

City College of San Francisco - Phase III - MIP  
February 24, 2006  
San Francisco, California

# **The Intersection between Critical Thinking & Transformative Multicultural Education**

*facilitated by,  
Jacquelyn Valerie Reza.*



Ed.D. International & Multicultural Education (1995), MFT #17540 (1982), M.S. (1981), B.A. (1980), B.S. (1978)  
Professor/Counselor De Anza College (1985 - )  
President Multicultural Staff Association De Anza College (2004-05)  
President Faculty Academic Senate, De Anza College (1989-1991)  
President Latina Leadership Network for California Community Colleges (1993-94)  
Northern Representative Statewide Academic Senate Executive Committee (1991-92)  
Chair Statewide Affirmative Action Cultural Diversity Advisory Committee (1991-92)

# Workshop Outline

Introductions and Expectations

Brief Review of Critical Pedagogy

- Multicultural Teaching Competencies
- Power
- Oppression / exclusion-inclusion
- Critical Variables in being a multicultural facilitator of learning
- Levels of Multicultural Education
- Conscientização & Praxis

Exercise: The Hidden Curriculum

- Questions needed to Assess the Curriculum
- Critical Thinking Assignment (3 pages)

Deconstructing the workshop

Close with El Pico

## What are Multicultural Teaching Competences?

**Multicultural Teaching Competence** is the ability to successfully teach students from different cultures other than your own. It entails mastering complex awarenesses, sensitivities, and attitudes, various bodies of knowledge, and a set of skills that, taken together, underlie effective cross-cultural teaching. (Diller & Moule, *Cultural Competence: A Primer for Educators*, 2005 p. 2 & 5)

### Individual Cultural Competence Skill Areas

(Diller & Moule, *Cultural Competence: A Primer for Educators*, 2005, pg 14-17):

1. **Awareness and Acceptance of differences:** In attuning one's educational efforts to work with students from other cultures, acknowledging and looking at differences are as important as highlighting similarities.
2. **Self-awareness:** involves understanding the myriad ways culture impacts human behavior and requires sufficient self-knowledge to anticipate when one's own cultural limits are likely to be pushed, foreseeing potential areas of tension and conflict with specific student groups, and accommodating them.
3. **Dynamics of difference:** is an awareness of the dynamics of difference and involves knowing what can go wrong in cross-cultural communication and knowing how to set it right.
4. **Knowledge of the student's culture:** It is critical for teachers to familiarize themselves with a student's culture so that behavior may be understood within its own cultural context.
5. **Adaptation of Skills:** involves adapting and adjusting generic teaching practices (that have their roots in the dominant cultural paradigm) to accommodate cultural differences. Adaptations can take a variety of forms and learning goals can be altered to better fit cultural values.

### Bank's Four Levels of Integration of Multicultural Content

(Banks & Banks (Eds.) *Multicultural Education: Issues and Perspectives*, 5<sup>th</sup> ed, pg. 246)

1. **Contributions approach** = adding discrete items of culture to the existing curriculum = heroes, holidays, food without any basic conceptual change in the material.
2. **Additive approach** involves adding content, concepts, themes and perspectives are added to the curriculum without changing its basic structure.
3. **The transformational approach** occurs when the structure of the curriculum is changed to enable students to view concepts, issues, events and themes from the perspectives of diverse racial and cultural groups.
4. **The social action approach** encourages students to make decisions on important social issues and take action to help solve them.

### The Dimensions of Multicultural Education

(Banks & Banks (Eds.) *Multicultural Education: Issues and Perspectives*, 5<sup>th</sup> ed., pg. 23)

1. **Content Integration:** deals with the extent to which teachers use examples & content from a variety of cultures in their teaching.
2. **Knowledge Construction:** Teachers need to help students understand, investigate, and determine how the implicit cultural assumptions, frames of

reference, perspectives, and biases within a discipline influence the ways in which knowledge is constructed.

3. **Prejudice Reduction:** this dimension focuses on the characteristics of students' racial attitudes and how they can be modified by teaching methods and materials.
4. **An Equity Pedagogy:** exists when teachers modify their teaching in ways that will facilitate the academic achievement of students from diverse racial, cultural, gender, and social-class groups.
5. **An Empowering School Culture:** Grouping and Labeling practices, sports participation, disproportionality in achievement, and the interaction of the staff and the students across ethnic and racial lines must be examined to create a school culture that empowers students from diverse racial, ethnic and gender groups.

### **5 Multicultural Teaching Principles**

(Diller & Moule *Cultural Competence: A Primer for Educators*, 2005, pg. 18)

Based on research related to diversity, Banks et al (2001) begin by asking what we currently know about culture and education, and then proceed to define a comprehensive set of principles of culturally competent teaching and educational delivery. **They group these principles into five categories: teachers, students, cross-cultural relations, school structure and equity and evaluation.**

#### **Examples of questions include:**

**Teachers:** are teachers knowledgeable about the cultural dynamics that might occur within a classroom?

**Students:** Are all students afforded access to all aspects of the curriculum and school resources?

**Cross-cultural relations:** Do school personnel actively promote positive interaction between students of different cultural backgrounds?

### **Teacher Characteristics that Make a Difference**

(Haberman, (1996) in Diller & Moule (2005) pg. 158)

1. **Teacher's belief:** that it is the teacher's responsibility to engage all student sin a meaningful learning activities
2. **Caring Orientation:** The expectation of the need for rapport with students
3. **Fallibility:** The expectation and orientation of teachers to their own errors, reflectivity.
4. **Persistence:** The predisposition to pursue activities at which students will succeed and to solve problems that intrude on learning.
5. **Organizational Ability:** The predisposition to engage in planning and gathering of materials.
6. **Physical and Emotional Stamina:** The ability to persist in situations characterized by poor home lives and other crises facing our students.
7. **Response to Authority:** The predisposition to protect students experiencing success in learning against bureaucratic constraints.
8. **Explanation of Success:** The predisposition to emphasize effort rather than ability.
9. **Teaching Style:** The predisposition to engage in coaching rather than directive teaching.

### Multicultural Learning Styles\*

Asian American	African American	Latino	Native American
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>➤ Respect for elders</li> <li>➤ Value education</li> <li>➤ Respect authority</li> <li>➤ Feel responsibility for relatives</li> <li>➤ Show self-control</li> <li>➤ Teachers are accorded higher status</li> <li>➤ Need reinforcement from teachers</li> <li>➤ Work more efficiently in a well-structures, quiet environment</li> <li>➤ Wait to participate, unless otherwise requested by teacher. Listen more than speak</li> <li>➤ Speak in soft voice</li> <li>➤ Be modest</li> <li>➤ Create organized classroom activities around naturalistic interactions that permit the Asian student to take the lead (Adapted from Feng 1994, online) (pg. 21)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>➤ Respond to things in terms of the whole instead of isolated parts;</li> <li>➤ Prefer inferential reasoning as opposed to deductive or inductive,</li> <li>➤ Approximate space and numbers rather than adhere to exactness,</li> <li>➤ Focus on people rather than things;</li> <li>➤ Be more proficient in nonverbal than verbal communications;</li> <li>➤ Prefer learning characterized by variation and freedom of movement;</li> <li>➤ Prefer kinesthetic/active instructional activities;</li> <li>➤ Prefer evening rather than morning learning;</li> <li>➤ Choose social over nonsocial cues; and proceed from top-down processing approach rather than bottom-up approach (adapted from Irvine &amp; York 2001, pg. 490) (pg. 23)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>➤ Prefer group learning situations;</li> <li>➤ Be sensitive to the opinions of others;</li> <li>➤ Remember faces and social words;</li> <li>➤ Be extrinsically motivated;</li> <li>➤ Learn by doing;</li> <li>➤ Prefer concrete representations to abstract ones, and</li> <li>➤ Prefer people to ideas (adapted from Irvine &amp; York 2001 , pg 490) (pg. 45)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>➤ Prefer visual, spatial, and perceptual information rather than verbal;</li> <li>➤ Learn privately rather than in public;</li> <li>➤ Use mental images to remember and understand words and concepts rather than word associations;</li> <li>➤ Watch and then do, rather than employ trial and error;</li> <li>➤ Learn experientially and in natural settings;</li> <li>➤ Have a generalist orientation, interested in people and things;</li> <li>➤ Values conciseness of speech, slightly varied intonation, and limited vocal range;</li> <li>➤ Prefer small-group work; and</li> <li>➤ Favor holistic presentations and visual representations (adapted from Irvine &amp; York 2001, 490-491) (pg. 28)</li> </ul>

Extracted from Educational Research Service publication, (2003), What We Know About Culture and Learning (pages 20 to 26).

Jackie's note: these generalities have been developed by researchers of their respective ethnicities & in relation to social justice & multicultural education and are for thought and reflection.

# The Culture of Power\*

## Five Tenets

1. Issues of power are enacted in classrooms.
2. There are codes or rules for participating in power; that is, there is a "culture of power."
3. The rules of the culture of power are a reflection of the rules of the culture of those who have power.
4. If you are not already a participant in the culture of power, being told explicitly the rules of that culture makes acquiring power easier.
5. Those with power are frequently least aware of -- or least willing to acknowledge -- its existence. Those with less power are often most aware of its existence.

*Point = Teachers must teach all students the explicit and implicit rules of power as a first step toward a more just society.*

Source: Extracted from Lisa D. Delpit, The Silenced Dialogue: Power and Pedagogy in Educating Other People's Children, *Harvard Educational Review* Vol. 58 No. 3 August 1988 by J.V Reza 2/11/94

# CROSS-CULTURAL EDUCATION: CRITICAL VARIABLES

## LEARNING OUTCOMES

- Cognitive
- Affective
- Behavioral

## LEARNING CHARACTERISTICS

- Background (age, gender, etc.)
- Heterogeneity-homogeneity
- Familiarity with each other
- Familiarity with instructors
- Familiarity with learning activities

## EDUCATOR CHARACTERISTICS

- Skill level
- Familiarity with learning activities
- Relationship with learners

## TYPES OF LEARNING ACTIVITIES

- Lectures
- Discussions
- Critical incidents
- Role plays
- Group problem solving
- Simulations

## RISK ELEMENTS OF LEARNING ACTIVITIES

- Risk of personal disclosure
- Risk of failure
- Risk of change in personal identity

## BEHAVIORAL REQUIREMENTS OF ACTIVITIES

- Active - passive
- Familiar - unfamiliar behavior
- Maximum - Minimum self-disclosure

## LEARNING ENVIRONMENT FEATURES

- Competitive - cooperative
- Structured - unstructured
- Task oriented - process oriented
- Democratic - hierarchical
- Affiliative/warm - distant/cold
- Supportive - unsupportive

Adapted from Paige, R.M. & J. N. Martin, "Ethical Issues and Ethics in Cross Cultural Training, in Landis, D. and R. Brislin, Handbook of Intercultural Training volume I, New York: Pergamon Press, 1983.

The Chart on the next page is titled:

**Levels of Multicultural Education**

Reference: Nieto, Sonia,  
*Affirming Diversity: The sociopolitical Context of  
Multicultural Education*  
4<sup>th</sup> Edition

The chart on the subsequent page was developed from the work of Paolo Freire and his notion of how people become conscious of their historical context. Reference: I have had the chart for about 10 years and have never known who the author is and over time I have amended it.

	Characteristics of Multicultural Education				
	Monocultural Education	Tolerance	Acceptance	Respect	Affirmation, Solidarity, & Critique
<b>Antiracist/antidiscriminatory</b>	Racism is unacknowledged. Policies & practices that support discrimination are left in place. These include low expectations & refusal to use students' natural resources (such as language & culture) in instruction. Only a sanitized and "safe" curriculum is in place	Policies & practices that challenge racism & discrimination are initiated. No overt signs of discrimination are acceptable (e.g., name calling, graffiti, blatantly racist & sexist textbooks or curriculum). ESL programs are in place for students who speak other languages.	Policies & practices that acknowledge differences are in place. Textbooks reflect some diversity. Transitional bilingual programs are available. Curriculum is more inclusive of the histories & perspectives of a broader range of people.	Policies & practices that respect diversity are more evident, including maintenance bilingual education. Ability grouping is not permitted. Curriculum is more explicitly antiracist & honest. It is "safe: to talk about racism, sexism, & discrimination.	Policies & practices that affirm diversity & challenge racism are developed. There are high expectations for all students; students' language & culture are used in instruction & curriculum. Two-way bilingual programs are in place wherever possible. Everyone takes responsibility for challenging racism & discrimination.
<b>Basic</b>	Defines education as the 3 R's & the "canon." "Cultural literacy" is understood within a monocultural framework. All important knowledge is essentially European American. This Eurocentric view is reflected throughout the curriculum, instructional strategies, & environment for learning.	Education is defined more expansively & includes attention to selected information about other groups.	The diversity of lifestyles & values of groups other than the dominant one are acknowledged in some content, as can be seen in some courses & school activities.	Education is defined as knowledge that is necessary for living in a complex & pluralistic society. As such, it includes much content that is multicultural. <i>Additive multiculturalism</i> the goal.	Basic education is multicultural education. All students learn to speak a second language & are familiar with a broad range of knowledge.
<b>Pervasive</b>	No attention is paid to student diversity.	A multicultural perspective is evident in some activities, such as Black History Month & Cinco de Mayo, & in some curriculum & materials. There may be an itinerant "multicultural teacher."	Student diversity is acknowledged, as can be seen not only in "holidays & Heroes" but also in consideration of different learning styles, values, & languages. A "multicultural program" may be in place.	The learning environment is imbued with multicultural education. It can be seen in classroom interactions, materials, & the culture of the school.	Multicultural education pervades the curriculum; instructional strategies; & interactions among teachers, students & the community. It can be seen everywhere: bulletin boards, the lunchroom, assemblies.
<b>Important for all Students</b>	Ethnic &/or women's studies, if available, are only for student from that group. This is a frill that is not important for other students to know.	Ethnic & women's studies are only offered as isolated courses.	Many students are expected to take part in curriculum that stresses diversity., A variety of languages are taught.	All students take part in courses that reflect diversity. Teachers are involved in over-hauling the curriculum to be more open to such diversity.	All courses are completely multicultural in essence. The curriculum for all students is enriched.
<b>Education for Social Justice</b>	Education supports the status quo. Thinking & acting are separate.	Education is somewhat, although tenuously, linked to community projects & activities	The role of the schools in social change is acknowledged. Some changes that reflect this attitude begin to be felt: Students take part in community service.	Students take part in community activities that reflect their social concerns.	The curriculum & instructional techniques are based on an understanding of social justice as central to education. Reflection & action are important components of learning.
<b>Process</b>	Education is primarily content: who, what, where, when. The "great White men" version of history is propagated. Education is static.	Education is both content & process. "Why" & "how" questions are tentatively broached.	Education is both content & process. "Why" & "how" questions are stressed more. Knowledge of & sensitivity to students of all backgrounds are more apparent.	Education is both content & process. Students & teachers begin to ask, "What if?" Teachers build strong relationships with students & their families.	Education is an equal mix of content & process. It is dynamic. Teachers & students are empowered. Everyone in the school is becoming a multicultural person.
<b>Critical pedagogy</b>	Education is domesticating. Reality is represented as static, finished, & flat.	Students & teachers begin to question the status quo.	Students & teachers are beginning a dialogue. Students' experiences, cultures, & languages are used as one source of their learning.	Students & teachers use critical dialogue as the primary basis for their education. They see & understand different perspectives.	Students & teachers are involved in a "subversive activity." Decision-making & social action skills are the basis of the curriculum.

## Conscientização Coding Categories Diagram

### MAGICAL CONSCIOUSNESS

### NAÏVE CONSCIOUSNESS

### CRITICAL CONSCIOUSNESS

	CONFORMING	REFORMING	TRANSFORMING
I. N A M I N G	1. PROBLEM DENIAL a. overt denial b. problem avoidance 2. SURVIVAL PROBLEMS a. poor physical state/health b. poverty c. lack of work d. insufficient work e. money as end in itself	1. OPPRESSOR DEVIATES FROM IDEAL EXPECTATIONS a. oppressed no like oppressor b. oppressed not meet oppressor's expectations c. horizontal aggression/intrapunitiveness 2. INDIVIDUAL OPPRESSOR DEVIATES FROM IDEAL EXPECTATIONS a. individual oppressor violates laws b. individual oppressor violates norms	1. REJECTION OF OPPRESSOR/ SELF AND PEER AFFIRMATION a. rejects modeling oppressor b. seeks to maintain ethnicity c. seeks to affirm uniqueness 2. TRANSFORM THE SYSTEM a. rejects oppressive system b. procedures / people
II. R E F L E C T I N G	1. SIMPLISITC CAUSAL RELATIONSHIPS a. blame physical states/poverty, health b. blame objects over people 2. FACTS ATTRIBUTED TO SUPERIIOR POWERS a. uncontrollable factors; God, Fate, Luck, Age, etc. b. fear of oppressor c. oppressor inevitable winner d. empathy for oppressor	1. PLAYING HOST OF OPPRESSOR'S IDEALOGY a. accepts oppressor's explanations and expectations (education) b. self and peer deprecation c. blames ancestors d. self-pity 2. UNDERSTANDS HOW OPPRESSOR VIOLATES NORMS a. sees intentionality by oppressor b. sees relationships between oppressor and oppressor's agents c. generalized from one oppressor to another	1. UNDERSTANDS/REJECTS OPPRESSOR'S IDEALOGY AND HIS/HER COLLUSION a. sympathy and understanding of peers b. self-critical/sees contradictions between actions and critical goals c. rejects oppressor and oppressor's ideology 2. UNDERSTANDS HOW SYSTGEM WORKS a. sees system as cause b. sees contradictions between rhetoric c. macro-socio-economic analysis d. generalizes from one oppressive system to another
II I A C T I N G	1. FATALISM a. resignation b. acceptance 2. PASSIVELY PLAYING HOST TO OPPRESSOR a. waiting for "good" patron or "good" luck b. dependence on oppressor	1. ACTIVELY PLAYING HOW TO OPPRESSOR a. models oppressor's behavior (education, dress, habits) b. misdirected aggression (horizontal aggression, intrapunitiveness) c. paternalistic towards peers d. meets oppressor's expectations 2. DEFENDING a. gregariousness b. make system work c. avoids oppressors d. opposes individual oppressor	1. SELF-ACTUALIZING a. sees appropriate role models b. personal ethnic self-esteem c. self-growth/transforming learning d. subject/actor in own life e. faith in peers/peer learning f. boldness/risk-taking/unorthodox solutions g. reliance on community resources/participation 2. TRANSORMING THE SYSTEM a. dialogue polemics b. comradeship c. scientific approach d. change norms/laws/procedures

## Questions to ask of a piece of curriculum for Multicultural Infusion

### 1- What contributions have people from different groups made to this area of study?

**Explanation:** Are there major contributors to this area of study from people from marginalized groups who have been left out?

**Example:** important mathematical discoveries made in non-Western societies.

### 2- Does this course help students to understand the multicultural context of society?

**Explanation:** Much of the traditional curriculum avoids controversial issues and does not help students to better understand the social processes that have made the world what it is.

**Example:** An English class that studies “the classics” might look at who defines what counts as a classic, and how that idea has worked to keep marginalized people’s experience from being valued.

### 3- How does this area of study impact people of different groups differently?

**Explanation:** People from different groups may have different experiences of the thing studied, and the perspective we teach from should be sensitive to these differences.

**Example:** Western Civilization has had impacts on the rest of the world that are different from its impacts within the West. In studying Western Civilization, the impact of the West on the rest of the world should be looked at.

### 4- Are questions being posed in ways that exclude?

**Explanation:** Many academic disciplines are structured around questions that put the experience of dominant groups at the center of study and push the experiences of others to the margins.

**Example:** If Political Science is defined as the study of the actions of governments, then it will mostly look at what men from privileged groups have done. If it is defined as including the effects of the actions of governments, then everyone is included. If it is defined as the study of how power works in society, then many more types of activities that are of importance to people in marginalized groups are included.

**5- What have scholars who are interested in challenging marginalization in this area of study said about how it should be studied?**

**Explanation:** For the past twenty years people from marginalized groups have made many contributions to most fields of study and in the process have raised deep questions about how these fields should be transformed. The work of these scholars should be a part of our discussions.

**Example:** Women in Economics have questioned the very idea of economics as the study of the money economy, pointing out that much of what women contribute to society happens outside the money economy, but is economic in a deeper sense of the word.

## CRITICAL THINKING ASSIGNMENT

An in class critical thinking exercise will constitute **10%** of the course grade.

1. In class exercise will be scheduled and assigned by individual clinical instructors.
2. A situation associated with course content will be presented to students for review.
3. Students will complete the critical thinking process in writing and submit for a grade at the end of class.
4. If absent on this class day a grade of zero (0) will be assigned for this exercise.

**THERE IS NO MAKE UP FOR THIS EXERCISE.**

### CRITICAL THINKING

Critical Thinking, curricular concept at San Antonio College Department of Nursing Education, is defined as a purposeful self-regulatory judgement which uses interpretation, analysis, evaluation, inference, explanation in the cognitive and affective domains to facilitate the process of knowledge development and clinical decision-making in nursing. (Facione and Facione). Critical thinking is utilized in the implementation of the nursing process and in collaboration with members of the interdisciplinary health care team in planning care for clients. Critical thinking assists the nurse to individualize client care and address problems that have no obvious solutions.

Students come into our program with various skill levels of critical thinking. The faculty at San Antonio College support the need for structured activities in each class and clinical course to learn and demonstrate critical thinking, thereby providing a process for formative evaluation to reflect the student's progress. Summative evaluation will be measured in the last course in the curriculum.

#### I. Formative Evaluation

##### A. Student Responsibilities

1. Complete a Critical Thinking Exercise in the course.
2. Recognize and demonstrate the use of critical thinking in clinical decision-making.
3. Participate in class/post-conferences using critical thinking competencies.

##### B. Faculty Responsibilities

1. Evaluate the Critical Thinking Exercise using the Holistic Rubric and plot the student's score on the graph.
2. Convert the score from the Holistic Rubric to a % grade and award 2-10% of the theory grade to this exercise.
3. Ask questions in the clinical area using the Socratic method.
4. Evaluate the student's use of critical thinking in the category "Uses critical thinking in the clinical area." (This competency will be a minimum of 5%.)
5. Plan and identify classes/post-conferences that focus on the use of critical thinking competencies..
6. Identify test items which require critical thinking and include a minimum of 10% on each exam.
7. Discuss the progress of the student's use of critical thinking competencies at the completion of each course.

#### II. Summative Evaluation

In the final course, the student and faculty will discuss and evaluate the students performance and progress in utilizing critical thinking competencies throughout the program.. The student self-evaluation and faculty evaluation will be used.

#### References:

- American Philosophical Association (1990). Critical Thinking: A Statement of Expert Consensus for Purposes of Educational Assessment and Instruction. The Delphi Report: Research Findings and Recommendations Prepared for the Committee of Pre-College Philosophy.
- Chubkinski, Suzanne. (1996). Creative Critical-Thinking Strategies. Nurse Educator 96. (21:6), 23-26.
- Facione, Noreen C. and Facione, Peter A. (1996). Externalizing the Critical Thinking in Knowledge Development and Clinical Judgement. Nursing Outlook, 96 (44), 129-136.
- Oermann, Marilyn (1997). Evaluating Critical Thinking in Clinical Practice, Nurse Educator (97). (22:5). 25-28.

## CRITICAL THINKING EXERCISE WITH HOLISTIC CRITICAL THINKING SCORING RUBRIC.

### A. Describe the situation.

**What data did you obtain to verify that a situation existed?**

**State the problem that requires a nursing action. (Interpretation)**

- 4 Consistently accurate in interpretation of evidence, statements, graphics, questions, etc.
- 3 Mostly accurate in interpretation of evidence, statements, graphics, questions, etc.
- 2 Misinterprets evidence, statements, graphics, questions, etc.
- 1 Offers biased interpretation of evidence, statements, graphics, questions, information, or the point of view of others.
- 0 Does not answer or omits the question

### B. Using nursing theory, state reasons that led you to believe the problem was significant for intervention.

**Which aspects of "caring" did you apply in analyzing the need for nursing action?**

**What assumptions (both scientific and personal) did you make about the problem? (Analysis)**

- 4 Consistently identifies the salient arguments.
- 3 Mostly identifies the salient arguments.
- 2 Mostly fails to identify strong relevant arguments.
- 1 Consistently fails to identify or hastily dismisses strong relevant arguments.
- 0 Does not answer or omits the question.

### C. List three plausible interventions you could have chosen for the problem.

**Explain why each is a plausible intervention. (Inference)**

#### Intervention # 1

- 4 Consistently draws warranted, nonfallacious conclusions.
- 3 Mostly draws warranted, nonfallacious conclusions.
- 2 Mostly draws unwarranted, fallacious conclusions.
- 1 Consistently draws unwarranted, fallacious conclusions.
- 0 Does not answer or omits the question.

#### Intervention # 2

- 4 Consistently draws warranted, nonfallacious conclusions.
- 3 Mostly draws warranted, nonfallacious conclusions.
- 2 Mostly draws unwarranted, fallacious conclusions.
- 1 Consistently draws unwarranted, fallacious conclusions.
- 0 Does not answer or omits the question.

#### Intervention # 3

- 4 Consistently draws warranted, nonfallacious conclusions.
- 3 Mostly draws warranted, nonfallacious conclusions.
- 2 Mostly draws unwarranted, fallacious conclusions.
- 1 Consistently draws unwarranted, fallacious conclusions.
- 0 Does not answer or omits the question.

### D. Analyze and evaluate the advantages and disadvantages of each intervention.

**Which intervention did you select for implementation? (Evaluation)**

#### Intervention # 1

- 4 Thoughtfully analyzes and evaluates major alternative points of view.
- 3 Offers analysis and evaluations of obvious alternative points of view.
- 2 Mostly ignores or superficially evaluates obvious alternative points of view.
- 1 Consistently ignores or superficially evaluates obvious alternative points of view.
- 0 Does not answer or omits the question

#### Intervention # 2

- 4 Thoughtfully analyzes and evaluates major alternative points of view.
- 3 Offers analysis and evaluations of obvious alternative points of view.
- 2 Mostly ignores or superficially evaluates obvious alternative points of view.
- 1 Consistently ignores or superficially evaluates obvious alternative points of view.
- 0 Does not answer or omits the question

