Accreditation Work Group Progress Form

Work Group Leaders: Please complete and submit this form to Gohar Momjian (gmomjian@ccsf.edu) and Grace Esteban (mesteban@ccsf.edu) via email by Thursday, August 16.

Recommendation number and topic:
8: Physical Resources

Full recommendation text:
To fully meet Standard III.B Physical Resources, the team recommends that the college incorporate all costs required to appropriately operate and maintain existing facilities, whether owned or leased, into its annual and long-term planning and budgeting processes and annually allocate the required human and fiscal resources to effectively and equitably operate and maintain physical resources at locations where courses, programs and services are offered (III.B.1)

Related standards:
• 10: Financial Planning and Stability
• 11: Financial Integrity and Reporting

Work group members:
Lawrence Wong Trustee Board
Jorge Bell VC Campuses / Enrollment Administrator
Minh Ta Dean ESL/CHN/NB Campus Administrator
   Lidia Jenkins Assoc. Dean / Matriculation Administrator
   Steven Brown Dept. Chair / Horticulture / Flrsty Dept. Chair
   Maya Novelli Broadcasting Staff
   Brian Leong Buildings / Grounds Staff
   Scott Cline Buildings / Grounds Staff
   Gohar Momjian Executive Asst. to Chancellor Accreditation Liaison
   David Liggett Facilities Staff

Provide the dates and times of all meetings held to date. For each meeting, please briefly describe the primary focus of the discussion that took place (1-2 sentences per meeting).
26 July 2012 – Read and discussed standard, self-study report, commission letter and evaluation report. Looked at effective models, identify resources / additional information needed, assign tasks and set next meeting date.
9 August 2012 – Discussed State vs. CCSF use of the terms Campus, Center and Site. Discussed chart of accounts, Banner codes, budget FY 12/13. Discussed draft Total Cost of Ownership (TCO) matrix. Discussed need to obtain annual Buildings and Grounds (B&G) operations and maintenance costs. Discussed difficulty of discussing annual and long-term operational,
maintenance and staffing costs since the work group does not know how the annual budget is determined.

23 August 2012 – preliminary date for next work-group meeting

On Monday, September 10, 2012, the Physical Resources/Operation/Maintenance Committee held a meeting at City College of San Francisco’s Ocean Campus. The work group members that attended the meeting are as follows:

1. Jorge Bell
2. Lidia Jenkins
3. Carlita Martinez
4. Steven Brown
5. Scott Cline
6. Jaime Martine (representing Xiomara Martinez)
7. Brian Leong
8. Maya Novelli

After providing information to the group regarding their responsibility as a team, the members decided that the charge of the group includes only the specified account numbers:

- 5450 Self-Insurance Claims
- 5510 Water/Sewage
- 5520 Gas/Electricity
- 5530 Telephone
- 5540 Other Utilities
- 5560 Housekeeping
- 5610 Other Property Leases
- 5620 Property Leases- SFUSD
- 5631 Vehicle Leases
- 5632 Copier Leases
- 5633 Other Leases
- 5640 Maintenance and Repair – Non Equipment
- 5650 Maintenance and Equipment
- 5655 Maintenance and Repair - Vehicles

Although the members of this group have concerns about the lack of expertise in this specified area, Dean Bell assured the members that everyone’s time and effort is needed in order to accomplish this task. Dean Bell will do his best to keep the members of the group focused while concentrating on the specific assignment only.

David Liggett joined the meeting via telephone. He provided an explanation on the work he has completed on the Total Cost of Ownership (TCO) Model. In addition, he indicated that he has requested Pam Merry to provide the FTE and FTES figures for all of City College of San
Francisco’s campuses and sites in order for him to complete the TCO matrix in full. While reviewing the TCO matrix, Dean Jenkins and Novelli raised the concern that the TCO matrix portrays the District budget as being equally distributed among the facilities regardless of size and/or need. Consequently, the presented approach may not accurately reflect the actual costs by center and/or campus. Dean Bell and Jenkins will revise the provided draft of the TCO matrix, in addition to calculating staffing estimates using the APPA guidelines.

Furthermore, Novelli introduced the MiraCosta College Institutional Self Study Report formula from the 2002 Association of Physical Plant Administrators (APPA). This formula focused on the staffing guidelines and the resulting recommendations made by MAAS Company, which demonstrates the quantity of the staffing needs. In order to address the staffing needs at City College of San Francisco, Novelli and Cline agreed to work together using the same formula presented in the MiraCosta College Institutional Self Study Report and will report their findings at the next meeting.

Cline provided the group with a copy of the 2 year, 5 year, and 10 year Capital Improvement Matrix separated by location. Cline will report the dollar amount for each of the areas on the matrix at the next meeting.

Additionally, Leong presented copies of the Staffing Matrix for City College of San Francisco. The matrix included three columns for the current staff, the needed staff, in addition to the ideal number of staff at City College of San Francisco. This matrix was developed based on Leong’s experience and past practices at the college. Dean Bell was concerned with how this particular matrix was developed and requested a more scientific method to be created. Leong and Brown will complete this project and provide their findings at the next meeting.

Martinez agreed to work on the custodial aspect of the recommendation in order to identify current practices/costs and explore recommendations for recycling and waste management.

Lastly, the Physical Resources/Operations/Maintenance group felt they needed more information in the areas of Leasing, Vehicle Leasing, Copier Leasing, and Other Leases. Dean Bell agreed to follow up with Lani Baptiste and Kathy Hennig in regards to these areas and the access to additional information. The next meeting will be held on Wednesday, September 19th at 11:00am.

FUTURE MEETINGS
The group schedule the following meetings: Wednesday, September 19th at 11:00 AM and Wednesday, September 26th at 11:00 AM Location to be determined.
Describe your plans for addressing the recommendation. Include a brief paragraph describing each activity included on your timeline along with key dates for accomplishing those activities.

3 August 2012 – Complete matrix and give progress report to Chancellor’s Office
16 August 2012 – Complete Total Cost of Ownership (TCO) model and forward to work groups 10 & 11 and give progress report to Chancellor’s Office

September 19th complete Total Cost Ownership Model using only the accounts pertinent to the group.


The members indicated that the charge of this group includes ONLY the following account numbers:

- 5450 Self-Insurance Claims
- 5510 Water/Sewage
- 5520 Gas/Electricity
- 5530 Telephone
- 5540 Other Utilities
- 5560 Housekeeping
- 5610 Other Property Leases
- 5620 Property Leases-SFUSD
- 5631 Vehicle Leases
- 5632 Copier Leases
- 5633 Other Leases
- 5640 Maintenance and Repair –Non Equipment
- 5650 Maintenance and –Equipment
- 5655 Maintenance and Repair –Vehicles

Jorge Bell and Lidia Jenkins will work on revising the TCO template and calculate staffing estimates using the APPA guidelines.

Carlita Martinez and Brian Leong will work on Custodial to identify current practices/costs and explore recommendations for recycling and waste management.

Brian Leong distributed a Staffing Matrix for the College. The Matrix included 3 columns for the current staff, the needed staff and the ideal number of staff. He indicated that he obtained these figures based on his experience and past practices. Brian Leong and Steven Brown agreed to work on this project and they will report at the next meeting.
Summarize your progress to date on carrying out the activities described above where applicable. If you have completed any of these activities, please note the date on which it was completed and append the evidence or any products relating to the activity.

3 August 2012 – Completed matrix and gave progress report to Chancellor’s Office
16 August 2012 – Completed Total Cost of Ownership (TCO) model and forwarded to work groups 10 & 11 and gave progress report to Chancellor’s Office
23 August 2012 – Compile all TCO costs that we have been able to determine and allocate to sites. For actual annual budget FY 12/13 and for realist costs. Will concentrate on the TCO for the new Chinatown Campus rather than attempt to determine all District wide costs.

List any challenges you have encountered or anticipate facing with respect to addressing the recommendation.
Discussed difficulty in understanding the chart of accounts, Banner codes, budget FY 12/13. Discussed difficulty in obtaining annual Buildings and Grounds (B&G) operations and maintenance costs. Discussed difficulty of discussing annual and long-term operational, maintenance and staffing costs since the work group does not know how the annual budget is determined. (Exampled, how was 5640 – Maint & Repair – non-equipment - $815,000 determined and set in the budget?)

One of the concerns of the group is that most of the members are not experts in this area. In addition, the group needs to follow up with Lani Baptiste regarding Leases and with Kathy Henning regarding Vehicle Leases, Copier Leases and Other Leases.