# Standard I.C. Institutional Integrity

**I.C.1.** The institution assures the clarity, accuracy, and integrity of information provided to students and prospective students, personnel, and all persons or organizations related to its mission statement, learning outcomes, educational programs, and student support services. The institution gives accurate information to students and the public about its accreditation status with all of its accreditors. (ER 20)

# I.C.1. Evidence of Meeting the Standard

**Ensuring Clarity, Accuracy, and Integrity.** The College assures the clarity, accuracy, and integrity of information related to its Mission Statement, learning outcomes, educational programs, and student support services provided to students and prospective students, personnel, and all other individuals and organizations affiliated with the College. <sup>12</sup>

**Mission and Vision Statements.** The College's complete Mission Statement is available on its website under "About City College" and included in the College Catalog and Class Schedule.<sup>3 4 5</sup> In addition, key planning documents include the Mission and Vision Statements.<sup>6</sup>

**Educational programs and learning outcomes.** The College provides clear and accurate information on its educational programs, their respective learning outcomes, and student support services through print and online versions of its Catalog and Class Schedule.<sup>7 8</sup> Student learning outcomes also appear on all course outlines and syllabi and in the online class schedule.<sup>9</sup> The Community College Student Survey of Engagement (CCSSE) results show that 84.1 percent of students surveyed agree or strongly agree that it is clear what they are expected to learn.<sup>10</sup>

The Office of Instruction produces, updates, reviews for accuracy, and reprints the College Catalog annually (with an updated addendum as needed) and a Class Schedule each semester. <sup>11</sup> To improve the accuracy of the printed schedule, the College has recently

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> ACCJC Policy on Rights and Responsibilities of ACCJC and Member Institutions, Compliant (Source: Accreditation Reference Handbook July 2015)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> ACCJC Policy on Commission Good Practice in Relations with Member Institutions (Source: Accreditation Reference Handbook July 2015)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> CCSF Mission Statement on Website

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Screenshot of Mission Statement; Front Matter (Source: College Catalog, p.2)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Screenshot of Mission Statement in Class Schedule, p. 27 (Source: Mission Statement in Class Schedule, see p. 27)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> <u>Screenshot of Vision and Mission on EMP</u> (Source: <u>2014-2020 Education Master Plan</u>, page 6); <u>Screenshot of Vision and Mission on Technology Plan</u> (Source: <u>DRAFT 2015-2017 Technology Plan</u>, page 2); <u>Screenshot of RFP for Facilities Master Plan</u> (Source: <u>RFP for Facilities Master Plan</u>, page 3)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Programs and Courses (Source: College Catalog)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Learning Resources and Student Services, p.33 (Source: College Catalog)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Accessing Course Outlines and SLOs

<sup>10 2014</sup> CCSSE Custom Survey Items - Results, see question 7

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> List of College Catalog Addenda under "Catalog Archives"; 2015-16 College Catalog Addendum

developed and published an enhanced production timeline that better ties together the Curriculum Committee cycles with the schedule development and Catalog maintenance processes. Each semester, the Office of Instruction reviews, revises, and distributes this production timeline to academic deans and department chairs.<sup>12</sup>

Accurate and up-to-date information on the website. CCSF utilizes an annual, centralized process for reviewing updates through a partnership between Information Technology Services (ITS) and the Office of Institutional Development. ITS reviews all web pages and generates a list of those that have not been updated in a year or longer. The appropriate managers receive this list and review the web pages and make changes. All CCSF web pages now contain a footer that automatically indicates when a web page was last updated and by whom. 4

In addition, a link at the top of each web page ("Send to a Friend") allows individuals to notify ITS when a web page contains inaccurate or out-of-date information. When ITS receives a notice through this system, it forwards the notice to the page owner. <sup>15</sup>

**Accurate Information about Accreditation Status.** CCSF communicates its accreditation status to students and the public on the College website's accreditation page, which complies with the "one click" rule from the homepage, in the College Catalog, and in the Class Schedule. <sup>16</sup> <sup>17</sup> <sup>18</sup> <sup>19</sup> The status statement includes the Commission's address, telephone number, web address, and contact information for filing a complaint. <sup>20</sup> Staff check these documents annually, and additionally as needed, against the accreditation web page for accuracy as part of ensuring academic quality. The website also includes information for programmatic accreditation with information about how students can file complaints.

The accreditation web page also provides access to related documentation from 2009 to the present, including the following:

- Evaluation reports
- Substantive change proposals and action/approval letters (2009, 2014)
- Student Learning Outcomes Implementation Report (2013)
- Institutional follow-up reports (2013)
- Annual Reports (2010 present)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Schedule Production Timeline 2015-2016

<sup>13</sup> Spreadsheet containing list of web pages that have not been updated in a year or more and current status

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> See, for example, Student Development Website, Academic Affairs Website, or Fantastic Five Website

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Contact Us web page with instructions on how to report web issues; Send to a Friend Website

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> CCSF Accreditation Website

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Screenshot of Accreditation; Front Matter (Source: College Catalog, p. 2-3); Screenshot of Accreditation in Class Schedule, p. 27 (Source: Fall 2016 Class Schedule, p. 27)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> ACCJC Policy on Policy on Public Disclosure and Confidentiality in the Accreditation Process, Compliant

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Screenshot of Eligibility Requirement 20, Integrity with the Communication with the Public, Compliant, p.5 (Source: ACCJC Eligibility Requirements for Accreditation, p.5)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> ACCJC Policy on Rights and Responsibilities of ACCJC and Member Institutions (Source: Accreditation Reference Handbook July 2015)

• Annual Fiscal Reports (2010 - present)

The CCSF ALO reviews all Commission materials and shares the information with the College, students, and the public as appropriate.

#### I.C.1. Analysis and Evaluation

CCSF faculty, staff, and administrators assure the clarity, accuracy, and integrity of information through regular and robust assessment of College practices and procedures for written, printed, and electronic publications. The College efforts provide ample, clear, and correct information to the College community. The College governance and decision-making processes create and maintain respective procedures and communication protocols. All information about the College's accreditation status, College wide and programmatic, is correctly stated on the web and in print.

Response to Findings from the Restoration Evaluation Team/January 2015 Action. The Restoration Evaluation Report included the following comments related to this Standard:

While [the] institution communicates information to students, personnel, and the community, there is no process where posted information is verified for accuracy. CCSF relies on the individual department to verify that the posted information is accurate. Moreover, there is no formal procedure to request information to be posted to or deleted from the website. (2002 Standard II.A.6.c.)

The College has addressed this finding. As noted above, in addition to its standard annual review of the Catalog to which units contribute updates, the Office of Instruction has developed an enhanced production timeline that promotes greater accuracy in the information contained within the Schedule. Moreover, the College now has an annual, centralized process for website updates and provides an online mechanism for reporting the need for changes to websites. Web pages include a footer that indicates the last date it was updated.

**Conclusion.** The College meets Standard I.C.1.

**I.C.2.** The institution provides a print or online catalog for students and prospective students with precise, accurate, and current information on all facts, requirements, policies, and procedures listed in the "Catalog Requirements" (see endnote). (ER 20)

#### I.C.2. Evidence of Meeting the Standard

**Precise, Accurate, and Current Information.** City College of San Francisco provides a print and online College Catalog for students and prospective students with precise, accurate, and current information on all facts, requirements, policies, and procedures mentioned in Standard I.C.2. and outlined below. In addition to other information, the College Catalog contains:

#### 1. General Information

- Official Name, Address(es), Telephone Number(s), and Website Address of the Institution<sup>21</sup>
- Educational Mission<sup>22</sup>
- Representation of accredited status with ACCJC, and with programmatic accreditors, if any<sup>23</sup>
- Course, Program, and Degree Offerings including course offering frequency and program minimum time of completion<sup>24</sup> <sup>25</sup>
- Student Learning Outcomes for Programs and Degrees<sup>26</sup>
- Academic Calendar and Program Length<sup>27</sup> <sup>28</sup>
- Academic Freedom Statement<sup>29</sup>
- Available Student Financial Aid<sup>30</sup>
- Available Learning Resources<sup>31</sup>
- Names and Degrees of Administrators and Faculty<sup>32</sup>
- Names of Governing Board Members<sup>33</sup>

# 2. Requirements

- Admissions<sup>34</sup>
- Student Tuition, Fees, and Other Financial Obligations<sup>35</sup>
- Degrees, Certificates, Graduation and Transfer<sup>36</sup>

# 3. Major Policies and Procedures Affecting Students

- Academic Regulations, including Academic Honesty<sup>37</sup>
- Nondiscrimination<sup>38</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Front Matter, see p. II

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Front Matter, see p. III

<sup>23</sup> Overview of the College, see pp. 2-3

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Course and Program Offerings

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Degree Requirements

<sup>26</sup> Sample Program SLO for Degree in French

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Academic Calendar

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Screenshot of Program Length for Administration Justice Certificate, p. 71 (Source: Program Length, see, for example, p. 71)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Academic Freedom Statement, see p. 446

<sup>30</sup> Student Financial Resources

<sup>31</sup> Student Learning Resources

<sup>32</sup> Names and Degrees of Administration and Faculty

<sup>33</sup> Screenshot of Governing Board Members, p.VI (Source: College Catalog, see p. VI

Admission to the College

<sup>35</sup> Screenshot of Enrollment Fees, pp. 19-21 (Source: Enrollment Fees, see pp. 19-21)

<sup>36</sup> Graduation; Transfer Information, p. 55

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Academic Policies and Procedures

<sup>38</sup> Screenshot of Equal Opportunity Statement, p. XI (Source: College Catalog, p. XI)

- Acceptance and Transfer of Credits<sup>39</sup>
- Transcripts<sup>40</sup>
- Grievance and Complaint Procedures<sup>41</sup>
- Sexual Harassment<sup>42</sup>
- Refund of Fees<sup>43</sup>

## 4. Locations or Publications of Other Policies<sup>44</sup>

As mentioned in Standard I.C.1., to ensure accuracy of the College Catalog, the Office of Instruction annually produces, updates, reviews for accuracy, and reprints the College Catalog. Each year, the owners of each section of the College Catalog (e.g., Library and Learning Resources, Financial Aid Office) review their respective sections, and the Office of Instruction incorporates all reported changes into the next printed version of the College Catalog. Additionally, when the College updates its policies, the Office of Instruction updates the appropriate sections of the College Catalog. A Policy Update document in the online College Catalog highlights these changes. <sup>45</sup> The Office of Instruction captures additional changes beyond policies in a Catalog Addendum. <sup>46</sup>

## I.C.2. Analysis and Evaluation

The Catalog meets the express expectations and requirements listed in Eligibility Requirement 20 and serves as the most complete and organized, one-stop source of information about the College and its programs and services. The College uses easy-to-read, user-friendly language. Staff are available to translate the contents for English language learners. The Catalog and its contents are regularly assessed, evaluated and updated to reflect regulatory, board policy, and administrative procedures changes.

# Response to findings from the Restoration Evaluation Team/January 2015 Action Letter. The Posteration Evaluation Penant included the following comments related to this Standard:

The Restoration Evaluation Report included the following comments related to this Standard:

Ensure the catalog is updated regularly and on time, and that all required information is included in the catalog. (2012 Standard II.B.2.)

The College has addressed this finding as described above. The self-evaluation process led to the identification of several changes needed in the Catalog in order to meet this Standard. The Office

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> Screenshot of Acceptance and Transfer of Credit, see p. 452 (Source: College Catalog - Academic Policies and Procedures, pp. 452)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> <u>Screenshot of Transcript</u>, pp. 451-454 (Source: <u>College Catalog - Academic Policies and Procedures</u>, pp. 451-454)

<sup>41</sup> Screenshot of Complaint Procedures, p.430 (Source: College Catalog - Rules and Regulations, see pp. 430)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> Sexual Harassment, see pp. 429-430, 438, and 442

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> Screenshot of Refund of Fees, page 20-21 (Source: 2016-17 Catalog - Admission to the College)

<sup>44 2016-17</sup> College Catalog - Academic Policies and Procedures

<sup>45 2015-16</sup> College Catalog Policy Update

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> See, for example, the <u>2015-16 College Catalog Addendum</u>

of Instruction implemented these changes to ensure the completeness and accuracy of the Catalog.

Conclusion. The College meets Standard I.C.2.

**I.C.3.** The institution uses documented assessment of student learning and evaluation of student achievement to communicate matters of academic quality to appropriate constituencies, including current and prospective students and the public. (ER 19)

## I.C.3. Evidence of Meeting the Standard

**Documented Assessment of Student Learning.** The College communicates matters of academic quality to appropriate constituencies through documented assessment of student learning via the SLO website, <sup>47</sup> regular emails, <sup>48</sup> faculty-led assessment reporting <sup>49</sup> including summary assessment reports, <sup>50</sup> assessment training workshops coordinated by our SLO team, <sup>51</sup> course-level assessment data in program review, <sup>52</sup> and Flex day materials used by departments, schools, and divisions to discuss student learning progress and improvements. The College community and the public can also access assessment information online through SLO assessment reports and Program Reviews. <sup>53</sup> <sup>54</sup> <sup>55</sup> <sup>56</sup> Departments also post assessment information to their web pages. <sup>57</sup> <sup>58</sup>

**Evaluation of Student Achievement.** Annually, the Office of Research and Planning analyzes the Student Success Scorecard data using the detailed, underlying files provided by the State Chancellor's Office. <sup>59</sup> The Assessment Planning Team proposes annual benchmarks to the Academic Senate for recommendation on credit achievement data in addition to institutional effective indicators (or aspirational goals) on student performance and outcomes. <sup>60</sup> Research staff incorporate trends and analyses into a College-wide Dashboard and presents this to the Board. In addition, the link is displayed on the College's website homepage. <sup>61</sup>

48 SLO Communication site

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> SLO Website

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> SLO assessment

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> Summary assessment reports

<sup>51</sup> SLO Professional Development

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> Fall 2015 Program Review Course SLO Assessment Question

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> SLO assessment reports archives web page

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> GELO Area B report

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>55</sup> Program Review Archives web page; CurricUNET Viewing Public Assessments Instructions

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> CurricUNET public assessment component; CurricUNET Viewing Public Program Reviews Instructions

<sup>57</sup> Sample department assessment website-- FORL

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> Instructional Department Details

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>59</sup> 2015 Scorecard data

<sup>60</sup> Institution-Set Standards for Credit Achievement Data; CCSF Aspirational Goal-Setting Web Page

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>61</sup> Dashboard on the College's homepage, and on Research web page

The Dashboard provides a visual and accessible four-page overview that includes data on "College Resources and Student Access" including Credit and Noncredit headcount, average class size, Full-Time Equivalent Students (FTES), and productivity ratios. Measures for "Student Achievement and Success" include units taken, units successfully completed, transfer and degrees. Basic Skills sequences, transition from Noncredit to Credit, and CTE completion are also included. A link on the Dashboard provides access to disaggregated achievement data.

Some examples of how the College actively uses documented assessment of student learning are the Institutional Learning Outcomes (ILOs) and General Education Learning Outcomes (GELOs) assessment reports. The Academic Senate SLO committee creates these reports and shares them with many other committees for assistance with vetting and implementing suggested actions, including the Assessment Planning Team subcommittee of the Planning Committee. Large numbers of faculty contribute, through their individual course assessments and in dialogue and surveys at All-College Flex Days, to the assessment analysis, refinements of ILO and GELO language, and the analytical findings included in the final reports. These reports are shared in multiple venues across the College including the Planning Committee and the Academic Senate as well as published, and available to the public, on the College's SLO web site. <sup>62</sup> In addition, by sharing the results widely, the College promotes the use of the assessment findings in multiple improvement planning venues such as Program Review and the College's Technology Plan.

#### I.C.3. Analysis and Evaluation

Considerable evaluative data and reports are publicly available online through the SLO, Research and Planning, and Program Review websites relevant to student learning and achievement and to program and institutional quality more generally. Public and private access for both Program Review and SLO reporting of SLO and achievement data for each program/area is available online. The Dashboard provides an overview of institutional effectiveness and links to disaggregated data.

Student achievement, success and learning data are regularly reported, analyzed, and displayed for outside granting agencies, the federal and state government, the public, and students. These data are made available through prominent links on the College's website and intranet. The College regularly reviews and makes available to the public information on the progress of CCSF students.

**Conclusion.** The College meets Standard I.C.3.

\_

<sup>62</sup> Dashboard for ILO and GELO assessment with links to reports

**I.C.4.** The institution describes its certificates and degrees in terms of their purpose, content, course requirements, and expected learning outcomes.

# I.C.4. Evidence of Meeting the Standard

**Description of Certificates and Degrees.** The College clearly describes all degrees and certificates in the College Catalog (online and in print). Faculty discipline experts use the Curriculum Handbook to develop curriculum, programs, and degrees that clearly identify the purpose, content, course requirements and expected learning outcomes of the stated programs, and to meet any relevant state regulations. Once reviewed and approved by the Curriculum Committee and approved by the Board of Trustees, the information about certificates and degrees goes into the next Catalog. The Office of Instruction follows a production timeline for the Class Schedule and the College Catalog that includes a process to ensure accuracy. Students enrolled in distance education (DE) programs receive information about the institution's degrees and certificates through the online Catalog and Schedule. Department web pages serve as another access point for degree and certificate information. <sup>64</sup>

In the most recent Community College Survey of Student Engagement (CCSSE), 92 percent of respondents "strongly agreed" or "agreed" that the expectations are clear as to what they are expected to learn upon completion of their degree, certificate or program (removing "N/A" responses). Less than 2 percent of students "strongly disagree" with this statement. 65

## I.C.4. Analysis and Evaluation

The College Catalog contains a complete description of all degree, certificate, and award requirements which is available also via the College website. The College annually examines the accuracy and currency of the Catalog. The College committees create brochures and an ancillary program literature.

**Conclusion.** The College meets Standard I.C.4.

**I.C.5.** The institution regularly reviews institutional policies, procedures, and publications to assure integrity in all representations of its mission, programs, and services.

## I.C.5. Evidence of Meeting the Standard

**Regular Review of Policies and Procedures to Ensure Integrity.** A key function of the Board of Trustees is to review institutional policies and procedures as needed. The College carries this out through an ongoing cycle of review. <sup>66</sup> This process takes place within the College's established governance process, involving all constituent groups in a manner

109

<sup>63</sup> Online College Catalog - Program and Courses

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>64</sup> Department web pages - Program and Certificate information

<sup>65</sup> Screenshot of CCSSE, 2014, p. 26 (Source: CCSSE, 2014, p 26)

<sup>66</sup> Board Policy 1.02 - Powers and Duties of the Board

consistent with their responsibilities and rights as specified in Board Policy 2.07, the PGC Operational Guidelines on Participatory Governance, and Board Policy and Administrative Procedure 2.08 on Collegial Governance. 67 68 In concert with these policies and procedures, the College has codified the roles, responsibilities, and processes related to the development of policies and procedures in the Roles, Responsibilities, and Processes Handbook (RRP Handbook). The charts and narratives within the RRP Handbook apply to changes in existing policies and procedures as well.<sup>69</sup>

**Review of Publications Ensuring Integrity.** The College annually reviews and updates its publications, such as the College Catalog and the Class Schedule, to ensure that current and future students receive accurate information about the College vision, mission, programs, and services. As with policies and procedures, the College incorporates any changes in the College vision, mission, programs, and services into its publications.

For example, Department Chairs, Deans and faculty review their respective sections of the College Catalog (e.g., Library and Learning Resources, Financial Aid, AA-T Programs). 70 Curriculum Committee actions trigger changes for the next Catalog issue with updated program and course information, addition of new courses, course changes, or course deletions.

When the Office of Instruction receives notification of approved new certificate or degree programs after the College Catalog has been published, it includes this information in the online College Catalog addendum.

The production cycle for each printed schedule includes a review by College constituents to ensure accuracy, currency, and completeness. To enhance the accuracy of the printed Class Schedule, the College has recently developed and published an enhanced production schedule that better syncs the Curriculum Committee cycles with the Schedule development and Catalog maintenance processes.

#### I.C.5. Analysis and Evaluation

CCSF has a system of Board policies, administrative procedures, and College practices that it reviews regularly through the Participatory Governance process.

**Conclusion.** The College meets Standard I.C.5.

<sup>67</sup> Board Policy 2.07 City College of San Francisco District Policy on Participatory Governance

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>68</sup> AP 2.07; BP & AP 2.08

<sup>69</sup> RRP Handbook

<sup>70</sup> Curriculum Committee

**1.C.6.** The institution accurately informs current and prospective students regarding the total cost of education, including tuition, fees, and other required expenses, including textbooks, and other instructional materials.

# I.C.6. Evidence of Meeting the Standard

**Total Cost of Education.** In accordance with federal financial aid and the California Student Aid Commission requirements, the College provides a link to a "Cost of Attendance" web page that links to a detailed PDF information sheet outlining the annual costs of attending CCSF for a range of student conditions. These conditions include students residing at home, students residing away from home, and resident students (of California) as compared to non-residents. The information sheet also includes estimates on the cost of textbooks, fees, and other required expenses. The College updates this information sheet annually. As a further step, and to comply with Title IV regulations, the College provides a link (active as of Spring 2016) to the "Net Price Calculator" that compares the cost of an education at City College of San Francisco with that of other community colleges in the State of California. The control of the community colleges in the State of California.

The Registration section of Admissions and Records/Registration services, listed under Student Services, provides students access to information about tuition and fees. <sup>74</sup> <sup>75</sup> <sup>76</sup> <sup>77</sup> This information is broken down into California residents, non-California residents, and International students. It also spells out for students "Additional Fees" such as the student health fee, student activities fee, and instructional materials fees. A range of tuition, fee, and other educationally related expense information can also be found under Financial Aid. <sup>78</sup>

Additionally, the Schedule of Classes and course syllabus also communicate the cost of materials fees to students. Board Policy 6.13 (Instructional Materials and Instructional Materials Fees) communicates the College's policy on materials fees.<sup>79</sup> 80

#### I.C.6. Analysis and Evaluation

The institution informs current and prospective students regarding the total cost of education, including tuition, fees, and other required expenses (such as textbooks and other instructional materials in multiple locations) and includes the federally required "Cost of Attendance" document on the Financial Aid website.

**Conclusion.** The College meets Standard I.C.6.

<sup>71</sup> Total Cost of Attendance web page

<sup>72</sup> Cost of Attendance sheet

<sup>73</sup> Net Price Calculator Web page

<sup>74</sup> Registration Web page

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>75</sup> Admissions and Records/Registration Web page

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>76</sup> Student Services Web page

<sup>77</sup> Tuition and Fees Web page

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>78</sup> Financial Aid Web page

<sup>79</sup> Screenshot of Class Schedule Front Matter, Tuition and Fees - see p. 14 (Source: Class Schedule Front Matter, Tuition and Fees, p.14)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>80</sup> BP 6.13 - Instructional Materials and Instructional Materials Fees

**I.C.7** In order to assure institutional and academic integrity, the institution uses and publishes governing board policies on academic freedom and responsibility. These policies make clear the institution's commitment to the free pursuit and dissemination of knowledge, and its support for an atmosphere in which intellectual freedom exists for all constituencies, including faculty and students. (ER 13)

## I.C.7. Evidence of Meeting the Standard

The institution has established and published clear policies and procedures that promote honesty, responsibility and academic integrity for all constituencies.<sup>81</sup>

Board Policy 6.06 (Academic Freedom) states that:

The District is unequivocally and unalterably committed to the principle of academic freedom in its true sense which includes freedom to study, freedom to learn and freedom to teach and provide educational professional services to students.

#### And:

Faculty cannot, however, expect academic freedom to be unlimited, for the right to exercise any liberty implies a duty to use it responsibly. Academic freedom does not give faculty freedom to engage in indoctrination. Nor can faculty invoke the principle of academic freedom to justify nonprofessional conduct.<sup>82</sup>

In addition to being posted on the Board of Trustees web page, this policy appears in the print and online Catalog.<sup>83</sup>

#### I.C.7. Analysis and Evaluation

CCSF takes academic freedom very seriously, and the administration supports that free inquiry. The College's policies and procedures concerning academic freedom are clear and public. Board policies and procedures strongly encourage an atmosphere supportive of academic freedom. The importance of academic freedom is fundamental to the culture of the College (Eligibility Requirement 13).

**Conclusion.** The College meets Standard I.C.7.

<sup>81</sup> Screenshot of Eligibility Requirements 13 on Academic Freedom, p.4 (Source: ACCJC Eligibility Requirements for Accreditation, p.4)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>82</sup> BP 6.06

\_

<sup>83</sup> College Catalog: p 446 Academic Freedom

**I.C.8.** The institution establishes and publishes clear policies and procedures that promote honesty, responsibility and academic integrity. These policies apply to all constituencies and include specifics relative to each, including student behavior, academic honesty and the consequences for dishonesty.

# I.C.8. Evidence of Meeting the Standard

Policies and Procedures that Promote Student Integrity and Academic Honesty. Board Policy 6.11<sup>84</sup> (Rules of Student Conduct) ensures that the College has a well-defined "rules and regulations governing student behavior along with applicable penalties for their violations." These take the form of Board Policy 5.16 and Administrative Procedure 5.16a (Standards of Student Conduct), which set forth expectations for student behavior and academic honesty. Administrative Procedure 5.16b (Student Discipline) communicates the disciplinary consequences for violating the Standards of Student Conduct. 85 86 87

Further student code of conduct information is also posted on the Student Affairs and Wellness web page under Student Conduct.<sup>88</sup> Information on student conduct and discipline also appears in the College Catalog.<sup>89</sup>

CCSF has processes in place to ensure that the student who registers for an online class is the student who participates and completes the class. Board Policy 6.18 and Administrative Procedure 6.18 both identify CCSF's compliance with the commission policy on student authentication. 90 91 Additionally, a link to the Student Code of Conduct is in the log-in block of the learning management system. 92

For faculty teaching online courses, the Distance Education Addendum requires the completion of a section on Distance Integrity before a course is approved by the Curriculum Committee for online delivery. <sup>93</sup> Best practices are shared with faculty teaching distance learning. <sup>94</sup> The Resource Center for Distance Learning faculty contains information about student authentication. <sup>95</sup>

<sup>84</sup> Board Policy 6.11 - Rules of Student Conduct

<sup>85</sup> Board Policy 5.16 - Standards of Student Conduct

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>86</sup> Administrative Procedure 5.16A - Standards of Student Conduct

<sup>87</sup> Administrative Procedure 5.16B - Student Discipline

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>88</sup> Student Conduct

<sup>89</sup> Screenshot of Student Conduct and Discipline, pp. 436-439 (Source: College Catalog - College Rules and Regulations, see pp. 436-439)

<sup>90</sup> B.P. 6.18 Student Authentication

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>91</sup> A.P. 6.18 Student Authentication

<sup>92</sup> Login page for Insight

<sup>93</sup> Distance Learning Chapter in Curriculum Committee Handbook

<sup>94</sup> Best Practices by WCET

<sup>95</sup> Information about Resource Center for Distance Learning Faculty

## Policies and Procedures that Promote Responsibility and Integrity for College

**Employees.** Board Policy 1.18<sup>96</sup> (Institutional Code of Ethics) establishes expectations for employees in relation to ethical behavior. This Board policy defines ethical behavior as, "fair, honest, straightforward, trustworthy, unbiased, and unprejudiced." To maintain this, employees are responsible:

- To provide and protect student access to the educational resources of the College;
- To protect human dignity and individual freedom, and assure that students are respected as individuals, as learners, and as independent decision-makers;
- To protect students from disparagement, or arbitrary judgment;
- To keep foremost in mind at all times that the College exists to serve students;
- To develop a climate of trust and mutual support;
- To foster openness by encouraging and maintaining open communication;
- To encourage, support, and abide by the written Board Policies and Administrative Procedures of City College of San Francisco; and
- To challenge unethical behavior in a timely manner.

Board Policy 1.17A (Governing Board Code of Ethics) outlines all ethical standards that governing board must adhere to as sitting members. <sup>97</sup> Finally, Board Policy 1.19 (Conflict of Interest) states that no trustee, officer or employee shall use his or her position to influence a district decision in which he or she has economic gain.

#### I.C.8. Analysis and Evaluation

Board policies and administrative procedures ensure that the CCSF maintains an institutional code of ethics that applies to all constituent groups. Conditions of violations of the codes are clearly stated and published on the College's website, student materials, and the Faculty Handbook. Consequences for violations are stated.

**Conclusion.** The College meets Standard I.C.8.

**I.C.9.** Faculty distinguish between personal conviction and professionally accepted views in a discipline. They present data and information fairly and objectively.

#### I.C.9. Evidence of Meeting the Standard

Faculty distinguish between personal conviction and professionally accepted views in their discipline and present data and information fairly. CCSF has memorialized this through Board policy, the faculty collective bargaining agreement, the Faculty Handbook, and the College Catalog. The faculty evaluation process, which includes student evaluations, and a

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>96</sup> BP 1.18

<sup>97</sup> BP 1.17A

student grievance process, also speak to these distinctions, ensuring that faculty maintain the highest standards.

**Policy and Procedures.** Board Policy 6.06, Article 8 of the collective bargaining agreement, the Faculty Handbook, Section 4.1, and the College Catalog affirm that academic freedom is indispensable to teaching in institutions of higher education, but also acknowledges academic freedom is not intended to further the personal views or values of the individual teacher. <sup>98</sup> <sup>99</sup> <sup>100</sup> <sup>101</sup> Faculty are entitled to freedom in the classroom to discuss their subject, but academic freedom carries duties and responsibility to adhere to the highest standard of critical inquiry and analysis.

**Faculty Evaluation.** To ensure and maintain professional integrity, the College regularly evaluates faculty on their professionalism, course content, and classroom presentation. Faculty evaluations indicate whether instructors are selecting appropriate course material and teaching with objectivity and scholarly inquiry. Faculty peers evaluate if the course syllabus accurately reflects the course outline of record.

**Student Evaluation.** Student evaluations of faculty enable students to report their perceptions of faculty objectivity. Student evaluation results and comments are reviewed by a faculty peer evaluations and discussed with the faculty member as part of the evaluation process. Students evaluate faculty on 19 different measures. The following questions are relevant to this Standard:

- 3. Does the instructor seem to have adequate knowledge of the subject area of this course?
- 5. Does the instructor respect your efforts and opinions as an individual?
- 18. Does the instructor show respect for all racial, sexual, religious, and political groups?

**Student Complaint and Grievance Process.** Students who feel a teacher has exceeded the limits of academic freedom and other issues may file a complaint with the faculty's department chair or the Office of Student Wellness and Affairs. Students can access information about how to file a grievance or complaint through the Student Development website. <sup>103</sup>

<sup>98</sup> Board Policy 6.06

<sup>99</sup> Screenshot of Article 8 of the collective bargaining agreement on academic freedom, p. 12 (Source: AFT Local 2121 Agreement, p12)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>100</sup> Screenshot of Academic Freedom in Faculty Handbook, Section 4.1, p. 49 (Source: Faculty Handbook Section 4.1, p. 49)

<sup>101</sup> Academic Freedom in College Catalog, p. 446

<sup>102</sup> Faculty Evaluations

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>103</sup> Student Grievance

#### I.C.9. Analysis and Evaluation

Board policies, the collective bargaining agreement, the College Catalog, and the Faculty Handbook communicate the responsibility of faculty to teach fairly and objectively, while supporting the right of faculty to express diverse viewpoints.

Faculty evaluations, which include student evaluations, and the student complaint process provide mechanisms to ensure faculty meet the standard in their teaching to distinguish between personal conviction and professionally accepted views in a discipline.

**Conclusion.** The College meets Standard I.C.9.

**I.C.10.** Institutions that require conformity to specific codes of conduct of staff, faculty, administrators, or students, or that seek to instill specific beliefs or worldviews, give clear prior notice of such policies, including statements in the catalog and/or appropriate faculty and student handbooks.

# I.C.10. Evidence of Meeting the Standard

City College of San Francisco is a public institution that promotes the acceptance and exploration of diverse perspectives and philosophies. Conformity to specific codes of conduct or policies that seek to instill specific beliefs or worldviews do not apply to the College community.

#### I.C.10. Analysis and Evaluation

As a public institution of higher learning, the College does not require specific codes of conduct nor does it seek to instill particular beliefs or worldviews.

**Conclusion.** The College meets Standard I.C.10.

**I.C.11.** Institutions operating in foreign locations operate in conformity with the Standards and applicable Commission policies for all students. Institutions must have authorization from the Commission to operate in a foreign location.

#### I.C.11. Evidence of Meeting the Standard

Not applicable. The College does not have any international campuses.

## I.C.11. Analysis and Evaluation

Not applicable.

**I.C.12.** The institution agrees to comply with Eligibility Requirements, Accreditation Standards, Commission policies, guidelines, and requirements for public disclosure, institutional reporting, team visits, and prior approval of substantive changes. When directed to act by the Commission, the institution responds to meet requirements within a time period set by the Commission. It discloses information required by the Commission to carry out its accrediting responsibilities. (ER 21)

# I.C.12. Evidence of Meeting the Standard

The Institution Agrees to Comply with All ACCJC Requirements. Per Board Policy 1.3:

The Chancellor shall ensure the District complies with the accreditation process and standards of the Accrediting Commission of Community and Junior Colleges and of other District programs that seek special accreditation. <sup>104</sup>

In its 2006 Self Evaluation, 2012 Self Evaluation, and in all subsequent follow-up reports, the College has met Standard IV.A.4. (pre-2014) and Eligibility Requirement 21. 105

The College has made extraordinary efforts to comply with ACCJC requirements and has completed a series of rigorous reports in the process, in addition to regular Annual and Fiscal Reports<sup>106</sup>:

- Institutional Self-Study Report (December 2011)<sup>107</sup>
- Special Report (October 2012)<sup>108</sup>
- Show Cause Report and Closure Report (March 2013)<sup>109</sup>
- Substantive Change Proposal Change in Location (February 2014)<sup>110</sup>
- Substantive Change Proposal Change in Control (February 2014)<sup>111</sup>
- Substantive Change Proposal Change in Mode of Delivery (February 2014)<sup>112</sup>
- Eligibility Report<sup>113</sup>
- Institutional Self Evaluation Report in Application for Restoration Status (October 2014)<sup>114</sup>

<sup>104</sup> Board Policy 1.33 - Accreditation Eligibility Requirement 21

<sup>105 2006</sup> Accreditation Visiting Team Report; 2012 Accreditation Visiting Team Report

<sup>106</sup> Other Reports Archive

<sup>107</sup> Institutional Self-Study Report (December 2011)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>108</sup> Special Report, October 2012

<sup>109</sup> Show Cause Report, March 2013

<sup>110</sup> Substantive Change Proposal - Change in Location, February 2014

<sup>111</sup> Substantive Change Proposal - Change in Control, February 2014

<sup>112</sup> Substantive Change Proposal - Change in Mode of Delivery, February 2014

<sup>113</sup> Eligibility Report, July 2014

<sup>114</sup> Institutional Self Evaluation Report in Application for Restoration Status

The College has submitted all reports in a timely fashion.

**Response to Commission's Direction to Act.** In July of 2012, and in all subsequent reporting requirements, CCSF has been working to improve on the function and educational experience for the CCSF student body, faculty, staff, administration, the community, and all residents of San Francisco based on recommendations and findings from the ACCJC. With each report mentioned above, the College has developed and followed through on a series of action plans designed to coordinate improvement efforts. This Institutional Self Evaluation serves as evidence of the changes the College has made to fully meet the Accreditation Standards.

**Disclosure of Information.** In accordance with ACCJC requirements, City College of San Francisco provides easy "one-click" access to all current and prior accreditation information.<sup>115</sup>

## I.C.12. Analysis and Evaluation

The College agrees to comply with all reasonable and fair requirements set forth by the Commission, responds appropriately and in a timely fashion when directed to act, and discloses all information on its accreditation status and with other pertinent information related to accreditation.

Conclusion. The College meets Standard I.C.12.

**I.C.13.** The institution advocates and demonstrates honesty and integrity in its relationships with external agencies, including compliance with regulations and statutes. It describes itself in consistent terms to all of its accrediting agencies and communicates any changes in its accredited status to the Commission, students, and the public. (ER 21)

#### I.C.13. Evidence of Meeting the Standard

Honesty and Integrity with External Agencies. The College advocates and demonstrates honesty and integrity in its relationship with ACCJC through communications and reports. It also demonstrates honesty and integrity in its relationships with its program accreditors, including: The California Commission on Peace Officer Standards and Training, The Federal Aviation Administration, The American Culinary Federation, the American Culinary Federation Education Foundation, The Commission on Dental Accreditation, The Joint Review Committee on Education in Radiologic Technology, the California Association of Alcohol and Drug Educators, The California State Fire Marshal's Office of State Fire Training, The Commission on Accreditation for Health Informatics and Information Management, The Commission on Accreditation of Allied Health Education Programs, The

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>115</sup> Accreditation Web page

California State Board of Registered Nursing, and The Board of Vocational Nursing and Psychiatric Technicians. 116 117 118 119 120

In addition, the College exhibits honesty and integrity in its relationships with key agencies such as the California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office (CCCCO) and the U.S. Department of Education. In both instances, the College submits a variety of data. Management Information System (MIS) data is the primary source data that the CCCCO uses for the Data Mart and Student Success Scorecard, and the U.S. Department of Education uses MIS for the Integrated Postsecondary Education Data System (IPEDS). The Banner Renewal Advisory Group (BRAG) ensures that data is accurate and timely. BRAG is a committee of "data managers" who each have responsibility for particular areas heavily involved with both CCSF's Banner implementation as well as MIS reporting. 121

The College Describes Itself in Consistent Terms to all Accrediting Agencies. The College's communications with ACCJC and annual and fiscal reports demonstrate that the College describes itself in consistent terms to the Commission. 122 123 124 125 The deans with oversight of the areas that have additional accreditors review all documents that the programs prepare for those accreditors and ensure that the description of the College (including its accreditation status) are consistent. 126 127

Communicates Changes in Accreditation Status. The College has kept students, the rest of the College community, and the public informed of changes in its accreditation through its accreditation website and email list and in publications such as the College Catalog and Class Schedule. 128 129 130 131

Accreditation Reference Handbook July 2015)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>116</sup> CCSF-ACCJC Communications Website

<sup>117</sup> CCSF-ACCJC Communications Website Archive

Reports to ACCJC Website

<sup>119</sup> CCSF Accreditation Self Evaluation Archive

<sup>120</sup> Screenshot of Eligibility 21 Compliant, p.5 (Source: ACCJC Eligibility Requirements for Accreditation, p.5)

<sup>121</sup> Banner Renewal Advisory Group Website

<sup>122</sup> Compare, for example, the 2016 Annual Report to the 2015 Annual Report

<sup>123</sup> CCSF Other Reports to ACCJC

<sup>124</sup> CCSF-ACCJC Communications Website

<sup>125</sup> CCSF-ACCJC Communications Website Archive

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>126</sup> ACCJC Policy Policy on Commission Good Practice in Relations with Member Institutions, Compliant (Source:

Accreditation Reference Handbook July 2015)

127 ACCJC Policy on Rights and Responsibilities of ACCJC and Member Institutions, Compliant (Source:

<sup>128</sup> CCSF Accreditation Website

<sup>129</sup> Accreditation Listserv Archive

<sup>130</sup> College Catalog (see p. 2-3)

<sup>131</sup> Screenshot of Accreditation on Class Schedule, p. 27 (Source: Fall 2016 Class Schedule (see p. 27)

## I.C.13. Analysis and Evaluation

The College demonstrates integrity, honesty, and consistency in its communications with its accreditors and other agencies and discloses information about its accreditation status and any changes thereof. The College complies with the policies related to public disclosure of information related to accreditation, programs and services.

Conclusion. The College meets Standard I.C.13.

**I.C.14.** The institution ensures that its commitments to high quality education, student achievement and student learning are paramount to other objectives such as generating financial returns for investors, contributing to a related or parent organization, or supporting external interests.

### I.C.14. Evidence of Meeting the Standard

City College of San Francisco is a public institution of higher learning that does not seek to generate financial returns for investors, contributing to a related or parent organization, or supporting external interests. Many of the Board policies and employee handbooks on ethics and institutional integrity mentioned in other parts of this Standard are manifestations of the College's commitment to putting high-quality education, student achievement, and student learning above any larger financial gain. Ensuring that student achievement and a focus on the quality of education provided to students is at the core of the College's mission and are reflected in the Board Goals and College Priorities. Much discussion at the College revolves around prioritizing a high-quality education and student success. The College mission and priorities clearly prioritize student learning and outcomes.

A broad range of documents including the Board Policy 1.19 (Institutional Code of Ethics), Board Policy (1.17A Governing Board Code of Ethics), Board Policy 1.17B (Governing Board Responsibilities), Board Policy 1.18 (Statement on Conflict of Interest), and Board Policy 1.22 (Audit Committee Guidelines) describe and define both a commitment to student learning and a prohibition of a range of behaviors including conflict of interest activities and financial, ethical, behavioral, and personal workplace activities that constitute violation. <sup>133</sup> <sup>134</sup> <sup>135</sup> <sup>136</sup> <sup>137</sup> Employee handbooks and negotiated contracts include references to both prohibited behavior and conflicts of interests.

120

<sup>132</sup> College Mission and Board Goals & College Priorities

<sup>133</sup> Board Policy 1.18 Institutional Code of Ethics

<sup>134</sup> Board Policy 1.17A Governing Board Code of Ethics

<sup>135</sup> Board Policy 1.17B Governing Board Responsibilities

<sup>136</sup> Board Policy 1.19 Statement on Conflict of Interest

<sup>137</sup> Board Policy 1.22 Audit Committee Guidelines

When seeking grant funding from public agencies or private foundations, the College utilizes a list of criteria and approval process that ensure that the purpose of the grant is aligned with the College mission and vision. 138 139

# I.C.14. Analysis and Evaluation

The College is deeply committed to ensuring that the provision of a high-quality education, student achievement and student learning are paramount to other objectives such as generating financial returns for investors, contributing to a related or parent organization, or supporting external interests.

**Conclusion.** The College meets Standard I.C.14.

Standard I.C. Changes and Plans Arising out of the Self Evaluation Process

Goal	Associated Action(s)	Person(s) Responsible	Completion Date	Outcome
Ensure that all publications contain accurate and up to date information (Standard I.C.1.)	Develop enhanced production timeline for the Class Schedule	Associate Vice Chancellor, of Instruction - Enrollment Management & Instructional Support Services	August 2015	Information in Class Schedule is as accurate and up to date as possible
,				
Enhance accuracy of the printed Schedule				
(Standard I.C.5.)				
Ensure that web pages are accurate and up to date	Develop annual, centralized process for website updates.	Associate Vice Chancellor, Institutional Development Chief Technology Officer	Annual, centralized process: Initiated Spring 2016 Reporting web pages: Spring 2016 Footer: Spring 2016	Website is as accurate and up to date as possible, although information is fluid
(Standard I.C.1.)	Clarify the process by which individuals can report problems with web pages.			
	Add a footer to the bottom of each web page that indicates when the page was last updated and by			

121

<sup>138</sup> Grant Criteria Assessment Form

<sup>139</sup> Grant Approval and Preparation Process

Ensure College Catalog includes all requisite information. (Standard I.C.2.)	Update information in the front part relating to frequency of course offerings (default) and then update course offerings that were contrary to default throughout catalog.  Add minimum time to completion for all programs.  Update instructions for transferring credit.	Office of Instruction	May 2016	Catalog contains all required information to ensure clear communication to students regarding frequency of course offerings, minimum time to completion, and transferring credit.
Ensure students have complete information regarding the annual cost to attend CCSF in compliance with Title IV regulations (Standard I.C.6.)	Link to "Net Price Calculator" that compares the cost of an education at City College of San Francisco with that of other community colleges in the State of California	Office of Financial Aid	Spring 2016	Students have accurate information regarding the cost of attendance; compliance with Title IV regulations

The College has no plans to report for Standard I.C. beyond those that are part of the College's regular quality improvement cycles.