



City College of San Francisco

50 FRIDA KAHLO WAY • SAN FRANCISCO, CA 94112 • (415) 239-3000

SAN FRANCISCO COMMUNITY COLLEGE DISTRICT CITIZENS' BOND OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE PROP A 2001 / PROP A 2005 / PROP A 2020

MINUTES

WEDNESDAY, February 23, 2022

Via Zoom Video Conference

- 1. Call to Order:** A.J. Thomas (Chair), called the meeting to order of the Citizens' Bond Oversight Committee (CBOC) at 1:06 P.M. on February 23, 2022. In response to the COVID-19 state of emergency, the meeting was held via video conference.
- 2. Roll Call:** A quorum was established via roll call.
Members present: A.J. Thomas (Chair), Peter Gallegos, Christine Hanson, Shannon Lampkins-Jones, Linda Fadeke Richardson, Steven Tang, Han Zou, Thomas Havey (1:12 P.M.), Dennis Kelly (Vice Chair) (1:29 P.M.)
Members not present: Orlando Galvez, Rafael Musni
- 3. Approval of the Agenda for February 23, 2022:** Chair Thomas made a motion to amend "Sub-Committee" to "Working Group" in Agenda Item 7d (Thomas/Richardson). The motion to amend the agenda was approved via roll call vote.
Ayes: Thomas, Gallegos, Lampkins-Jones, Richardson, Tang, Zou (6)
Nays: 0
Abstentions: Hanson (1)

There was a motion to adopt the agenda as amended (Richardson/Gallegos). The amended agenda was approved via roll call vote.
Ayes: Thomas, Gallegos, Lampkins-Jones, Richardson, Tang, Zou (6)
Nays: 0
Abstentions: Hanson (1)
- 4. Resolution Permitting Online Meeting (AB 361):** There was a motion to adopt the Resolution continuing the Committee's authority to hold virtual meeting pursuant to AB 361 (Richardson/Tang). The resolution was approved via roll call vote.
Ayes: Thomas, Gallegos, Hanson, Lampkins-Jones, Richardson, Tang, Zou (7)
Nays: 0
Abstentions: 0

Note: Thomas Havey's vote was not counted as he was having difficulties with his audio.

BOARD OF TRUSTEES

DR. BRIGITTE DAVILA, PRESIDENT • JOHN RIZZO, VICE PRESIDENT

ALIYA CHISTI • SHANELL WILLIAMS • THEA SELBY • ALAN WONG • MALINALI VILLALOBOS, STUDENT TRUSTEE

DAVID MARTIN EdD, CHANCELLOR

5. Introduction/Welcome of Chancellor David Martin: Chair Thomas thanked Chancellor Martin for joining the meeting and asked him to introduce himself and share his vision.

Chancellor Martin was formerly the CCSF Chief Financial Officer and subsequently the interim Vice Chancellor of Finance and Administration from 2015 thru 2017. He is excited to engage with the CBOC and the broader campus community in his new role as Chancellor. The passing of the \$845 million Proposition A 2020 Bond Program is a testament to the amazing community support from San Francisco residents. Chancellor Martin reminded the CBOC members of the important role they have in reporting the actions of the District to the Community. He also reminded the members that San Francisco taxpayers thank them for taking on this responsibility and they can count on the support of District staff. Chancellor Martin also provided the following updates:

- The approval of the architect of record for the Diego Rivera Theater project occurred during the February 24th Board of Trustees Meeting.
- The Student Success Center project is also underway, with the proposed construction of the building at the Conlan Hall location. The District is looking to efficiently relocate the existing Conlan Hall employees, in order to start demolition and ultimately begin construction of the building in this calendar year. Several meetings have been held with various stakeholder groups to identify where to relocate the current employees of Conlan Hall.
- The District is also developing its five-year financial plan, which is important as the District reviews and envisions its facility project list, renovations, modernizations, and infrastructure needs of our campus. The five-year financial plan will be a part of the campus wide discussions and ultimately will connect with the work that the CBOC is doing to ensure that Prop A 2020 bond funds are spent in accordance with voter approved language.
- The seven-year comprehensive accreditation review process begins next year, and the District is preparing the Institutional Self-Evaluation Report (ISER) to submit to the accrediting agency. The ISER requires that the Administration is engaged in discussions with the Facilities Department to ensure that District's facilities meet the needs of its academic programs, student support requirements, and the mission of the District. The District is looking to finalize the ISER this fall. The Facilities section of the ISER is going to be important information and will connect with the work being done by the CBOC.
- The Facilities Master Planning and Oversight Committee are looking to schedule site visits as the District slowly brings students, faculty, and staff back to the campus. Chancellor Martin hopes that the CBOC members will attend these campus site visits to see the current state of the District's facilities, especially the facilities that are scheduled for significant modernization. He reminded the CBOC members that many of these facilities have been vacant for the last two years due to COVID.

Member Richardson welcomed Chancellor Martin and told him that she is looking forward to meeting him in person. She mentioned that she had the privilege of seeing first-hand the process that Chancellor Martin had to undergo to get the position, as she was part of the selection committee. Lastly, she conveyed her concerns to Chancellor Martin regarding the lack of action on Bayview-Hunters Point - 1550 Evans Campus.

Chair Thomas thanked Member Richardson for her comments. He reminded the CBOC members that they have exceeded the amount of time allotted for this Agenda item and that the CBOC has a packed agenda.

Member Hanson also welcomed and congratulated Chancellor Martin. She informed him that the Bond Purchase Order report that he originally put together at her request is being revived, and that the CBOC is getting caught up with the list of purchase orders from 2018 onwards.

Chair Thomas thanked Chancellor Martin and reminded him that he is always welcome to attend the CBOC meetings.

6. Approval of the Meeting Minutes for November 10, 2021: Member Richardson made a motion to amend

BOARD OF TRUSTEES

DR. BRIGITTE DAVILA, PRESIDENT • JOHN RIZZO, VICE PRESIDENT

ALIYA CHISTI • SHANELL WILLIAMS • THEA SELBY • ALAN WONG • MALINALI VILLALOBOS, STUDENT TRUSTEE

DAVID MARTIN EdD, CHANCELLOR

Agenda Item 2 by adding “Excused – Members not present: Linda Fadeke Richardson, Peter Gallegos.” (Richardson/Zou). The motion to amend the minutes was approved via roll call vote.

Ayes: Thomas, Gallegos, Hanson, Lampkins-Jones, Richardson, Tang, Zou (7)

Nays: 0

Abstentions: 0

Note: Thomas Havey’s and Dennis Kelly’s votes were not counted as they were having difficulties with their audio.

A public comment request was received. One member of the public spoke for one minute.

There was a motion to adopt the minutes as amended (Tang/Hanson). The amended minutes were approved via roll call vote.

Ayes: Thomas, Gallegos, Hanson, Kelly, Lampkins-Jones, Richardson, Tang, Zou (8)

Nays: 0

Abstentions: 0

Note: Thomas Havey’s vote was not counted as he was having difficulties with his audio.

Chair Thomas reminded the members of the compliance requirement that roll call votes must be captured for all online meetings. He thanked the members for being quick to unmute themselves.

- 7. Updates from the Chair:** To be responsive to the requests and questions that came from CBOC members from the previous meeting, Chair Thomas provided an update on the following:
- a. Independence of the Committee – Chair Thomas informed the CBOC members that this information can be found highlighted in the Meeting Packet (p.16).

Member Hanson: The lawyer, David Casnocha, works for the District and does not represent the CBOC.

Chair Thomas thanked Member Hanson for her comments and informed all participants that public comments will be taken after all updates have been provided.
 - b. Proposition A-2001/2005 Performance Audit Follow-up (Audit Letter) – Chair Thomas informed the CBOC members that all the relevant information regarding the Audit Letter can be found in the Meeting Packet (pp. 21-26).
 - c. Public Communication Access – Chair Thomas thanked Member Hanson and Staff for their contributions on this topic. If the public would like more information or to submit a public comment to the CBOC, an email address is provided on the CBOC website. The emails that are received are provided to the Chair, and distributed to the whole committee at their subsequent meeting. This prevents the CBOC from engaging in serial meetings. The public can provide comments on Agenda Items or Non-Agenda Items. Chair Thomas will provide updates to the rest of the committee in a timely manner and being careful not to engage in serial meetings.
 - d. Fiscal Year 2019-2020 Annual Report Appointment of Working Group – Chair Thomas thanked Members Zou and Tang and Vice Chair Kelly for volunteering to be on the working group and for drafting the Annual Report that will be reviewed at the next meeting.

Member Hanson: It’s my understanding that the process to volunteer for the working group requires an action item during a public meeting.

Chair Thomas: The review and approval of the Annual Report will be an action item at our next meeting.

BOARD OF TRUSTEES

DR. BRIGITTE DAVILA, PRESIDENT • JOHN RIZZO, VICE PRESIDENT

ALIYA CHISTI • SHANELL WILLIAMS • THEA SELBY • ALAN WONG • MALINALI VILLALOBOS, STUDENT TRUSTEE

DAVID MARTIN EdD, CHANCELLOR

Identifying the working group will facilitate the process in having a draft document to review, as opposed to the Committee working off of a blank page.

A public comment request was received. One member of the public spoke for one minute.

- 8. Public Comment on Non-Agenda items:** Chair Thomas opened the Public Comment for a period of 15 minutes and each speaker was allocated one minute to speak. One member of the public spoke. No other requests for public comment were received. There was a motion to close the public comment period and move to the next item on the agenda (Kelly/Lampkins-Jones).

Chair Thomas asked Mike Chegini to remind the participants how to submit public comment. Mike Chegini informed participants that public comments can be entered into the Chat or submitted to the email address that can be found on the CBOC website.

- 9. Bylaw Amendments Approved by Board of Trustees:** Vice Chancellor John al-Amin reviewed the amendments to the Bylaws that were approved by the Board of Trustees in December 2021.

- Section 5.4 Term – If establishing a new committee, members from the previous committee can serve in the new committee. The clock for the members term of service will restart. In other words, individuals are entitled to serve an additional three two-year terms for an additional six years.
- Section 5.5 Appointment – As the Chancellor’s designee, the Facilities and Operations Office receives the applications. Interim Vice Chancellor Alberto Vasquez reviews the applications and submits copies of all applications and attached documents to the Board and make recommendations to the Board
- Section 5.8 Authority of Members – The CBOC may establish sub-committees for any purpose
- Section 6.1 Meetings – The Committee shall meet at least four times a year.

Chair Thomas thanked Vice Chancellor al-Amin for the summary and asked for questions or comments from members.

Member Hanson: Has there be any discussion of using an MOU between the CBOC and the Board as opposed to going the Bylaw route?

Vice Chancellor al-Amin: We would be happy to take a look at the use of a MOU, but it is not common. Normally Bylaws are established given the legality of the committee and its nature in code. We will review and provide information back to the committee.

Member Richardson: Bylaws are very important and given the choice I will opt for Bylaws.

Chair Thomas thanked Vice Chancellor al-Amin.

A public comment request was received. One member of the public spoke for one minute.

- 10. Prop A 2001/2005 & 2020 Current Project Update:** Associate Vice Chancellor Alberto Vasquez provided a status update. Vice Chancellor Vasquez’s presentation is included in the Meeting Packet (pp. 34-45).

Chair Thomas thanked Associate Vice Chancellor Vasquez and asked for questions or comments from members.

Member Richardson: Thank you for the presentation and for referencing the Aircraft Maintenance Technology (AMT) program. Please describe the selection process for 1550 Evans. What is the decision-making process?

Associate Vice Chancellor Vasquez: I wasn’t involved with the College at that time, but I know that the prior leadership identified 1550 Evans as a potential project for Prop A 2020 bond and is a listed project. I believe there are discussions with the City to define the collaboration, but I have not been involved on the legal side of

BOARD OF TRUSTEES

DR. BRIGITTE DAVILA, PRESIDENT • JOHN RIZZO, VICE PRESIDENT

ALIYA CHISTI • SHANELL WILLIAMS • THEA SELBY • ALAN WONG • MALINALLI VILLALOBOS, STUDENT TRUSTEE

DAVID MARTIN EdD, CHANCELLOR

those discussions.

Member Richardson: Having a project on the list does not actually get it built. My other question is regarding crossover projects from 2001, 2005, and 2020 bonds. What are the projects and what is currently being done on them?

Associate Vice Chancellor Vasquez: There will be some examples when we get to Section 11b.

Member Richardson: Thank you.

Chair Thomas thanked Member Richardson for her question, and recognized Member Hanson.

Member Hanson: I believe one of the crossover projects is the Diego Rivera Theater. How many square feet is this project?

Associate Vice Chancellor Vasquez: In the architect selection process, the Request for Proposal identified a building up to 77,000 square feet. The square footage may decrease after the completion of the programming phase, but we needed to put a maximum number in there and 77,000 had been used in prior examples.

Member Hanson: Under Prop A, there is \$33 million listed as invested in the Performing Arts Education Center (PAEC) in the 2019 audit, but in this presentation and the next presentation, spending to date under Prop A 2005 only lists \$3 million. How did you guys come to that figure?

Associate Vice Chancellor Vasquez: Yes, we can clarify the numbers in Section 11c.

Chair Thomas thanked Member Hanson for her question, and recognized Vice Chair Kelly.

Vice Chair Kelly: Thank you for the report. You mentioned the difficulty with the pump with supply chain problems. Are there any other supply chain problems that we should be anticipating or should be aware of?

Associate Vice Chancellor Vasquez: Great question. Supply chain issues vary. We try to work with the contractor to order stuff in advance and store them on site. For example, the pump that I mentioned in the update, the designer specified the product, and we ordered it in advance, and it was sitting in our facility for three months before the contractor had access to it. This is not possible for a lot of products, but we knew there will be a long lead time with the uniqueness of the pump. The supply chain issue will vary on trade and will depend on what the contractor or subcontractor in stock and available.

Vice Chair Kelly: There are no contingencies planned for supply chain? I would also like to know if there's any kind of industry-wide concern about this becoming worse instead of better.

Associate Vice Chancellor Vasquez: Our process includes asking the contractor to submit documentation in advance, so they can order materials in advance of when they need it. We can only engage with the contractor after they're under contract and they're on board. The contractor can order materials in advance and store it, and we could process payments for that stored material. Yes, supply chain issues are a concern industry-wide because it's affecting any entity that's trying to build something in the United States. The supply chain is a worldwide issue. Yes, it's a concern for us as we take steps moving forward with our larger projects.

Chair Thomas thanked Vice Chair Kelly for his question. There were no additional questions or comments.

A public comment request was received. One member of the public spoke for one minute.

Chair Thomas thanked Associate Vice Chancellor Vasquez for his presentation and moved to the next item. Chair Thomas brought to the committee's attention that 30 minutes have been allocated for Section 11.

BOARD OF TRUSTEES

DR. BRIGITTE DAVILA, PRESIDENT • JOHN RIZZO, VICE PRESIDENT

ALIYA CHISTI • SHANELL WILLIAMS • THEA SELBY • ALAN WONG • MALINALI VILLALOBOS, STUDENT TRUSTEE

DAVID MARTIN EdD, CHANCELLOR

11. Program Financial Reports: Chair Thomas introduced Jeff Scogin and welcomed back Associate Vice Chancellor Vasquez.

- a. Follow Up on Non-Bid Purchase Order Report – Jeff Scogin stated that at the last meeting, the committee requested a report that listed purchase orders that did not go through the bidding process. There is no easy way to pull this information and non-bid needs to be better defined. The public procurement process includes hard bids, Request for Qualifications (RFQs), Request for Proposals (RFPs), CUPCAA thresholds, sole-source agreements, piggyback contracts, etc. Staff would like further clarification from the committee: clarity on the expectation and report frequency. Jeff Scogin reviewed the Purchase Order Report which is included in the Meeting Packet (p. 46).

Chair Thomas started the discussion. He mentioned that in his discussions with Staff this request is a significant investment in time and resources and ultimately cost to the District to produce this report, which is fine if the committee believes it's important.

Member Richardson: I think what I'm struggling with here, has to do with jurisdiction. I don't want to second guess the College and the Board of Trustees on their internal processes. If there is a correlation of the purchase orders to the Bond Program, then that should clarify the criteria for the report. Anyone that wants information on approved purchase orders can reference the Board of Trustees documentation.

Member Hanson: I found this information extremely helpful, especially during the period when much of the Prop A 2005 spending was for the umbrella project of the ADA and renovation when there was a lot of little projects being done. I wonder if there is a less expensive, less comprehensive way for us to view this information.

Member Kelly: I agree with Members Richardson and Hanson. This seems like a lot of information to request of the staff. Can we get a report by project that simply shows the total non-bid purchase orders?

Ann Kennedy: I would like to clarify one thing. What I believe I heard Member Hanson say is that the problem you've had in the past was seeing the expenditures broken out on a per project basis on what you referred to as an umbrella project. If I understood you correctly then we have a solution to that.

Member Hanson: Yes, that was something that, in that particular time, we found to be very helpful. Since then, there have been other costs that were coming in just under the bid threshold and without the non-bid purchase order list, we were not able to see the details of the expense.

Ann Kennedy: Thank you. There are ways we can address this need with the data we already have within the system.

Jeff Scogin: We are using the BMET software system to pull the data from the District's ERP system. This is a nightly process that imports all of the District's purchase order and expenditure items for reporting and for executive level management and tracking. With a click of a button, we can produce the first four columns and the last column of the sample report. The heavy lift is bringing the Board approval and RFP/RFQ/Bid Number into the system.

Chair Thomas: If I understand you correctly, everything except for the columns "Board Approval" and "RFP/RFQ/Bid Number" is actually a low lift and can be produced regularly pretty easily?

Jeff Scogin: That is correct.

Chair Thomas: Member Kelly does this answer your question?

BOARD OF TRUSTEES

DR. BRIGITTE DAVILA, PRESIDENT • JOHN RIZZO, VICE PRESIDENT

ALIYA CHISTI • SHANELL WILLIAMS • THEA SELBY • ALAN WONG • MALINALI VILLALOBOS, STUDENT TRUSTEE

DAVID MARTIN EdD, CHANCELLOR

Member Kelly: Yes, that does answer my question. I don't think we want this broad report that becomes a burden on staff. The level of reporting should be minimized so that the information is available without the depth because most of these items are not going to be questioned.

Chair Thomas attempted to have Member Havey speak but he was still experiencing technical issues. Chair Thomas read Member Havey's comments from the chat. "Since I'm new and trying to get up to speed on things, I'm not sure if a detailed list should be added to the annual report or not but I personally do like to see details of what decisions have been made by staff, other than when low bidders have been contracted with. Maybe a sub-committee can be formed to review the matter in question, in lieu of report from staff.

Chair Thomas: I think that is a good thought and more discussion on this topic with a working group might be ideal.

Member Hanson: What I had worked with was a leaner report, most items made sense. On the few items that I had questions on, I would ask the Staff. So maybe that might be the way to go.

Chair Thomas: It seems like there is a consensus that we do not want to have a report that requires huge Staff lift and there are some thoughts about a working group to determine if we need more details.

There was a motion to request that Staff produce the report that does not include the "Board Approval" or "RFP/RFQ/BID Number" columns (Vice Chair Kelly/Richardson). The motion was approved via roll call vote.

Ayes: Thomas, Gallegos, Kelly, Lampkins-Jones, Richardson, Tang, Zou, Havey (8)

Nays: 0

Abstentions: Hanson (1)

Note: Peter Gallegos' vote was not counted as he was having difficulties with his audio.

Jeff Scogin asked for clarification on the reporting period of the report to be produced for the next meeting.

Chair Thomas: I believe our discussion was specifically as it relates to the 2019 – 2020 fiscal year project report that we are working on; not a live tracking document per quarter.

- b. Fiscal Year 2019-2020 Project Update and Financial Report - Associate Vice Chancellor Alberto Vasquez provided a status update. Vice Chancellor Vasquez's presentation is included in the Meeting Packet (pp. 47-51).

Member Richardson: This is the kind of information that we need. It's self-explanatory and I like the way the information is formatted and that every item is segregated. This is the standard I would like to see. Well done. Thank you.

Member Hanson: Has there been an effort to apply the revenue from the Frog Project lawsuit towards the rebuilding of the Child Development Center?

Vice Chancellor Vasquez: We'd have to verify, but I think some of the funds were used for the relocation and temporary solution. The Child Care facility is named as a project in the Bond list it is just not in the design phase yet.

BOARD OF TRUSTEES

DR. BRIGITTE DAVILA, PRESIDENT • JOHN RIZZO, VICE PRESIDENT

ALIYA CHISTI • SHANELL WILLIAMS • THEA SELBY • ALAN WONG • MALINALI VILLALOBOS, STUDENT TRUSTEE

DAVID MARTIN EdD, CHANCELLOR

Member Kelly: Regarding your reference to the Facilities Master Plan on the presentation, what categories do you anticipate that being broken out to in the future?

Jeff Scogin: The categories and the labels that were used on that report tied directly to the district's accounting system. We looked at the purchase orders and expenditures that were active during that fiscal year, and they were related to design standards and CEQA compliance. There could be a very specific project created on Prop A 2020 to capture and daylight those expenditures, or if it was minor in nature staff may elect to code that against program-wide Project DW-098 – Program Administration Costs.

Member Kelly: Thank you very much and I second what Member Richardson said that this is a wonderful report and I appreciate it.

Chair Thomas: Thank you Member Kelly. I also really appreciate this report.

- c. Prop A-2001/2005 and 2020 Project Summary Report – Jeff Scogin reviewed the Project Summary Report with the Committee which is included in the Meeting Packet (pp 52-54). Jeff Scogin addressed Member Hanson's question from earlier in the meeting regarding the variance in expenditures listed for the Performing Arts Education Center (PAEC). He explained that Prop A 2001 and Prop A 2005 data imported into the system was from July 2018 forward. This is when the Bond program was rebooted as documented in Board items.

Member Hanson: I want to point out that the auditor does not make the distinction between the spending to date to the change in 2018. So, our documents are out of sync by about \$30 million, at least on one project. I don't know how we can reconcile that, but it seems to me that that's kind of an issue.

Chair Thomas: Member Hanson, to clarify, is this something that you would like to receive more information on?

Member Hanson: The expenditures to date do not match the auditors report and I think at some point we need to address it or explain it.

Chair Thomas: It does not seem like this is something that we can answer easily at this time, but we will try to get it, at the very minimum, some sort of answer together by next meeting.

There was motion to receive and file the reports as presented (Kelly/ Lampkins-Jones). The Project Summary Report was approved via roll call vote.

Ayes: Thomas, Gallegos, Hanson, Havey, Kelly, Lampkins-Jones, Richardson, Tang, Zou (9)

Nays: 0

Abstentions: 0

- 12. Future Meeting Schedule:** Chair Thomas informed the committee that they will receive a Doodle calendar invitation to identify a date for the next meeting. Although it has been mentioned that the committee consider having more frequent meetings, the default for this committee is to meet quarterly. Once the draft Annual Report is ready, it's up to the committee to decide if more frequent meetings are necessary.

- 13. Next Meeting Agenda Topics:** Chair Thomas reviewed the suggested topics for the next meeting. He reminded the committee that they are not required to review all these topics. There were no additional topics proposed by members of the committee.

BOARD OF TRUSTEES

DR. BRIGITTE DAVILA, PRESIDENT • JOHN RIZZO, VICE PRESIDENT

ALIYA CHISTI • SHANELL WILLIAMS • THEA SELBY • ALAN WONG • MALINALLI VILLALOBOS, STUDENT TRUSTEE

DAVID MARTIN EdD, CHANCELLOR

14. Adjournment: There was a motion to adjourn (Richardson/Vice Chair Kelly). The meeting to adjourn was passed unanimously. Meeting adjourned at 3:02 P.M.

Chair Thomas thanked everyone and wished the Working Group good luck.

BOARD OF TRUSTEES

DR. BRIGITTE DAVILA, PRESIDENT • JOHN RIZZO, VICE PRESIDENT

ALIYA CHISTI • SHANELL WILLIAMS • THEA SELBY • ALAN WONG • MALINALI VILLALOBOS, STUDENT TRUSTEE

DAVID MARTIN EdD, CHANCELLOR