



SUBSTANTIVE CHANGE PROPOSAL

Change in Mode of Delivery

City College of San Francisco
50 Phelan Avenue
San Francisco, California 94112

Submitted to

**The Accrediting Commission for Community and Junior Colleges
Western Association of Schools and Colleges**

Submitted by

**Dr. Arthur Q. Tyler
Chancellor**

February 6, 2014

Table of Contents

Required Substantive Change Proposal Elements:

A. Description of proposed change and rationale	1
B. Extended description of the program	2
C. Description of the Planning Process.....	3
D. Institutional Resources	5
E. Internal and External Approval of Program	12
1. Evidence of Approving from Faculty, Administration, Governing Board or Regulatory Agencies.....	12
2. Evidence Legal Requirements have been Met.....	12
3. Evidence of Governing Board Action Approving the Change	13
F. Evidence of fulfillment of Eligibility Requirements	13
G. Evidence of fulfillment of Accreditation Standards	13
Standard I: Institutional Mission and Effectiveness	13
Standard II: Student Learning Programs and Services	14
Standard III: Resources.....	15
Standard IV: Leadership and Governance	17
Appendix A: Program Details.....	18
Appendix B. Evidence List.....	22

A. Description of proposed change and rationale

Description. In 2008 City College of San Francisco submitted a Substantive Change Proposal documenting programs where students could earn 50% or more of the units via distance education. This proposal was accepted in early 2009.

Since that time, the College has crossed the 50% threshold set in the Substantive Change Proposal guidelines for several additional certificate and degree programs. This Substantive Change Proposal documents these additional programs. This report is to inform the Commission of these additional degrees and certificates. Details of the additional programs are included in Appendix A.

Relationship to Institutional Mission. The College's Mission Statement (01) states "Our primary mission is to provide programs and services leading to:

- Transfer to baccalaureate institutions
- Achievement of Associate Degrees in Arts and Sciences
- Acquisition of Certificates and career skills needed for success in the workplace
- Basic Skills, including learning English as a Second Language and Transitional Studies"

The continued development of distance education courses, and programs that can be largely met by taking courses via distance education, is directly related to the first three of these four areas. In particular, this substantive change proposal contains details about new ways in which students are able to use distance education courses to fulfill transfer general education and Associate Degree for Transfer requirements, along with career technical education-focused programs.

The College's Mission Statement goes on to state "City College of San Francisco belongs to the community and continually strives to provide an accessible, affordable, and high-quality education to all its students." A majority of students enrolled in Distance Education courses live in the City and County of San Francisco.

Rationale for Change. For many years City College of San Francisco offered distance education courses using televised instruction. The College continues to offer telecourses. In Fall 2000 the College developed its first online course. Since that time, more departments have employed varying amounts of distance education components in their courses. Some of the online courses are hybrid in nature, incorporating both face-to-face class sessions and distance education, while others can be completed fully online.

The rationales for increasing the College's distance education offerings are varied. In some instances, the nature of the course lends itself to a distance education mode. For example, distance education courses of a general education nature in the Art department have allowed students to use online repositories of images, rather than relying on in-class slides. In other cases, the flexibility of a distance education course has allowed us to accommodate students with widely varying schedules and challenging work-school-family commitments. Distance education courses have allowed us to continue to offer high quality coursework and make it accessible to a wide audience.

The determination to develop distance education modes of courses originates at the department level. Before a course is taught online, the instructor receives training in online pedagogy and the course is reviewed by two participatory governance committees.

B. Extended description of the program

All programs that are proposed to be offered via Distance Education are also offered through the face-to-face mode of instruction. There are no differences in the general education, major, or graduation requirements between the distance education and traditional versions of any program. The schedule of courses offered via distance education is developed at the same time that the schedule of face-to-face courses is developed, and there are no differences in the scheduling procedures.

City College of San Francisco has procedures in place to ensure that the rigor, breadth, objectives, learning outcomes and academic quality of courses and programs offered in the distance education mode meet the same standards as those offered in the traditional mode. Specifically, in accordance with California Code of Regulations, Title 5, Section 55206, the College's Curriculum Committee separately reviews and approves each course proposed for delivery via the distance education mode (04) to ensure the following criteria are met:

- Regular effective contact is maintained between instructor and students through methods including group or individual face-to-face meetings (including orientations and exams), telephone or email contact, online chat or other synchronous communications, or online message boards or other asynchronous communications.
- The instructional methodology, including assignments, evaluation, textbooks, and other instructional materials, are appropriate to the distance education mode and support the stated learning outcomes of the course.
- Appropriate measures are in place to ensure the academic integrity of students enrolled in distance education courses.

Every certificate program, including those proposed to be offered in the distance education mode, must be approved by the College's Curriculum Committee (05) and have a specific set of required courses.

Every degree program, including those proposed to be offered in the distance education mode, have the following curricular requirements (07):

- Major Requirement. Students must complete at least 18 units of coursework in a major that has been proposed by the department and approved by the Curriculum Committee. (05)
- General Education Requirement. City College of San Francisco has two general education patterns:
 - One pattern is used for Associate in Science and Associate in Arts degrees. This pattern follows the requirements of California Code of Regulations, Title 5, Section 55063, along with local general education requirements proposed by the College's Academic Senate. Students must complete courses in Communication and Analytical Thinking, Written Composition, Natural Sciences, Social and

Behavioral Sciences, Humanities, US History and Government, Health Knowledge and Physical Skills, and Mathematics.

- The other General Education pattern is used for the Associate in Science for Transfer and the Associate in Arts for Transfer degrees. Students completing those degrees must complete either the California State University General Education (CSU GE) pattern or the Intersegmental General Education Transfer Curriculum (IGETC) pattern.

Appendix A contains details on the list of programs offered in a distance education format.

C. Description of the Planning Process

1. Relationship to Institution's Planning, Evaluation, and Mission

The expansion of distance education offerings improves access to the College's education programs, in particular the following programs cited in the College's Mission Statement (01):

- Transfer to baccalaureate institutions
- Achievement of Associate Degrees in Arts and Sciences
- Acquisition of Certificates and career skills needed for success in the workplace

Expanding distance education opportunities is also consistent with the College's Vision Statement (02), which states that we are "Reaching out to and including all populations".

Finally, the appropriate expansion of distance education offerings is called out in the College's Strategic Plan (03), as a way to accommodate students who are unable to attend classes where they are offered.

2. Assessment of Needs and Resources

From 1995 to 2000, City College of San Francisco was a recipient of a Title III grant, one activity being "Increasing Student Success with Education Technology." Over 60 faculty participated in this grant. As a result of this success, the College institutionalized the Education Technology Office and the means to continue faculty training and course development using technology. This provided a technical support staff and an administrative support staff for program development. In Spring 2010 the College reorganized the Information Technology Division and as a result of this reorganization in Spring 2011 created the Educational Technology Department housed within Academic Affairs.

The College has provided ongoing institutionalized support for distance education, funding areas including release time for faculty developing distance education courses as well as release time for the Distance Education Coordinator and faculty peer support for faculty engaged in distance education.

In September 2013, the College adopted a Technology Plan covering the two-year period 2013-2015. This plan provides a vision for the use of information technology at the College, as well as a set of college-wide technology goals based on the CCSF Strategic Plan (26). Specific goals to support distance learning through the Educational Technology department, library, and counseling areas have been established in this plan. The needs and resources related to distance

education are also assessed in the annual program review for the Educational Technology department.

The number of distance education sections has grown, from 13 in Fall 2001 to over 150 per semester today (27).

3. Anticipated Effect of the Proposed Change on the Institution

The expansion of distance education courses has historically had a significant positive impact on class enrollment. Classes offered through distance education are typically filled prior to their face-to-face counterparts during registration. For example, in Fall 2013, average census enrollment across all credit courses was 26.1; for telecourses only, the average was 28.8, and for online courses, the average was 35.0.

The overall effect of the proposed change should be to allow more students access to courses and the completion of degrees and certificates.

4. Statement of Intended Benefits

The continued growth of distance education courses has increased access to courses. This expanded access benefits students who typically enroll in courses on campuses other than the College's main campus, in addition to students who would otherwise be unable to attend face-to-face classes. The intended benefit is to provide more opportunities for students to complete certificate and degree programs.

5. Description of the Preparation and Planning Process for the Change

To ensure that all courses offered in the distance education mode meet both City College of San Francisco's standards for quality as well as the requirements established by the California Code of Regulations, Title 5, faculty developers go through several steps.

Prior to beginning development of a distance education course, faculty submit an application to the College's Distance Learning Advisory Committee (DLAC) (08). The DLAC has established criteria and procedures involved in the selection of courses for distance education and recommends courses for development in the distance education mode. Further, the DLAC reviews applications from faculty developers and recommends reassignment units needed for that development.

California Code of Regulations, Title 5, Section 55206 requires that the College's Curriculum Committee separately review and approve courses to be offered via distance education. City College of San Francisco's Curriculum Committee has developed the Distance Education Addendum to be used for this separate review and approval (04). The Distance Education Addendum establishes expectations on the following areas:

- Regular effective contact is maintained between instructor and students through methods including group or individual face-to-face meetings (including orientations and exams), telephone or email contact, online chat or other synchronous communications, or online message boards or other asynchronous communications.
- The instructional methodology, including assignments, evaluation, textbooks, and other instructional materials, are appropriate to the distance education mode and support the stated learning outcomes of the course.

- Appropriate measures are in place to ensure the academic integrity of students enrolled in distance education courses.

Faculty members developing a distance education version of a course develop the Distance Education Addendum during this development process. The Distance Education Coordinator reviews the Distance Education Addendum prior to submission to the Curriculum Committee.

In addition to establishing procedures for the selection of courses for distance education and reviewing applications from course developers, the Distance Learning Advisory Committee provides a mechanism for representatives from Academic Affairs, Student Services and Information Technology Services to collaborate on the best ways to serve students engaged in distance education. The DLAC also recommends policies related to distance education instruction, especially in response to changes in state and federal regulations. For example, in early 2013 the DLAC reviewed and recommended to the Curriculum Committee the policy Regular Effective Contact for Distance Learning Courses.

Beyond the Distance Education Coordinator, the DLAC, and the Curriculum Committee, the San Francisco Community College District and the administration further support planning and implementation of distance education. In 2011, the College created the Educational Technology Department, combining the areas of distance education with overall college-wide technology training. In addition to providing faculty release time for the Distance Education Coordinator, developers of distance education courses, and faculty peer support, the College has provided the Educational Technology Department with its own instructional budget so that it can support the offering of distance education offerings as they are initially offered and grow.

D. Institutional Resources

1. Evidence of Adequate and Accessible Student Support Services

- Admissions.** The College's Admissions and Records office provides a number of services online, including application to the College via the online CCCApply system and online registration through the College's Web4 system. The College's Web4 system also provides a way for students to view their registration priority status, view placement results for Mathematics and English, view holds on registration, pay enrollment fees and/or set up a payment plan for fees, obtain unofficial transcripts, and order official transcripts. The Admissions and Records web site also provides online versions of forms for other typical student needs, including petitioning for certificates and degrees. (28)
- Orientation.** Students enrolled in distance education courses can come to an in-person orientation, or can attend an online orientation to the College. (30)
- Assessment.** Student placement in classes in English, Math, or English as a Second Language includes in-person placement testing. Placement tests are done either via a computerized assessment or a paper and pencil test. Students enrolled in distance education courses are able to use an online form to make an appointment for computerized assessments while the testing office is open. Students taking the paper and pencil exam come in during scheduled exam times, which are posted online (29).

Students who have already taken college courses or certain standardized tests, including California's Early Assessment Program or the SAT, may petition to waive the placement

assessment tests and get placed directly into English and Mathematics courses. In addition, certain students are able to exempt from the assessment step altogether. Forms for both of these processes are available on the Admissions and Records web site.

- d. **Counseling.** Students meet with a counselor to review the results of assessment exams and create an educational plan. Students enrolled in distance education courses can call in to make an appointment for a face-to-face meeting with a counselor. Counselors are available at the Ocean Campus and the Downtown, Civic Center, Chinatown/North Beach, Evans, John Adams, and Southeast Centers. The Student Services division maintains a web page of information about counseling services. (31)
- e. **Accessibility.** Disabled Students Programs and Services (DSPS) provides qualifying students with a range of services, including the identification of appropriate accommodations, help in establishing educational and career goals, and the use of coping strategies. Distance education students can access services in person, or can use email or telephone to work with DSPS counselors. Forms required for disability verification, testing accommodations, and other services are available online. (18)

DSPS operates two High Tech Centers, one at the Ocean Campus and one at the John Adams center, instructing students with disabilities in the use of adaptive computer technology and software. These labs support educational access for students with disabilities by teaching computer adaptations and providing instruction in computer skills that can be transferred to other computer labs. (19)

Accessibility of online courses to those students using adaptive technologies is of primary importance. The College's learning management system is section 508 compliant, and ensuring accessibility is embedded into the development process.

- f. **Course Materials.** Students can search for and purchase textbooks and other instructional materials for their distance education courses through the College bookstore's web site (32). In certain courses, textbooks are also available to rent or are available in a digital format. In addition, faculty can place materials on reserve at the library, and students can search online for those reserve materials.
- g. **Financial aid.** The College's Financial Aid Office has an extensive web presence, providing guidance, directions, forms, and other online resources for students enrolled in distance education courses (33). Students can complete the Free Application for Federal Student Aid (FAFSA) form online, and receive an award letter via their CCSF E-mail account indicating the amount and types of aid they are eligible to receive based on a full time enrollment assumption. Disbursement of financial aid funds can be done via direct deposit. The Financial Aid Office's web site also contains links for the California Dream Act, which provides financial aid for students who are not eligible to file the FAFSA.
- h. **Veterans.** The College's Veterans Services office provides online information for students enrolled in distance education courses who are veterans (34). Students can apply for Veterans Educational Benefits online, or can come to the College's Veterans Services office, located at the Ocean Campus, to apply for benefits and receive counseling and support.
- i. **Library.** The library provides students with services both in-person and online (35). Students are able to search the library's catalog of books and other materials online, and

can also use an online search to look for materials that faculty have put on reserve. The library offers several databases of articles from newspapers, journals, and magazines, as well as e-books that can be read online. The library also offers an inter-center loan service to move most circulating materials between center libraries on request, providing students enrolled in distance education courses a way to check out circulating materials at the center library that is most convenient to them.

In addition to providing access to instructional materials, the library offers a number of online workshops to assist student learning. Online workshops are offered in several subjects, including use of the library catalogs and periodical resources, web search techniques, appropriate ways to cite sources, and evaluation of sources to ensure quality information.

- j. **Learning management system training and support.** All distance education courses, with the exception of telecourses, use a common learning management system, *CCSF Insight*, based on the open-source Moodle system and hosted remotely (36). Students are provided with login information through their CCSF email account, and can view an introductory video and a quick start guide online. Students can access services to support their use of Insight through the Online Course Support Center, an outside vendor that provides both answers to frequently asked questions as well as a mechanism by which students can ask specific questions, getting responses seven days a week, 9AM to midnight. Students are also able to drop-in or call the Educational Technology department to receive one-on-one help.

In addition to direct student support in the learning management system, the College provides coursework to support students who are enrolled in online courses, or are contemplating enrolling in these courses. LERN 55, “Successful Online Learning”, is a one-unit course that provides instruction in the technology and study skills necessary to succeed in online courses. Topics include online course navigation, course-related computer competencies, self-directed learning, online communications, and study skills for online learning. (08) LERN 55 is, itself, an online course, and several sections are offered each semester in a short-term format. (09)

- k. **Learning Resources.** Students enrolled in distance education courses can access a number of resources operated by the Learning Assistance Center at City College of San Francisco’s Ocean campus, as well as the Mission and Chinatown/North Beach centers. Students can get face-to-face tutoring in a variety of subjects, and can review schedules of specific tutoring services online. The Learning Assistance Center is piloting a program to use Google Hangouts as a tutoring option. The Speech Communication Department is also exploring the use of Google Hangouts to provide support to students.

The College supports general computer needs of students enrolled in distance education by operating open access computer labs, including the Academic Computing Resource Center, which is open 51 hours per week during the semester (38). Other open computer facilities are readily available at our Ocean and Downtown campuses. There is limited open computer availability in the library facilities at our Mission, Southeast and John Adams campuses. Distance education students enrolled in courses in certain subjects are also able to access computer labs specific to their coursework, including labs operated by the English Department and Business Department.

1. **Student employment.** Students enrolled in distance education courses who wish to seek on-campus employment use the College’s Student Hiring Eligibility Process (20). Information about this process is available online, and the College operates an online job listing service to assist students in finding employment opportunities throughout the district. Some parts of the Student Hiring Eligibility Process must be completed in-person, notably, the I-9 Employment Eligibility Verification form.

2. Evidence of Sufficient and Qualified Faculty, Management, and Support Staffing

a. Faculty. Instructors who teach through distance education are subject to the same standards and scrutiny in hiring and evaluation as all other faculty at City College of San Francisco. The minimum standards for hiring are those specified by the California Community Colleges. Besides meeting minimum qualifications as established by the California Community Colleges, faculty desiring to teach online must complete a training program provided by the Educational Technology Department.

In 2012/13, close to 100 faculty taught online courses, and the majority of those faculty are full-time tenured. The number of faculty teaching online has steadily increased over the last several years. CCSF has not hired full-time probationary (tenure-track) faculty solely for the purposes of increasing the number of courses offered online, but has rather focused on training current faculty.

The faculty evaluation criteria are largely the same for faculty teaching online courses as for other courses. The San Francisco Community College District/American Federation of Teachers Local 2121 Collective Bargaining Agreement specifies a number of elements that are particular to instructors of online classes (11):

- The evaluation form used has two criteria specific to distance education instructors:
 - “Student-instructor contact is timely and appropriate”
 - “Course structure is consistent and easy to navigate”
- In addition, the student evaluation form used for faculty teaching distance education is different, most notably by substituting a question about responding to student inquiries promptly for a question about meeting and dismissing class on time.

b. Management. In 2013 City College of San Francisco’s Academic Affairs structure was reorganized. The Educational Technology Department, which has previously been under the Dean of Social and Behavioral Sciences, was placed under the Associate Dean of Instructional Support Services, a position that also supervises the College’s Library (13).

c. Support Staffing. City College of San Francisco employs several people in support of Distance Education courses, including:

- The Educational Technology Department, who are faculty reassigned to provide training and support in the technology tools, design, and pedagogy of online learning to faculty developing new online courses.

- A Distance Education Coordinator who provides continuity for maintaining an effective distance education program and who is proactive in monitoring learning technology trends in distance education, as well as changes in State and Federal regulations.
- Technical staff who support the computer servers and learning management system software and provide help for faculty.
- An Alternative Media Specialist who reviews newly-developed online classes, supports faculty teaching existing online classes, and supports students enrolled in online classes.

d. Support through Participatory Governance. The Distance Education Advisory Committee (DLAC), which is a subcommittee of the Academic Senate (14), supports distance education. The DLAC comprises of representatives from Academic Affairs, Student Development, and Information Technology Services, where they collaborate on the best ways to serve distance education students. The DLAC establishes the criteria and procedures involved in the selection of courses for distance education and recommends distance education courses for development. The DLAC reviews applications from online course developers and recommends reassignment units needed for that development. Additionally the committee recommends practices related to distance education instruction and issues and seeks and disseminates information regarding distance teaching and learning. DLAC monitors changes in state and federal regulations that impact distance education and recommends policies and procedures resulting from these changes.

3. Evidence of Professional Development for Faculty and Staff to Effect the Change

The Educational Technology Department provides professional development for faculty who are developing Distance Education courses as well as faculty who are taking over already-established Distance Education courses. All faculty teaching Distance Education courses at City College of San Francisco must complete training with the Educational Technology Department, even if they have experience teaching Distance Education at another institution.

Faculty who are developing Distance Education courses are released from some of their teaching load, and are trained on the pedagogy of converting a face-to-face course to online delivery by participating in the Online Teaching and Learning Course. Face-to-face workshops are required where faculty learn how to use the various tools in the Learning Management System. One-on-one meetings are required as faculty build content in the new online class. Final approval is done in collaboration with the developing faculty member, the Department Chair where the course is housed, and the Distance Education Coordinator. The process takes one to two semesters.

Faculty who are taking over already-established Distance Education courses participate in much of the same professional development. While there is not as much development work to do, faculty are still required to learn the Learning Management System and will review the pedagogy used in the initial course development.

Finally, the Educational Technology Department has ongoing professional development for faculty. Most recently, the department had a series of workshops in Fall 2013 to help faculty manage the transition work needed for an upgrade of the Learning Management System. Additionally, the department collaborated with the SLO Coordinator to offer workshops about the benefits of using the tools in the college's learning management system to gather assessment data.

4. Evidence of Appropriate Equipment and Facilities, Including Adequate Control of Off-Campus Sites

Library: Students enrolled in distance education courses are supported by the Library's extensive web presence, with an online catalog and online access to periodical databases and e-books.

In addition to online resources, the library offers a number of online workshops in several subjects, including use of the library catalogs and periodical resources, web search techniques, appropriate ways to cite sources, and evaluation of sources to ensure quality information.

Student Computer Labs: Students completing distance education courses can use one of several open computer laboratories or computers in a library to complete coursework for online classes. Open computer facilities are readily available at our Ocean and Downtown campuses. There is limited open computer availability in the library facilities at our Mission, Southeast and John Adams campuses. These general-usage labs offer internet access and office applications. Distance education students enrolled in courses in certain subjects are also able to access computer labs specific to their coursework, including labs operated by the English Department and Business Department.

Faculty Computer Resources: The Technology Learning Center Laboratory, located within the Educational Technology wing, serves as an open computer lab for faculty and staff as well as an area for training faculty. The lab includes 20 PCs and Apple computers with updated operating systems and software supporting online instruction. The lab includes a scanner and printer. Knowledgeable lab aides are available to work with faculty.

5. Evidence of Sustainable Fiscal Resources including the Initial and Long Term Amount and Sources of Funding

In July 2012, the California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office (CCCCO) and the Fiscal Crisis and Management Assistance Team (FCMAT) entered into an agreement for FCMAT to provide a fiscal review of the San Francisco Community College District on behalf of the CCCCCO. Part of this review was to identify recommendations that would enable the College to sustain financial solvency and maintain recommended reserve levels. FCMAT conducted a second review, in March 2013, on organization and staffing review of the finance and administrative office of the district. (21)

Both of the FCMAT reviews provided recommendations on ways to improve operations, and the College has acted on a number of these recommendations. The College has adopted a long-range model to ensure fiscal solvency and an appropriate funding of the Board Designated Reserve. The College has also improved the connections between planning and budget using program review and annual assessments. (22)

6. Evidence of a Comparative Analysis of the Budget, Enrollment and Resources; Identifying New or Reallocated Funds

Financial support for distance education courses uses the same process as all courses. Student demand for online sections is robust, and while the number of sections offered via distance education has been about 5% percent for the last six years, distance education courses represent about 9% of the College's full-time equivalent students (27). Funding for most distance education sections is included in the overall instructional budget provided to schools and

departments. The Educational Technology Department has a small budget to support offering newly-developed online classes.

7. Evidence of a Plan for Monitoring Achievement of the Desired Outcomes

Student learning is central to the mission and vision statements of the College (01) (02), and assessable Student Learning Outcomes (SLOs) and assessment processes are required of all new courses and programs (04) (05) (06), and are in place for existing College programs and courses (15). College faculty members develop all curriculum, which is reviewed by the College's Curriculum Committee for approval.

Students are informed of course-level learning outcomes in all classes on course syllabi (23). Students earn credit by achieving the stated learning outcomes of the course, regardless of the instructional delivery method. Program-level learning outcomes are available to students via the College Catalog, in either printed or online form. Program-level learning outcomes are aligned with the courses in that program, and the College's Curriculum Committee ensures that students are able to develop mastery of those learning outcomes, regardless of any program options they may take.

Faculty assess both course- and program-level learning outcomes and use assessment results to make improvements. Details of course- and program-level learning outcome assessment for all departments are visible on the College's SLO web site. Assessment results are integrated into the College's program review process, influencing departmental decisions on future goals and resource requests.

Course- and program-level learning outcomes are aligned in two ways. When a certificate or degree program is submitted to the Curriculum Committee for approval, departments must develop a matrix showing how the program-level outcomes are aligned with the courses. Departments show the progression of learning, from introduction of a learning outcome through its mastery, in this matrix. Alignment of learning outcomes is further enhanced as many departments use course-level assessment as a driver of program-level outcomes assessment. Information about course- and program-level assessment is published centrally at the College's SLO web site, and also locally through departmental assessment web pages.

All faculty members, including those that teach Distance Education courses, are evaluated regularly by their peers (11). Peer evaluation of faculty engaged in Distance Education includes evaluation of the content and instructional methodology of the course, as well as student evaluations.

8. Evidence of Evaluation and Assessment of Student Success, Retention, and Completion

Departments examine data on student success and retention as a part of the annual program review process (24). Departments have access to student success and retention information, which is disaggregated by various demographic factors. The data is examined and is used by departments in decisions about future directions for course and program offerings. In the program review form, departments are asked to provide an analysis of these data trends, as well as identify future plans and comment on progress on prior years' planning objectives.

College-wide completion and success rate data on student enrollment in distance education and face-to-face courses are presented below for the last four years:

Term	Completion Rate		Success Rate	
	Online	Face-to-Face	Online	Face-to-Face
Fall 2009	76%	84%	60%	71%
Spring 2010	80%	86%	62%	71%
Fall 2010	76%	86%	59%	71%
Spring 2011	78%	85%	59%	70%
Fall 2011	76%	85%	58%	70%
Spring 2012	80%	86%	62%	71%
Fall 2012	81%	86%	61%	70%
Spring 2013	76%	86%	60%	71%
Average	78%	86%	60%	71%

Source: CCCC Data Mart

E. Internal and External Approval of Program

1. Evidence of Approving from Faculty, Administration, Governing Board or Regulatory Agencies

All courses and programs offered by City College of San Francisco have been approved by the College's Curriculum Committee, the San Francisco Community College District's Board of Trustees, and the California Community College System Office. Since July 2013, the approval by the Board of Trustees has been completed by the appointed Special Trustee.

All courses taught in a distance education mode have been reviewed separately by the College's Curriculum Committee in accordance with California Code of Regulations, Title 5.

Documentation of approval for each course, program, and distance education mode is available upon request.

2. Evidence Legal Requirements have been Met

California Code of Regulations, Title 5, Section 55206 requires separate approval of distance education courses:

If any portion of the instruction in a proposed or existing course or course section is designed to be provided through distance education in lieu of face-to-face interaction between instructor and student, the course shall be separately reviewed and approved according to the district's adopted course approval procedures.

Curriculum Committee approval of the Distance Education Addendum is our mechanism to comply with this regulation.

3. Evidence of Governing Board Action Approving the Change

Since July 2013, the District's Governing Board has been set aside, and a Special Trustee has assumed its governance role. City College of San Francisco's Chancellor has reported to the Special Trustee that this Substantive Change Proposal is being developed in preparation for submission to the Accrediting Commission for Community and Junior Colleges.

As described in Section D, all resource allocation recommendations are vetted through the participatory governance system and submitted by the Chancellor to the Special Trustee for approval.

F. Evidence of fulfillment of Eligibility Requirements

Evidence of the Fulfillment of Eligibility Requirements were last submitted to the commission in the March 2013 Show Cause report. Since that time, the College has made significant improvements and changes to address the deficiencies noted in the Commission's July 2013 decision letter. This Substantive Change Proposal is one of the ways in which the College is working to address the deficiency noted for Eligibility Requirement #21 (Integrity in Relations with the Accrediting Commission).

G. Evidence of fulfillment of Accreditation Standards

In July 2013, the Commission issued a decision following the submission of the College's March 2013 Show Cause report and the findings of the team that visited the College on April 4-5, 2013. The July 2013 decision letter cited a number of Accreditation Standards that were not met by the College.

Accreditation standards that are particularly impacted by the proposed substantive change are addressed below.

Standard I: Institutional Mission and Effectiveness

I.A. Mission

City College of San Francisco's mission and vision statements clearly articulate the College's commitment to student learning. The latest revision to the College's mission statement occurred in October 2013. Both mission and vision statements are published online at the College's web site, as well as in the College Catalog and other publications. The mission and vision statements are reviewed annually, in accordance with District Policy BP 1.00 (16).

The College's mission statement provides focus on the primacy of student learning and achievement and the needs of the diverse community served by the College. It describes a focus on transfer to baccalaureate institutions, achievement of Associate Degrees, acquisition of certificate and career skills needed for success in the workplace, and basic skills. The vision statement emphasizes the community focus of the College, with commitments to teaching and learning, inclusiveness, and diversity. Together, the mission and vision statements form the core of the College's planning processes.

I.B. Improving Institutional Effectiveness

As a result of action in response to the July 2012 notice of Show Cause and the July 2013 notice of Closure, City College of San Francisco has implemented a number of processes to improve institutional effectiveness.

Evaluation of the annual program review system has been done annually through a survey available to the entire College community. Results of the survey and plans for improvement are made available through the Program Review web site (24) and are discussed through participatory governance at the Planning Committee. The College is also currently engaged in the development of an Educational Master Plan, which will outline the College's most important priorities and goals, thereby providing a continuing guide to the College's integrated planning, future actions, and decisions about the allocation of resources (25).

Standard II: Student Learning Programs and Services

II.A. Instructional Programs

All courses at City College of San Francisco are developed by faculty and approved by the College's Curriculum Committee, which also reviews and approves Distance Education Addenda for those courses that are proposed to be offered via distance education. Student Learning Outcomes for a course are consistent, regardless of the mode of delivery. The College has developed a timeline to update course outlines for all courses, so that, in time, all courses offered by the College will have course outlines that were updated and reviewed by the Curriculum Committee no more than six years ago.

In Spring 2014, the College is implementing the Curricunet curriculum management system. This system will further enable the College's ability to align course- and program-level Student Learning Outcomes and document assessment activities.

II.B. Student Support Services

City College of San Francisco provides a broad array of student support services to the diverse student population it serves. Student services include the formal matriculation process of admissions, placement, orientation, counseling and the development of an educational plan, and registration. All services are available face-to-face, and a large number are also available online, including application, orientation, registration, access to the College Catalog and Schedule of Classes, transcript requests, fee payment, some financial aid services, and textbook purchasing.

The College also provides services directed at historically underrepresented populations, through the Multicultural Student Retention programs and Extended Opportunity Programs and Services. Students can also take advantage of learning communities, such as MESA and the Puente Project, as well as an array of support services for veterans, homeless students, students exiting the foster care system, and formerly incarcerated students.

Areas in student development are committed to the assessment of learning outcomes as the basis of program improvement. In Spring 2013, 74% of counseling programs and 55% of other student service programs reported that they had ongoing closed-loop assessment of outcomes (15). As with instructional programs, student service areas must report on outcome assessment as a part of the annual program review process.

II.C. Library and Learning Support Services.

The library provides students with services both in-person and online. Students are able to search the library's catalog of books and other materials online, and can also use an online search to look for materials that faculty have put on reserve. The library offers several databases of articles from newspapers, journals, and magazines, as well as e-books that can be read online. The library also offers an inter-center loan service to move most circulating materials between center libraries on request, providing students enrolled in distance education courses a way to check out circulating materials at the center library that is most convenient to them.

In addition to providing access to instructional materials, the library offers a number of online workshops to assist student learning. Online workshops are offered in several subjects, including use of the library catalogs and periodical resources, web search techniques, appropriate ways to cite sources, and evaluation of sources to ensure quality information.

Standard III: Resources

III.A. Human Resources

For many years, City College of San Francisco has provided ongoing institutionalized support for distance education, funding areas including release time for faculty developing distance education courses as well as release time for the Distance Education Coordinator and faculty peer support for faculty engaged in distance education.

The College has also provided classified support for distance education, with positions supporting technical training, system administration, and administrative support.

Faculty members who teach courses in a distance education mode are regular members of the faculty of the appropriate department, hired using our standard hiring practices and meeting the state minimum qualifications for teaching in their field. In addition, faculty who are interested in teaching a course via distance education must first go through a one-semester training. This training covers not only the technical details of preparing a course for delivery via distance education but more importantly the pedagogy of online delivery. Faculty work with the Educational Technology Department including the Distance Education Coordinator and the Distance Learning and Teaching Specialist. Faculty teaching distance education are supported by the Educational Technology Department. The department provides workshops, open labs, and one-on-one sessions for faculty to enhance teaching and learning. A section of the College's website is dedicated to distance learning where students can find information about online readiness, a self-assessment, student support services, and frequently asked questions. The college continues to fund a class in successful online learning.

III.B. Physical Resources

The Educational Technology Department supports Technology Mediated Instruction and the Technology Learning Center. The department supports an open lab where faculty can use computers, scanners, software, and other learning resources to assist in the development of distance education coursework. The Technology Learning Center and Technology Mediated Instruction are in the same hallway. The Educational Technology Department provides on-going workshops for faculty on a variety of learning technologies including the College's learning management system. Workshops are offered both face-to-face and online. Additionally, the department collaborates with the Broadcast Media Arts Department in providing faculty with a

facility to record lectures for delivery in online classes. The department provides faculty teaching online with priority use of a dedicated classroom with access to learning technologies for student orientations, meetings, and exams.

III.C. Technology Resources

In September 2013, the College adopted a Technology Plan covering the two-year period 2013-2015. This plan provides a vision for the use of information technology at the College, as well as a set of college-wide technology goals based on the CCSF Strategic Plan (26). Specific goals to support distance learning through the Educational Technology department, library, and counseling areas have been established in this plan.

Distance Education courses use an online learning management system hosted by a third party vendor. The College uses the Moodle open source learning management system.

Server maintenance and support is managed by the Educational Technology Department, contractors, and by an authorized Moodle hosting partner. All systems are protected by the highest security measures including state of the art firewalls and intrusion-detection systems. The learning management system is on virtualized servers accounting for load balancing and stability. Back-ups are performed regularly.

While the vast majority of students pursuing Distance Education courses delivered via the Internet own their own home computers, it is possible for students to use one of several open computer laboratories or computers in a library to complete coursework for online classes. Open computer facilities are readily available at our Ocean and Downtown campuses. There is limited open computer availability in the library facilities at our Mission, Southeast and John Adams campuses.

All students who are enrolled in online courses at City College of San Francisco are given a secure account for access to the learning management system. Student accounts are generated based on enrollment information in the College's enterprise resource planning system, Banner. The use of a secure login and password that is unique to City College of San Francisco and that does not use any portion of any non-district issued form of identification reduces the risk of non-district information being compromised. Students accessing the learning management system affirm that they are the student who is enrolled, and understand and agree to follow the regulations regarding academic integrity as described in the Rules of Student Code of Conduct (36). The College adheres to the Family Educational Right to Privacy Act regarding the release of student information.

III.D. Financial Resources

City College of San Francisco provides a single learning management system for all online courses through the use of the open-source Moodle system and a contract for hosting of Moodle with Remote Learner. The College continues to fund faculty and classified positions in support of distance education. Funding for the programs noted in this Substantive Change Proposal, and for the College's distance education offerings in general, is from the College's general fund.

Standard IV: Leadership and Governance

IV.A. Decision-Making Roles and Processes

City College of San Francisco has a participatory governance system that features simple transparent structures, and seeks the experience and expertise of a full range of diverse stakeholders with processes grounded in solid practices and effective outcomes. Timely, evidence-based dialogs empower participants to initiate student-centered improvements in education and services and to promote effective institutional operations. The system promotes respect for and broad understanding of the recommendations that are made. The leadership of the college is committed to making recommendations and decisions free from undue or inappropriate influence. District policy codifies the processes for participatory governance at the College (17). The final participatory governance body is the Participatory Governance Council, which receives recommendations from other committees and makes a final recommendation to the Chancellor. The Chancellor is the College's chief executive officer, responsible for the leadership of the college, and reporting to the Special Trustee.

There are two committees that are essential to distance education: the Distance Learning Advisory Committee, and the Curriculum Committee. Both groups inform decision-making bodies on the establishment of distance education programs and courses, as well as ways to provide resources to support distance education. Additional guidance is provided by Teaching and Learning with Technology Roundtable, which provides a forum for District-wide discussion and collaboration on learning technologies including distance education. The Information Technology Advisory Committee regularly reviews the human and technology needs of the learning management system used for distance education.

IV.B. Board and Administrative Organization

In response to the Commission's July 2012 finding of Show Cause and the subsequent July 2013 decision, a number of changes in the Board and Administrative Organization of the College have taken place. The State Chancellor has named a Special Trustee to fulfill the decision-making role in lieu of the District's Board of Trustees. The Special Trustee ensures that the District's educational mission is being implemented, and also ensures the quality, integrity, and financial stability of City College of San Francisco.

City College of San Francisco has a permanent chief executive officer, appointed by the Special Trustee. Supporting the chancellor is the Academic Affairs division, led by the Vice Chancellor of Academic Affairs, which contains the Educational Technology Department. Participatory governance for the College culminates in the Participatory Governance Council. The Distance Learning Advisory Committee and Curriculum Committees are subcommittees of the Academic Senate. The Curriculum Committee has been established in accordance with Title 5 Section 55002.

Appendix A: Program Details

Detailed information about programs for which 50% or more of the credits are offered via distance education are included below.

Associate Degree for Transfer General Education Requirements

In response to the SB 1440 requirement to create Associate Degrees for Transfer, the college approved an alternate General Education pattern, where students need to complete either CSU General Education (CSU GE) or Intersegmental General Education Transfer Curriculum (IGETC) certification. Students pursuing either of those two patterns can complete well over 50% of the units in those patterns via distance education; however, both patterns require a science laboratory activity, which is only available face to face. The following tables provide details on these requirements.

CSU GE

AREA	EXAMPLE COURSE	
A: Communication in the English language and critical thinking (9 units, with one course from A1, A2, and A3)	A1: Oral Communication	SPCH 1A
	A2: Written Communication	ENGL 1A
	A3: Critical Thinking	ENGL 1B
B: Physical Universe and its Life Forms (9 units required with at least one course each from B1, B2 (at least one to contain a laboratory component identified in B3) and B4)	B1: Physical Science	CHEM 40
	B2: Life Science	ECOL 10
	B3: Laboratory Activity	
	B4: Mathematics/ Quantitative Reasoning	MATH 80
C: Arts, literature, foreign language and philosophy (9 units with at least one course in C1 and one course in C2)	C1: Arts	ART 104 ART 118
	C2: Humanities	CHIN 1A
D: Social political and economic institutions and behavior, historical background (9 units with courses to be selected from at least two disciplines)	D0: Sociology and Criminology	BCST 103
	D1: Anthropology	ANTH 20
	D2: Economics	ECON 1
	D3: Ethnic Studies	
	D4: Gender Studies	
	D5: Geography	
	D6: History	
	D7: Interdisciplinary Social or Behavioral Science	
	D8: Political Science, Government and Legal Institutions	
D9: Psychology		
E: Lifelong understanding and self-development		LERN 50
Total required units: 39	Total available via Distance Education: 39	

IGETC

AREA	EXAMPLE COURSE	
1: English Communication (3 courses, with one course from 1A, 1B, and 1C)	1A: English composition	ENGL 1A
	1B: Critical thinking	ENGL 1C
	1C: Oral Communication	SPCH 1A
2: Mathematical Concepts and Quantitative Reasoning (1 course)		MATH 80
3: Arts and Humanities (3 courses, with one course from 3A and one course from 3B. 9 units.)	3A: Arts	ART 104 CINE 18
	3B: Humanities	ENGL 1B
4: Social and Behavioral Sciences At least three courses from at least two disciplines or an interdisciplinary sequence. 9 units.	4A: Anthropology	
	4B: Economics	ECON 1
	4C: Ethnic Studies	
	4D: Gender Studies	
	4E: Geography	
	4F: History	
	4G: Interdisciplinary	
	4H: Political Science	
	4I: Psychology	PSYC 1
	4J: Sociology	BCST 103
5: Physical and Biological Sciences (Two courses, one Physical Science course and one Biological Science course; at least one must include a laboratory, 7-9 units)	Physical Sciences	CHEM 40
	Biological Sciences	ECOL 10
Total Required Units: 37-39	Total Available via Distance Education: 36	

Liberal Arts and Sciences Areas of Emphasis

In Spring 2008 the College created four general Areas of Emphasis that could be used by students to satisfy the major requirement of the Associate Degree. These Areas of Emphasis were created in response to the CCC State Chancellor's Office directive to update non-compliant transfer-oriented Associate Degrees.

In the time since the 2008 Substantive Change Proposal, the College has expanded its distance education offerings such that students can complete *all* of the units required for each of these Areas of Emphasis via distance education. Details are in the following table.

AREA OF EMPHASIS	SAMPLE COURSES	
Arts and Humanities (18 units, with at least one course in Arts and one course in Humanities)	Arts: ART 104 ART 118 ART 125A GRPH 21 MUS 27A	Humanities: CHIN 1A
Communication (18 units)	ENGL 1A ENGL 1B ENGL 1C	SPCH 1A SPCH 12 SPCH 20
Science and Mathematics (18 units, with at least one course in Science and one course in Mathematics)	Science: ASTR 1 ASTR 17 CHEM 40 PHYC 40 P SC 11	Mathematics: MATH 80
Social and Behavioral Sciences (18 units, with at least one course in Social Sciences and one course in Behavioral Sciences)	Behavioral Sciences: ANTH 20 BCST 103 HLTH 54 HLTH 221	Social Sciences: ECON 1 LGBT 5

Associate Degree Programs

DEPARTMENT	PROGRAM
Behavioral Sciences	Psychology AA-T Sociology AA-T Anthropology AA-T
Business	Accounting AS Administrative Support AS Finance AS
Computer Networking and Information Technology	CNIT: Cisco Networking AS CNIT: Computer Technical Support AS CNIT: Microsoft Windows AS CNIT: Network Security AS CNIT: Web Site Development Techniques AS CNIT: Wireless Networks AS
English	English AA-T
Health Education	Health Education AS
Speech Communication	Communication Studies AA-T

Certificate Programs

DEPARTMENT	PROGRAM
Business	Finance Office Technology
Computer Networking and Information Technology	Routing and Switching: Cisco
College-wide	CSU General Education IGETC
Health Education	Post-Prison Health Worker

Appendix B. Evidence List

01. [City College of San Francisco Mission Statement](#)
02. [City College of San Francisco Vision Statement](#)
03. [City College of San Francisco Strategic Plan, 2011-2016](#)
04. [City College of San Francisco Curriculum Handbook, Chapter 3, Course Outline Addenda.](#)
05. [City College of San Francisco Curriculum Handbook, Chapter 4, Majors](#)
06. [City College of San Francisco Curriculum Handbook, Chapter 5, Certificates](#)
07. [City College of San Francisco College Catalog, Associate Degree Graduation Requirements.](#)
08. [City College of San Francisco College Catalog, Learning Assistance course descriptions](#)
09. [City College of San Francisco Schedule of Classes, various semesters](#)
10. [Distance Learning Advisory Committee description](#)
11. [San Francisco Community College District/American Federation of Teachers Local 2121 Collective Bargaining Agreement, Article 9](#)
12. [San Francisco Community College District/American Federation of Teachers Local 2121 Collective Bargaining Agreement, Exhibit D](#)
13. Academic Affairs organizational chart (attached)
14. [Academic Senate Committee Chart](#)
15. [Summary of August 31, 2013 Outcomes Assessment Activities Reporting – Spring 2013 Review & Future Plans](#)
16. [San Francisco Community College District Policy Manual, Policy BP 1.00, District Vision And Mission Statement](#)
17. [San Francisco Community College District Policy Manual, Policy 2.07, District Policy On Participatory Governance](#)
18. [Disabled Students Programs and Services web site](#)
19. [Disabled Students Programs and Services High Tech Center web site](#)
20. [City College of San Francisco Student Jobs web site](#)
21. [CCSF Forward Accreditation Web Site, Key Documents](#)
22. [CCSF Forward Accreditation Web Site, Road Map](#)
23. [City College of San Francisco Faculty Handbook, Section 4.7](#)
24. [Program Review web site](#)
25. [Education Master Plan web site](#)
26. [City College of San Francisco Technology Plan 2013-2015](#)
27. [Educational Technology Department, Distance Learning Growth web page](#)
28. [Admissions and Records web site](#)
29. [Placement web site](#)
30. [Orientation web site](#)

31. [Counseling web site](#)
32. [City College of San Francisco Bookstore web site](#)
33. [Financial Aid web site](#)
34. [Veteran's Center web site](#)
35. [Library web site](#)
36. [CCSF Insight web site](#)
37. [Learning Assistance Center web site](#)
38. [Academic Computing Resource Center web site](#)

ACADEMIC AFFAIRS DIVISION

