Standard II.B. Library and Learning Support Services

II.B.1. *The institution supports student learning and achievement by providing library, and other learning support services to students and to personnel responsible for student learning and support. These services are sufficient in quantity, currency, depth, and variety to support educational programs, regardless of location or means of delivery, including distance education and correspondence education. Learning support services include, but are not limited to, library collections, tutoring, learning centers, computer laboratories, learning technology, and ongoing instruction for users of library and other learning support services. (ER 17) CW IIC, IIC1*

II.B.1. Evidence of Meeting the Standard

The College supports student learning through the Library and Learning Resources Department and a variety of other learning support services. Each department examines the quantity, currency, depth, and variety of its services through Program Review, which includes the assessment of learning, success, and usage data (see also the response to Standard II.B.2.).[1]

Library and Learning Resources Department (LLR). City College of San Francisco's Library and Learning Resources Department supports the programs of the College, the learning and success needs of its diverse student population, and instructional and other faculty by providing a rich variety of resources as well as instruction in information competency. Importantly, it offers services at all Centers throughout the District and online as one of seven core services the College has identified as critical to offer at all sites (see also Standards II.B.3. and II.C.).[2] The LLR communicates its goals and purpose through a mission statement posted on its website, in key locations throughout the library, and on library literature and advertising.[3]

CCSF has established Board policy that clearly identifies the College's commitment to fostering academic success and attainment of learning through information competency.[4] The administrative procedure reflects LLR's mission.[5]

The LLR Department provides three essential categories of services: Library Collections, Information Competency Instruction, and Computer Labs and Learning Technology, as described below. In addition, library orientations and tours are available in person at all locations. An Interactive Walking Tour is also available for students to independently become familiar with the resources, services, and facilities at the Rosenberg Library.[6]

---

[1] Fall 2015 Library and Learning Resources Program Review; Fall 2015 Learning Assistance Center Program Review; Fall 2015 English Department Program Review

[2] Library and Learning Resources offers services at all Centers throughout the District and online

[3] CCSF Library and Learning Resources Mission Statement

[4] CCSF Board Policy BP 6.24 (Library Services)

[5] CCSF Administrative Procedure AP 6.24 (Library Services)

[6] Library walking tour

Library collections. Library collections support the curriculum needs of students and faculty. The LLR Department develops and manages library collections based on curriculum needs, usage data and other related factors.[7] To help maintain the currency of the collections, the LLR provides access to online resources including e-books, streaming video, and online journals. Almost half of the CCSF book collection consists of e-books which are added and weeded on an ongoing basis. For print collections, the liaison librarians order most materials through the College's book distributor's online ordering system. The College offers a wide variety of collection formats including print, periodicals, audiovisual, databases, streaming video, and e-journals.[8] [9]

In accordance with the LLR Collection Development Policy, librarians review physical materials for currency and appropriateness to weed out obsolete materials. The depth of the College's collections are appropriate for the programs offered at CCSF; greater depth of content is available in archives and as needed. The LLR meets the diverse learning needs of students at all sites by offering much of its collection in online formats and by circulating books and materials through the District-wide delivery service.[10]

Information competency instruction. Information competency is an Institutional Learning Outcome and graduation requirement at the College, and the LLR provides the mandatory library instruction as part the freshman composition requirement. The LLR tracks many instruction statistics for decision-making and resource allocation, including numbers of workshops taught, workshop attendance, assignments corrected, reference transactions using different modes of interaction (chat, email, telephone, in person).[11] An information competency team keeps track of literature, revises online workshops and makes recommendations for improvement and updating information competency resources posted on the website.[12] Peer institutions have recognized CCSF librarians and have recruited them to provide training. Students choose which online workshops best suit their learning needs. Students receive instruction in a variety of learning venues, including the reference desk, classes, subject-specific workshops, and hybrid library skills workshops.[13] Instructional faculty and student demands drive the depth of the information competency content. For example, for subject-specific workshops, instructional faculty communicate with liaison librarians to develop workshop content.[14] Whether in person, by phone or online, all CCSF librarians employ active teaching methods, rather than the passive conveyance of answers, so that students develop critical skills and information competencies of their own.

---

[7] CCSF LLR Collection Development Policy

[8] CCSF LLR Statistical Summary of Services and Collections

[9] Screenshot of ER 17 on Information and Learning Support Services, Compliant p. 4 (Source: ACCJC Eligibility Requirements for Accreditation, p.4)

[10] Assessment of promptness in providing materials through inter-campus delivery

[11] CCSF LLR Statistical Summary of Services and Collections

[12] Information Competency Student Learning Outcomes

[13] Library Workshops

[14] Library Instruction for your class

Computer labs and learning technology. Students have access to computers and learning technology at every CCSF Center. The LLR connects people to the technology by offering a spectrum of services, including one-on-one instruction and assistance by faculty reference librarians and software needed to conduct library research or create research projects. Other learning technology includes document replication services (printing, scanning, photocopying), Disabled Students Programs and Services (DSPS) software, and wifi access. Information Technology Services (ITS) provides troubleshooting, software updates, and equipment replacement and repair.

The LLR uses Program Review to assess, plan for, and request new equipment, additional software, and computer replacements.[15]

Learning Support Services.[16] The primary provider for learning support services is the Learning Assistance Center (LAC). Learning Assistance is considered a "discipline" at CCSF because it provides instruction and services to help students strengthen their self concept, increase their sense of control over their education, set realistic goals, and accept responsibility for their own learning. The College also provides a number of other learning support services that are discipline-specific and/or population-specific. More detail on the LAC and the services housed within the LAC, along with a sample listing of other learning support services, appears below.

Learning Assistance Center (LAC). The LAC is part of the Student Development Division. A departmental mission, that is tied to the larger College mission, drives all instruction and services offered through Learning Assistance, which include:[17]

- **Learning Assistance (LERN) courses.** These courses include College Success courses such as LERN 50 (College Success). This course integrates personal growth and values, study strategies, communication, and critical analysis into life-long success in academic, professional, and personal development. LERN 52 A/B (Study Strategies, Discipline and Skills Based) increases student success by introducing study strategies particular to targeted study skills or targeted discipline-specific study skills. Workshops and in-class mentoring provide further learning support. These courses are integrated across several programs such as Summer Bridge, Child Development, Extended Opportunities Programs and Services (EOPS), Online Learning, Counselors, Interdisciplinary Studies (IDST), Gateway to College, and Concurrent/Dual Enrollment students.[18]

- **Tutoring.** Through the Tutorial Center within the LAC, students can receive peer and professional tutoring. Peer tutors provide an active learning experience for their students

---

[15] Program Review Report for Fall 2015 Library and Learning Resources

[16] Screenshot of Eligibility Requirement 17, Information and Learning Support Services, Compliant (Source: ACCJC Eligibility Requirements for Accreditation, p.4)

[17] Learning Assistance Center

[18] Learning Assistance courses

by explaining difficult concepts and providing examples for exploration. LAC tutors are recommended by departmental faculty within the subject they will be tutoring. All peer tutors must complete LERN 10, Introduction to Tutoring, which the LAC offers in the fall and spring semesters and which the LAC Department Chair and Coordinator teach. In addition, faculty expertise is also evidenced by instructors who volunteer or hold office hours in the LAC, such as those who teach math and accounting. Department chairs of those departments encourage a strong faculty presence in the LAC. Professional tutors are also available to support more challenging and in-demand subjects, such as statistics. Faculty can contact LAC's Coordinator and tutor managers to make requests for materials that support their courses' needs.

Tutorial assistance is available for a wide variety of subjects, split up by physical areas in the Tutorial Center. The Business and Science Areas offer tutoring and study tables for students enrolled in accounting, anatomy, biology, chemistry, economics, physics, physiology and statistics classes. The Foreign Language Area offers tutoring and study tables for students enrolled in Cantonese, French, German, Italian, Japanese, Mandarin, Russian, and Spanish classes. The Language Center provides supplemental foreign language instruction in Rosenberg 403 as well as at Centers where foreign languages are taught. The Social Science Areas offer tutoring in subjects such as music, philosophy, political science, psychology, and sociology. The Math and Engineering Tutoring Area offers tutoring and study tables for students enrolled in most credit math classes and a number of engineering classes.

Online tutoring is available to all CCSF students, whether they are taking courses online or in person at any of the College's Centers or at Ocean Campus. This is a new service offered via the College's participation in the state's Online Education Initiative (OEI), which uses a service called NetTutor. All CCSF students may use NetTutor's online services with their CCSF email accounts. The College is currently working on expanding the available live 1:1 online tutoring subjects for Fall 2016. However, any student can use their paper review service.[19]

- **The Writing Success Project (WSP).** WSP is a federally funded TRIO grant program that links students enrolled in particular English sections with weekly group study sessions led by classified tutors. The Writing Success Project functions as a learning community of students who are actively working on their writing skills at CCSF. Students enroll in WSP-linked sections of English 92 up through English 1B or 1C. Each section offers a professional tutor who attends class and leads weekly study groups. WSP-linked sections are open to all CCSF students, and additional WSP services are available to students who either receive financial aid, or will be the first in their families to graduate from college, or have disabilities, or are U.S. veterans. The Learning Assistance Department Chair oversees the Writing Success Project, which is housed

---

[19] NetTutor Services at CCSF

physically and programmatically in the Learning Assistance Center. Faculty and staff of the Writing Success Project participate in departmental staff meetings and trainings.

- **The LAC Computer Lab.** The LAC Computer Lab is City College of San Francisco's largest open-access computer lab for students, located in the Learning Assistance Center on the 2nd floor of the Rosenberg Library. The LAC Computer Lab offers Internet access on over 100 computers, which includes word processing and printing for CCSF students. Access is available for all registered CCSF students taking academic classes such as Business, English, ESL, Math, and Science. While tutoring services focus on supporting students in credit classes, any CCSF student can use the LAC computer lab or reserve study rooms. Individual computer workstations offer a variety of course-related educational software, Microsoft Office, and Internet/email access. It also offers software programs for students taking identified academic classes.[20] Lab assistants help students in selecting and using the Computer Lab's hardware and software. Faculty and staff can also reserve the LAC Computer Lab to support classroom instruction.[21] The LAC tracks and summarizes computer usage each semester and administers satisfaction surveys annually.[22]

At the Ocean Campus, the LAC is based in the Rosenberg Library. In addition, the Mission LAC is housed in the Mission Center Library and offers tutoring and computer lab support for students taking typing, English, ESL, GED subjects, statistics, biotechnology, Spanish, and math courses. Both credit and noncredit students use LAC services at Mission Center. The Learning Support Center at the Chinatown North Beach Center (CNB) opened in Summer 2016 and is currently expanding its services in collaboration with the CNB Library. Computers are available for online tutoring via NetTutor (see below). Project SHINE volunteers offer ESL tutoring to students. The LAC collaborates with the CNB Library when scheduling hours and services. Professional tutoring in Math credit courses offered at CNB, was made available over the summer.

Discipline-specific learning support services. Sample discipline-specific learning supports services include the following:

- **The English Lab.** The English Lab (Rosenberg 205), based in the Ocean Campus's Rosenberg Library and adjacent to the Learning Assistance Center, provides essential reading, writing, technology, and distance education resources designed to supplement instruction, primarily for students enrolled in English and Humanities classes.[23] Up-to-date methodologies, such as Reading Apprenticeship practices in tutoring, and meaningful technology like idea-mapping software, are priorities of English learning support, as is the offering of workshops designed to address students' needs for academic

---

[20] Learning Assistance Center Computer Software List

[21] Learning Assistance Center Computer Lab Request Form

[22] LAC SLO Survey, 2014-15

[23] Learning Assistance Center and Designated Learning Center Report

success, ranging from basic skills vocabulary issues to argumentation strategies to literary analysis.[24] [25] Resources also include various skills workbooks and reading assessments.[26] Teacher-managed online programs, such as *Reading Plus* and *Learning Curve,* strengthen students' reading and writing skills regardless of location, and faculty offer tutoring the Centers before or after classes meet.[27] [28]

In addition to the Ocean Campus's English Lab and the English Support Areas at the Centers, the English Department, due to its dedication to basic skills and the success of its Accelerated Learning Programs, now has a special support space staffed by class-assigned professional tutors for the six-unit ENGL 91 (basic skills integrated reading and writing) and accelerated courses.[29] Equity and Basic Skills funding pays for this support space, which is located within the LAC.[30] Class-assigned tutors also interact with students in the classroom, fostering a culture of support designed to improve programmatic student success. Since the tutors in these programs work closely with their students and see them regularly, they are including SLOs in their progress reports. All English sites include access to the Department's online resources for reading and writing.[31]

- **The Math Lab.** Students can access free tutoring in the Math Lab, located in Bungalow 602, for Math E, 835, 840, 850, and 855.[32] The Math Lab website also provides access for all students to math videos and computer programs for Math E, 835, and 840.[33] Computers are also available to students in the Math Lab for working on online homework for math courses.

Learning support services for specific populations. The College provides a number of learning supporting services to meet the needs of specific student populations. These include, but are not limited to:

- **Disabled Students Programs and Services (DSPS) Accessible Computer Labs.** Consisting of 22 PCs, five Macintoshes, network printers, and scanners, this lab is available to assist students with specialized software and hardware needs. It offers access to adaptive software such as JAWS, ZoomText, Kurzweil 3000/1000, and more. Adaptation training is available to all students at all locations with a DSPS referral.

---

[24] English Lab tutoring
[25] Reading and Writing Workshops
[26] English Lab Options
[27] English web resources
[28] English Lab Home Page
[29] ALP page with tutors listed
[30] F '15 analysis of 91 tutoring
[31] English web resources
[32] Math Lab Web Site
[33] Math Lab Videos

Students can also receive printing services as well as assistance in using the equipment and software.[34]

- **Multicultural Retention Services Department (MRSD).** MRSD consists of four academic retention programs that, in addition to counseling services and academic classes, provide tutoring and other learning support services such as computer labs. These programs primarily support underprepared, underrepresented students, and include the following: African American Scholastic Program (AASP), Asian Pacific American Student Success Program (APASS), Latino Services Network (LSN), and Tulay (a program geared towards supporting Filipino students).[35]

II.B.1 Analysis and Evaluation

The College supports student learning and achievement by providing library and other learning support services to students and to personnel responsible for student learning and support. Services are broadly offered throughout the College and are continually updated to meet changing needs and modes of delivery. A full range of learning support services include a robust library collection, in-person and online tutoring options, computer labs, and programs of instruction in information competency and academic success.

Conclusion. The College meets Standard II.B.1.

II.B.2. *Relying on appropriate expertise of faculty, including librarians, and other learning support services professionals, the institution selects and maintains educational equipment and materials to support student learning and enhance the achievement of the mission. CW IIC1a*

II.B.2. Evidence of Meeting the Standard

Relying on Faculty Expertise. The Library and the College's learning support services support student learning and the College's mission by relying on the appropriate expertise of faculty, including librarians and other support services professionals, to identify the best materials and equipment for student learning.

The assignment of liaison librarians for each discipline and each Center facilitates communication between librarians and instructional faculty about collections and other matters.[36] The duties of liaison librarians include consultation with discipline faculty and familiarization with curriculum and the needs of students in that discipline area or at that Center.[37] Faculty use the library website to identify and contact their liaison librarian.[38]

---

[34] Information regarding Accessible Computer Laboratories on DSPS website
[35] Multicultural Retention Services Department Website
[36] Subject Liaison Assignments for 2016-17
[37] Librarian Liaison Duties
[38] List of Liaison Librarians

Additionally, faculty use an online form for requesting additions to the collections, which the appropriate selector receives.[39] [40]

In addition, librarians and learning support services faculty maintain strong connections throughout the College. They are active in Collegial and Participatory Governance, and librarians serve on the Information Technology Advisory Committee, Curriculum Committee, Distance Learning Advisory Committee, Planning Committee, Student Equity Strategies Committee, the Teaching and Learning with Technology Roundtable, Concert and Lecture Committee, and the Participatory Governance Council. These strong connections enable the Library and the College's learning support services to make sure the equipment and materials selected are in sync with the academic programs.

Selecting Educational Equipment and Materials. In coordination with instructional faculty, librarians evaluate and select both physical and online collections throughout the District. The LLR Collection Development Policy, which the librarians periodically review and revise, defines the framework for collection decisions.[41] The inclusion of a librarian on the CCSF Curriculum Committee ensures that library collection development considers course outline content and materials and that instructional faculty include appropriate library resources in course outlines requiring research activities.

The faculty Department Chair of Library Learning Resources, the Coordinator for the Center Libraries, and/or the librarians serving at each location either make or inform decisions about LLR equipment and collections for each Center or site. At Evans, Civic Center, Airport, and Fort Mason, where services are expanding, group meetings, one-on-one meetings, and emailed questions serve as avenues for consulting the instructional faculty at the Center regarding the selection of materials and equipment.[42] [43] For expansion at Evans Center, this consultation included a survey sent to all faculty teaching at that location.[44] Center librarians regularly attend faculty meetings at their Centers to gather information about the needs of students in order to support student learning at that location.

In an effort to ensure the appropriate depth and variety of materials, the Library has increased the quantity of required course textbooks on reserve. In 2015-16, the Library has been able to purchase, and make available to students, approximately 80 percent of the textbooks used in the curriculum by applying for and receiving an equity grant from the College. Collaboration on this effort included staff and faculty in the various academic disciplines and student support services, the Bookloan Program, the CCSF bookstore, and the Office of Research and Planning. To make

---

[39] Email inviting faculty to request materials
[40] Online form for faculty acquisition requests
[41] Collection Development Policy
[42] Report on Initiating Library Services at the CCSF Airport Center
[43] Report on Initiating Library Services at Ft. Mason
[44] Report on need for library at Evans

the purchasing decisions, individuals involved analyzed data.[45] Assessment of this project's success in supporting student learning at every location commenced in Spring 2016 and will be ongoing.[46]

Library and learning resource faculty serving on the Distance Learning Advisory Committee and the Teaching and Learning with Technology Roundtable help provide special attention to the needs of distance education students. Online resources that the Library recently evaluated and selected to meet the needs of distance learning students include *Scientific American* and online journals from *Nature*, Safari Books online (on technology, engineering, and business), *PsycArticles,* and *PrepStep* (college success and test preparation resources).[47] Subject liaison librarians and instructional faculty contribute to the evaluation and selection of online resources. Faculty ensure that appropriate types of online resources, such as ebooks and streaming video, are integrated into web pages, the online catalog, and learning management system to be easily accessible to students.

Library resources are embedded in the learning management system when new course shells are created. This includes information on accessing Library resources, information for students needing services from DSPS, and help for using the learning management system. Online faculty receive updates via an email list.

The Learning Assistance Center also utilizes the expertise and collaboration of faculty to appropriately support student learning. For example, faculty in the Educational Technology Department collaborated with the LAC Department Chair to integrate NetTutor and the WorldWide Whiteboard software into CCSF's current learning management system to support all distance education courses and faculty, while remaining inclusive of both credit and noncredit students. The LAC also relies on faculty expertise for the selection of software, materials such as anatomical materials and textbooks, and equipment used in the lab by students that is maintained with the support of the ITS department. In addition, all peer tutors are required to have a letter of recommendation from a faculty in the field in which they are tutoring in order to provide tutoring services in the LAC.

Other learning support services, such as the English Lab, similarly rely on faculty to assist in selecting technology and paper-based resources, as well as software, tutoring, and workshops options.

Maintaining Educational Equipment. The College also relies on faculty expertise to maintain educational equipment. For example, a major locus of the reliance on the expertise of faculty and other learning support services professionals regarding the provision of equipment and technology is the yearly update cycle of the CCSF Technology Plan, which identifies Library

---

[45] Equity Reserves Books Project
[46] Library Reserve Books Equity Project Assessment Report
[47] Email promoting electronic resources

and Learning Resources as a functional area.[48] The faculty of LLR and of other departments participate as members or resources in the work of the Information Technology Advisory Committee (ITAC) in creating, revising, and implementing the Technology Plan and other tools. Staff from Information Technology Services act as resources for appropriate technologies and provide the equipment maintenance.

Disabled Students Programs and Services serves as another example. Specifically, DSPS staff provide guidance on appropriate accessibility technologies and, in many cases, provide the equipment, software, and installation and maintenance. Screen-reading software, which DSPS installs and maintains, is available on selected student workstations, as well as screen magnification among other adaptive technologies. DSPS consults on the selection of library materials with a view toward assuring accessibility. DSPS also maintains its own computer lab for students who need specific adaptive technologies.

Supporting Student Learning and Enhancing Achievement of the College's Mission. To ensure that the educational equipment and materials of the Library and learning support services support student learning, the College regularly evaluates their use and efficacy. LLR, for example, regularly administers student surveys, faculty surveys, and surveys of distance learners to assess whether materials and equipment support student learning and success.[49] [50] [51] The most recent LLR Program Review (December 2015) evaluated trends and progress and set the focus of the department on the continuous improvement of aligning resources with student needs, increasing student access to information competency instruction, expanding services to distance education students and to all students online, and improving collections and equipment.[52]

Within the realm of learning support services, the English Lab coordinators designed a faculty survey to connect desired learning outcomes with appropriate learning materials.[53] Reading programs such as *Reading Plus* and writing sites such as *Learning Curve* require the careful guidance and report analysis skills of teachers to make interfacing with the technology meaningful for students in the context of their English course expectations and outcomes and learning support time.[54] [55] [56] The relationship between classroom learning and learning support

---

[48] Screenshot of Technology Plan 2015-17, pp. 16-18 (Source: Technology Plan 2015-2017, see pp.16-18)

[49] Library Student Survey, 2014

[50] Library Faculty Survey, 2014

[51] Distance Learner Responses - Library Student Survey, 2014

[52] Program Review Report for Fall 2015 Library and Learning Resources

[53] English Skills, Lab Materials

[54] *Reading Plus* Handout

[55] Sample class progress report

[56] RP progress snapshot

resources designed to strengthen academic skills and self-efficacy is written into the course outlines directing faculty expertise.[57] [58] [59]

To maximize the collaborative potential of faculty knowledge, a faculty inquiry group—a FIG on Labs—has begun work on reviewing what the English Lab needs in terms of materials, practices, and policies to improve student success and further the mission of the College.[60] Faculty expertise will also drive the FIG through research of other colleges' lab and supplemental learning materials and structures, outcomes, and course success analysis in relation to lab options, consultation with librarians, cross-analysis of library and English tasks and materials, and responses to equity District wide.[61] [62]

II.B.2 Analysis and Evaluation

Librarians, faculty, and learning support professionals from across the College use their experience and knowledge to select and maintain educational equipment and materials that support student learning and enhance the achievement of the mission. The quality, quantity, depth, and variety of educational materials are appropriately maintained through the many processes in place. Program Review; liaison librarians; participation in the Curriculum Committee, Information Technology Advisory Committee and other College forums; surveys of faculty and students; and book and course reserve request mechanisms help the LLR identify and prioritize the selection of equipment and materials.

Conclusion. The College meets Standard II.B.2.

II.B.3. *The institution evaluates library and other learning support services to assure their adequacy in meeting identified student needs. Evaluation of these services includes evidence that they contribute to the attainment of student learning outcomes. The institution uses the results of these evaluations as the basis for improvement. CW IIC2*

II.B.3. Evidence of Meeting the Standard

City College of San Francisco regularly evaluates Library and Learning Resources and learning support services to assess their adequacy in meeting identified student needs in a number of ways. Methods of evaluation include student learning and student services outcomes assessment, Program Review, and surveys. The College also utilizes College plans as an opportunity for evaluation and improvement of LLR and learning support services.

---

[57] ENGL 91 outline
[58] ENGL 95 outline
[59] ENGL 1A outline
[60] FIG PR Screenshot
[61] From 2015 library-lab-1A survey
[62] Area B GELO Report on library-lab-1A findings

Outcomes Assessment. LLR and learning support services engage in outcomes assessment, whether analyzing student learning outcomes (SLOs), student services outcomes (SSOs), or both. Standards I.B.2., II.A.3., and II.C.2. describe the institutional processes by which all academic departments and student development areas conduct outcomes assessment, including LLR and learning support services (or their parent departments).

LLR outcomes assessment. LLR documents and assesses both SLOs and SSOs.[63] [64] The Library and Learning Resources (LLR) Assessment Plan outlines the assessment activities scheduled over a three-year cycle, and its instructional activities and assessments are set out in an Instructional Services Assessment Plan.[65] [66] The LLR Information Competency (IC) and Curriculum Committee is responsible for assessing and improving the information competency curriculum and pedagogy, guided by the Library's 2013-16 Instructional Service (IS) Plan. The IS Plan and accompanying Instructional Services Assessment Plan outline the goals of the program and tie information competency instruction to student success and the specific assessment measures for information competency instruction. They cover five broad mechanisms for information competency instruction: orientations and tours, research skills workshops and classes, course-specific workshops and classroom presentations, independent learning subject guides and tutorials, and one-on-one workshop consultations with teaching faculty.[67] [68] [69] [70]

Library and Learning Resources supports the attainment of SLOs and SSOs through direct course instruction in the use of information resources, workshops, and direct support of information competency in the College curriculum:

- Evaluation of learning in library courses takes place in the same manner as for all courses. The library information competency team reviews the results and makes pedagogical, methodological, and curriculum improvements.[71]

- Library skills online workshops have an in-person evaluation component for onsite students and an online evaluation with a librarian for distance students. Workshops are divided into basic and advanced skill levels. While many instructors require completion as fundamental to success in both academic and vocational courses, all students are encouraged to voluntarily complete them in order to develop primary research skills. All library workshop SLOs have undergone assessment, and all learning outcomes at the workshop, course, and library program level undergo regular assessment.[72]

---

[63] LLR SLOs
[64] LLR SSOs
[65] LLR Academic Service Area SSO Assessment Plan
[66] LLR Instructional Services Assessment Plan
[67] Tours and orientations
[68] Library Research skills workshops
[69] Subject specific workshops
[70] CCSF Library research guides
[71] LLR Instructional Services Plan
[72] Library workshops

- Librarian support of information competency includes the support of visual literacy. Librarians develop exhibitions in consultation with instructional faculty that are integrated into the instructional curriculum.[73] Faculty design class assignments for each exhibition which they assess using a rubric, and LLR uses the results to inform improvements to exhibitions, presentations, and coordinated assignments.[74]

Library and Learning Resources has as one of its goals supporting the growth of skills and knowledge in the development and implementation of an information competency that supports both the curriculum and life-long learning. The LLR assesses knowledge and competencies in all segments of study or activity at the LLR through measurable learning outcomes and working with faculty at the institutional, program, degree, and course levels and in student support services.[75] The Library is integrally involved in this skill and ability development.

Reinforcing this goal is the College's identification of critical thinking and information competency as one of four institutional learning outcomes (ILOs).[76] CCSF defines information competency in close alignment with standards of the Association of College and Research Libraries (ACRL).[77] Library faculty take responsibility for the instruction of information competency and approach it as a key context for the learning of critical thinking skills.

Library and Learning Resources has assessed information competency as an Institutional Learning Outcome through embedded course and program-level outcomes.[78] This is in addition to the regular assessment of the standard information competency workshops that students do outside of the classroom. The LLR assessment of activities in the subject-specific workshops included reviewing the assignments for common errors, pitfalls, and other issues.

CCSF librarians share responsibility with College faculty for delivering quality education and supporting the academic, professional, and personal development of the students served.[79] An assessment of District Program Learning Outcomes (PLOs) mapping to Institutional Learning Outcome 1 demonstrates that instruction in information competency facilitates connections between learning outcomes in all departments and is increasingly integrated throughout the curriculum.[80] One hundred seventeen (117) programs, disciplines, and majors in 37 departments mapped at least one program-level SLO to information competency. An associate degree at CCSF requires the completion of English 1A, which requires five hours of library research skills workshops taught by library faculty.[81] As a result of past evaluations, instructors are now asked

---

[73] CCSF Library Exhibitions Blog

[74] Outcome Assessment Report for Exhibitions/Visual Literacy

[75] See ACCJC Glossary, Definition of Student Learning, p.2 (Source: 2014 Standards Crosswalked with Glossary, 2014, p.2)

[76] ILO Web Page

[77] Information Literacy Competency Standards for Higher Education

[78] Institutional SLOs

[79] Shared Responsibility in Teaching Information Competency

[80] ILO IC curriculum mapping

[81] English 1A Course Outline of Record in CurricUNET - see under Section VI.A.6; English 1A Course Outline of Record on Office of Instruction Website

to choose up to three information research skills out of a list of seven or more.[82] This way, the workshops can better focus on and target the most essential skills required for the instructor's assignments.

Librarians also teach information competencies through collaboration with department faculty with course-related and course-integrated instruction sessions at all locations. Some programs are noteworthy for the inclusion of information competency instruction sessions in their syllabi, particularly in Health Education, ESL, Learning Assistance, and English. In addition to these, Library Information Science 10 offers a more comprehensive means of teaching information competencies. This course is a one-unit, transfer-level course, reaching approximately 100 students each year online and in person. The number of course-specific instructional sessions has continued to increase, over 35 percent from 2012-13 to 2014-15. In 2014-15, 9,808 students participated in course-specific instructional sessions, 780 over the prior year.[83]

Given this collaboration, in addition to assessing the attainment of SLOs in the Library and Learning Resources as a department, the College has also correlated library usage data with the attainment of student success in closely related courses in order to establish a connection between the usage of library services and student learning in other departments.[84] For example, an analysis of the correlation between 2014-15 library usage data (circulation and workshop completion) with course success in English 1A, 1B, 1C, 91, and 96 resulted in positive correlations between library circulation and/or library workshop completion and English Department course success.[85] In the Spring 2015 English 1A SLO assessment on composing well-organized source-based essays that demonstrate critical thinking and rhetorical strategies, skills very much related to information competency: 74 percent of students met the outcome, with another 23 percent in the process of developing that skill.[86] That assessment involved 876 papers/students. According to a survey taken by 120 of those English 1A students, 73 percent of them worked in a CCSF library as part of their research writing process, and 92 percent used the library's online resources.[87] These findings serve as evidence of the contribution of library and learning support services to the attainment of student learning outcomes in a broad sense. The Library has requested further analysis by the Office of Research and Planning to examine relationships between the outcomes results, course completion, library use, and lab use. LLR will use these findings in order to continually improve library instruction and other services.

Learning support services outcomes assessment. Many learning support services also assess SLOs and/or SSOs. Like LLR, the Learning Assistance Department regularly assesses its

---

[82] Library workshop request

[83] CCSF LLR Statistics Summary, 2010-2015

[84] CurricUNET Table from Fall 2015's ENGL 1A SLO Assessment

[85] "Library services support student success" slide from librarian Leading from the Middle presentation

[86] Spring 2015 ENGL 1A SLO results

[87] 1Apaper-libraryuse-survey

SLOs (for LERN courses) and SSOs for services provided within the LAC.[88] LERN course SLO assessment follows the College's procedures. The LAC assesses SSOs such as "After receiving Learning Assistance Center services, students will be able to apply gained skills to improve success in their academic courses."[89] For example, students were surveyed to find out how often they apply strategies learned in the LAC, such as academic strategies learned through a tutoring session, with over 80 percent responding with "always" or "sometimes." The LAC collaborated with the Office of Research and Student Service Outcomes Workgroup to improve assessment of service outcomes. Through SSO workgroup meetings and departmental meetings, the Learning Assistance Discipline redesigned current SSOs to begin assessment of peer tutors to increase professional skills gained through providing tutoring services to CCSF students.[90] Assessment of this particular SSO is being implemented in Fall 2016.[91] DSPS similarly assesses both SLOs and SSOs.[92]

The Multicultural Retention Services Department only assesses SSOs.[93]

The effectiveness of English Lab programs and services is under regular review and the source of ongoing departmental dialogue and students' self-assessment.[94] Lab coordinators and class teachers access Accutrack lab records to analyze attendance trends, review student progress in programs such as *Reading Plus* and *Learning Curve,* examine SLO and course completion data in CurricUNET and Argos to gauge the effects of lab work, take surveys into account, meet regularly to discuss the lab's role in curriculum, participate in a Lab Faculty Inquiry Group (FIG) to review data and figure out ways to improve learning support operations, and to communicate with librarians and Learning Assistance Center colleagues about ways to support students and support each other.[95] [96] [97] [98]

Program Review. Program Review provides Library and Learning Resources and learning support services with an opportunity to analyze learning and service outcomes data alongside a variety of other data to evaluate strengths and opportunities for improvement and to develop improvement plans accordingly.[99]

---

[88] CurricUNET outcomes assessment search page; Screenshots of LERN SLOs list from CurricUNET and list of LAC SSOs; Student Service Outcomes Matrix

[89] Outcome Report for Learning Assistance Center After Receiving Learning Assistance Center Services

[90] SSO Assessment Workgroup Meeting Minutes Fall 2015; Assessment and analysis of service outcomes

[91] SSO Detailed Status Report

[92] CurricUNET outcomes assessment search page; DSPS Assessment Website; Screenshots of DSPS SLOs list from CurricUNET and list of DSPS SSOs from CurricUNET

[93] CurricUNET outcomes assessment search page; MRSD Assessment Website; MRSD SSOs

[94] Lab outcomes survey

[95] *Reading Plus* benchmarks

[96] Area B GELO Report findings on lab support

[97] Fall 2015 lab survey

[98] FIG PR Screenshot

[99] Program Review Website

Library and Learning Resources and learning support services conduct Program Review in a timely manner and according to the College schedule, which has been on an annual, comprehensive basis. Now, along with the rest of the College, the LLR and learning support services each submit a comprehensive Program Review once every three years (most recently in Fall 2015) and submit an annual plan in the intervening years. Some learning support services, such as the LAC, DSPS, and MRSD, submit their own Program Review, while others, such as the English Lab and Math Lab, are included within a parent department's Program Review. Program Reviews and Assessment Currency Reports are publicly available via CCSF's CurricUNET site.[100] [101] [102] [103] [104]

Examples of the most recent Program Review evaluations of trends and progress (December 2015) include the following:

- LLR set the focus of the department on the continuous improvement of aligning resources with student needs, increasing student access to information competency instruction, expanding services to distance education students and to all students online, and improving collections and equipment.[105]

- The LAC identified a need for improving SSOs, creating greater awareness of online tutoring services, implementing NetTutor online tutoring services, identifying a better tracking system to allow for expansion of tutoring, expanding tutoring and supplemental instruction.[106]

- The English Lab identified five areas in need of improvement, including utilizing classified staff more effectively, increasing access to tutoring by increasing the student lab aide budget for peer tutors, increasing effectiveness of tutoring by implementing a monthly staff meeting for student lab aide tutors, improving the effectiveness of our technology and a smart re-integration of paper materials, and intensifying the evaluation of the program through a dedicated Faculty Inquiry Group (FIG).

Additional data informing Program Review and ongoing improvement efforts.
While the LLR and selected learning support services write up and submit analyses of outcomes assessments through CCSF's CurricUNET system every semester and through Program Review, they often conduct other less formal assessments to continually assess the adequacy of services and identify possible improvements. For example:

- For the LLR, these assessments include ongoing tracking of the many aspects of library usage, access, and, where possible, student learning. Measures of use include circulation,

---

[100] Program Review Report for Fall 2015 Library and Learning Resources
[101] Assessment Currency Report for Fall 2015 Library and Learning Resources
[102] Program Review Report for Fall 2015 Learning Assistance
[103] Assessment Currency Report for Fall 2015 Learning Assistance
[104] CurricUNET portal
[105] Program Review Report for Fall 2015 Library and Learning Resources
[106] Screenshot of NetTutor online tutoring services in Student Equity Plan, p. 41 (Source: Student Equity Plan, see p. 41)

gate counts, and usage of online resources.[107] The LLR summarizes the data in monthly and annual reports by location and in the LLR Statistical Summary.[108] After doing an analysis of data, the department implements improvements, such as recently shifting librarian hours based on the distribution of students and course schedules at the Centers.[109] [110]

Interactions at the reference desk give the librarians further feedback on the collection's depth and variety. Collection development is informed by student requests for materials and information at the reference desk. Circulation statistics provide another evaluation of the print collection, and web statistics show the use of online resources. Interactions at the reference desk also serve as an informal and anecdotal assessment of information competency skills.

- In addition to learning, the CCSF Library examines its role in supporting the success of students at recognized points of achievement, including successful course completion, certificates and degrees, licensure examination passage, post-program employment, and other similar measures.[111] The LLR is working with the Office of Research and Planning to correlate library usage data with course completion data for the levels of English.

- The English Lab also uses its software, such as the *Reading Plus* program's initial assessment for comprehension and fluency, to find new contexts in which to understand, correlate, and address course-level entry and exit learning outcomes expectations as one way to improve course completion rates.[112]

Surveys. LLR and various learning support services utilize findings from satisfaction, usage, and College-wide surveys to inform the need for changes in level, location, quality, and types of services.

Satisfaction and usage surveys. For example, LLR administers surveys to students, faculty, and distance learners to assess their satisfaction with services and offerings.[113] [114] [115] [116] Results inform Library staff with respect to the need for improvements. To better serve students, including distance education, the LLR Department administered a survey to online students and, as a result, increased online services.[117] Specifically, LLR has instituted a 24/7 online chat

---

[107] Example - Usage statistics for Distance Learning Electronic Resources 2015-16

[108] CCSF LLR Statistics Summary, 2010-2015

[109] Center Hours Assessment documents

[110] Center Hours Allocation Assessment Report

[111] See, ACCJC Glossary, Definition of Achievement (Source: 2014 Standards Crosswalked with Glossary, 2014, p.2)

[112] RP f'15 inSight Assessment avgs by course level

[113] Student Perception Survey Spring 2014 - open in Explorer to view tabs for disaggregation

[114] Library Student Survey, 2014

[115] Library Faculty Survey, 2014

[116] Distance Learner Responses - Library Student Survey, 2014

[117] Distance Learner Responses - Library Student Survey, 2014

reference service (OCLC QuestionPoint) as well to primarily meet the reference needs of distance learners, although on-site students at all College locations can also use this service.[118]

Another example includes a Fall 2015 survey based on the English Lab's learning outcomes that produced 90 percent favorable responses from students in terms of resources and services enhancing learning, not just in English classes but in overall college success.[119] The survey also provides helpful feedback for adjusting services through a clearer understanding of students' perspectives.

Centers Survey. The College administers an annual Centers Survey to assess student satisfaction and usage of core student support services throughout the District.[120] The Centers Survey includes questions about library access, use, and satisfaction, and the College examined results and made improvements to library hours and opened new libraries. It indicated that only 30 percent of the students at the Evans Center reported that they do not need library services, indicating that the lack of an on-site library there has been an obstacle to their success.[121] This led to the opening of the Evans library in September 2015 for limited weekly hours. Service hours expanded in Spring 2016 to 17 hours per week and will expand further in Fall 2016 to 26.5 hours per week.[122]

College -Wide Plans as Assessment and Improvement Opportunities. The College also utilizes its College-wide plans to assess specific services provided and explore strategies to improve those services.

Equal Access to Success Emergency (EASE) Task Force Plan. In 2015 the College reassessed and adjusted the delivery of services across the entire College in order to ensure that all students have access to core services at the College's eight primary locations aside from the Ocean Campus; these include the Airport, Civic Center, Chinatown/North Beach, Downtown, Evans, John Adams, Mission, and Southeast Centers. One of the seven services that EASE identified as a core service is Library and Learning Resources.

The EASE Task Force used a variety of data, including the Centers Survey noted above, to identify the needs of each Center in order to assure equitable access to success. In general, the EASE Task Force identified four key areas for change: staffing, space usage, improved technology, and training.[123] (See also the response to Standard II.C.3. for more information.)

EASE findings, as contained with the EASE Plan, resulted in the following:

- LLR expanded services at Evans, Civic Center (as noted above), and Airport.

---

[118] QuestionPoint announcement to CCSF community
[119] Fall 2015 English Lab Outcomes Survey
[120] LLR Analysis: EASE Center Survey Spring 2015 Library Questions
[121] Report on need for library at Evans
[122] Evans Library Website
[123] EASE Plan pg. v.

- The Learning Assistance Center began offering online tutoring via NetTutor as a pilot in Spring 2016 with Equity funding. This online tutoring service provides additional accessibility to evening, weekend, and distance learner students, and supports at the other Centers who can now access tutoring remotely.[124] At the Chinatown/North Beach Center, the EASE Plan called for on-site professional tutoring services, which the College began providing in Summer 2016.

Student Equity Plan. The 2015 Equity Plan (a state-required plan) provided an opportunity to disaggregate data and intentionally explore the results by student population group. In Fall 2015, an Equity Task Force consisting of administrators, classified staff, faculty, and students re-evaluated disaggregated student achievement data and revised the 2014 Equity Plan based on this data. The College found that of the students included in the federal definition of underrepresented minority (African American, Latino, Veterans, Disabled Students, and Foster Youth) all experience disproportionate impact at the College, including in access to and use of student services.[125] Data analysis led to the identification of specific activities to address equity gaps. Examples include:

- The purchase of approximately 80 percent of the textbooks used in the curriculum with Equity funding. Community College Survey of Student Engagement (CCSSE) data served as a rationale for the Equity funds request; 42 percent of the students responding to the CCSSE question "If the college were to provide more resources to help you be more successful as a student, which one area would be most helpful?" indicated that textbooks would be the most helpful.

- Equity funding (along with Basic Skills funding) is supporting space within the LAC for the Accelerated Learning Programs to house professional tutors for the six-unit ENGL 91 (basic skills integrated reading and writing) and accelerated courses.[126] [127]

II.B.3 Analysis and Evaluation

CCSF Library and Learning Resources as well as learning support services formally collect relevant data via Program Review and outcomes assessment along with less formal surveys and other measures. Library faculty use that data to refine library and learning support services, update information competency course components, appropriately expand services to all locations throughout San Francisco, and improve services to CCSF students.

Conclusion. The College meets Standard II.B.3.

---

[124] Online tutoring via NetTutor - 11/12/15 BOT Resolution - authorization to purchase NetTutor Software and Services, Board's approval for the funding to be released (item 151112-X-529); NetTutor pricing proposal to CCSF
[125] Screenshot of 2015 Student Equity Plan, pp. 6-8 (Source: 2015 Student Equity Plan, pp. 6-8)
[126] ALP page with tutors listed
[127] F '15 analysis of 91 tutoring

II.B.4. *When the institution relies on or collaborates with other institutions or other sources for library and other learning support services for its instructional programs, it documents that formal agreements exist and that such resources and services are adequate for the institution's intended purposes, are easily accessible and utilized. The institution takes responsibility for and assures the security, maintenance, and reliability of services provided either directly or through contractual arrangement. The institution regularly evaluates these services to ensure their effectiveness. (ER 17) CW IIC1e+*

II.B.4. Evidence of Meeting the Standard

Library and Learning Resources primarily relies on internal resources to provide services to students. A few contractual agreements (beyond basic purchasing agreements or software/hardware licenses) exist to enhance student support. These include agreements for shared cataloging, a library services platform (also known as an integrated library system), consortial arrangements for database pricing discounts and access, printing and photocopying service support, and tutorial software support agreements.

The Library participates in the Online Computer Library Center (OCLC) for cataloging records, a standard service used by many libraries. The library administration maintains the contract, and staff in the Library's cataloging department handle service questions.

The library services platform, Sierra, is provided by Innovative Interfaces, Inc., which hosts the server containing the Library's catalog and patron database, provides regular maintenance and updates of the software, and customer support. The Systems Librarian and 1.5 FTE Library Technicians manages the relationship with the vendor for the library services platform maintenance, updates, and day-to-day technical issues. A vendor on the server side provides system security for patron records along with firewall protections on CCSF's network for staff access. The College evaluates system reliability by tracking vendor response levels, monitoring help tickets, and participating in user groups to gather information about other libraries' system experiences and updates.[128]

Students have ready use of the library catalog at any time, and library staff are able to perform all necessary acquisitions, circulation, cataloging, course reserve, and serials management functions. The Library maintains membership in the vendor's user group for additional support and professional development related to the system.

The College continuously evaluates these systems using data on records, usage, and functionality. This includes measuring and analyzing cataloging data for quantity and speed of access to new materials each month.[129] It also involves examining circulation and catalog use

---

[128] Invoice link; OCLC Record in Sierra; IUG membership page and support page
[129] cataloging data

data to gauge how the system supports meeting student needs, collection usage, ability to request materials, and access across multiple locations as well as distance users.[130]

The Library is a member of the Community College Library Consortium (a partnership of the California Community College League and the Council of Chief Librarians) and takes advantage of the statewide community college EBSCO license. Database access for students and faculty supports student learning across the curriculum. Relationships with the CCL Consortium are managed by the Acquisitions Librarian and the LLR's Collection Management Committee.[131]

In Spring 2016, the College entered into an agreement with OCLC to implement QuestionPoint as part of the California Community College cooperative, a service to provide 24/7 online chat reference assistance to CCSF library users. CCSF librarians participate in answering questions throughout library open hours, with librarians from other locations providing service at other times. Evaluation is based on the reliability, responsiveness, quality and quantity of responses to students. Early survey data show that students are finding the service easy to use and there is a high level of satisfaction with responses.[132]

The Library has a contract with Yankee Book Peddler (YBP) to purchase preprocessed materials (i.e., books). Under this agreement, YPB provides order records, catalog records, and fully processed items. This arrangement began in Fall 2015 as an effort to get materials to users more efficiently. Technical Services will work with the Dean of Library and Learning Resources and other stakeholders to assess the efficacy of the service at the beginning of Spring semester 2017. Metrics will include elements related to: service improvement, customer satisfaction, cost effectiveness, and vendor-related issues such as timeliness, accuracy of records, quality of processing, error rates, and responsiveness of vendor customization requests.[133]

The District contracts with Pinnacle for copier and printer service and maintenance. Pinnacle provides copier machines, printers in open computer labs, toner and paper, vend cards, manages money collection, and handles daily maintenance and service calls so that students have photocopy and computer printing available all hours that labs are open. These services meet student needs for reliable printing and photocopying in all library locations. Pinnacle printing support is also available in open computer labs and the Learning Assistance Center. The vendor sends maintenance staff to heavy-use locations daily Monday through Friday and is available via a toll-free number for problem reports. Staff maintain logs of support requests. The majority of students surveyed in 2014 use library computers and photocopiers and are satisfied with these services.[134] The Library administration maintains the Pinnacle contract, while the District administration maintains the contract for computer labs.[135]

---

[130] CityCat; printout of system functions; Catalog searches, circulation, intercampus requests; transit assessment data; student survey questions on access to library materials; student survey satisfaction question

[131] CCL Page; database pricing options; database satisfaction from 2014 student survey; EBSCO Terms of Use

[132] Library page with chat box; QuestionPoint Survey Results; Sample QuestionPoint Data

[133] YBP specs email; Sample record processing log

[134] Library & Learning Resources Student Perception Survey Spring 2014

[135] Pinnacle email printing/copying volume 2014 Student Survey Copy Print satisfaction

The collections and services of the San Francisco Public Library are a rich community resource to which CCSF librarians refer as appropriate, in particular for interlibrary loan. These services are freely available and no formal agreement is necessary. San Francisco Public Library has branches throughout the city, close to all City College of San Francisco locations.

The Learning Assistance Center contracted with NetTutor in Fall 2015 to provide additional online tutoring services and accessibility to evening, weekend, and distance learner students, as well as online tutoring support that students at the other Centers can access remotely. Pilot services began in Spring 2016 and are currently under analysis and evaluation.[136]

To support students on and off campus, the English Department has contracted with Taylor Associates for *Reading Plus* and MacMillan (Bedford) for *Learning Curve*. Both programs engage a wide range of students, from basic skills through university-parallel, and provide teachers with excellent assessment records and easily integrated activities. Taylor Associates hosts the program, provides technical support for students and faculty, offers professional development regularly in the form of live webinars and archived sessions, and even offers in-house training.[137] MacMillan provides technical support 18 hours/day as well as online and live training.[138] Several thousand English students use these programs each semester, and both companies' tech support and professional development services have been essential.

II.B.4 Analysis and Evaluation

City College of San Francisco documents formal agreements and ensures that resources and services are adequate, easily accessible, and utilized. The College regularly monitors and evaluates security, maintenance, and reliability of services for effectiveness.

Conclusion. The College meets Standard II.B.4.

---

[136] Online tutoring via NetTutor - 11/12/15 BOT Resolution - authorization to purchase NetTutor Software and Services, Board's approval for the funding to be released (item 151112-X-529); NetTutor pricing proposal to CCSF

[137] Reading Plus support

[138] MacMillan support form

Standard II.B. Changes and Plans Arising out of the Self Evaluation Process

Standard II.B. Changes Arising Out of the Self Evaluation Process				
Goal	**Associated Action(s)**	**Person(s) Responsible**	**Completion Date**	**Outcome**
Ensure all locations have equitable access to library and learning support services. (Standard II.B.1.; see also II.A.7. and II.C.3.)	Review existing services through EASE Task Force and expand library and learning assistance services as needed.	Vice Chancellor of Student Development	Spring 2016 and ongoing	Students will have access to library and learning services at all locations. EASE resulted in providing library services to the three remaining locations previously without library services and provided increased online services and outreach.

The College has no plans to report for Standard II.B. beyond those that are part of the College's regular quality improvement cycles.