contact at UC Berkeley. If not, I will give it to you.
- Tom Kennedy moved to approve the BP/AP. Seconded by Lou Schubert.
- Passed by CONSENT

Resolution 2023.02.08.6A

Approval of the Transfer Center BP/AP 5.13

Resolved that the Academic Senate Executive Council approved the [Transfer Center BP/AP 5.13](#)

Adopted by CONSENT

- B. [DRAFT Resolution on Flexibility of Modalities for Full-Time Faculty to Fulfill Their Teaching and Professional Obligations](#) – work with individual council members and faculty at-large to refine and improve this resolution to bring back on or around this date, per Nov 30th ASEC meeting – no progress to date
- The spirit of the additional resolution was to capture some of the nuance post-Covid.
 - Was the 2018 Resolution a 10+1? Some people think it's not.
 - Mitra Sapienza suggested tabling this to Time Uncertain.
 - Lou Schubert moved the Resolution. Sheri Miraglia seconded the motion.
 - Lisa Romano suggested that this was not a 10+.1 issue and encouraged ASEC Officers to see if this is a 10+1 issue. I don't think it is and think it should be taken off the table.
 - Mitra Sapienza confirmed that this is why it was being tabled to Time Uncertain for this very reason and because no progress was made otherwise.
 - If progress is made, the item will definitely be coming back.
 - Passed by CONSENT

Resolution 2023.02.08.6B

Approval for Flexibility of Modalities for Full-Time Faculty to Fulfill Their Teaching and Professional Obligations

Resolved, that the Academic Senate Executive Council approved the [Flexibility of Modalities for Full-Time Faculty to Fulfill Their Teaching and Professional Obligations](#)

VII. New Business 3:45

A. [OER committee description](#) (10mins) – first read, discussion and potential vote

- Ying Liu : Thank you Alexis Litzky for her help and to Katryn Wiese for asking questions and forcing me to justify the wording in the description.
- Katryn Wiese: if you have a committee that tells you that you have to do things a certain way, it sets your agenda. We want to make sure that faculty have looked at the goals of this committee. When you promote something you have to be careful. I've been involved since 2011 on these OER issues. I do think this description could be improved.
- Ying Liu: the overall goal is to promote low costs and zero cost instructional material for the students.
- Michele Sieglitz: asked about using OER/ZTC for software and/or online educational resources like Linked-In Learning and Adobe software.
- Ying Liu: suggested becoming part of the committee to talk about the needs/resources for students who need online/software resources in lieu of textbooks. She also mentioned that an entire pathway, degree or certificate would have to be submitted for consideration. She confirmed that the committee meets every third Thursday morning at 9am.
- Lou Schubert: Once an application is submitted for a pathway or certificate, would a program have to use OER forever thereafter? He also asked to clarify OER being zero cost to the student, not zero cost. When I think of zero textbook costs, I think of zero costs. Period. He discussed the costs of copying pages as handouts. Would initiatives like this be able to get funded by OER/ZTC. He also talked about Cengage Unlimited which uses a flat fee for an annual subscription to all Cengage titles. We might be able to save a lot of money by using these resources rather than develop them in house. Have we explored this option as well?
- Ying Liu: That's the idea but as long as one course was using the OER resources and that section continued to do so, this would work. It comes down to a local decision. Some courses fit into LTC rather than ZTC
- Nuala Sheetz: I was into OER when we first started looking at it and found that some of the issues, like accessibility, made these tools challenging. Can we require students to use digital materials if they are meeting in person? Will these issues be discussed in the committee? Also, I wanted to say that it's difficult for people to meet who are commuting from centers.
- Ying Liu confirmed that the OER Committee is meeting by Zoom.

- Mitra Sapienza: this discussion is intended to bolster the committee description but the description is also revisable. It can also come back.
- Landi Ehnle: would a translation of an existing OER resource be part of the committee purview? Landi confirmed that in her department she had some texts in Spanish and English but wanted to translate some resources into Chinese.
- Ying Liu confirmed that there would be different levels of awards, including adding to pre-existing OER resources as well as adopting brand new resources for OER.
- Lou Schubert: a lot of what we've discussed is very cohesive. Hopeful on the second read we can pass it next time?
- Alexis Litzky: all of these questions are good to help us create a stronger committee.
- Mitra Sapienza: can you add track changes for the next read for 2/22/23?
- Yong Liu: Yes, I will do that.

B. Sunshining College-wide Faculty Leadership opportunities with reassigned time (15mins) – Mitra Sapienza, first reads, discussion

1. [Draft Faculty Coordination Process](#)

- The intention is to be more transparent and inclusive.
- Faculty leadership opportunities for college-wide positions are open to all and accessible to all.
- Making sure we all have access to the same information and that the knowledge doesn't just live with one person.
- Madeline Mueller: where is the budget for these positions coming from?
- Mitra Sapienza: some are coming from U-Fund and some are Categorical.
- Madeline Mueller: Awhile back we saw some positions were being funded directly from departments and courses were cut in order to fund coordinator positions. It was a straight drain on students to create these positions. Can we make it clear that it's not directly subtracted from department U-funds.
- Edie Kaeuper: confirmed that when funds are coming from the Chancellor's Office it is coming directly from the Chancellor's budget.
- Kimberly Keenan: I think it's a great idea to know what all the positions are but some of the things show a calendar in April/May. Geisce said the full schedule is open to students on April 17th. Shouldn't we be advertising these in the beginning of the year so we don't have issues coming up re: schedules? It might be good to

get people into these positions earlier so it doesn't mess up department loads. There is a perception of backroom dealing. Even with this document there is an irony that these positions are given a rubber stamp from a committee which just adds an extra layer. I think it's great but we need to keep working on it.

- Mitra Sapienza: Reassign time that connects with each position is listed on the spreadsheet that is attached.
- Kimberly Keenan: You said that you were going to update each of these positions every semester which seemed too ambitious. Put them out in August/September to inform people of when the positions are going to open again.
- Mitra Sapienza: corrected Kimberly that it would not be changed that frequently. We want to have guardrails and clarity but not be too prescriptive to that would lock people in. The way we do it now is after a coordinator position is opened by a supervising administrator or program lead coordinator, we bring this in front of the council. Then a hiring committee is created. We want to make sure coordinators are notified either before or at the time the departments are doing their scheduling. Ideally we'd announce the following Fall appointments in February.
- Kimberly Keenan: One point of advocacy... there was one year the administration did not want to fund faculty going to the Curriculum Institute. I'd like for the officers to bring this up in Collegial Consultation to advocate for faculty going to the CI.
- Please read through and make notes on the document directly.
- Lou Schubert: this implies that the college has its budget available to us on this timeline. In the past we are told that we have to wait for the budget. Is there a way to say we need this funding early? May 15th is when the revise will come through. Can we encumber first and then spend later? Maybe we should just ask for this funding before the May revise.
- Mitra Sapienza: we will keep this on our radar and make sure we keep coming back to that piece.

a) [Faculty Coordinator Job Description Template](#)

2. [ASEC DRAFT Budget and Planning Calendar](#)

C. [Resolution Recommending Honorary Paramedic Degree for Elizabeth Rose Maguire](#) (10 mins) – Dean Edie Kaeuper and Megan Corry (in accordance with https://archive.ccsf.edu/BOT/Administrative_Procedures/6/6.21_AP_Honorary_Associate_Degree.pdf)

- Megan Corry read letter about who Elizabeth McGuire was in the department. She was a CNA student who returned for the EMY

program. She led a group on opiate use disorder. She was very open with her own struggles with addiction and recovery. She died of an accidental overdose. She asked us to approve the request to award Elizabeth with an honorary degree.

- Motion to approve by Lisa Romano. Seconded by Chad Stephenson and Sheri Miraglia.
- Seconded by Chad Stephenson and Sheri Miraglia
- Katryn Wiese asked about whether there was a policy in place for this that we have to consider.
- Megan Corry affirmed.
- Edie mentioned that we are in compliance with the policy and the steps are to go to Chancellor, (done) ASEC (done) and then goes to the BOT in March. She stated that it hurts a department so badly when you lose a student with so much potential.
- Megan Corry stated that Elizabeth's father is also a PT faculty member in EMS and Fire Science.
- Approved by ACCLAMATION in celebration of Elizabeth Rose Maguire.
- Madeline Mueller asked to adjourn in Memory of Elizabeth Rose Maguire. Lou Schubert Seconded.

**Resolution 2023.02.08.7C
Maguire**

Honorary Paramedic Degree to Elizabeth Rose

Resolved, that the Executive Council approved [Recommendation for an Honorary Paramedic Degree to Elizabeth Rose Maguire](#).

Adopted by ACCLAMATION

VIII. Adjournment (5:00pm)