Student Development Assessment of Educational Centers
August 1-2, 2013

Executive Summary

Participants:
Dr. Faye McPhail Naples, Vice Chancellor of Student Development
MaryLou Leyba, Dean of Admissions, Records and Outreach
Jorge Bell, Dean of Financial Aid
Carl Jew, Interim Dean of Matriculation and Counseling
Samuel Santos, Interim Dean of Student Affairs and Wellness
Monika Liu, Associate Dean of Admissions and Records
Margaret Sanchez, Associate Dean of Matriculation and Assessment
Sunny Clark, Director of Student Health
André Barnes, Chief of Campus Police
Lidia Jenkins, Special Program Coordinator

On August 1 -2, 2013, a two-day student services needs assessment of the City College of San Francisco Educational Centers occurred, led by Vice Chancellor Faye McPhail Naples. In consultation and collaboration with Vice Chancellor Joanne Low and Associate Vice Chancellor Darlene Spoor, the student services leadership team, and Dr. Chuen Chan, Director of Research, met with center deans to assess and to discuss issues concerning student services provided at the Centers, including staffing and relevant instructional issues.

Tours of CCSF Educational Centers
On the first day of the two-day assessment, the team went to the following four Centers: Downtown, Chinatown-North Beach, Civic Center and John Adams; likewise, on the second day, the team visited the remaining three Centers: Southeast, Evans and Mission. From the outdoor construction classroom at Evans, to the Childcare Center at Mission, and the self-started Library at Civic Center, each campus showcased its unique services. While extraordinary efforts are made to serve the communities of San Francisco, the Centers face many challenges specifically with the enrollment of noncredit students. As written in the recommendations from ACCJC with regards to Standard IIB, the College has work to do in finding ways to provide student services at each of its Educational Centers.

Assessment Instrument
A 39-item assessment instrument was developed for use by team members. The survey instrument included questions in the following areas: center facilities and hours of operation, faculty and staff professional development, access to computers, counseling, testing, orientation, financial aid, and center administration. This served as a starting point for robust and candid conversations that were had with the Center Deans. Among the many concerns related to staffing levels, student
registration/enrollment, building maintenance and security, it was clear that Center Deans take a hands-on approach to do whatever is necessary, particularly during the first few weeks of school.

**Survey Results and Findings**
The assessment instrument used as well as a summary of the responses collected is attached. Next, are some findings from the assessment:

- Responses indicated that student services do not have matching hours of operation. Further, some campuses would benefit from better alignment or coordination between A&E and Counseling.
- Marks ranged from zero to 44% in response to Centers not having adequate student services staffing for proper office coverage.
- Downtown, Civic Center and Evans were viewed as the most understaffed specifically in Admissions & Enrollment staff, each receiving a score of zero.
- Civic Center, Southeast and Evans needing more campus police, as indicated by a score of 11%, 11% and 0% respectively.
- Responses for office hours provided by faculty such as counseling, Financial Aid, and DSPS ranged by Center from 0-56%.
- Bilingual signage and facilities maintenance need improvement. Comments from the team stated that building directories might prevent lost or misdirected students.
- Chinatown-North Beach and Mission received high marks for their use of multilingual signage.
- Conversely, 89% and 67% of the responses state that Downtown and Civic Center could expand their use of multilingual signs to include additional languages.
- More than half of the group marked that professional development or training of faculty and staff is needed in one or more of the following areas: interdepartmental training, communication, directing students to credit vs. noncredit programs, how to petition for AA/AS degree, general financial aid knowledge, advanced Banner training, CCSF website as a resource, assisting students with commonly used forms.
- Marks in technology were somewhat low. Of the 7 Centers, Evans, Southeast, and Downtown do not have sufficient computers for student use. In contrast, Civic Center did report having sufficient computers outside of the A&E office for students. Some Center employee computers are not in good working condition and could be upgraded.
- The responses did not clearly indicate whether there are an appropriate number of counselors at the Centers. Similarly, many raters did not have enough information to know if student demand for counseling appointments is being met; and further, whether paper or electronic ed plans for students are stored and retrievable. Meetings will be convened with the counseling chairs to specifically discuss this issue in more depth.
- Southeast, Evans and Chinatown-North Beach are concerned about changes in the Counseling Department’s hours and the impact that has on student registration.
- Testing and Orientation received many low and blank responses. There was confusion around the frequency of testing (noncredit vs. credit) and when student orientation occurs following the test. Again, a few raters did not have enough information to rate the question.
- At some Centers, Financial Aid provides services once a week; however, low marks indicate that more Financial Aid counseling is needed at some Centers. Financial Aid is currently evaluating their services.
One-Stop Center and Cross-functional Teams

In four of seven Centers, staff noted that they work cross-functionally to serve students. “One-stop” cross-functional teams are in place at Chinatown-North Beach, Downtown, John Adams and Mission this fall; the remaining three Centers are in various stages of fully implementing one-stop cross-functional teams. At John Adams, the Dean and counselors reported that training had taken place last summer. The redesign of office space has also helped with the one-stop concept. The newly built Chinatown-North Beach Center has staff and faculty working together inside the A&E Office, with counselors available next door. Mission Center also has one-stop office featuring A&E staff, Counseling faculty and Financial Aid staff as well as a staffed information station to welcome and direct students to the right place. Civic Center reported that the layout on the first floor and lack of proximity between offices makes the one-stop model more challenging. Evans also has a fragmented layout and would benefit by having a dedicated A&E Office with staff. Several Centers reported using administrative office staff to assist students, particularly those with bilingual skills. Additional staff will need to be identified to round out the cross-functional teams.

Student Migration

Various accounts from Center faculty, staff and deans, described an inter-Center migration of noncredit students. Particularly for Centers that are geographically nearby or share public transportation bus lines, it is commonplace for students to travel back and forth between Centers to get the services or classes they need. Faculty and staff often refer students to different Centers when trying to connect students more quickly with services not on site at the desired time. Ultimately, noncredit students self-select where to receive services and enroll for courses based on how well the availability of services or courses matches their needs or schedule. This theme was mentioned at almost every Center. Civic Center and John Adams, for example, acknowledged that students receive different services from each Center. Civic Center refers students needing DSPS services to John Adams. Mission A&E and Counseling see students from Civic Center or Downtown who are looking for different course availability. Similarly, Downtown and Chinatown-North Beach reported that they often refer to the schedule of the other Center for noncredit ESL or CASAS testing. The Southeast and Evans Centers are also combining resources.

Lack of Standardization

Students traveling from Center to Center may be the impetus that motivates Centers in adopting more standardized processes throughout the district. Currently, some Centers have modified forms to suit their Center needs. The College should explore where standardization is possible with the goal of streamlining enrollment processes and alleviating the need to have students fill out duplicative enrollment forms. There was consensus that signage and forms should be available in multilingual formats whenever possible. Other comments also touched on the use of technology with noncredit students. For consideration, the question is: what role should technology play in the enrollment of noncredit students? While there were mixed comments on whether all noncredit students have access to technology in their homes, it is clear that the College should find ways to use online systems for things such as noncredit registration.

Technology

Technology is generally underutilized in many college practices, not least of which are the student services processes that involve Banner, the College’s ERP system. From the first to the most current version of Banner, the College has created local software modifications to Banner baseline as a way of bridging office practices with Banner functionality, across the College, but particularly in noncredit
where continuous open-entry open-exit enrollment occurs. This creates an environment heavily dependent on manual paper-based processes requiring hours of data entry; multiple languages, paper admissions and records forms, thousands of students, and more than seven locations (Centers and sites) only compound the log jam.

One step in advancing the use of Banner and Web4 (Banner Self-Service) for noncredit students is to expand Banner online registration for noncredit courses. Currently the Downtown Center is in its fourth semester of offering online registration to the noncredit business certificate students. Preceding online registration at Downtown, A&R had conducted two registration pilots at the Centers, one at the John Adams Center for ESL and TRST courses, and one at the Downtown Center for noncredit business certificate courses. One important consideration is incorporating multilingual on-screen directions for student users. While not all noncredit students will choose to use online services, those who self-select online services will benefit from the accessibility of web-based services at their convenience. Students opting not to use online services will continue to be accommodated in person at the Centers.

Faculty and staff are also limited by their current access to and use of existing technology. Improving district-wide use of technology will allow for greater inter-Center communication when referring students to services provided at different Centers in the district. In some instances, information is slow to reach all Centers diminishing its timeliness making it difficult to inform students of current information. The CCSF webpages for noncredit are slow to be updated due to limited staff with website experience.

Lastly, data collection, storage, and data retrieval for both faculty/staff and students was discussed briefly. Developing student educational goals, educational plans, and maintaining student records are key aspects to address as the College implements various mandates related to the Student Success Act, MIS reporting requirements, and other Title 5 changes.

**Counseling and Ed Plans**
Counseling services are available at each Center. However, from the Centers we learned that improvements to hours and schedules would benefit our students. Comments from Center Deans addressed the challenges in establishing a counseling schedule when the reporting line leads to chairs and deans not located at the Center. A more collaborative reporting structure would allow for Center Deans to be involved with hours of operation and unplanned schedule changes. More, each campus has a unique need for bilingual services including Chinese and Spanish and also Arabic. Counselors at the Centers do more than provide academic counseling services; counselors also serve as a contact for other personal counseling questions and connect students with resources in the community. Unclear during the tours of the Centers was the degree to which noncredit students have education plans. The number of education plans must be increased for all students to comply with requirements of the Student Success Act. Increasing the usage of the electronic ed plan in Web4 could provide the tool to improve the number of student ed plans.

A Counseling Taskforce on Student Educational Plans is being formed now. Several volunteers have come forward to tackle this important issue. Additional members from student services will complete the task force. Beginning in September, their chief role will be to review and evaluate the status of ed plans and make recommendations for improvements to bring the College into full compliance with new state mandates and concerns raised by the accrediting commission in Standard IIB.
Another remarkable project underway this fall at the Centers is a partnership with the College’s multicultural retention programs: African American Scholastic Programs (AASP), Asian Pacific American Student Success (APASS), Latino/a Services Network (LSN), and Tulay “Bridge” Filipino American Success Program (Tulay). The Multicultural Retention Service Department quickly mobilized their counseling faculty and support staff to lend a hand to the Centers during the peak noncredit enrollment period in August—a critical time for our Centers. Teams were sent to five Centers: Chinatown-North Beach, Downtown, Evans, Mission and Southeast. With student services expertise in credit and noncredit courses and programs, this added support will ensure that students do not face enrollment roadblocks and enroll in appropriate courses that meet their goals. Change is occurring; already feedback from the Centers has been positive.

The Chair of Automotive, Motorcycle, Construction and Building Maintenance Department sends this warm note of appreciation:

*Hey Dr. Faye! Thanks for sending your team of helpers to the Evans Center. It has made such a big difference to us all during the hectic enrollment period. You are welcome here any time! Consider our center your home away from home.*

Collaborations such as these deploying student services teams throughout the district in the spirit of “putting students first,” demonstrates the deep commitment our student services professionals have to serve the students of City College.

**Campus Safety and Facilities Maintenance**

Deans and staff repeatedly commented on the lack of building maintenance, specifically custodial services. It was evident during the tours at the Centers that immediate attention is needed to remedy the lack of cleanliness resulting from not having the appropriate resources on site. Trash is infrequently collected and more supplies are needed in the restrooms. With classes beginning on August 14, the need for maintenance becomes all the more urgent.

Safety was another concern. Some Centers reported that campus police is insufficient. Police sometimes leave one site to provide coverage at another site. John Adams staff that enter the empty building at 7:30 a.m. walk in together as a security measure. Civic Center uses a doorbell when police or staff is scarce to grant entry into the building. Southeast, also located in a San Francisco neighborhood with high crime statistics, could use more presence from campus police. Without knowing information about police assignments, schedules, time-off requests, or unplanned schedule changes, Center deans cannot predict campus police availability.

**Staffing at Educational Centers**

Overall lack of staffing was expressed by Center deans and staff. Many felt that unfilled vacancies due to retirements, resignations and layoffs are having an adverse effect on the Centers.

Center staff varies greatly in size. This is evident in the number of staff working in the Admissions and Enrollment Offices. Those affected by retirements or resignations have lost staff at a higher rate than other where attrition has not occurred leaving uneven numbers of staff at each Center. Evans lost the one and only A&E staff and now relies on the Auto Department’s staff person to serve as the Center’s A&E staff. Downtown which had a student headcount of 6,610 in spring 2012 has only 1 fulltime A&E staff after losing one position due to a resignation. Concerns were expressed regarding counseling hours...
and financial aid hours as well, which raises the question as to whether students are being served appropriately. Insufficient staff in key areas puts a strain on the hours offices are open to serve students.

Levels of volunteerism at the Centers have grown. John Adams greatly appreciates their retired phone operator; she volunteers dutifully every day just as she did before her retirement. Civic Center has many faculty volunteers, most from the ESL department, who have started and run a modest ESL library where students can read books in English. Chinatown-North Beach too has faculty volunteers working in the A&E Office helping students fill out registration forms. These are a few examples of the many faculty and staff who have stepped in to fill voids at the Centers. While volunteers are a great resource, a long-term solution for staffing the Centers must be identified.

**Unique Programs and Events at the Centers**
The Centers are to be commended for their efforts to serve such diverse communities. At every Center their dedication to serve students was heartfelt. Testimonials from former CCSF students near the Mission Center further supported how important the College is to thousands of immigrant and nonimmigrant families in San Francisco. The Educational Center in Civic Center engages its students not only with a strong English as a Second Language (ESL) program, but also with extra-curricular student events featuring mainstream American music. For students learning English this is a fun opportunity to practice what they’ve learned in the classroom. Mission’s Childcare center is a classroom for students and parents. This laboratory provides a multi-generational learning experience for young toddlers, CCSF students studying Child development, and CCSF parents. At Southeast, the A&E operation is small yet efficient, directing students to a variety of courses from pre-GED classes to certified nursing classes. Evans Center is a hands-on learning center from fine detail wood working to photovoltaic panels, students can complete certificates that prepare them for many industries in the Bay Area.

**Student Development Leadership Debriefing Session**
The Student Development Leadership Team met to discuss what was learning during the two-day assessment of the Educational Centers. This is an important first step in college-wide integrated planning to address and implement solutions about concerns raised during the accreditation process, as well as observations made when touring the Centers. Described within this document are several recommendations which emerged from the debriefing and brain storming session.

One observation is that Center Deans would like to be more empowered with regards to not only Admissions and Enrollment but also student services generally. However, it is important for VCSD to have one clear message when responding to the concerns raised by the Center Deans. Center Deans perceive that greater accountability could be achieved by moving functions such as payroll away from the Ocean campus to the Centers. The Interim Dean of Matriculation and Counseling Services is requesting on a voluntary basis that counselors agree to have their payroll/time sheets processed by the Centers. This concept may be applicable to other areas and staff in student services.

More thoughtful discussion needs to take place when deciding how to allocate services and resources. For instance, what role does headcount play in allocating staffing and fiscal resources? As CCSF enrollment decreases and state funding follows suit, Centers may need to consider sharing or merging staff at non-peak periods. Centers cannot afford to operate with the same number of staff year-round when that is not the best use of limited resources. The collaboration with the Retention programs piloted in the fall at the Centers was successful. This could be the first step in creating a multicultural center at the Mission Center.
Signage, CCSF branding, the student services identity are unclear. More unified signage is important across the District, particularly at the Centers, to support our students in locating needed services. The vocabulary used to describe Student Development and Student Services is very confusing. The VCSD team discussed renaming the division—student development, VC Student Development, VC Student Services, Student Affairs, student services, among other names were considered. In the end the team felt that at the Ed Centers, for ease and consistency, the proper name will be known as “Student Services.”

Financial Aid is evaluating its services to determine whether faculty or classified staff are the appropriate personnel to deliver the service to students. Among the considerations is the cost effectiveness of one versus the other.

Academic Affairs is challenged with adding Late Start classes this October. Up to 200 classes have fewer than 20 students enrolled. Student Development is an important partner in growing college enrollment. Enrollment at CCSF must be brought up; otherwise, the District faces a potential $20-million dollar loss. To aide in increasing student enrollment, the VC of Student Development has worked with the VC of Academic Affairs to allow large lecture classes to be held in Conlan Hall 101. Placement Testing and Orientation activities will be relocated to the Multi-Use Bldg. Credit classes at the Centers need to be added and scheduled in a more effective manner. Currently students have difficulty meeting requirements because classes are not scheduled in a manner that supports certificate/degree completion or transfer requirements. The Leadership team must identify a start-date in October. Student Services will support this enrollment drive.

More analysis is needed on the numbers of students served at the Centers. This fiscal year, funding is available through Matriculation (SSSP) to provide comprehensive matriculation services. What is the best use of these funds? Budget requests and recommendations for student services at the Centers should be directed to and will be considered by the Vice Chancellor of Student Development. The role of counseling needs to be defined. Counselors should expect to play a more active role in recruitment, in-reach, and certificate completion.

The scheduling of English, ESL and math assessment has become a competitive process with Centers sending in requests earlier than other Centers to secure their preferred placement testing dates. The Office of Matriculation will meet with Center Deans to propose testing dates at the Centers.

The Student Development Leadership team identified four core student services at the Centers. They are: Admissions and Records, Financial Aid, Counseling and Assessment/Testing. Long-term planning to find student-friendly names when describing college services must continue. The names of and vocabulary used to describe services and offices is a barrier to new and lost students. For example, is the term “enrollment” more widely understood by and relevant to students more than the use of the term “admissions?” Signage should reflect the proper names and be as descriptive as possible.

All Centers should be operating cross-functionally. Currently four Centers operate as such. However, the remaining Centers have work to do in fully implementing cross-functional teams. The cross functional model must be standard across the District. During the visit, lack of support among student services was observed at the Downtown Center. Specifically support staff at Downtown—A&E, Admin Office staff,
Counseling support staff, and others-- will need to be trained to work together cross-functionally to support students.

The Student Development team also discussed the closing down and relocation of services during the summer. Is this approach acceptable best-practices for students? Should Center services be consolidated at other times during the year? To make the most with what we have, collaborations and mergers will be explored and evaluated.

The team also felt that marketing and communication is important but is presently lacking. The marketing team must develop relationships with the Center Deans for a stronger presence and sense of connectedness. With so many competing messages and issues facing the college, the message to students must be clear, concise and direct: It’s not too late, Enroll Now. There’s still time! The team suggests adding pictures of current students to the CCSF website. All the campaigns stemming from The Student Development division need to be consistent—A&R message to non-matriculating students, “Get Your Life, Get Your EdPlan,” outgoing mass text messages, etc.

**Recommendations**

While we recognize the efforts of many individuals to make our Educational Centers run smoothly, we also acknowledge that many areas in student services have been neglected and need attention. The Student Development team, along with others at the College, is committed and continues working to fully implementing not only cross-functional teams equipped to provide the appropriate level of student services, but also the recommendations outlined in this assessment of the Educational Centers.

Thus the following recommendations are made with the goal of improving student services at all City College of San Francisco Educational Centers:

- **Rename the Student Development Division for clarity among students, staff and faculty.** At Educational Centers, refer consistently to services provided by Student Development as, “Student Services.”
- **Continue to implement the cross-functional student services model.** VCSD and the Center Deans will continue with the implementation of the cross-functional model at Downtown, Evans, and Southeast. Leading the way are the teams at Mission, John Adams, Civic Center and Chinatown-North Beach.
- **Develop collaborative approach to sharing resources at Centers.** Namely, Southeast and Evans given their close proximity and low student headcount can combine forces to serve students with the current level of staffing. Similarly, the Civic Center and John Adams Centers can combine staffing where appropriate. Larger Centers should look internally and evaluate staffing. During peak periods, other Center staff may be used to support college-wide enrollment efforts. Allocate classified staffing levels to Centers as appropriate based on College needs such as student enrollment and hours of operation.
- **Evaluate and redesign placement testing frequency and calendar at the Centers.** Associate Dean of Matriculation will meet with Center Deans to refine process at the Centers. Evaluate frequency of student orientations and placement assessments. Implement new schedule of orientations and placement assessments.
• Procure signage, building directories, and marketing publications in English and multiple languages. Install new signage to direct students to the appropriate location at all Centers. Naming, titles, and office locations must be clearly identified.
• Review funding requests to provide comprehensive matriculation services, with emphasis on services that support the late-start classes in October. Requests should be addressed to the Vice Chancellor of Student Development.
• Review and evaluate counseling hours and services at Centers. Work with Deans and Chairs to identify appropriate level of resources during peak and non-peak enrollment periods.
• Increase numbers of student ed plans at each Center. Implement full use of electronic ed planning tool and provide counselors with professional development training. Expand use of online Banner registration for noncredit students at all Centers. Work with IT, Department Chairs of ESL, Business, TRST and others as needed to establish Banner protocols.
• Complete review and reengineer Financial Aid services at the Centers. Conduct professional development workshops to educate cross-functional team members in financial aid eligibility requirements.
• Expand Multicultural Retention Services at the Centers to increase retention of noncredit-to-credit students.
• Collaborate with the College’s Custodial Services department to ensure all educational centers have adequate services and maintain a high level of cleanliness and met health and safety standards.
• Collaborate with the College’s Police Department to ensure that all CCSF Educational Centers are a safe place of learning free from danger for our students, staff and faculty.

Lastly, this assessment is the culmination of site tours, reviews and candid conversations among a large leadership team from Student Development and Academic Affairs. We acknowledge each participant’s expertise and candor, and their cooperation in striving to make transformational change at City College on behalf of our students.