

SYNOPSIS OF WASC VISITING TEAM FINDINGS
FROM THE TEAM VISIT MARCH 19 - MARCH 23, 2006



Office of Institutional Advancement

The draft Evaluation Report on City College of San Francisco presents the findings of the evaluation team that visited CCSF from March 19 through March 23, 2006. What follows is a synopsis of what the team has said about CCSF. This synopsis identifies the team's views on needed changes and explicit recommendations to the College for improvements. This report also identifies team commendations of the College as well as instances where the team was impressed with the work of the college. Beginning on page 3, the synopsis is broken out into two columns of verbatim text from the report. One addresses recommendations and areas needing improvement; the other are commendations and areas where the team was impressed with the work of the College.

The visiting team also developed eight (8) recommendations intended to guide the college in accomplishing certain goals and assuring high quality of its programs and services. ***Recommendations #2, #3, and #4 are presented as overarching concerns that should receive the college's focused attention and emphasis.*** The other recommendations are also important for the college to address in conjunction with its ongoing planning and operational activities.

The recommendations are also verbatim from the draft report:

Recommendation 1: Mission Statement

The team recommends that the college regularly review and approve the mission statement in a discrete process to ensure that it is clearly addressed. (Standards I.A.3 and I.A.4).

Recommendation 2: Planning and Assessment

The team recommends that the college build upon its continuing planning and assessment efforts and develop an integrated process of institutional planning and assessment that combines strategic planning, educational planning, facilities planning, technology planning, and personnel planning in a manner that links these planning processes to annual budgets. Planning should be based upon the findings of instructional and non-instructional program review, which should include clear criteria for resource reallocation and/or program and service development, expansion, or termination. (Standards I.B, II.A.2.e, and II.A.2.f).

Recommendation 3: Student Learning Outcomes

The team recommends that the college ensure that student learning outcomes are fully institutionalized as a core element of college operations, with specific focus on curriculum and program development. (Standards I.B.1, II.A.1.c, II.A.2, II.A.3, and II.A.6).

Recommendation 4: Financial Planning and Stability

The team recommends that the college develop a financial strategy that will: match ongoing expenditures with ongoing revenue; maintain the minimum prudent reserve level; reduce the percentage of its annual budget that is utilized for salaries and benefits; and address funding for retiree health benefits costs. (Standards III.D.1.b, III.D.2.c, and III.D.2.d).

Recommendation 5: Physical Facilities Contingency Planning

The team recommends that the college ensure the development of adequate contingency plans, which should be implemented in a timely manner in order to reduce potential exposure to losses. (Standard III.D.2.c).

Recommendation 6: Physical Facilities Maintenance Planning

The team recommends that the college include the future costs of operating and maintaining new and existing facilities in its planning models and allocate funds in a timely manner to ensure the effective operation of these facilities. (Standard II.B.2.a).

Recommendation 7: Technology Planning

The team recommends that all unit technology plans be brought up-to-date, and that a unified college-wide technology plan be developed. This plan should be integrated with facilities and budget plans. Funds for technology acquisition and maintenance, including regular replacement of outdated hardware, should be integrated into the institution's budget. (Standards I.B.4, I.B.6, III.C.1, and III.C.2).

Recommendation 8: Board of Trustees Evaluation

The team recommends that the Board of Trustees establish a method of self evaluation, determine the schedule for this process, and complete self evaluations on a regular basis. (Standard IV.B.1.g).

Recommendations	Commendations
<p>The team suggests for future evaluation visits that the college provide a written update, including documentation, of significant changes that have occurred between the publication of the self study and the team visit in order to ensure the currency of information and evidence that is available to the team at the time of the visit. (4)</p>	<p>In general, the high quality of the self study and essays, the availability and candor of members of the institutional community on site, and the efforts by the staff to respond to requests for current information made for a visit that reaffirmed the excellence of the college and identified areas of challenge that the college will need to address in the future. (4)</p> <p>City College of San Francisco is one of the premier community colleges in the region represented by the Western Association of Schools and Colleges. (4)</p>
<p>Student Learning Outcomes The team's judgment is that City College of San Francisco has made the necessary investments both in dialogue and in data to enable the institution to take the next step in resolving the remaining differences of opinion in order to shape and implement an institutional approach. (17)</p>	<p>Dialogue The team was impressed by the extent of the college's dialogues on subjects ranging from graduation requirements to student learning outcomes to operational effectiveness to planning to pedagogical philosophy. (17)</p>
	<p>Integrity The team was impressed by the documentation provided in the self study and in the evidence provided in the team room that enabled the team to validate the institution's honesty and accuracy in the information it provides to students and the public. (17)</p>
	<p>Planning, Evaluation, Improvement The team was impressed by the college's efforts, but also noted that progress needs to be made in integrating these efforts with each other and linking them more directly to the annual budget plan. (17)</p>
	<p>Organization Special commendations are in order for City College of San Francisco in completing its transition from separate institutions within a district to a single, multi-campus organization. (17) The team also was impressed by the high level of morale and support expressed by the campus community. (18)</p>
<p>Standard I—Institutional Mission and Effectiveness</p> <p>Review of Mission Statement While finding the commitment to institutional mission commendable, the team recommends that the college regularly review and approve the mission statement in a discrete process to ensure that it is clearly addressed (19)</p> <p>Integration Process of Planning The team recommends that the college build upon its continuing planning and assessment efforts and develop an integrated process of institutional planning and assessment that combines strategic planning, educational planning, facilities planning,</p>	<p>Standard I—Institutional Mission and Effectiveness</p> <p>Planning Processes City College of San Francisco is to be commended for conducting systemic assessments of planning processes as well as planning activities (19)</p> <p>Use of Data and Evidence The institution's use of data and evidence was noted by the team, and the team found the efforts of the Office of Research, Planning and Grants commendable in providing this service through the Decision Support System (DSS), which has become the official source of real-time data for program and</p>

<p>technology planning, and personnel planning in a manner that links these planning processes to annual budgets. Planning should be based upon the findings of instructional and non-instructional program review, which should include clear criteria for resource reallocation and/or program and service development, expansion, or termination (19/20).</p> <p>Program Review The team paid special attention to program review during the visit. Program review, for example, is not part of the overall planning guide (Standard II.A.2.e). Further, program review was not occurring in sync with curriculum review at the time when the team arrived. A separate committee and process exist to conduct faculty position allocation studies and this appeared to the team to be linked more closely with the annual budget planning cycle than the program review cycle. The team also found evidence of problems in conducting program reviews in a timely and consistent fashion across the institution. The team concurs with the findings in the college's self study that it renew its commitment to program review and ensure its integration with curriculum review and resource decisions. (21)</p>	<p>course-level planning. (20)</p> <p>Communication There is remarkably effective communication between staff at different campuses regarding college activities and institutional performance (21)</p>
<p>Standard II—Student Learning Programs and Services</p> <p>Program Review and SLOs ...student learning outcomes do not appear to be clearly presented as a significant goal within the program review process within the area of instruction, and do not appear appreciably within the context of program reviews (Standard II.A.2.b). In reviewing this situation, the team recommends that the college ensure that student learning outcomes are fully institutionalized as a core element of college operations, with specific focus on curriculum and program development (Standards I.B.1, II.A.1.c, II.A.2, II.A.3, and II.A.6). The institution's Education Master Plan should include a development plan for measuring and assessing student learning outcomes. The institution should also make arrangements to ensure that these assessments and the use of these assessments are implemented throughout the institution in a timely manner. (25)</p> <p>BMS and AV The two support units, audiovisual and broadcast media services, are physically situated at different locations and operationally managed by different administrators. This separation of the two units has not promoted adequate operational integration of these two units, which the college should address along with appropriate levels of staffing.(26)</p> <p>Equipment Replacement Plan The college does not have a systematic plan for equipment replacement and new equipment</p>	<p>Standard II—Student Learning Programs and Services</p> <p>Biotech The team was...impressed by the college's new developments in biotech education (23)</p> <p>Noncredit programs The team was also impressed by model programs in noncredit education. The ESL Department, for example, allows the immigrant population of San Francisco opportunities to gain language acquisition and work entry skills. (23)</p> <p>Implementation of instructional programs The team was impressed by the standards and rigor of the college's implementation of its instructional program. (26)</p>

requirements, with funding for these purposes presently limited primarily to VTEA, federal, state and private grants, and instructional block grants provided by the State. (26)

Academic Freedom Statement

The team noted that while publicizing its policies, the college should take steps to ensure that an Academic Freedom statement is included in the college catalog as well as any other appropriate publications (Standard II.B.2.a). (26)

Program Review and Budget

The process does not precisely link budget decisions to program review findings and action plans. (27)

SLOs Assessment

... although the curriculum committee has included in the new course outline template the inclusion of 'Major Student Outcomes,' there is no institutional progress toward assessing, validating and using the results of these learning outcomes. (27)

SLOs and Distance Education

There is continuing need for clearly defined and appropriate student learning outcomes in distance education, as in other areas of curriculum (27)

Student Records

On a practical note, the college still needs to address the issue of permanent maintenance of all student records (30)

Age of Library Book Collection

...great concern about the age of the overall collection, with many books that are outdated by two or more decades. This issue needs to be addressed within the overall campus planning and budgeting process (31)

Standard III—Resources

Human Resources

The team also encourages the college to incorporate examination of appropriate administrative staffing level planning processes as it continues to expand program services (33).

Facilities Planning and Integration

...facilities planning still needs to be more closely linked with educational planning and with budgetary strategies. The college has a wide variety of plans. The interrelationship of these plans is paramount in assuring the optimal operation of the institution. There are situations where the plans are not as well

Leadership of Student Development

There is a new energy, commitment, and shared vision that wasn't evident prior to the reorganization. There was a shared acknowledgement that the leadership of the chancellor, and most notably the Vice Chancellor of Student Development/Academic Affairs, created a structure for communication and an environment that allowed for participation, decision-making, and individual investment in the process. (28/29)

College and Diverse Populations

The college is greatly sensitive to the needs of diverse student populations and has created programs and activities to address the unique needs of these groups. (30)

Information Competency

Infusion of information competency into general courses, regular workshops, and the creation of the graduation requirement for information competency are quite impressive accomplishments (32)

Library Resource Collaboration

Library resources are made available throughout the institution and a collaborative effort among the campuses is impressive (32)

Standard III—Resources

Human Resources

The team was impressed by the positive spirit of cooperation and support for the institution and its students exhibited by all members of the college community (33).

integrated as they should be. The relationship between the Educational Master Plan, the Facilities Master Plan, and the various budget plans should be more effectively integrated. (34)

Health and Safety Processes

In order to increase effectiveness of the health and safety management of its facilities, the team encourages the college to formalize its Health and Safety committee process, and structure its actions to ensure that issues are dealt with in a proactive manner (35)

Adequate Contingency Planning

The team recommends that the college ensure the development of adequate contingency plans, which should be implemented in a timely manner in order to reduce potential exposure to losses (35)

Future Costs—Maintenance & Operation

The team recommends that the college include the future costs of operating and maintaining new and existing facilities in its planning models and allocate funds in a timely manner to ensure the effective operation of these facilities (Standard III.B.2.a). (35)

College Technology Plan

The team recommends that all unit technology plans be brought up-to-date, and that a unified college-wide technology plan be developed. This plan should be integrated with facilities and budget plans. Funds for technology acquisition and maintenance, including regular replacement of outdated hardware, should be integrated into the institution's budget. (37)

Long Term Financial Plan

The team encourages the college to develop a plan to address this long-term financial liability (Standard III.D.1.c). (39)

The team recommends that the college develop a financial strategy that will: match ongoing expenditures with ongoing revenue; maintain the minimum prudent reserve level; reduce the percentage of its annual budget that is utilized for salaries and benefits; and address funding for retiree health benefits costs. (Standards III.D.1.b, III.D.2.c, and III.D.2.d) (39)

Standard IV—Leadership and Governance

BOT Self Evaluation

The team recommends that the Board of Trustees establish a method of self evaluation, determine the schedule for this process, and complete self evaluations on a regular basis. (Standard IV.B.1.g). (44)

Improvements in Technology Infrastructure

Significant improvements in technology infrastructure have been accomplished and are commendable. (37)

Addressing the College's Fiscal Needs

The chancellor, the vice chancellor for finance, and the Board deserve special commendation for the manner in which they have addressed the college's fiscal needs.(38)

Sharing Information on Financial Priorities

The college is very effective in determining and sharing information relative to conveying both its short-range and long-range financial priorities. (38)

Freeze in Salary Structure

The institution is to be commended that in tight budget its employees agreed to implement a freeze in the salary structure for two years. This reflects a dedication to the college by its employees that is very rare. (39)

Standard IV—Leadership and Governance

Collegial Governance

The team was impressed by the extent and success of the effort that all have made to make the new organization function effectively utilizing a well-constructed system of collegial governance. (41)

	<p>City College of San Francisco has a robust and dynamic collegial governance system that is both proactive and responsive to the issues, needs and concerns of the institution. (41)</p> <p>The quality of decision-making at City College San Francisco has been greatly enhanced by its effective system of collegial governance in which all governance leaders and stakeholders have made a concerted effort to work together to achieve mutual goals for the benefit of students. The team found this effort commendable. (42)</p> <p>BOT Availability and Knowledge of Accreditation During the visit, the team was impressed by board members' availability as well as by their knowledge about and involvement in the accreditation process (Standard IV.B.1.i). (43)</p> <p>Chancellor's Leadership The chancellor is to be commended for his excellent leadership. His decision-making skills, problem-solving approach and ability to reach consensus were cited by many during the visit as examples of his leadership. He is considered an ethical leader who is providing effective leadership to the entire organization. (44)</p>
--	---